

# Cofnod y Trafodion

## The Record of Proceedings

### 29/01/2014

Cynnwys Contents

[Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau](#)  
[Questions to the Minister for Education and Skills](#)

[Cwestiynau i Weinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth](#)  
[Questions to the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport](#)

[Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd ar yr Ymchwiliad i Bolisi Ynni a Chynllunio yng Nghymru—Adroddiad Dilydol](#)  
[The Environment and Sustainability Committee's Report on the Inquiry into Energy Policy and Planning in Wales—Follow-up Report](#)

[Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Mewnfuddsoddi](#)  
[Welsh Conservatives Debate: Inward Investment](#)

[Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Y Cynllun Bwyd Ysgol](#)  
[Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: The School Food Plan](#)

[Cyfnod Pleidleisio](#)  
[Voting Time](#)

[Dadl Fer: Cyflogaeth i Raddedigion—Atal y Draen Dawn i Loegr](#)  
[Short Debate: Graduate Employment—Stopping the Brain Drain to England](#)

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 13:30 gyda'r Llywydd (Y Fonesig Rosemary Butler) yn y Gadair.*

*The Assembly met at 13:30 with the Presiding Officer (Dame Rosemary Butler) in the Chair.*

#### 13:30 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Good afternoon. The National Assembly for Wales is now in session.

Prynhawn da. Dyma ddechrau trafodion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

## Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau

### Blas am Oes

## Questions to the Minister for Education and Skills

### Appetite for Life

#### 13:30 **Jenny Rathbone** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*1. Beth yw asesiad y Gweinidog hyd yma o'r ymgyrch Blas am Oes? OAQ(4)0376(ESK)*

*1. What is the Minister's assessment to date of the Appetite for Life campaign? OAQ(4)0376(ESK)*

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

#### 13:30 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*Y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau / The Minister for Education and Skills*

I thank the Member for Cardiff Central for the question. The 'Appetite for Life' initiative paved the way for the introduction of the Healthy Eating in Schools (Nutritional Standards and Requirements) (Wales) Regulations 2013, which came into force last September, by giving schools and local authorities recommended standards to work towards to improve food and drink in schools before we introduced those statutory standards.

Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ganol Caerdydd am y cwestiwn. Roedd menter 'Blas am Oes' wedi paratōi'r ffordd i gyflwyno Rheoliadau Bwyta'n Iach mewn Ysgolion (Gofynion a Safonau Maeth) (Cymru) 2013, a ddaeth i rym fis Medi diwethaf, drwy argymhell safonau i ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol weithio tuag atynt er mwyn gwella bwyd a diod mewn ysgolion cyn inni gyflwyno'r safonau statudol hynny.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

- 13:31 **Jenny Rathbone** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Obviously, the healthy schools initiative has been fantastically important. However, many schools and youth clubs remain very concerned about the impact of so-called energy drinks, and their impact on children's behaviour. Recent converts include John Vincent, Michael Gove's adviser and the author of the school food plan, and I wondered whether there is anything that we in Wales can do to tackle this problem, under our own proposals in Wales.
- Yn amlwg, mae'r fenter ysgolion iach wedi bod yn anhygoel o bwysig. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o ysgolion a chlybiau ieuencid yn dal i fod yn bryderus iawn am effaith diodydd egni fel y'u gelwir, a'u heffaith ar ymddygiad plant. Ymhlith y rhai a argyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar mae John Vincent, cynghorydd Michael Gove ac awdur y cynllun bwyd ysgol, a meddyliaf tybed a oes unrhyw beth y gallwn ni yng Nghymru ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, o dan ein cynigion ein hunain yng Nghymru.
- 13:31 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I believe that Jenny Rathbone's concern is well founded. It is concerning enough that our young people are exposed to too much in the way of sugary drinks, without those drinks also being laced with caffeine. As a result of Jenny Rathbone's question, I will instruct officials to look at the regulatory basis of what might be happening elsewhere in the UK, with a view to taking a long, hard look at what could be achieved in Wales in a devolved context.
- Credaf fod sail i bryder Jenny Rathbone. Mae'n ddigon o achos pryder bod ein pobl ifanc yn cael eu hamlygu i ormod o ddiodydd llawn siwgr, heb i'r diodydd hynny gynnwys caffein hefyd. O ganlyniad i gwestiwn Jenny Rathbone, byddaf yn gofyn i swyddogion edrych ar sail reoleiddiol yr hyn sy'n digwydd o bosibl mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU, gyda'r nod o feddwl yn ofalus am yr hyn y gellid ei gyflawni yng Nghymru mewn cyd-destun datganoledig.
- 13:32 **Andrew R.T. Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid / The Leader of the Opposition*
- Minister, 'Appetite for Life' has been going now for some five years. Obviously, there could be wide variations across Wales in its implementation, because local authorities take the lead on this, and, with 22 local authorities, there could be differences. What evaluation have your officials undertaken to assess the impact of 'Appetite for Life', to identify good practice, and to ensure that there is uniformity in its delivery across Wales?
- Weinidog, mae 'Blas am Oes' wedi bod ar waith bellach ers rhyw bum mlynedd. Yn amlwg, gallai fod amrywiadau eang ledled Cymru o ran y ffordd y caiff ei weithredu, gan mai awdurdodau lleol sy'n ei arwain a, gyda 22 o awdurdodau lleol, gallai fod gwahaniaethau. Pa werthusiad y mae eich swyddogion wedi'i gynnal er mwyn asesu effaith 'Blas am Oes', nodi arfer da, a sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei gyflwyno mewn ffordd unffurf ledled Cymru?
- 13:32 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I do not know whether we could, or should, aim for absolute uniformity across Wales. As I say, the 'Appetite for Life' recommended standards have been superseded now by the statutory regulations, which prohibit the provision of confectionery, as well as salty, fatty and sugary snacks. They also increase the availability of fruit and vegetables, improve the quality of the meat products that are served, and allow only healthy drinks as options to be provided. In terms of an assessment, it is a little early in the day, I think, to assess the impact of the regulations, which have been in force only for a few months, but, of course, we would all expect these to have a positive effect. As I said, local authorities, though, do need to interpret those rules with common sense.
- Ni wn a allem, nac ychwaith a ddylem, anelu at unffurfiaeth lwyr ledled Cymru. Fel y dywedais, mae'r safonau a argymhellwyd gan 'Blas am Oes' bellach wedi'u disodli gan y rheoliadau statudol, sy'n gwahardd darparu melysion, yn ogystal â byrbrydau hallt, brasterog a llawn siwgr. Maent hefyd yn sicrhau bod mwy o ffrwythau a llysiau ar gael, yn gwella ansawdd y cynnyrch cig sy'n cael ei weini, ac yn datgan mai dim ond diodydd iach a ddylai gael eu darparu fel opsiynau. O ran asesu, mae ychydig yn gynnar, yn fy marn i, i asesu effaith y rheoliadau, sydd ond wedi bod mewn grym ers rhai misoedd, ond, wrth gwrs, byddai pob un ohonom yn disgwyl i'r rhain gael effaith gadarnhaol. Fel y dywedais, mae angen i awdurdodau lleol, fodd bynnag, ddehongli'r rheolau hynny mewn ffordd synhwyrol.
- 13:33 **Peter Black** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, the implementation of these regulations is going to be absolutely crucial, and, of course, making sure that local authorities make appropriate provision is going to be vital to how well they are implemented. In my own region, Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council is cutting £106,000 next year from its school meals budget, and £100,000 the year after. I am sure that that may be replicated elsewhere in Wales. How, then, will you be enforcing the statutory nature of these guidelines to ensure that local authorities do make the appropriate investment to deliver on healthier school meals?
- Weinidog, mae'r ffordd y caiff y rheoliadau hyn eu rhoi ar waith yn mynd i fod yn hollol hanfodol, ac, wrth gwrs, mae sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud darpariaeth briodol yn mynd i fod yn hollbwysig o ran pa mor dda y cânt eu rhoi ar waith. Yn fy rhanbarth i, mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn torri £106,000 y flwyddyn nesaf oddi ar ei gyllideb prydau ysgol, a £100,000 y flwyddyn ganlynol. Rwy'n siŵr y gallai'r un peth ddigwydd mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru. Sut, felly, y byddwch yn gorfodi natur statudol y canllawiau hyn er mwyn sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud y buddsoddiad priodol i ddarparu prydau ysgol iachach?

13:34	<p><b>Huw Lewis</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Would that I had the powers to enforce the Westminster Government to sufficiently resource the Welsh Government, as well as local government here in Wales, in order to do everything that we might like to do with regard to school budgets. I think that Peter Black's question is better translated into a letter for our colleagues at Westminster.</p>	<p>Byddai'n dda gennyf gael y pwerau i orfodi Llywodraeth San Steffan i roi adnoddau digonol i Lywodraeth Cymru, yn ogystal â llywodraeth leol yma yng Nghymru, er mwyn gwneud popeth yr hoffem ei wneud mewn perthynas â chyllidebau ysgolion. Credaf y byddai'n well i Peter Black ofyn ei gwestiwn mewn llythyr at ein cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
<b>Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig</b>		<b>Special Educational Needs</b>	
13:34	<p><b>Julie James</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>2. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog ar gyfer darpariaeth anghenion addysgol arbennig yn Abertawe? OAQ(4)0368(ESK)</p>	<p>2. What plans does the Minister have for special educational needs provision in Swansea? OAQ(4)0368(ESK)</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
<b>Janet Finch-Saunders</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>		<b>3. Will the Minister make a statement on special educational needs provision? OAQ(4)0382(ESK)</b>	
<p>3. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth anghenion addysgol arbennig? OAQ(4)0382(ESK)</p>		<p>3. Will the Minister make a statement on special educational needs provision? OAQ(4)0382(ESK)</p>	
<b>Kirsty Williams</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>		<b>10. Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of services for children with additional educational needs in Brecon and Radnorshire? OAQ(4)0378(ESK)</b>	
<p>10. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu gwasanaethau i blant ag anghenion addysgol ychwanegol ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed? OAQ(4)0378(ESK)</p>		<p>10. Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of services for children with additional educational needs in Brecon and Radnorshire? OAQ(4)0378(ESK)</p>	
13:34	<p><b>Huw Lewis</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Presiding Officer, I understand that you have given your permission for questions 2, 3 and 10 to be grouped.</p> <p>The responsibility to provide suitable education for all pupils in Swansea, including those with special educational needs, lies with the local authority. In doing so, authorities must have due regard to the SEN code of practice for Wales, which provides practical advice on carrying out their duties.</p>	<p>Lywydd, deallaf eich bod wedi rhoi caniatâd i gwestiynau 2, 3 a 10 gael eu grwpio.</p> <p>Yr awdurdod lleol sy'n gyfrifol am ddarparu addysg addas ar gyfer holl ddisgyblion Abertawe, gan gynnwys y rhai ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Wrth wneud hynny, rhaid i awdurdodau roi sylw dyledus i god ymarfer AAA Cymru, sy'n rhoi cyngor ymarferol iddynt ar gyflawni eu dyletswyddau.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
13:35	<p><b>Julie James</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Thank you for that, Minister. Minister, among the many problems that parents with special educational needs children experience is a difficulty in easing the transition between different levels of schools, and, indeed, into adult life, when they arrive at that age. What can be done in terms of strategic policy to assist local authorities to make those transitional provisions as easy as possible, and, in particular, to assist local authorities to start the process of discussing the transition with those parents as early as possible, and as much as two years, perhaps, before the actual transition takes place, given the difficulties that many children with special educational needs have in dealing with change and resettlement?</p>	<p>Diolch ichi am hynny, Weinidog. Weinidog, ymysg y problemau niferus sy'n wynebu rhieni â phlant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig, mae anhawster i hwyluso'r cam pontio rhwng lefelau ysgol gwahanol, ac, yn wir, i fywyd oedolyn, pan fyddant yn cyrraedd yr oedran hwnnw. Beth y gellir ei wneud o ran polisi strategol er mwyn cynorthwyo awdurdodau lleol i wneud y darpariaethau pontio hynny mor hawdd â phosibl, ac, yn benodol, cynorthwyo awdurdodau lleol i ddechrau ar y broses o drafod y camau pontio gyda'r rhieni hynny cyn gynted ag y bo modd, a chymaint â dwy flynedd, efallai, cyn y cyfnod pontio gwirioneddol, o ystyried yr anawsterau y mae llawer o blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig yn eu profi wrth ddelio â newid ac ailgynefino?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>

13:35	<b>Huw Lewis</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Julie James is quite right to point to the critical nature of these transitional times in the growth and education of young people. Future legislative reform of the current SEN legal framework will, and should, aim to improve transition for learners at every stage of their educational journey. We have developed a transition key worker framework to provide guidance on developing and sustaining transition key working in Wales. This includes the delivery of training and support to local authorities across Wales that wish to further develop their own transition key worker services, with a focus on sustainable programmes. However, I look forward to investigating and debating these points further as we move towards a future SEN reform Bill.</p>	<p>Mae Julie James yn llygad ei lle i dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod y cyfnodau pontio hyn yn hollbwysig i dwf ac addysg pobl ifanc. Bydd diwygiadau deddfwriaethol yn y dyfodol i'r fframwaith AAA cyfreithiol presennol yn anelu, fel y dylent, at wella prosesau pontio i ddysgwyr ar bob cam o'u taith addysgol. Rydym wedi datblygu fframwaith gweithiwr pontio allweddol i ddarparu canllawiau ar ddatblygu a chynnal gwaith pontio allweddol yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn cynnwys darparu hyfforddiant a chymorth i awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru sy'n dymuno datblygu eu gwasanaethau gweithwyr pontio allweddol eu hunain ymhellach, gan ganolbwyntio ar raglenni cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, edrychaf ymlaen at ymchwilio i'r pwyntiau hyn a'u trafod ymhellach wrth inni symud tuag at Fil diwygio AAA yn y dyfodol.</p>
13:36	<b>Janet Finch-Saunders</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Minister, I am sure that, like me, you must be delighted with the new build of Ysgol y Gogarth in Craig-y-Don, Llandudno. This school supports those children with a wide spectrum of additional learning and complex needs. It is a day and residential special school catering for approximately 180 pupils between the ages of three and 19. The redevelopment, at a cost of £18 million, now boasts a high-tech sensory room, vocational training classrooms, an amazing sports hall, with basketball and netball hoops, a climbing wall, abseiling for wheelchair users, and a hydrotherapy pool and jacuzzi. The children themselves have been largely influential in choosing some of the colour schemes and the room themes. The school is incredible and has been described as one of the best special educational needs schools in the whole of the UK. Minister, as a former school governor there myself—</p>	<p>Weinidog, rwy'n siŵr eich bod, fel minnau, wrth eich bodd gydag adeilad newydd Ysgol y Gogarth yng Nghraig-y-Don, Llandudno. Mae'r ysgol hon yn cefnogi'r plant hynny sydd â sbectwm eang o anghenion dysgu ychwanegol a chymhleth. Ysgol arbennig yw hon i tua 180 o ddisgyblion dydd a phreswyl rhwng tair a 19 oed. Mae'r ailddatblygiad, a gostiodd £18 miliwn, bellach yn cynnwys ystafell synhwyraidd uwch-dechnoleg, ystafelloedd dosbarth hyfforddiant galwedigaethol, neuadd chwaraeon anhygoel, gyda chylchoedd pêl fasedg a phêl-rwyd, wal ddringo, cyfleusterau abseilio i ddefnyddwyr cadeiriau olwyn, a phwll hydrotherapi a jacuzzi. Mae'r plant eu hunain wedi cael cryn ddylanwad wrth ddewis rhai o'r cynlluniau lliw a themâu'r ystafelloedd. Mae'r ysgol yn anhygoel ac wedi cael ei disgrifio fel un o'r ysgolion anghenion addysgol arbennig gorau ledled y DU. Weinidog, fel un o gyn-lywodraethwyr yr ysgol fy hun—</p>
13:37	<b>Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Are you coming to the question?</p>	<p>A ydych yn dod at y cwestiwn?</p>
13:37	<b>Janet Finch-Saunders</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>[Continues.]—and present at the planning stage, will you join me in placing on record our immense thanks and gratitude to the developers, Conwy County Borough Council, your own Government officials, school governors and the headteacher, Mr Jonathan Morgan? This is a very, very special school. Parents and pupils—</p>	<p>[Parhau.] —ac fel un a fu'n bresennol yn ystod y cam cynllunio, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i gofnodi ein diolch a'n gwerthfawrogiad aruthrol i'r datblygwyr, Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy, eich swyddogion eich hun yn y Llywodraeth, llywodraethwyr yr ysgol a'r pennaeth, Mr Jonathan Morgan? Mae hon yn ysgol arbennig iawn, iawn. Y rhieni a'r disgyblion—</p>
13:38	<b>Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>I am sorry; we do not want to thank everybody in north Wales. Have you asked a question?</p>	<p>Mae'n ddrwg gennyf; nid ydym am ddiolch i bawb yn y gogledd. A ydych wedi gofyn cwestiwn?</p>
13:38	<b>Janet Finch-Saunders</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Yes. Without which this school could not have been possible, enriching the lives of these very special children.</p>	<p>Ydw. Hebddynt, ni fyddai'r ysgol hon wedi bod yn bosibl, gan gyfoethogi bywydau'r plant arbennig iawn hyn.</p>

13:38

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Of course I will, and I wholeheartedly join Janet Finch-Saunders in welcoming this fantastic new development for Llandudno, for north Wales and the surrounding region, which would also, of course, not have been possible without the Welsh Government's commitment to its twenty-first century schools capital programme, which we are conducting even in the teeth of these times of austerity.

Wrth gwrs y gwnaf, ac ymunaf â Janet Finch-Saunders i groesawu'r datblygiad newydd gwyh hwn ar gyfer Llandudno, y gogledd a'r rhanbarth cyfagos, na fyddai wedi bod yn bosibl ychwaith, wrth gwrs, heb ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru i'w rhaglen gyfalaf ysgolion ar gyfer yr 21ain ganrif, yr ydym yn ei gweithredu hyd yn oed yn ystod y cyfnod hwn o galedi.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:38

**Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru / The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats*

Minister, Powys County Borough Council is about to go out to consultation on closing all its additional needs units that are currently based in mainstream schools and moving to a centrally-resourced peripatetic service. This is causing a great deal of concern to the parents of the children who will be affected by these changes. The council tells me that the changes are based on the findings of an independent report that it commissioned from an additional learning needs expert, who recommended that this is the best way forward for the services. Yet, when I asked to see a copy of that independent expert's report, the council refused to make that available either to me or to the parents. Would you agree with me that, if there is a strong case for this change, the council should make that report available to parents so that they can see why the change is necessary?

Weinidog, mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Powys ar fin cynnal ymgynghoriad ar gau ei holl unedau anghenion ychwanegol sydd mewn ysgolion prif ffrwd ar hyn o bryd a newid i wasanaeth teithiol gydag adnoddau canolog. Mae hyn yn peri llawer iawn o bryder i rieni'r plant y bydd y newidiadau hyn yn effeithio arnynt. Mae'r cyngor yn dweud wrthyf fod y newidiadau yn seiliedig ar ganfyddiadau adroddiad annibynnol a gomisiynodd gan arbenigwr ar anghenion dysgu ychwanegol, a argymhellodd mai dyma'r ffordd orau ymlaen i'r gwasanaethau. Eto i gyd, pan ofynnais am gael gweld copi o adroddiad yr arbenigwr annibynnol hwnnw, gwrthododd y cyngor roi'r adroddiad i mi a'r rhieni. A fydddech yn cytuno â mi, os oes achos cryf dros weithredu'r newid hwn, y dylai'r cyngor sicrhau bod yr adroddiad hwnnw ar gael i rieni er mwyn iddynt allu gweld pam fod y newid yn angenrheidiol?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:39

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank the Member for Brecon and Radnorshire for the question. Of course, these are matters for the local authority and there would need to be a proper consultation process. I would, of course, be concerned if the consultation process around issues as important as this were flawed in any way. I need to be careful, because of my role perhaps later on in this process, as to what I say here today, but I can guarantee to the Member that I will be keeping a very close eye on issues surrounding the propriety around consultation in Powys, and in Brecon and Radnorshire.

Diolch i'r Aelod dros Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed am y cwestiwn. Wrth gwrs, materion i'r awdurdod lleol yw'r rhain a byddai angen cynnal proses ymgynghori briodol. Byddwn, wrth gwrs, yn bryderus pe bai'r broses ymgynghori ar faterion mor bwysig â hyn yn ddiffygiol mewn unrhyw ffordd. Mae angen imi fod yn ofalus, oherwydd fy rôl bosibl yn ddiweddarach yn y broses hon, ynghylch yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yma heddiw, ond gallaf warantu i'r Aelod y byddaf yn cadw llygad agos iawn ar faterion yn ymwneud â phriodoldeb gwaith ymgynghori ym Mhowys, ac ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:40

**Joyce Watson** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, I am going to raise exactly the same issue that Kirsty Williams has raised. I have been contacted by an extremely concerned constituent, who is also concerned about the future of special educational needs provision in Powys and the proposals that have just been mentioned, which might result in closing all of the county's additional learning needs units as part of the council's spending cuts. A huge amount of effort and money was invested in reorganising education in Powys in the first place, of which this played a major part. Recognising what you have just said, Minister, if you cannot engage with Powys County Council as a matter of urgency, will you at least keep a watching brief on it and have what dialogue you are able to have almost immediately?

Weinidog, hoffwn godi yn union yr un mater ag a gododd Kirsty Williams. Mae etholwr pryderus iawn wedi cysylltu â mi, sydd hefyd yn pryderu am ddyfodol y ddarpariaeth anghenion addysgol arbennig ym Mhowys a'r cynigion sydd newydd gael eu crybwyll, a allai arwain at gau holl unedau anghenion dysgu ychwanegol y sir fel rhan o doriadau gwariant y cyngor. Gwnaed ymdrech fawr a buddsoddwyd llawer iawn o arian yn y gwaith o ad-drefnu addysg ym Mhowys yn y lle cyntaf, yr oedd hwn yn rhan bwysig ohono. Gan gydnabod yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud, Weinidog, os na allwch ymgysylltu â Chyngor Sir Powys fel mater o frys, a wnewch chi o leiaf gadw llygad ar y mater a chynnal unrhyw drafodaethau ag y gallwch bron yn syth?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

- 13:41 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Yes, I can undertake to do that—of course I can. As I said, I have to be careful in what I say here today, because any changes to provision could come to me, in the end, for a final decision. However, as I said, the Government is committed to ensuring the most effective provision for students with additional learning needs, and we would want to make sure that, in every part of Wales, change and development of services was undertaken properly and in a spirit of openness and proper consultation.
- Gallaf ymrwymo i wneud hynny—wrth gwrs y gallaf. Fel y dywedais, rhaid imi fod yn ofalus ynghylch yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yma heddiw, oherwydd gallai unrhyw newidiadau i'r ddarpariaeth gael eu trosglwyddo imi benderfynu'n derfynol arnynt yn y pen draw. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, mae'r Llywodraeth yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau'r ddarpariaeth fwyaf effeithiol i fyfyrwyr ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol, a byddem am wneud yn siŵr, ym mhob rhan o Gymru, bod camau i newid a datblygu gwasanaethau yn cael eu cymryd yn briodol ac mewn ffordd agored gydag ymgynghori priodol.
- 13:41 **Suzu Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, I learned from a constituent that an SEN statement will be made for a child or young person in Swansea only if they are deemed to be 'below par' on every category on which they are tested. Looking at the recent pupil level annual school census data, it appears that this unwillingness to set itself up with an obligation to provide support is replicated in other authorities. As families are losing faith in the statementing process, when will we hear the timetable for individual learning plans and how they are to be rolled out so that local authorities can no longer hide behind the statementing process in order to hide from their responsibilities?
- Weinidog, dysgais gan etholwr y bydd datganiad AAA ond yn cael ei lunio ar gyfer plentyn neu berson ifanc yn Abertawe os tybir ei fod 'islaw'r safon' ym mhob categori y caiff ei brofi ynddo. O edrych ar ddata diweddar y cyfrifiad ysgolion blynyddol ar lefel disgyblion, mae'n ymddangos bod yr amharodrwydd hwn i dderbyn rhwymedigaeth i ddarparu cymorth i'w weld mewn awdurdodau eraill. Gan fod teuluoedd yn colli ffydd yn y broses o roi datganiadau, pryd y byddwn yn clywed yr amserlen ar gyfer cynlluniau dysgu unigol a sut y cânt eu cyflwyno fel na all awdurdodau lleol guddio mwyach y tu ôl i'r broses o wneud datganiadau er mwyn osgoi eu cyfrifoldebau?
- 13:42 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Well, I am not aware, Presiding Officer, of the specific points and case that the Member refers to, but, of course, if the Member were to write to me, I would be very willing to look into those issues. As regards the timetable, I can reassure you that my officials and I, given the changes now to the legislative set-up that have been agreed in a cross-party sense across this Chamber, are working flat out to ensure that a stand-alone SEN Bill encompassing these issues is brought forward as soon as is humanly possible.
- Wel, nid wyf yn ymwybodol, Lywydd, o'r pwyntiau na'r achos penodol y mae'r Aelod yn cyfeirio atynt, ond, wrth gwrs, pe bai'r Aelod yn ysgrifennu ataf, byddwn yn barod iawn i edrych ar y materion hynny. O ran yr amserlen, gallaf eich sicrhau bod fy swyddogion a minnau, o ystyried y newidiadau i'r drefn ddeddfwriaethol y cafwyd cytundeb trawsbleidiol arnynt ar draws y Siambr hon, yn gweithio'n ddiflino i sicrhau bod Bil AAA annibynnol sy'n cwmpasu'r materion hyn yn cael ei gyflwyno cyn gynted ag sy'n ymarferol bosibl.
- 13:43 **Lindsay Whittle** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, we know from the latest statistics that expenditure on SEN varies considerably across local authorities in Wales. What action will you be taking to make sure that children with special educational needs in low-spending local authority areas will not be receiving a second-rate or even third-rate education? Also, I would not be forgiven by my daughter if I did not ask how you will ensure that teachers have the skills and resources needed to support them in their tasks.
- Weinidog, gwyddom o'r ystadegau diweddaraf bod gwariant ar AAA yn amrywio'n sylweddol ar draws awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd i wneud yn siŵr na fydd plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig mewn ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol sydd â gwariant isel yn derbyn addysg eilradd neu hyd yn oed drydedd radd? Hefyd, ni fyddai fy merch yn maddau imi pe na fyddwn yn gofyn sut y byddwch yn sicrhau bod gan athrawon y sgiliau a'r adnoddau sydd eu hangen i'w cefnogi yn eu tasgau.
- 13:43 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Well, these issues of consistency will, of course, need to be addressed through what will become, I am sure, a debate of national concern as we move towards the development of the SEN Bill, which we would aim to have on the statute book during this Assembly.
- Wel, wrth gwrs, bydd angen mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn o ran cysondeb drwy'r hyn a ddaw, rwy'n siŵr, yn ddadl o bwys cenedlaethol wrth inni fynd ati i ddatblygu'r Bil AAA, y byddem yn anelu at ei roi ar y llyfr statud yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn.

13:43

**Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, many children with special educational needs also have additional psychological needs that need to be assessed at the same time. However, I have been approached by two constituents in different local authorities who say that the process of liaising between the local authority and the educational psychiatrists has been fraught with difficulties. In one case, they have been passed between psychiatry and psychology for three years now without there being a diagnosis. That child is unable to access school at present, and the situation needs to be addressed. However, will you agree to work with the Minister for health to review the way in which educational psychologists and child psychiatrists work in these complex cases so that children can receive diagnosis and treatment much more quickly?

Weinidog, mae gan lawer o blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig anghenion seicolegol ychwanegol y mae angen eu hasesu ar yr un pryd. Fodd bynnag, mae dau etholwr mewn awdurdodau lleol gwahanol wedi cysylltu â mi i ddweud bod y broses gyswllt rhwng yr awdurdod lleol a'r seiciatryddion addysg wedi bod yn llawn anawsterau. Mewn un achos, maent wedi cael eu trosglwyddo rhwng gwasanaethau seiciatreg a seicoleg ers tair blynedd bellach heb gael diagnosis. Ni all y plentyn hwnnw fynychu ysgol ar hyn o bryd, ac mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, a wnech chi gytuno i weithio gyda'r Gweinidog iechyd er mwyn adolygu'r ffordd y mae seicolegwyr addysg a seiciatryddion plant yn gweithio yn yr achosion cymhleth hyn fel y gall plant gael diagnosis a thriniaeth yn llawer cyflymach?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:44

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

In terms of the individual case that the Member refers to, if she thinks that it might be helpful to write to me with the details of it—it sounds like an untenable situation—I would be more than willing to work with the Minister for health in terms of trying to resolve that particular issue. As we move to a new regime, these overlapping issues of health and educational support services need to be part of the debate, as we formulate our SEN Bill. If there are discussions that raise concerns about wider issues around educational psychology, for instance, then those are also debates that I would welcome during our progress towards that Bill.

O ran yr achos unigol y mae'r Aelod yn cyfeirio ato, os yw hi'n credu y gallai fod yn ddefnyddiol ysgrifennu ataf gyda'r manylion—mae'n swnio fel sefyllfa anghynaliadwy—byddwn yn fwy na pharod i weithio gyda'r Gweinidog iechyd er mwyn ceisio datrys y mater penodol hwnnw. Wrth inni symud at gyfundrefn newydd, mae angen i'r materion hyn sy'n gorgyffwrdd o ran gwasanaethau cymorth addysgol ac iechyd fod yn rhan o'r ddadl, wrth inni lunio ein Bil AAA. Os oes trafodaethau sy'n codi pryderon am faterion ehangach yn ymwneud â seicoleg addysg, er enghraifft, yna mae'r rheini hefyd yn ddadleuon y byddwn yn eu croesawu wrth inni weithio tuag at y Bil hwnnw.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:45

**Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, over the years, a great many children with special educational needs have been very successfully integrated into mainstream schooling. Queen Elizabeth High School in Carmarthen is one such place, and a couple of primary schools in the Powys area that I have visited have also been very good at that kind of objective. Can you ensure that, when we look at the special educational needs provisions of the proposed new Bill, you look at the concept of segregation and centralisation, so that the drive for centralisation and saving money does not end up with young people being segregated and taken away from their mainstream peers? What they need is to be part and parcel of society in the richest possible way.

Weinidog, dros y blynyddoedd, mae llawer iawn o blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig wedi'u hintegreiddio'n llwyddiannus iawn mewn ysgolion prif ffrwd. Mae Ysgol Uwchradd y Frenhines Elizabeth yng Nghaerfyrddin yn un lle o'r fath, ac mae rhai ysgolion cynradd yn ardal Powys yr wyf wedi ymweld â hwy wedi perfformio'n dda iawn o ran y math hwnnw o amcan hefyd. A allwch sicrhau, pan fyddwn yn edrych ar ddarpariaethau anghenion addysgol arbennig y Bil newydd arfaethedig, y byddwch yn ystyried y cysyniad o wahanu a chanoli, fel nad yw'r ymgyrch i ganoli ac arbed arian yn arwain at wahanu pobl ifanc a'u symud oddi wrth eu cyfoedion prif ffrwd? Mae angen iddynt fod yn rhan annatod o'r gymdeithas yn y ffordd gyfoethocaf bosibl.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:46

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Of course I will undertake to have a look at that, and I share your concerns about it. Thus far, in terms of my tenure in this office, I have seen some very good examples even in very tough times, financially speaking, of movement in the other direction. The Vale of Glamorgan is a case in point, showing movement towards integration right from the off, in terms of capital spend on new investment in school buildings. However, I share the Member's concerns, and I would be as concerned as she would be if instances like this were to come to light.

Wrth gwrs y gwnaf ymrwymo i edrych ar hynny, a rhannaf eich pryderon am y peth. Hyd yma, o ran fy nghyfnod yn y swydd hon, rwyf wedi gweld rhai enghreifftiau da iawn hyd yn oed mewn cyfnodau anodd iawn, yn ariannol, o gamau i'r cyfeiriad arall. Mae Bro Morgannwg yn enghraifft o hyn, ac yn cymryd camau i integreiddio o'r cychwyn cyntaf, o ran gwariant cyfalaf ar fuddsoddiad newydd mewn adeiladau ysgol. Fodd bynnag, rhannaf bryderon yr Aelod, a byddwn innau yr un mor bryderus ag y byddai hithau pe bai achosion fel hyn yn dod i'r amlwg.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

- 13:46 **Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Weinidog, mae gwaith seicolegwyr addysgol yn hollbwysig yn y maes hwn. Byddwch yn gwybod ein bod wedi codi dyfodol y cwrs ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd gyda chi o'r blaen, ac rywf yn gwybod eich bod yn edrych i mewn i'r sefyllfa hon. A oes modd i chi ddiweddarau'r Cynulliad ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa hon, fel y mae hi heddiw?
- Minister, the work of educational psychologists is crucial in this area. You will know that we have raised with you in the past the future of the course in Cardiff University, and I know that you are currently looking into the situation. Can you give us an update on this situation, as it currently stands?
- 13:47 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- As best I can, I will. This is a matter of concern for all of us. Cardiff University's doctorate in educational psychology training is a vital piece of educational infrastructure within Wales. It would have implications for the whole nation if the course was to be discontinued. It is primarily the responsibility of the Welsh Local Government Association, speaking on behalf of local government, to resolve this. However, my officials are closely involved in conversations between the WLGA and Cardiff University in an attempt to address the issue. I will be in a position very soon, I think, to give a more substantive update on the situation.
- Gwnaf hynny orau y gallaf. Mae hwn yn fater sy'n peri pryder i bob un ohonom. Mae doethuriaeth Prifysgol Caerdydd mewn hyfforddiant seicoleg addysg yn rhan hanfodol o'r seilwaith addysgol yng Nghymru. Byddai goblygiadau i'r genedl gyfan pe bai'r cwrs yn cael ei ddirwyn i ben. Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, gan siarad ar ran llywodraeth leol, sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am ddatrys hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae fy swyddogion yn cymryd rhan mewn sgysiau rhwng CLILC a Phrifysgol Caerdydd mewn ymgais i fynd i'r afael â'r mater. Credaf y byddaf mewn sefyllfa yn fuan iawn i roi diweddariad mwy pendant ar y sefyllfa.
- 13:48 **Bethan Jenkins** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Weinidog, mae ysgol arbennig Pen-y-Bryn yn Nhreforys wedi gorfod ceisio am ganiatâd cynllunio ar gyfer offer chwaraeon yn yr ysgol na ellir ei ddefnyddio, er bod yr offer hwnnw yno'n barod, am fod cymdogion wedi cwyno i'r cyngor am y ffaith fod yr offer yn difetha eu golygfa. A fydddech yn cytuno y gall meysydd chwarae o'r math hwn fod yn eithriadol o bwysig o ran helpu pobl ifanc? A fydddech yn fodlon ysgrifennu at Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe i geisio mynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa hon, sef bod yr ysgol yn ceisio datblygu athrawon ond yn cael eu hatal gan bobl leol oherwydd y gŵyn benodol honno, ac i ddweud na fydd hyn yn dderbyniol yn y dyfodol?
- Minister, Pen-y-Bryn special school in Morriston has had to apply for planning permission for sports equipment in the school that it cannot use, even though the equipment is there already, because neighbours have complained to the council that the equipment affects their view. Would you agree that playing fields such as this can be extremely important in helping young people? Would you be willing to write to the City and Council of Swansea to try to address the situation, namely that the school is trying to develop its teachers but is being stopped by local people because of this specific complaint, and to say that this is not acceptable in the future?
- 13:48 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Well, as I have said already this afternoon, I am not aware of the particular instance that the Member brings to light. That is not to say that what you suggest is not a legitimate thing to do. However, if the Member were to write to me with the specifics of her concerns, I would be more than happy to ask officials to take a look at the situation. Of course, school playing fields are tremendously important, and we would like to see them used.
- Wel, fel y dywedais eisoes y prynhawn yma, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r achos penodol y mae'r Aelod yn cyfeirio ato. Nid yw hynny i ddweud nad yw'r hyn yr ydych yn ei awgrymu yn beth dilys i'w wneud. Fodd bynnag, pe bai'r Aelod yn ysgrifennu ataf gyda manylion ei phryderon, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i ofyn i swyddogion edrych ar y sefyllfa. Wrth gwrs, mae meysydd chwarae ysgolion yn hynod o bwysig, a byddem yn hoffi eu gweld yn cael eu defnyddio.
- 13:49 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Question 4, OAQ(4)0374(ESK), has been withdrawn. Mae cwestiwn 4, OAQ(4)0374(ESK), wedi cael ei dynnu'n ôl.

## Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr

## Workers' Educational Association

- 13:49 **Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- 5. Pa gynnydd y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei ragweld o ran addysgu oedolion yn y gymuned, yn dilyn uno Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr yn y de a'r gogledd? OAQ(4)0371(ESK)*
- 5. What progress does the Minister foresee in the teaching of adults in the community, following the merger of the Workers' Educational Association in South Wales and North Wales? OAQ(4)0371(ESK)*



- 13:49 **Kenneth Skates** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
*Y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau a Thechnoleg / The Deputy Minister for Skills and Technology*  
 Mae'r coleg newydd WEA Cymru yn anelu at gynyddu ei ddarpariaeth ar gyfer dysgu oedolion. Rhagwelir y bydd niferoedd y dysgwyr sy'n oedolion yn cynyddu o 14,000 i 21,000 yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Mae WEA Cymru yn parhau i ganolbwyntio ar ddarparu ail gyfleoedd dysgu i oedolion, naill ai yn eu cymunedau neu yn y gweithle.  
 The new college WEA Cymru aims to increase its provision for adult learning. Adult learner numbers are forecast to increase from 14,000 to 21,000 learners during this financial year. WEA Cymru remains focused on providing second-chance learning to adults in either their community or in the workplace.
- 13:50 **Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ateb mewn Cymraeg rugl, sy'n profi gwerth addysg i oedolion. A yw'n gweld y bydd rôl darparwr arweiniol mewn dysgu gan oedolion yn syrthio i WEA Cymru, gan gynnig maes llafur yn cynnwys astudiaethau rhyddfrydig, yn ogystal â sgiliau cyflogadwyedd a lles i'r unigolion?  
 I would like to thank the Minister for his answer in fluent Welsh, which proves the importance of adult education. Does he anticipate that the lead provider in adult learning role will fall to WEA Cymru, providing a curriculum that includes liberal studies, as well as employability and wellbeing skills for individuals?
- 13:50 **Kenneth Skates** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 I thank the Member and assure him that my Welsh language is not yet fluent, though I am trying. I apologise if my pronunciation is not quite accurate.  
 Diolch i'r Aelod a gallaf ei sicrhau nad wyf yn rhugl yn Gymraeg eto, er fy mod yn ymdrechu. Ymddiheuraf os nad yw fy ynganiad yn berffaith gywir.  
 I will go over some of the points on the merger. It will provide more influence—there is no doubt about that—on the emerging shape of all post-16 community and workplace learning. In that respect, it is very positive. It will be able to offer key responsibility and influence. It will also have a turnover of £10 million, which will mean that it is sustainable for the future and has strength through scale.  
 Trafodaf rai o'r pwyntiau ynglŷn â'r uno. Bydd yn cael mwy o ddylanwad—nid oes amheuaeth am hynny—ar ffurf newydd yr holl ddarpariaeth dysgu ôl-16 yn y gymuned a dysgu yn y gweithle. Yn hynny o beth, mae'n gadarnhaol iawn. Gall hefyd gynnig cyfrifoldeb a dylanwad allweddol. Bydd ganddo hefyd drosiant o £10 miliwn, a fydd yn golygu y bydd yn gynaliadwy i'r dyfodol a'i fod yn gryf oherwydd ei faint.
- Comisiwn Williams** **Williams Commission**
- 13:51 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
*6. Pa asesiad y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ei wneud o'r effaith y bydd argymhellion Comisiwn Williams yn ei chael ar gonsortia addysg? OAQ(4)0372(ESK)*  
*6. What assessment has the Welsh Government made of the impact the Williams Commission recommendations will have on education consortia? OAQ(4)0372(ESK)*
- 13:51 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 It is, and should be, business as usual, although there may, in future, be a need to look at consortia boundaries. Local authorities have a job to do in implementing the national model for regional working and raising standards. The Williams report should not be a distraction or an excuse to slow down.  
 Mae'n fater o fusnes fel arfer, fel y dylai fod, ond efallai, yn y dyfodol, y bydd angen edrych ar ffiniau'r consortia. Mae gan awdurdodau lleol waith i'w wneud i weithredu'r model cenedlaethol ar gyfer gweithio rhanbarthol a chodi safonau. Ni ddylai adroddiad Williams dynnu sylw oddi ar hynny ac ni ddylai fod yn esgus i arafu chwaith.
- 13:51 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 Thank you for that answer. It is early days, but we heard how the Estyn annual report criticised the variation of governance and delivery across the regional consortia. The Williams commission itself recommends merging local authorities in a way that sits differently from those regional consortia. Is this Williams hinting that consortia are not the way forward to improve the delivery of education in Wales?  
 Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw. Mae'n gynnar, ond clywsom sut yr oedd adroddiad blynyddol Estyn wedi beirniadu'r amrywiadau o ran llywodraethu a darpariaeth ar draws y consortia rhanbarthol. Mae comisiwn Williams ei hun yn argymhell y dylid uno awdurdodau lleol mewn ffordd wahanol i'r consortia rhanbarthol hynny. A yw Williams yn awgrymu nad y consortia yw'r ffordd i wella darpariaeth addysg yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol?

- 13:52 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- No, that is not my reading of Williams at all. The Williams report does not challenge any of the options contained in the Hill review, for instance. In my reading of the Williams report, I see that there is an acknowledgement that there are no real substantial issues with education and education consortia. I cannot see where the Member has picked up that interpretation of what Williams has to say.
- Na, nid dyna fy nehongliad i o adroddiad Williams o gwbl. Nid yw adroddiad Williams yn herio unrhyw un o'r dewisiadau yn adolygiad Hill, er enghraifft. Ar ôl darllen adroddiad Williams, gwelaf ei fod yn cydnabod nad oes unrhyw faterion sylweddol gwirioneddol o ran addysg a chonsortia addysg. Ni allaf weld sut mae'r Aelod wedi dehongli'r hyn sydd gan Williams i'w ddweud yn y ffordd honno.
- 13:52 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I call on Simon Thomas, the Plaid Cymru spokesperson.
- Galwaf ar Simon Thomas, llefarydd Plaid Cymru.
- 13:52 **Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Weinidog, roedd yn dda gennyf glywed yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud ynglŷn â'r neges i'r consortia lleol na ddylent oedi gan ddisgwyl bod Williams yn mynd i newid y drefn iddynt. Wedi dweud hynny, rydych yn gwybod bod yn rhaid i'r consortia fod yn gwbl weithredol erbyn diwedd mis Mawrth; rydych wedi datgan hynny sawl gwaith yn y Siambr. A fedrwrch roi sicrhad inni eich bod yn hyderus y bydd hyn yn digwydd?
- Minister, I was pleased to hear what you just said in relation to the message to the local consortia that there should be no delay in the expectation that Williams is going to change the regime for them. Having said that, you will know that the consortia have to be fully operational by the end of March; you have made that made that clear many times in the Chamber. Can you give us an assurance that you are confident that that will be the case?
- 13:53 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Yes, I can. We have worked together with local government, the regional consortia, headteachers and education experts in the construction of the national model for regional working that I have talked about. I approved the model back in December and this week we are rolling out the national model to the regions through a number of engagement events that involve hundreds of professionals—I believe 700 up until today. Only yesterday, there were positive discussions at the Liberty Stadium, as we move towards implementation by 1 April.
- Gallaf. Rydym wedi cydweithio â llywodraeth leol, y consortia rhanbarthol, penaethiaid ac arbenigwyr addysg i lunio'r model cenedlaethol ar gyfer gwaith rhanbarthol yr wyf wedi sôn amdano. Cymeradwyais y model ym mis Rhagfyr a'r wythnos hon rydym yn cyflwyno'r model cenedlaethol i'r rhanbarthau drwy nifer o ddigwyddiadau ymgysylltu sy'n cynnwys cannoedd o weithwyr proffesiynol—700 hyd at heddiw, fe gredaf. Dim ond ddoe, cafwyd trafodaethau cadarnhaol yn Stadiwm Liberty, wrth inni anelu at weithredu erbyn 1 Ebrill.
- 13:53 **Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I thank the Minister for that reply. I very much look forward to seeing the new consortia being fully operational. As has already been mentioned, the Williams report itself suggests a configuration that would seem, on the face of it, to cut across some of the existing joint operational working—for example, between Ceredigion and Powys. In that context, and following on from Williams, is it your view, Minister, that the new local education authorities should be the 10, 11 or 12 new authorities, or should those powers now be vested in the consortia? Is this an opportunity to get regional education authorities for Wales?
- Diolch i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Edrychaf ymlaen yn fawr at weld y consortia newydd yn gwbl weithredol. Fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes, mae adroddiad Williams ei hun yn awgrymu cyfluniad sy'n ymddangos, ar yr olwg gyntaf, fel pe bai'n torri ar draws rhai o'r trefniadau cydweithio presennol—er enghraifft, rhwng Ceredigion a Phowys. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, ac yn dilyn adroddiad Williams, a ydych o'r farn, Weinidog, y dylai'r awdurdodau addysg lleol newydd fod yn seiliedig ar y 10, 11 neu 12 awdurdod newydd, neu a ddylai'r pwerau hynny gael eu breinio yn awr yn y consortia? A yw hwn yn gyfle i sefydlu awdurdodau addysg rhanbarthol yng Nghymru?
- 13:54 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- It really is too early in the debate to make pronouncements like that, one way or the other. It is clear that there are some interesting issues thrown up by the suggested boundaries that Williams has presented us with. However, let us remember that Williams was only published 24 hours ago. There is a lot to digest in that regard. One thing is clear—for the medium term, at least, we have a system that I am confident will deliver, and we need to make it operational as quickly as possible.
- Mae wir yn rhy gynnar yn y ddadl i wneud datganiadau fel yna, un ffordd neu'r llall. Mae'n amlwg bod y ffiniau y mae Williams wedi'u hawgrymi inni yn codi rhai materion diddorol. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni gofio mai dim ond 24 awr yn ôl y cyhoeddwyd adroddiad Williams. Mae llawer i'w ystyried yn hynny o beth. Mae un peth yn glir—ar gyfer y tymor canolig, o leiaf, mae gennym system yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd yn cyflawni, ac mae angen inni ei rhoi ar waith cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

13:55	<p><b>Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>I call on Aled Roberts, the Welsh Liberal Democrat spokesperson.</p>	<p>Galwaf ar Aled Roberts, llefarydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
13:55	<p><b>Aled Roberts</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Weinidog, mae'n bwysig nad yw mwy o ansicrwydd yn creu problemau o ran y dasg o godi ansawdd dysgu yng Nghymru. Hoffwn eich cyfeirio at adroddiad Estyn ddoe, a oedd yn sôn am un awdurdod nad oedd yn cydweithio gyda'i gonsortium rhanbarthol, yn dilyn arolwg eleni. Hefyd, mewn awdurdod arall, nid oedd y consortiwm wedi dechrau ei waith ynglŷn â gwella dysgu mewn ysgolion. A ydych yn ymwybodol o ba awdurdodau yw'r rheiny? Pa gamau ydych chi wedi eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon?</p>	<p>Minister, it is important that more insecurity does not create problems in terms of the task of raising the quality of teaching in Wales. I want to refer you to yesterday's Estyn report, which mentioned one authority that was not co-operating with its regional consortium, following this year's inspection. Also, in another authority, the consortium had not started its work in terms of improving teaching within schools. Are you aware of which authorities those are? What steps have you taken to address this problem?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
13:55	<p><b>Huw Lewis</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Of course, the Estyn report is for 2012-13, and the annual report refers to things that are 12 months in the past. Those problems that Aled Roberts has referred to were, of course, very real, and they were the motivating factor behind the shift towards a national model. All 22 local education authorities will co-operate with the national model, because the finance, apart from anything else, will flow through that model. There is not really any wriggle room in that regard.</p>	<p>Wrth gwrs, mae adroddiad Estyn yn ymwneud â 2012-13, ac mae'r adroddiad blynyddol yn cyfeirio at bethau sydd 12 mis yn y gorffennol. Roedd y problemau hynny y cyfeiriodd Aled Roberts atynt yn real iawn, wrth gwrs, a'r problemau hynny wnaeth ysgogi'r newid i fodel cenedlaethol. Bydd pob un o'r 22 o awdurdodau addysg lleol yn cydweithredu â'r model cenedlaethol, oherwydd bydd y cyllid, ar wahân i unrhyw beth arall, yn llifo drwy'r model hwnnw. Nid oes unrhyw ffordd o osgoi hynny mewn gwirionedd.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
13:56	<p><b>Aled Roberts</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Mae nifer ohonom yn pryderu ynglŷn â'r swyddi sydd dal i fod yn wag o fewn y consortia, yn cynnwys rhai swyddi ar lefel uwch swyddog, heb sôn am rai swyddi ar lefel cyngorwr pynciau o fewn gwahanol adrannau. Pa gamau fydd y Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd os bydd anhawster parhaol ynglŷn â llenwi swyddi o fewn y consortia?</p>	<p>A number of us are concerned about the jobs that are still vacant within the consortia, including some jobs at a senior official level, as well as some jobs at a subject adviser level within different departments. What steps will the Government take if there are lasting difficulties in filling these vacancies within the consortia?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
13:56	<p><b>Huw Lewis</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>No urgent problems regarding vacancies have been brought to my attention thus far. I will take the Member's concerns to my officials and do a quick audit of where we are in each consortium area and write to him with the conclusions of that.</p>	<p>Nid oes unrhyw broblemau brys ynghylch swyddi gwag wedi cael eu dwyn i'm sylw hyd yn hyn. Byddaf yn trosglwyddo pryderon yr Aelod i'm swyddogion ac yn cynnal archwiliad cyflym i weld ble yr ydym arni yn ardal pob consortiwm ac yn ysgrifennu ato gyda chasgliadau hynny.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
13:57	<p><b>Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>I call on Angela Burns, the opposition spokesperson.</p>	<p>Galwaf ar Angela Burns, llefarydd yr wrthblaid.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
13:57	<p><b>Angela Burns</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Minister, both Williams and Hill refer to the importance of leadership within regional consortia. What are you doing to monitor whether the consortia that are set up in March are able not just to be a pattern set in stone, but are able to offer strong leadership?</p>	<p>Weinidog, mae Williams a Hill yn cyfeirio at bwysigrwydd arweinyddiaeth o fewn consortia rhanbarthol. Beth ydych yn ei wneud i fonitro p'un a all y consortia a sefydlir ym mis Mawrth fod yn fwy na phatrwm digyfnawid, ac y gallant gynnig arweinyddiaeth gref?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>

- 13:57 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Yes, this is a critical factor and the Member is quite right to point to it. We will, of course, have the need to recruit the very best people at the forefront of our minds. In addition, there will be an advisory group acting at a national level, working alongside those regional consortia—again, made up of the very best people who we can find.
- Ydy, mae hwn yn ffactor allweddol ac mae'r Aelod yn hollol iawn i dynnu sylw ato. Wrth gwrs, bydd yr angen i recriwtio'r bobl orau bosibl yn flaenoriaeth inni. Yn ogystal, bydd grŵp cynghori yn gweithredu ar lefel genedlaethol, gan weithio ochr yn ochr â'r consortia rhanbarthol hynny—ac unwaith eto, bydd y grŵp hwn yn cynnwys y bobl orau y gallwn ddod o hyd iddynt.
- 13:57 **Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I am delighted to hear that. Of course, leadership needs to cascade down, and I wonder whether that group might also look at the possibility of opening the Master's up to older teachers in order to help increase their leadership skills? They are the people who need to be the senior team leaders in any individual school.
- Rwy'n falch iawn o glywed hynny. Wrth gwrs, mae angen i arweinyddiaeth raeadru i lawr, a thybed a allai'r grŵp hwnnw hefyd edrych ar y posibilrwydd o gynnig y rhaglen gradd Meistr i athrawon hŷn er mwyn helpu i gynyddu eu sgiliau arwain? Nhw yw'r bobl a ddylai fod yn uwch arweinwyr tîm mewn unrhyw ysgol unigol.
- 13:58 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- We do have the national leadership development board, of course, which will be working alongside senior teachers and those who aspire to senior positions across Wales. The leadership board has only recently begun its work and is, again, made up of very accomplished individuals who are very motivated to raise aspirations and capabilities as regards leadership.
- Mae gennym y bwrdd datblygu arweinyddiaeth cenedlaethol, wrth gwrs, a fydd yn gweithio ochr yn ochr ag uwch athrawon a'r rhai sy'n anelu at swyddi uwch ledled Cymru. Dim ond newydd ddechrau ar ei waith y mae'r bwrdd arweinyddiaeth ac, unwaith eto, mae'n cynnwys unigolion medrus iawn sy'n llawn cymhellant i godi dyheadau a gwella galluoedd ym maes arweinyddiaeth.
- On the Master's programme, we have great aspirations as to opening it up, for all sorts of reasons, and, perhaps, in more directions than one. We are constrained by resources in very tough times, and are running at the very edge of our capabilities in terms of resources at the moment as regards the Master's programme. However, I do have great ambitions for the Master's programme, and I am always willing to listen to arguments about priorities for future spend.
- O ran y rhaglen gradd Meistr, rydym yn awyddus iawn i'w chynnig ar raddfa ehangach, am bob math o resymau, ac, efallai, mewn mwy nag un cyfeiriad. Cawn ein cyfyngu gan adnoddau mewn cyfnod anodd iawn, ac rydym yn ymestyn ein galluoedd o ran adnoddau i'r eithaf ar hyn o bryd o safbwynt y rhaglen Gradd Meistr. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf uchelgeisiau mawr ar gyfer y rhaglen Gradd Meistr, ac rwyf bob amser yn barod i wrando ar ddadleuon ynghylch blaenoriaethau ar gyfer gwariant yn y dyfodol.
- Cwricwlwm Cymreig** **Cwricwlwm Cymreig**
- 13:59 **Alun Ffred Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- 7. A wnaiff y Gweinidog adrodd ar y cynnydd yn ei ymateb i'r Adolygiad o'r Cwricwlwm Cymreig, hanes a stori Cymru? OAQ(4)0367(ESK)*
- 7. Will the Minister report on progress towards making his response to the Review of the Cwricwlwm Cymreig, history and the story of Wales? OAQ(4)367(ESK)*
- 13:59 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I thank the Member for Arfon. The report from the review group made a number of important and wide-reaching recommendations, the majority of which I am considering as part of the second phase of the review of assessment and the national curriculum.
- Diolch i'r Aelod dros Arfon. Gwnaeth adroddiad y grŵp adolygu nifer o argymhellion pwysig a phellgyrhaeddol, ac rwy'n ystyried y mwyafrif ohonynt fel rhan o ail gam yr adolygiad o drefniadau asesu a'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol.
- 13:59 **Alun Ffred Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Diolch yn fawr, ond nid yw hynny'n awgrymu bod cynnydd wedi bod. Mae'n gywilydd—a gofynnaf ichi gytuno neu anghytuno â mi—bod llawer o blant Cymru yn gadael yr ysgol heb glywed fawr ddim am hanes a stori Cymru. Yn wir, gallwch astudio llenyddiaeth Saesneg yng Nghymru heb wybod bod y fath bobl â Dylan Thomas, R.S. Thomas, heb sôn am Owen Sheers, wedi bodoli erioed. A ydy'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu creu cwricwlwm a fydd yn adlewyrchu Cymru a'r byd?
- Thank you very much, but that does not suggest that there has been any progress. It is a disgrace—and I ask you to agree or disagree with me—that many Welsh children leave school without knowing much at all about the history and story of Wales. Indeed, you can study English literature in Wales without knowing that individuals such as Dylan Thomas, R.S. Thomas, not to mention Owen Sheers, had ever existed. Does the Government intend to create a curriculum that reflects Wales and the world?

14:00

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I think that the Member uses pejorative terms in quite a liberal sense here and quite unfairly. The group chaired by Dr Elin Jones produced, in my view, an extremely thought-provoking look at the situation as regards the Curriculum Cymreig in Wales. Perhaps many of the latter comments that the Member for Arfon has made are well-aimed barbs. There are issues, which I accept, around what is delivered through the curriculum to our young people in terms of understanding and comprehension, and a pride in a sense of place.

In putting Dr Elin Jones's conclusions, however, into the second phase of the curriculum review, there is no question of delay or in any way putting this on the back burner. This underlines the importance that I ascribe to the conclusions that Dr Elin Jones came to. This needs to be part and parcel of the most significant curriculum reform that Wales has ever seen. Phase 2 of the national curriculum review will, essentially, herald the very first bespoke, made-in-Wales-for-Wales curriculum. This is quite a historic step forward in terms of Welsh educational history. The Curriculum Cymreig will be right there at the centre of everyone's concerns as we rewrite that curriculum to suit Wales's young people.

Credaf fod yr Aelod yn defnyddio termau difriol mewn ystyr eithaf rhyddfrydol yma ac yn eithaf annheg. Mae'r grŵp, sy'n cael ei gadeirio gan Dr Elin Jones, wedi llunio, yn fy marn i, ddarlun o sefyllfa'r Cwricwlwm Cymreig yng Nghymru sy'n ysgogi'r meddwl cryn dipyn. Efallai bod llawer o'r sylwadau diwethaf a wnaed gan yr Aelod dros Arfon yn feirniadaethau crafog. Derbyniad fod yna broblemau o ran yr hyn a gyflwynir drwy gyfrwng y cwricwlwm i'n pobl ifanc o ran dealltwriaeth, a balchder mewn ymdeimlad o le.

Fodd bynnag, wrth gynnwys casgliadau Dr Elin Jones yn ail gam yr adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm, mae'n sicr na fydd unrhyw oedi ac na chaiff y mater hwn ei roi o'r neilltu mewn unrhyw ffordd. Mae hyn yn tanlinellu'r pwysigrwydd a briodolaf i gasgliadau Dr Elin Jones. Mae angen i hyn fod yn rhan annatod o'r diwygiad mwyaf sylweddol i'r cwricwlwm a welwyd erioed yng Nghymru. Yn ei hanfod, bydd cam 2 yr adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn rhagflaenu'r cwricwlwm pwrpasol cyntaf erioed a wnaed yng Nghymru i Gymru. Mae hwn yn gam eithaf hanesyddol ymlaen o ran hanes addysg yng Nghymru. Bydd y Cwricwlwm Cymreig yno yn ganolog i ystyriaethau pawb wrth inni ailysgrifennu'r cwricwlwm hwnnw er mwyn gweddu i bobl ifanc Cymru.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:01

**Leighton Andrews** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, one of the areas of history that young people will have the opportunity to think about over the next few years is the history of the engagement of Wales with the first world war. Today, we launched [www.rhonddaremembers.com](http://www.rhonddaremembers.com), and I encourage you to visit it, obviously. Would you agree that there are some excellent resources there for schools, not least on the department's own Hwb website, but also new resources just produced by the Royal British Legion?

Weinidog, un o'r meysydd hanes y bydd pobl ifanc yn cael y cyfle i feddwl amdano dros y blynyddoedd nesaf yw hanes cysylltiad Cymru â'r rhyfel byd cyntaf. Heddiw, lanswyd [www.rhonddaremembers.com](http://www.rhonddaremembers.com), ac fe'ch anogaf i ymweld â'r wefan, yn amlwg. A fydddech yn cytuno bod rhai adnoddau gwych ar gael i ysgolion, nid yn unig ar wefan Hwb yr adran ei hun, ond hefyd yr adnoddau newydd a gynhyrchwyd yn ddiweddar gan y Llenng Brydeinig Frenhinol?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:02

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I do agree with that. I noted with interest the Member for the Rhondda's very interesting newspaper article today about these issues, where he points to the wealth of resources that teachers and schools can now take advantage of, in terms of the very important 2014 centenary commemoration of world war one. I would like to take the opportunity, on behalf of the Welsh educational establishment, if you like, to thank Deian Hopkin and the team for the marvellous piece of work that they did, alongside the National Library of Wales, in terms of developing the story of Wales as it relates to the first world war.

Cytunaf â hynny. Yn y papur newydd heddiw, darllenais gyda diddordeb erthygl ddiddorol iawn gan yr Aelod dros Rhondda ar y materion hyn, lle mae'n cyfeirio at y cyfoeth o adnoddau y gall athrawon ac ysgolion fanteisio arnynt yn awr, o ran digwyddiadau pwysig iawn 2014 i goffâu canmlwyddiant y rhyfel byd cyntaf. Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle, ar ran y sefydliad addysgol yng Nghymru, os mynnwch, i ddiolch i Deian Hopkin a'r tîm am y darn gwych o waith a wnaethant, ochr yn ochr â Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru, i ddatblygu stori Cymru mewn perthynas â'r rhyfel byd cyntaf.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:03

**Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Weinidog, wrth sôn am adnoddau, mae rhai o'r argymhellion a gyflwynwyd gan y grŵp adolygu yn ymwneud â pholisiau addysg Cadw a'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i ysgolion ac athrawon. Er bod Cadw yn darparu rhywfaint o ddeunydd addysgol, mae wedi paratoi nodiadau addysg ar ddim ond pump o safleoedd yn ei ofal. A ydych yn hapus gyda'r ddarpariaeth gyfyngedig hon?

Minister, in mentioning resources, some of the recommendations put forward by the review group relate to Cadw's educational policies and the resources available to schools and teachers. Although Cadw does provide some educational material, it has provided educational notes on only five sites in its care. Are you content with this limited provision?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

- 14:03 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- No, and, in my previous role, this was something that I made clear to Cadw. Cadw was very ready to agree that there was a great deal of development that needed to be undertaken in terms of Cadw as an educational vehicle, if you like, as well as an organisation that conserves and protects our heritage. I am looking forward very much to the final conclusions of Baroness Kay Andrews's review of this area of work, and the crossover with education will be of great interest and concern to me.
- Nac ydw, ac, yn fy rôl flaenorol, roedd hyn yn rhywbeth a fynegais yn glir i Cadw. Roedd Cadw yn barod iawn i gytuno bod llawer o waith i'w wneud er mwyn datblygu Cadw fel cyfrwng addysgol, os mynnwch, yn ogystal â sefydliad sy'n diogelu ac yn amddiffyn ein treftadaeth. Edrychaf ymlaen yn fawr iawn at gasgliadau terfynol adolygiad y Farwnes Kay Andrews o'r maes gwaith hwn, a bydd y gorgyffwrdd gydag addysg o ddiddordeb a phwys mawr imi.
- 14:04 **William Powell** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, earlier this week, I attended the national Holocaust commemoration at city hall, and this included a poignant address by the renowned Welsh author Heini Gruffudd, who spoke about the experiences of his own family under fascist oppression, and how the family found sanctuary in Wales. In the context of that, and given the work of the Holocaust Memorial Day Trust, would you undertake to consider incorporating into the Curriculum Cymreig some of the experiences of Welsh victims and survivors of the Holocaust, so that future generations may learn from the past?
- Weinidog, yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, mynychais y digwyddiad cenedlaethol i goffáu'r Holocaust yn neuadd y ddinas, ac yn ystod y digwyddiad cafwyd anerchiad dirdynnol gan yr awdur Cymreig adnabyddus Heini Gruffudd, a siaradodd am brofiadau ei deulu ei hun o dan ormes ffasgaidd, a sut y daeth y teulu o hyd i loches yng Nghymru. Yng nghyd-destun hynny, ac o ystyried gwaith Ymddiriedolaeth Diwrnod Cofio'r Holocaust, a fydddech yn ymrwymo i ystyried cynnwys rhai o brofiadau dioddefwyr a goroeswyr yr Holocaust yng Nghymru yn y Cwricwlwm Cymreig, fel y gall cenedlaethau'r dyfodol ddysgu oddi wrth y gorffennol?
- 14:04 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- A very thought-provoking suggestion, I think, which, of course, I would be willing to consider. The Curriculum Cymreig, and the discussion that we will have around it as we roll out phase 2 of the curriculum review, will, I hope, take a very inclusive view of Welshness and the lived experiences of people who have been born or who have lived all or a part of their lives in Wales, and the role of Wales in the great sweep of history and those great events, such as the Holocaust, which we commemorate every year. So, yes, I will undertake to consider that.
- Credaf fod yr awgrym hwnnw yn ysgogi'r meddwl ac yn un y byddem yn barod i'w ystyried, wrth gwrs. Gobeithio y bydd y Cwricwlwm Cymreig, a'r drafodaeth a gawn yn ei gylch yn ystod cam 2 o'r adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm, yn edrych mewn ffordd gynhwysol iawn ar Gymreictod a phrofiadau bywyd pobl sydd wedi cael eu geni neu sydd wedi byw drwy gydol eu hoes neu am ran o'u hoes yng Nghymru, a rôl Cymru mewn hanes a'r digwyddiadau mawr hynny, megis yr Holocaust, yr ydym yn eu coffáu bob blwyddyn. Felly, rwy'n addo i ystyried hynny.
- Darpariaeth Ôl-16 yn Nhorfaen** **Post-16 Provision in Torfaen**
- 14:05 **Lynne Neagle** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- 8. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am drafodaethau rhwng Coleg Gwent a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Torfaen ynglyn â darpariaeth ôl-16? OAQ(4)0381(ESK)*
- 8. Will the Minister provide an update on discussions between Coleg Gwent and Torfaen County Borough Council regarding post-16 education? OAQ(4)0381(ESK)*
- 14:05 **Kenneth Skates** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- The local authority and Coleg Gwent are working together to achieve the best possible outcome for the learners of Torfaen and have agreed many common goals. I look forward to meeting with you and all other interested parties in early February to discuss the most appropriate solution for the area.
- Mae'r awdurdod lleol a Choleg Gwent yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i sicrhau'r canlyniad gorau posibl ar gyfer dysgwyr Torfaen ac wedi cytuno ar nifer o nodau cyffredin. Edrychaf ymlaen at gwrdd â chi a phawb arall sydd â diddordeb yn gynnar ym mis Chwefror i drafod yr ateb mwyaf priodol ar gyfer yr ardal.

- 14:05 **Lynne Neagle** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thank you, Deputy Minister. I know that you are very well aware of my long-standing concerns about lack of A-level provision in north Torfaen. I am very grateful that you have agreed to meet with me and with key stakeholders to try to progress this. Would you agree with me, Deputy Minister, that the recent joint letter setting out common ground between the parties involved was very encouraging, and do you share my hope that there might finally be a light at the end of the tunnel when it comes to resolving this long-standing iniquity for my constituents?
- Diolch ichi, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol iawn o'm pryderon hirsefydlog ynghylch diffyg darpariaeth Safon Uwch yng ngogledd Torfaen. Rwy'n ddiolchgar iawn eich bod wedi cytuno i gyfarfod â mi a rhanddeiliaid allweddol er mwyn ceisio symud y mater hwn yn ei flaen. A fydddech yn cytuno â mi, Ddirprwy Weinidog, fod y llythyr ar y cyd diweddar a nododd dir cyffredin rhwng y partion dan sylw yn galonogol iawn, ac a ydych yn rhannu fy ngobaith fod goleuni ym mhen draw'r twnnel o ran datrys yr annhegwch hirsefydlog hwn i'm hetholwyr?
- 14:06 **Kenneth Skates** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Yes, I do agree. May I put on record my thanks to you for the energy and the work that you have given to this subject area? I am sure that the people of Torfaen are very grateful. The letter that you referred to, which was signed by both the chief executive of Torfaen County Borough Council and the college confirms that they have determined that a unified tertiary system is the best future option for the learners of Torfaen. In the same letter, the chief executive and the principal confirmed joint preference in terms of delivery options. I now look forward to meeting with you and them on 10 February.
- Cytunaf. A gaf ddiolch ichi ar goedd am eich egni a'r gwaith a wnaethoch yn y maes pwnc hwn? Rwy'n siŵr bod pobl Torfaen yn ddiolchgar iawn. Mae'r llythyr y cyfeiriasoch ato, a lofnodwyd gan brif weithredwr Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Torfaen a'r coleg, yn cadarnhau eu bod wedi penderfynu mai system drydyddol unedig yw'r dewis gorau yn y dyfodol ar gyfer dysgwyr Torfaen. Yn yr un llythyr, cadarnhaodd y prif weithredwr a'r pennaeth ffafriaeth ar y cyd o ran opsiynau cyflenwi. Edrychaf ymlaen yn awr at gwrrd â chi a hwy ar 10 Chwefror.
- 14:07 **William Graham** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Deputy Minister, you will be well aware of the independent report by the Tribal consultancy into the particular matter to which you have referred. Would you outline your department's suggestions for the implications for funding of what is a major provision of a new campus in Cwmbran town centre?
- Ddirprwy Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol iawn o'r adroddiad annibynnol gan ymgynghoriaeth Tribal ar y mater penodol yr ydych wedi cyfeirio ato. A wnewch chi amlinellu awgrymiadau eich adran o ran y goblygiadau ar gyfer ariannu'r gwaith sylweddol hwn i sefydlu campws newydd yng nghanol tref Cwmbrân?
- 14:07 **Kenneth Skates** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thank you, William Graham. I will be happy to discuss any potential capital build plans with all parties in that meeting in February.
- Diolch, William Graham. Byddaf yn hapus i drafod unrhyw gynlluniau adeiladu cyfalaf posibl gyda phob parti yn y cyfarfod hwnnw ym mis Chwefror.
- 14:07 **Jocelyn Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- There is a proposal to deny travel passes to some post-16 pupils within the Coleg Gwent area. I wonder, Deputy Minister, how you feel about that proposal.
- Mae cynnig i wrthod rhoi tocynnau teithio i rai disgyblion ôl-16 yn ardal Coleg Gwent. Tybed, Ddirprwy Weinidog, beth yw eich barn chi ar y cynnig hwnnw.
- 14:07 **Kenneth Skates** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- This is a matter that the Member for Torfaen has also raised with me. It is an issue that I will be raising with the interested parties.
- Mae hwn yn fater y mae'r Aelod dros Dorfaen wedi'i godi gyda mi hefyd. Mae'n fater y byddaf yn ei godi gyda'r partion sydd â diddordeb.

## Cymraeg fel Ail Iaith

## Welsh as a Second Language

- 14:08 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
9. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am addysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith? OAQ(4)0373(ESK)
9. Will the Minister provide an update on the teaching of Welsh as a second language? OAQ(4)0373(ESK)

- 14:08 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I am committed to improving Welsh provision in English-medium schools. The radical changes needed to overhaul Welsh as a second language need developing in the context of wider curriculum change. Welsh second language teaching and learning will be considered during phase two of the review of assessment and the curriculum in Wales.
- Rwy'n ymrwymedig i wella'r ddarpariaeth Gymraeg mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg. Mae angen i'r newidiadau radical sydd eu hangen i ailwampio Cymraeg fel ail iaith gael eu datblygu yng nghyd-destun newidiadau i'r cwricwlwm ehangach. Caiff addysgu a dysgu Cymraeg ail iaith eu hystyried yn ystod ail gam yr adolygiad o drefniadau asesu a'r cwricwlwm yng Nghymru.
- 14:08 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I am relieved by that answer, Minister. The second-language short GCSE course has pretty much lost its credibility, and I am very keen to understand the other ways that you are considering to promote Welsh language skills and their informal use in English-medium schools for those pupils who choose not to take the full GCSE second-language Welsh. Will you be in a position before the finalisation of your curriculum review to give us some indication of the way that you are thinking on this?
- Rwy'n falch o glywed yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Mae'r cwrs ail iaith TGAU byr wedi colli ei hygredd yn llwyr bron, ac rwy'n awyddus iawn i ddeall y ffyrdd eraill yr ydych yn eu hystyried o hyrwyddo sgiliau iaith Gymraeg a'u defnydd anffurfiol mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg ar gyfer y disgyblion hynny sy'n dewis peidio â chymryd y TGAU Cymraeg ail iaith llawn. A fyddwch mewn sefyllfa cyn cwblhau eich adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm i roi rhyw awgrym inni o'ch syniadau ar hyn?
- 14:08 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I can tell the Member for South Wales West that thinking is under development at the moment. She is quite right, and I acknowledge and share her concern—we have issues to resolve when it comes to the provision of Welsh as a second language in English-medium schools. Everyone will be concerned that perhaps we are not getting the results that we would hope for from the system. We are not getting the skills level in the Welsh language that we would have hoped for from that investment, and there are big issues to discuss around how reform of that provision would fit into reform of the wider curriculum, particularly around key stages 2 and 3, what we are asking schools to deliver and what we are providing in terms of quality to young people.
- Gallaf ddweud wrth yr Aelod dros Orllewin De Cymru bod syniadau'n cael eu datblygu ar hyn o bryd. Mae hi yn llygad ei lle, ac rwy'n cydnabod ac yn rhannu ei phryder—mae gennym broblemau i'w datrys o ran y ddarpariaeth Gymraeg fel ail iaith mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg. Bydd pawb yn pryderu efallai nad ydym yn cael y canlyniadau y byddem yn gobeithio eu cael drwy'r system. Nid ydym yn sicrhau'r lefel sgiliau yn yr iaith Gymraeg y byddem wedi gobeithio amdanynt o'r buddsoddiad hwnnw, ac mae materion mawr i'w trafod ynghylch sut y byddai diwygio'r ddarpariaeth honno yn cyd-fynd â diwygiadau i'r cwricwlwm ehangach, yn enwedig o ran cyfnodau allweddol 2 a 3, yr hyn yr ydym yn gofyn i ysgolion ei gyflwyno a'r hyn yr ydym yn ei ddarparu o ran ansawdd i bobl ifanc.
- 14:09 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Gan barhau ar y pwynt hwnnw, byddai'n ddiddorol gwybod i ba gyfeiriad y byddech yn dymuno gweld pethau'n mynd o ran yr adolygiad hwnnw o'r cwricwlwm o ran dysgu ail iaith, ond, yn bwysicach, fe allwn fod yn bwrw ymlaen i weithredu rhai o argymhellion yr adroddiad hwnnw rŵan, heb effeithio'n ormodol ar rannau eraill o'r cwricwlwm. Pa ystyriaeth a wnewch chi ei rhoi, fel Gweinidog, i weithredu rŵan, cyn i ni symud ymlaen at yr adolygiad llawn o'r cwricwlwm, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r gwir broblemau mewn dysgu ail iaith?
- To continue on that point, it would be interesting to know in which direction you would wish to see things moving in terms of the curriculum review of second-language teaching, but, more importantly, we could be forging ahead to implement some of the report's recommendations now, without having too much of an impact on other parts of the curriculum. What consideration will you, as Minister, give to their implementation now, before we move to a full review of the curriculum, in order to address some of these real problems in second-language teaching?



14:10 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I understand the Member's impatience, and there are Members concerned with almost every aspect of the curriculum who would have a degree of impatience about when we could get through phase 2 of the curriculum review. However, I caution Members that we are dealing here with changes that may well be radical in nature, fundamental for sure, and may well take a good deal of time to bed in. We all have to remember that you cannot change a curriculum or the educational workforce, where its energies are concentrated, in a period of days, weeks or months. It will take years, and phase 2 of the national curriculum review gives us time to do a good job of work, in terms of attempting to reach a consensual conclusion around where our efforts are best expended when it comes to Welsh as a second language.

Deallaf pam mae'r Aelod yn colli amynedd, ac mae Aelodau sy'n ymwneud â bron pob agwedd ar y cwricwlwm a fyddai rhywfaint yn ddiamynedd ynghylch pryd y gallem gwblhau cam 2 o'r adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm. Fodd bynnag, rhybuddiaf yr Aelodau ein bod yn ymdrin â newidiadau sy'n debygol o fod yn rhai radical ac sydd, yn sicr, yn sylfaenol ac a allai gymryd cryn dipyn o amser i ymsefydlu. Rhaid inni i gyd gofio na ellir newid cwricwlwm na'r gweithlu addysgol, lle caiff ymdrechion eu canoli, mewn cyfnod o ddiwrnodau, wythnosau neu fisoedd. Bydd yn cymryd blynyddoedd, ac mae cam 2 o'r adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn rhoi amser inni wneud gwaith da, o ran ceisio dod i gasgliad cydsyniol ynghylch y meysydd gorau i ganolbwyntio ein hymdrechion arnynt pan ddaw hi'n fater o'r Gymraeg fel ail iaith.

14:11 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Question 10 was grouped with questions 2 and 3. Therefore, we move to question 11; Russell George. Cafodd cwestiwn 10 ei grwpio gyda chwestiynau 2 a 3. Felly, symudwn at gwestiwn 11, Russell George.

## Recriwtio Athrawon

## Teacher Recruitment

14:11 **Russell George** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*11. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am recriwtio a chadw athrawon yng Nghymru? OAQ(4)0380(ESK)*

*11. Will the Minister make a statement on teacher recruitment and retention in Wales? OAQ(4)0380(ESK)*

14:11 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I thank the Member for Montgomeryshire for his question. We continue to encourage the very best qualified people to consider teaching as a career and have strengthened continuous professional development through the introduction of the Master's in educational practice and through leadership development programmes to support teachers during their careers, ensuring we develop and retain the very best practitioners.

Diolch i'r Aelod dros Sir Drefaldwyn am ei gwestiwn. Rydym yn parhau i annog y bobl â'r cymwysterau gorau i ystyried addysgu fel gyrfa ac rydym wedi cryfhau datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus drwy gyflwyno'r Radd Meistr mewn arfer addysgol a thrwy raglenni datblygu arweinyddiaeth i gefnogi athrawon yn ystod eu gyrfaedd, gan sicrhau ein bod yn datblygu ac yn cadw'r ymarferwyr gorau.

14:12 **Russell George** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Thank you for your answer, Minister. Two of the issues raised in the recent Estyn report as areas cited for improvement were that Wales has not been recruiting enough trainee teachers with the best qualifications and that there is a need for more consistency in the quality of what is provided to them initially through education and training in order to give them the best chance in their teaching career. How is the Welsh Government intending to address those concerns?

Diolch am eich ateb, Weinidog. Dau o'r materion a godwyd yn adroddiad diweddar Estyn fel meysydd i'w gwella oedd nad yw Cymru wedi bod yn recriwtio digon o athrawon dan hyfforddiant sydd â'r cymwysterau gorau a bod angen mwy o gysondeb o ran ansawdd yr hyn a ddarperir iddynt yn y lle cyntaf drwy addysg a hyfforddiant er mwyn rhoi'r cyfle gorau iddynt yn eu gyrfa addysgu. Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon hynny?

14:12 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Many of the concerns mentioned by the Member were addressed through the Tabberer review of initial teacher training in Wales. I have accepted all of the conclusions that Professor Ralph Tabberer has presented me with. The acceptance of those recommendations is very much a matter of concern to the higher education institutions that, in particular, deliver initial teacher training on our behalf. A great deal of work is going on within those institutions, as we speak, to deliver on the recommendations of Tabberer.

Cafodd llawer o'r pryderon a grybwyllwyd gan yr Aelod eu hystyried drwy adolygiad Tabberer o hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon yng Nghymru. Rwyf wedi derbyn yr holl gasgliadau a gyflwynodd yr Athro Ralph Tabberer imi. Mae derbyn yr argymhellion hynny yn fater o bwys mawr i'r sefydliadau addysg uwch sy'n darparu hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon, yn enwedig, ar ein rhan. Caiff llawer iawn o waith ei wneud o fewn y sefydliadau hynny, ar hyn o bryd, i gyflawni argymhellion Tabberer.

14:13 **Aled Roberts** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Following on from the Tabberer report, what discussions have you held with those higher education institutions, given the qualification requirements? I am told that some of them are willing to accept one C grade at A-level for entry to the initial teacher training course, which would seem to go against reassurances that we have heard that the better qualified, hopefully, will be attracted to the teaching profession.

Yn dilyn adroddiad Tabberer, pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cynnal â'r sefydliadau addysg uwch hynny, o ystyried y gofynion o ran cymwysterau? Deallaf fod rhai ohonynt yn barod i rywun ddilyn y cwrs hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon gydag un radd C Safon Uwch, sy'n gwrthdaro fel pe bai â'r sicrwydd yr ydym wedi'i glywed y bydd pobl â chymwysterau gwell, gobeithio, yn cael eu denu i'r proffesiwn addysgu.

14:13 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

We have raised the bar when it comes to the GCSE qualifications that are required, as of this intake, for initial teacher training. I do not regard that debate regarding entry threshold as a debate that has been shut down after we have done that. I think that there needs to be an ongoing conversation about how we ensure that we have people of the very best quality, particularly when it comes to their levels of literacy and numeracy, coming out of the training at the end into the classroom.

Rydym wedi codi'r safon o ran y cymwysterau TGAU sydd eu hangen i gael hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon, o'r fwyddyn dderbyn hon. Ni chredaf fod y ddatl honno ynglŷn â throthwy mynediad yn un sydd wedi dod i ben ar ôl inni wneud hynny. Credaf fod angen trafod yn barhaus sut y gellir sicrhau bod gennym bobl o'r ansawdd gorau posibl, yn enwedig o ran eu lefelau llythrennedd a rhifedd, yn gadael yr hyfforddiant ar y diwedd ac yn mynd i'r ystafell ddosbarth.

## Diogelu Plant

## Safeguarding Children

14:14 **Rebecca Evans** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*12. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am swyddogaeth ysgolion o ran diogelu plant? OAQ(4)0377(ESK)*

*12. Will the Minister make a statement on the role of schools in safeguarding children? OAQ(4)0377(ESK)*

14:14 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Yes. I thank the Member for Mid and West Wales. Safeguarding is everybody's business. The role of schools in safeguarding children should not be seen in isolation, but as part of a wider multi-agency approach to providing a safe and secure school setting in which children can develop, learn and reach their full potential.

Gwnaf. Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ganolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. Mae diogelu yn fusnes i bawb. Ni ddylid ystyried swyddogaeth ysgolion o ran diogelu plant ar ei phen ei hun, ond fel rhan o ddull amlasiantaeth ehangach o ddarparu lleoliad ysgol diogel lle gall plant ddatblygu, dysgu a chyrraedd eu llawn botensial.

14:14 **Rebecca Evans** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Thank you, Minister. I share the Welsh Government's stated view that safeguarding includes appropriate sex-and-relationships education. Given the worrying level of domestic abuse in teenage relationships and the pressures that young people tell us they are under, is the Welsh Government confident that all schools are addressing sexual consent, sexual violence and healthy relationships in their classrooms?

Diolch, Weiniog. Rhannaf farn ddatganedig Llywodraeth Cymru fod diogelu yn cynnwys addysg briodol ar ryw a pherthnasoedd. O ystyried y lefel bryderus o gam-drin domestig mewn perthnasoedd rhwng pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau a'r pwysau y mae pobl ifanc yn dweud wrthym sydd arnynt, a yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn hyderus bod pob ysgol yn mynd i'r afael â chydsyniad rhywiol, trais rhywiol a pherthnasoedd iach yn ei hystafelloedd dosbarth?

14:15

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

No, I am not; I do not think that many of us would assume that we are necessarily where we need to be in terms of this debate. The Welsh Government is committed to providing opportunities for young people to learn about healthy relationships as part of personal and social education, which is a statutory part of the curriculum for learners aged 5 to 16. However, we will revisit many of these issues as we revisit the basic curriculum, which, of course, includes PSE, sex and relationships education and religious education in order to ensure that we have broad and balanced provision that is fit for the twenty-first century. That, as I have said, will also be a part of the phase 2 curriculum review, which will take an all-encompassing look at the curriculum for Wales. This thread will run through it and will be a very important part of the considerations of that curriculum review for us all.

Nac ydw; ni chredaf y byddai llawer ohonom yn tybio ein bod wedi cyflawni'r hyn sydd ei angen o ran y ddatl hon. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymrwmo i ddarparu cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc ddysgu am berthnasoedd iach fel rhan o addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol, sy'n rhan statudol o'r cwricwlwm i ddysgwyr rhwng 5 ac 16 oed. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn ailystyried llawer o'r materion hyn wrth inni ailystyried y cwricwlwm sylfaenol, sydd, wrth gwrs, yn cynnwys ABCh, addysg rhyw a pherthnasoedd ac addysg grefyddol, er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym ddarpariaeth eang a chytbwys sy'n addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Fel y dywedais, bydd hynny hefyd yn rhan o gam 2 yr adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm, a fydd yn edrych mewn ffordd hollgynhwysol ar gwricwlwm Cymru. Bydd y llinyn hwn yn rhedeg drwyddo, a bydd yn rhan bwysig iawn o ystyriaethau'r adolygiad hwnnw o'r cwricwlwm i ni i gyd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:16

**Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, would you agree that it was disappointing to read the Wales Audit Office report published last November, which made it quite clear that not all schools are ensuring that the safeguarding procedures are in place for temporary or agency staff and that more work needed to be done to ensure that schools and governing bodies were acting on their responsibilities to take those pre-employment checks for agency staff seriously? What action are you taking as a Government to regularise the situation and to police the responsibilities of school governing bodies and headteachers before they allow people into schools to teach our children?

Weinidog, a fydddech yn cytuno ei bod yn siomedig darllen adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru a gyhoeddwyd fis Tachwedd diwethaf, a nododd yn glir nad yw pob ysgol yn sicrhau bod y gweithdrefnau diogelu ar waith ar gyfer staff dros dro neu staff asiantaeth, a bod angen gwneud mwy o waith i sicrhau bod ysgolion a chyrrff llywodraethu yn gweithredu ar eu cyfrifoldebau i gymryd yr archwiliadau cyn cyflogi hynny ar gyfer staff asiantaeth o ddirif? Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd fel Llywodraeth i unioni'r sefyllfa a phlismona cyfrifoldebau cyrrff llywodraethu ysgolion a phenaethiaid cyn iddynt dderbyn pobl i ysgolion er mwyn addysgu ein plant?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:16

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Of course, action was taken by officials in terms of the concerns of the Wales Audit Office. I will check with officials and write to the Member with the current, up to date, picture of where we are in terms of the response to the WAO report.

Wrth gwrs, gweithredodd fy swyddogion ar bryderon Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru. Byddaf yn cysylltu â'r swyddogion ac yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod gyda'r darlun diweddaraf ar hyn o bryd o ran ein hymateb i adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

## Athrawon Gwyddoniaeth

## Science Teachers

14:17

**David Rees** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*13. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygiad proffesiynol parhaus i athrawon gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru? OAQ(4)0375(ESK)*

*13. Will the Minister make a statement on continuing professional development for science teachers in Wales? OAQ(4)0375(ESK)*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:17

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

CPD for all school practitioners is key to offering the effective delivery of national priorities. Areas for development are identified through performance management and professional standards. Officials are working with practitioners to develop a national model to ensure that all CPD is collaborative, sustainable and informed by the latest research.

Mae DPP i bob ymarferwr ysgol yn hollbwysig er mwyn gallu cyflawni blaenoriaethau cenedlaethol yn effeithiol. Caiff meysydd i'w datblygu eu nodi drwy brosesau rheoli perfformiad a safonau proffesiynol. Mae swyddogion yn gweithio gydag ymarferwyr i ddatblygu model cenedlaethol er mwyn sicrhau bod yr holl ddarpariaeth DPP yn gydweithredol, yn gynaliadwy ac yn seiliedig ar yr ymchwil ddiweddaraf.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:17

**David Rees** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you for that answer, Minister. Last week, I was fortunate enough to see science at work at CERN, the European Organization for Nuclear Research, where I became aware that there were opportunities for science teachers to visit and to undertake summer programmes at CERN. Science is a major element of our curriculum and we need to enthuse our young people to take science at GCSE, A-level or undergraduate level. Therefore, will your department look at ways to disseminate this information to teachers and perhaps also provide opportunities for Welsh teachers to go to see for themselves the science at work so that they can go back to the classroom and enthuse young people?

Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yr wythnos diwethaf, bûm yn ddigon ffodus i weld gwyddoniaeth ar waith yn CERN, y Sefydliad Ewropeaidd ar gyfer Ymchwil Niwclear, lle darganfyddais fod cyfleoedd i athrawon gwyddoniaeth ymweld â CERN a chymryd rhan mewn rhaglenni haf yno. Mae gwyddoniaeth yn elfen bwysig o'n cwricwlwm ac mae angen inni ennyn brwdfrydedd ein pobl ifanc i astudio gwyddoniaeth ar lefel TGAU, Safon Uwch neu israddedig. Felly, a wnaiff eich adran edrych ar ffyrdd o rannu'r wybodaeth hon ag athrawon ac efallai hefyd roi cyfleoedd i athrawon o Gymru fynd i weld gwyddoniaeth ar waith drostynt eu hunain fel y gallant ddychwelyd i'r ystafell ddosbarth ac ennyn brwdfrydedd pobl ifanc?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:18

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

It does sound like a fascinating development. The Welsh Government's approach to CPD is one of encouraging less of a reliance on what might be seen as conventional CPD, characterised by going off on a one-off training course that is remote from the classroom and generally for a small number of individuals. As professionals, I would expect practitioners to see CPD as an ongoing process that is primarily their own responsibility and not necessarily one that has to be directed by Government. It is up to schools to decide what will be the most effective and sustainable way to meet professionals' requirements in relation to a school's priorities and, hopefully, its improvement plan. Having said that, there is room for bringing a greater level of coherence to the conversation regarding what those priorities are. The Welsh Government has a legitimate say in terms of the reforms that we are going through at the moment to encourage schools to go in certain directions. Certainly, science, technology, engineering and mathematics would be high on the agenda.

Mae'n swnio fel datblygiad diddorol. Ymagwedd Llywodraeth Cymru at DPP yw annog llai o ddibyniaeth ar yr hyn y gellid ei ystyried yn DPP confensiynol, a nodweddir gan gyrsiau hyfforddi untro i ffwrdd o'r ystafell ddosbarth sydd wedi'u cynllunio, yn gyffredinol, ar gyfer nifer fach o unigolion. Fel gweithwyr proffesiynol, byddwn yn disgwyl i ymarferwyr ystyried DPP yn broses barhaus y maent hwy yn bennaf cyfrifol amdani ac nid o reidrwydd yn broses y mae'n rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ei chyfarwyddo. Mater i ysgolion yw penderfynu ar y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol a chynaliadwy o fodloni gofynion gweithwyr proffesiynol mewn perthynas â blaenoriaethau ysgol a, gobeithio, ei chynllun gwella. Wedi dweud hynny, mae lle i gydlynw'r sgwrs ynglŷn â beth yw'r blaenoriaethau hynny yn well. Mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru gyfraniad diliys i'w wneud ar hyn o bryd i annog ysgolion i fynd i gyfeiriadau penodol. Yn sicr, byddai gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianeg a mathemateg yn uchel ar yr agenda.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:19

**Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The questioner for question 14 is not present, so we will move on to question 15.

Nid yw'r holwr ar gyfer cwestiwn 14 yn bresennol, felly symudwn ymlaen i gwestiwn 15.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Absenoldebau**

**Absenteeism**

14:19

**Mike Hedges** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*15. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lefel yr absenoldebau mewn ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru?*  
OAQ(4)0364(ESK)

*15. Will the Minister make a statement on the level of absenteeism in primary schools in Wales?*  
OAQ(4)0364(ESK)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:19

**Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank the Member for Swansea East. It is clear that our actions to increase attendance in all schools in Wales are having a positive impact. There is, however, still work to be done. We need to ensure that local authorities and schools have the skills, confidence and capacity to sustain and build on these improvements using the attendance grant.

Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ddwyrain Abertawe. Mae'n amlwg bod ein camau gweithredu i gynyddu presenoldeb ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru yn cael effaith gadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, mae gwaith i'w wneud o hyd. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod gan awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion y sgiliau, yr hyder a'r gallu i gynnal y gwelliannau hyn ac adeiladu arnynt gan ddefnyddio'r grant presenoldeb.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:20 **Mike Hedges** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

The quality of teaching is not of any importance if the child is not present in the classroom. What recent advice and guidance has the Welsh Government given, or does it intend to give, to local authorities regarding primary schools dealing with absenteeism at an early age?

Mae ansawdd yr addysg yn amherthnasol os nad yw'r plentyn yn bresennol yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Pa gyngor a chanllawiau diweddar y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u rhoi, neu y mae'n bwriadu eu rhoi, i awdurdodau lleol ynghylch sut y dylai ysgolion cynradd ddelio ag absenoldebau ymhlith plant ifanc?

14:20 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

It is encouraging—the Member is quite right—to see again this year the reduction in persistent absence from school in Wales, as well as the continuing fall in the overall rates of unauthorised absenteeism in primary schools. This has been a success story over the last 10 years or so; we have made real in-roads into this situation. There is £800,000 of funding available over two years to support consortia to work with their authorities and schools to continue to develop and embed effective practices that can secure long-term improvements in attendance.

Mae'r Aelod yn llygad ei le—mae'n galonogol gweld unwaith eto eleni y gostyngiad mewn absenoldebau cyson o ysgolion yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â'r gostyngiad parhaus mewn cyfraddau absenoldebau anawdurdodedig cyffredinol mewn ysgolion cynradd. Mae hwn wedi bod yn llwyddiant dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf neu fwy; rydym wedi gwneud gwelliannau gwirioneddol i'r sefyllfa. Mae £800,000 o arian ar gael dros ddwy flynedd i helpu'r consortia i weithio gyda'u hawdurdodau ac ysgolion er mwyn parhau i ddatblygu a sefydlu arferion effeithiol a all sicrhau gwelliannau hirdymor mewn presenoldeb.

14:21 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Thank you, Minister. Diolch, Weinidog.

## Cwestiynau i Weinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth

## Questions to the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport

### Datblygu Economi Cymru

#### Developing the Welsh Economy

14:21 **William Powell** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*1. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cymru i ddatblygu economi Cymru?*  
OAQ(4)0362(EST)

*1. Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh Government plans to develop the Welsh economy?*  
OAQ(4)0362(EST)

14:21 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*Gweinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth / The Minister for Economy, Science and Transport*

Our plans are set out in our programme for government. Supporting jobs and growth is a priority. Mae ein cynlluniau wedi'u nodi yn ein rhaglen lywodraethu. Mae cefnogi swyddi a thwf yn flaenoriaeth.

14:21 **William Powell** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Thank you very much for that response, Minister. I would like to take this opportunity to thank you very much indeed for agreeing to visit Robert Owen Montgomeryshire Credit Union Ltd in Newtown tomorrow. In the context of that visit, would you agree that there is greater scope to promote and develop credit unions within schools and colleges across Wales so as to upskill our young people in terms of financial management for their future careers?

Diolch yn fawr iawn am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch ichi yn fawr iawn am gytuno i ymweld ag Undeb Credyd Sir Drefaldwyn Robert Owen Cyf yn y Drenewydd yfory. Yng nghyd-destun yr ymweliad hwnnw, a fydddech yn cytuno bod mwy o gyfle i hyrwyddo a datblygu undebau credyd mewn ysgolion a cholegau ar draws Cymru er mwyn gwella sgiliau ein pobl ifanc o ran rheolaeth ariannol ar gyfer eu gyrfaeddd yn y dyfodol?

14:22 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I look forward to attending that meeting with you tomorrow. I think that it will be very informative to have the opportunity to see a very successful credit union in action. I note that my colleague the Minister for Education and Skills is still present in the Chamber. He, like me, feels passionately about the role of credit unions. I can assure you that he will take that point on board, because it is never too soon to learn about or understand good financial management; just like entrepreneurship in schools, it is never too young for them to start.

Edrychaf ymlaen at fod yn y cyfarfod hwnnw gyda chi yfory. Credaf y bydd gweld undeb credyd llwyddiannus iawn ar waith yn gyfle i ddysgu llawer. Sylwaf fod fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau, yn dal yn bresennol yn y Siambr. Fel finnau, mae ef yn teimlo'n angerddol am rôl undebau credyd. Gallaf eich sicrhau y bydd yn ystyried y pwynt hwnnw, gan nad yw byth yn rhy fuan i ddysgu am reolaeth ariannol dda neu ei deall; ac fel entrepreneuriaeth mewn ysgolion, nid yw byth yn rhy ifanc iddynt ddechrau.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:22 **Nick Ramsay** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, Welsh businesses have been saying for years that Finance Wales is not fit for purpose. The Welsh Conservatives also made this point in our Invest Wales policy launch last January, as did your Welsh Government-commissioned access to finance review, undertaken by Professor Dylan Jones-Evans. Is today's announcement of a development bank for Wales finally a recognition from the Welsh Government that Finance Wales is failing to do the job that it was set up to do? Why has it taken the Welsh Government so long to listen to the views of the business community in Wales?

Weinidog, mae busnesau Cymru wedi bod yn dweud ers blynyddoedd nad yw Cyllid Cymru yn addas at y diben. Gwnaed yr un pwynt hefyd gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn ein lansiad polisi Buddsoddi Cymru fis Ionawr diwethaf, fel y gwnaeth eich adolygiad o gyllid a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru, ac a gynhaliwyd gan yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans. A yw cyhoeddiad heddiw o fanc datblygu i Gymru yn gydnabyddiaeth o'r diwedd gan Lywodraeth Cymru fod Cyllid Cymru yn methu â gwneud y gwaith y cafodd ei sefydlu i'w wneud? Pam ei bod wedi cymryd cymaint o amser i Lywodraeth Cymru wrando ar farn y gymuned fusnes yng Nghymru?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:23 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

You will find that many members of the business community in Wales are very grateful for the help and support that they have had from Finance Wales, as there are elements within the business community that have been frustrated that they have not had help and assistance. In what has been a very difficult time for bank lending, Finance Wales has been available to undertake lending. It has been particularly successful with the new microbusiness fund, and even though there are issues—I have been quite open and transparent about that, in that I have commissioned reports on it—I am continuing to look at further work. I have picked up some very useful suggestions from comments made in the Chamber about what further work I need to undertake. This is an open and transparent process, so there is no point in having any political point-scoring on this, because there is none to be had.

Fe welwch fod llawer o aelodau o'r gymuned fusnes yng Nghymru yn ddiolchgar iawn am y cymorth a'r gefnogaeth a gawsant gan Cyllid Cymru, gan fod elfennau o fewn y gymuned fusnes sydd wedi teimlo'n rhwystredig na chawsant unrhyw help na chymorth. Mewn cyfnod sydd wedi bod yn anodd iawn o ran benthyciadau banc, mae Cyllid Cymru wedi bod ar gael i gynnig benthyciadau. Bu'n arbennig o lwyddiannus gyda'r gronfa fenthyciadau i ficrofusnesau newydd, ac er bod problemau—rwyf wedi bod yn eithaf agored a thryloyw ynglŷn â hynny, yn yr ystyr fy mod wedi comisiynu adroddiadau arni—rwy'n parhau i edrych ar waith pellach. Rwyf wedi casglu rhai awgrymiadau defnyddiol iawn o sylwadau a wnaed yn y Siambr ynghylch pa waith pellach yr oedd angen i mi ei wneud. Mae hon yn broses agored a thryloyw, felly nid oes diben ceisio sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol yma, oherwydd nid oes rhai ar gael.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:23 **Nick Ramsay** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, we very much welcome the process and hope that it is open and transparent. Finance Wales has done some things well, but it has done some other things extremely badly. You mentioned lending. Dylan Jones-Evans, in his report, uncovered the unjustifiably exorbitant interest rates charged on loans to Welsh companies, without justification, by Finance Wales. It now seems that those businesses that were told for so long that they were wrong are actually right. Finance Wales clearly has to go, and it has to go pretty quickly. Given the process that you have now embarked upon, will you give us and businesses a clear time frame by the end of which Welsh business will get the sort of financial support that they need and deserve?

Weinidog, croesawn yn fawr y broses a gobeithio ei bod yn agored a thryloyw. Mae Cyllid Cymru wedi gwneud rhai pethau'n dda, ond wedi gwneud pethau eraill yn wael iawn. Soniasoch am fenthycia. Datgelodd Dylan Jones-Evans, yn ei adroddiad, y cyfraddau llog hollol afresymol a godir ar fenthyciadau i gwmnïau o Gymru, heb gyfiawnhad, gan Cyllid Cymru. Ymddengys yn awr fod y busnesau hynny y dywedwyd wrthynt am gymaint o amser eu bod yn anghywir, mewn gwirionedd yn iawn. Yn amlwg rhaid i Cyllid Cymru fynd, a rhaid iddo fynd yn weddol gyflym. O ystyried y broses yr ydych bellach wedi cychwyn arni, a wnewch chi roi ffrâm amser glir i ni ac i fusnesau, lle y bydd busnesau Cymru erbyn diwedd y ffrâm amser honno yn cael y math o gymorth ariannol sydd ei angen arnynt ac y maent yn ei haeddu?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:24

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Welsh businesses are getting appropriate financial support from this Government, as shown by recent statistics. A number of our funds have been welcomed across the piece. This is about a review; it is a genuine dialogue about how we take things through to the next stage. Without Finance Wales, some businesses would not have been successful, and successive Governments have supported Finance Wales. However, it is important now that I look at its remit. I was delighted by the work that was undertaken by Professor Dylan Jones-Evans. That is why it is going to a further stage—because he has my confidence in these matters. The important thing to recognise is that this organisation exists; in some areas it does a good job and some issues have been found with it. However, we must remember that we do not want to destabilise the market in any shape or form for people looking for future investment.

Mae busnesau yng Nghymru yn cael cymorth ariannol priodol gan y Llywodraeth hon, fel y dangosodd ystadegau yn ddiweddar. Mae nifer o'n cronfeydd wedi cael eu croesawu yn gyffredinol. Mae a wnelo hyn ag adolygu; mae'n ddeialog gwirioneddol ynghylch sut yr ydym yn symud pethau ymlaen i'r cam nesaf. Heb Cyllid Cymru, ni fyddai rhai busnesau wedi bod yn llwyddiannus, ac mae Llywodraethau olynol wedi cefnogi Cyllid Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig bellach fy mod yn edrych ar ei gylch gwaith. Roeddwn wrth fy modd gyda'r gwaith a wnaed gan yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans. Dyna pam y mae'n mynd ymlaen i gam pellach—gan fod ganddo fy ffydd i yn y materion hyn. Y peth pwysig i'w gofio yw bod y sefydliad hwn yn bodoli; mewn rhai ardaloedd mae'n gwneud gwaith da a chanfuwyd rhai problemau yn ei gylch. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio nad ydym am ansefydlogi'r farchnad mewn unrhyw ffordd i bobl sy'n chwilio am fuddsoddiad yn y dyfodol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:25

**Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I certainly welcome your statement today, Minister. I think that it is a significant step forward and it means that we can streamline support to small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales. There is some history that points to the idea that a development like this would be useful. Certainly, Plaid Cymru has advocated, as you know, a development bank for Wales. What is the opportunity in the creation of this new bank now in its relationship with Government and the Government's new borrowing powers, and can that be made accessible as well to businesses in Wales? Perhaps we can add value to the borrowing powers that the Government will have.

Yn sicr, croesawaf eich datganiad heddiw, Weinidog. Credaf ei fod yn gam sylweddol ymlaen ac mae'n golygu y gallwn symleiddio cymorth i fentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru. Ceir rhywfaint o hanes sy'n cyfeirio at y syniad y byddai datblygiad o'r fath yn ddefnyddiol. Yn sicr, mae Plaid Cymru wedi dadlau o blaid banc datblygu i Gymru, fel y gwyddoch. Beth yw'r cyfle wrth greu'r banc newydd hwn nawr o ran ei gydberthynas â'r Llywodraeth a phwerau benthyca newydd y Llywodraeth, ac a ellir sicrhau bod hynny hefyd ar gael i fusnesau yng Nghymru? Efallai y gallwn ychwanegu gwerth at y pwerau benthyca a fydd gan y Llywodraeth.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:26

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Well, you see, these are the types of issues that Jane Hutt and I discuss around this issue, because we are now into a very new arena in terms of Government borrowing powers and what further we need to do for business—and, of course, the relationship of Government and Finance Wales with the private sector banks as well. We need to look at what type of relationship we need there in terms of borrowing. I have been speaking at length to some of the banks about how we can dovetail more of the work that we do in terms of lending—who could take the last 20% on a loan, perhaps, and at what rates. So, those are ongoing discussions. I very much welcome your comments about the review, which is essential as we develop policy in this particular area.

Wel, dyma'r math o bethau y mae Jane Hutt a minnau yn eu trafod ar y mater hwn, oherwydd rydym bellach mewn sefyllfa newydd iawn o ran pwerau benthyca'r Llywodraeth a beth arall y mae angen inni ei wneud ar gyfer busnes—ac, wrth gwrs, cydberthynas y Llywodraeth a Cyllid Cymru â banciau'r sector preifat hefyd. Mae angen inni edrych ar ba fath o berthynas sydd ei hangen arnom yno o ran benthyca. Rwyf wedi cynnal trafodaeth faith â rhai o'r banciau ynghylch sut y gallwn gysoni mwy o'r gwaith a wnawn o ran benthyca—pwy allai gymryd yr 20% olaf ar fenthyciad, efallai, ac ar ba gyfraddau. Felly, trafodaethau sy'n mynd rhagddynt yw'r rheini. Croesawaf yn fawr eich sylwadau ar yr adolygiad, sy'n hanfodol wrth inni ddatblygu polisi yn y maes penodol hwn.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

## Gwasanaethau Rheilffyrdd yn Nhorfaen

## Rail Services in Torfaen

14:26

**Lynne Neagle** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*2. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau rheilffyrdd yn Nhorfaen? OAQ(4)0367(EST)*

*2. Will the Minister make a statement on rail services in Torfaen? OAQ(4)0367(EST)*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:26

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I am committed to improving rail services in Wales and I am considering options for further investment in south-east Wales.

Rwyf wedi ymrwymo i wella gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru ac yn ystyried opsiynau ar gyfer buddsoddiad pellach yn y de-ddwyrain.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

- 14:26 **Lynne Neagle** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I welcomed your statement yesterday where you set out the range of actions that the Welsh Government is taking to transform our transport network in Wales. As part of that wide programme of work, would you be willing to investigate the possibility of boosting the number of trains that stop at Pontypool and New Inn and Cwmbran stations during peak times? There are currently large gaps in the timetable when no trains run from Pontypool or Cwmbran to Cardiff, and I believe that increasing the frequency and options available to commuters would provide a really vital economic boost to the area.
- Croesewais eich datganiad ddoe lle y nodwyd yr amrywiaeth o gamau gweithredu y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu cymryd i drawsnewid ein rhydwraith trafnidiaeth yng Nghymru. Fel rhan o'r rhaglen waith eang honno, a fydddech yn fodlon ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o gynyddu nifer y trenau sy'n stopio yng ngorsafoedd Pont-y-pŵl, New Inn a Chwmbrân yn ystod oriau brig? Ar hyn o bryd mae bylchau mawr yn yr amserlen lle nad oes unrhyw drenau yn rhedeg o Bont-y-pŵl neu Gwmbrân i Gaerdydd, a chredaf y byddai cynyddu amllder y trenau a'r opsiynau sydd ar gael i gymudwyr yn rhoi hwb economaidd hollbwysig i'r ardal.
- 14:27 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Obviously, my officials continue to work with Arriva Trains Wales to adjust and improve the timetable, but your point is well made. People's working patterns change. They are not necessarily first thing in the morning or last thing at night—they are all through the day. For example, I think that the Holyhead to Cardiff express now stops at Pontypool and New Inn station, and there have been some enhancements. We are certainly looking at what further enhancements we can undertake to improve the regularity of these trains.
- Yn amlwg, mae fy swyddogion yn parhau i weithio gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru i addasu a gwella'r amserlen, ond gwnaethoch bwynt teg. Mae patrymau gwaith pobl yn newid. Nid ydynt o reidrwydd yn teithio ben bore nac ar ddiwedd y dydd—maent yn teithio drwy gydol y dydd. Er enghraifft, credaf fod trên Caerdybi i Gaerdydd yn stopio nawr yn ngorsaf Pont-y-pŵl a New Inn, a gwnaed rhai gwelliannau. Yn sicr rydym yn ystyried pa welliannau pellach y gallwn eu gwneud i wella cysondeb y trenau hyn.
- 14:27 **William Graham** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Will the Minister outline what consideration has been given to creating a modern passenger-friendly park-to-ride station to coincide with the proposed development at Mamhilad village? This would replace the rather inadequate Pontypool Road station.
- A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd i greu gorsaf parcio a theithio fodern sy'n hawdd i deithwyr ei defnyddio a fydd yn cyd-daro â'r datblygiad arfaethedig ym mhentref Mamhilad? Byddai hyn yn disodli gorsaf Heol Pont-y-pŵl sy'n annigonol braidd.
- 14:28 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Yes, I think that you make a good point about the importance of park-to-ride schemes in terms of our travel policy, which, of course, is to get more people off the roads and more people using public transport, and particularly the trains. I will certainly ask my officials what level of discussions there may have been on this particular issue with Network Rail and all the partners. I will drop you a line, if I may, William, and I will copy in other Members.
- Gwnaf. Credaf eich bod yn gwneud pwynt da ynghylch pwysigrwydd cynlluniau parcio a theithio o ran ein polisi teithio, sef cael mwy o bobl, wrth gwrs, oddi ar y ffyrdd a mwy o bobl i ddefnyddio trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, a threnau yn enwedig. Yn sicr, gofynnaf i'm swyddogion pa lefel o drafodaethau a fu ar y mater penodol hwn gyda Network Rail a'r holl bartneriaid. Ysgrifnaf atoch, os caf, William, a chopio Aelodau eraill i mewn.
- 14:28 **Lindsay Whittle** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thank you, Minister, for your previous answers. They were very interesting. Last year's metro consortium report on the south-east Wales city region noted that the majority of the residents of Torfaen, including those in the most densely populated areas, are not within 1.2 km of train stations at Cwmbran or Pontypool and New Inn. What efforts will you undertake as the Minister with responsibility for transport, working with the south-east city region board, to look at options for medium-term improvement to this situation to help connect some of the most deprived communities in my region to some of the other regional centres, please?
- Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am eich atebion blaenorol. Roeddent yn ddiddorol iawn. Nododd adroddiad consortium metro y llynedd ar ddinas-ranbarth y de-ddwyrain nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o drigolion Torfaen, gan gynnwys y rhai yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf poblog, o fewn 1.2 km i orsafoedd trenau yng Nghwmbrân neu Bont-y-pŵl a New Inn. Pa ymdrechion a wnewch fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am drafnidiaeth, gan weithio gyda bwrdd dinas-ranbarth y de-ddwyrain, i ystyried opsiynau ar gyfer gwelliant tymor canolig i'r sefyllfa hon er mwyn cysylltu rhai o'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yn fy rhanbarth â rhai o'r canolfannau rhanbarthol eraill, os gwelwch yn dda?



14:29 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I think that the point you make about deprived communities and their access to and the availability of public transport is important. I was with the city region board in south-east Wales this week, talking about the exciting metro proposals and the responsibilities that it has for developing the economy in south-east Wales. One of the key issues is that of transport. In light of your comments today, I will particularly ask it to pick up those points in its discussion on transport.

## Y Strategaeth Wyddoniaeth

14:29 **David Rees** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*3. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynnydd Strategaeth Wyddoniaeth Llywodraeth Cymru? OAQ(4)0365(EST)*

14:29 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Yes. Our science strategy is progressing following the principles set out in Science for Wales.

14:29 **David Rees** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you for that answer, Minister. As I identified earlier in questions, I, along with other members of the cross-party group on science and technology, visited CERN last week and had the opportunity to see cutting-edge science research at work in reality. We saw international collaboration delivering research that would benefit Wales through projects based at CERN undertaken by Swansea University, for example, and how they can attract leading academics from across the world. That clearly fits into the Welsh Government's vision, which recognises vital links between research and science skills, and also provides a base of fundamental research and STEM outreach. What is the Welsh Government doing to ensure that the ensuing processes of innovation, development, and commercialisation, which can transform scientific outputs, actually help to bring economic benefit to Wales?

Credaf fod y pwynt a wneuch am gymunedau difreintiedig a'u gallu i gael gafael ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus a'i hargaeledd yn bwysig. Roeddwn gyda bwrdd y dinas-ranbarth yn y de-ddwyrain yr wythnos hon, yn siarad am y cynigion metro cyffrous a'r cyfrifoldebau sydd ganddo am ddatblygu'r economi yn y de-ddwyrain. Un o'r materion allweddol yw trafnidiaeth. Yng ngoleuni eich sylwadau heddiw, gofynnaf yn benodol iddo drafod y pwyntiau hynny yn ei drafodaeth ar drafnidiaeth.

## The Science Strategy

*3. Will the Minister make a statement on the progress of the Welsh Government's Science Strategy? OAQ(4)0365(EST)*

Gwnaf. Mae ein strategaeth gwyddoniaeth yn mynd rhagddi gan ddilyn yr egwyddorion a nodir yn Gwyddoniaeth i Gymru.

Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weindog. Fel y nodais yn gynharach yn y cwestiynau, ymwelais i, ynghyd ag aelodau eraill o'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar wyddoniaeth a thechnoleg, â CERN yr wythnos diwethaf a chawsom y cyfle i weld ymchwil wyddonol arloesol ar waith. Gwelsom gydweithio rhyngwladol yn darparu ymchwil a fyddai o fudd i Gymru drwy brosiectau sy'n seiliedig yn CERN a gynhelir gan Brifysgol Abertawe, er enghraifft, a sut y gallant ddenu academyddion blaenllaw o bob rhan o'r byd. Mae hynny'n cyd-fynd yn glir â gweledigaeth Llywodraeth Cymru, sy'n cydnabod cysylltiadau hanfodol rhwng sgiliau ymchwil a gwyddoniaeth, ac sydd hefyd yn darparu sylfaen o ymchwil sylfaenol ac allgymorth STEM. Beth mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod prosesau dilynol arloesi, datblygu a masnacheiddio dilynol, a all drawsnewid allbynnau gwyddonol, yn helpu mewn gwirionedd i ddod â budd economaidd i Gymru?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:30

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

You also questioned my colleague the Minister for Education and Skills on matters related to this issue. Our science strategy certainly calls for action to ensure that more learners in Wales want to study well, and want to perform well internationally at school level. Therefore, that is quite important as part of this equation. We also remain committed to ensuring the best possible environment for innovation and business growth in Wales, to promote a culture of research, development, innovation and design. Only yesterday, I attended the launch of a research and development project in Bridgend, at the Sony Technology Centre, which has co-operation from people from Harvard, et cetera. That project has actually brought forward nine jobs in terms of research and development, and is looking at the possibility of more. That is exactly the type of strategy that we want to encourage, as well as the engagement, of course, between various universities, as well as international universities. We have to recognise the links between the research and the science skills base in Wales, and the process of innovation and development. I think that we are getting rather better at that.

Gwnaethoch hefyd holi fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau ar faterion sy'n gysylltiedig â'r mater hwn. Mae ein strategaeth wyddoniaeth yn sicr yn galw am weithredu er mwyn sicrhau bod mwy o ddysgwyr yng Nghymru eisiau astudio yn dda, ac yn awyddus i berfformio'n dda yn rhyngwladol ar lefel ysgol. Felly, mae hynny'n eithaf pwysig fel rhan o'r hafaliad hwn. Rydym hefyd yn ymrwymedig o hyd i sicrhau bod yr amgylchedd gorau posibl ar gael ar gyfer arloesedd a thwf busnesau yng Nghymru, i hyrwyddo diwylliant o ymchwil, datblygu, arloesi a dylunio. Dim ond ddoe, roeddwn yn bresennol yn achlysur lansio prosiect ymchwil a datblygu ym Mhenybont-ar-Ogwr, yng Nghanolfan Dechnoleg Sony, y mae pobl o Harvard ac ati yn cydweithio â hi. Mae'r prosiect hwnnw wedi cyflwyno naw swydd ymchwil a datblygu mewn gwirionedd, ac yn ystyried y posibilrwydd o gyflwyno rhagor ohonynt. Dyna'r union y math o strategaeth rydym am ei hannog, yn ogystal â'r broses ymgysylltu, wrth gwrs, rhwng prifysgolion amrywiol, a phrifysgolion rhyngwladol. Rhaid inni gydnabod y cysylltiadau rhwng y sylfaen sgiliau ymchwil a gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru, a'r broses arloesi a datblygu. Credaf ein bod yn gwella yn hynny o beth.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:31

**Nick Ramsay** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, we welcome the Welsh Government's science strategy. Looking through the policy, one of the core aspects to it is to attract star scientists to Wales. We saw one announced last July, in the guise of neurobiologist—and forgive my pronunciation—Yves Barde; I think that I got that right. Can the Minister tell me what progress the Government is making on attracting further star scientists to Wales, to help to raise the profile of other fields of science in Wales, because, as David Rees said, these personalities can often do a lot to raise the profile of different aspects of science?

Weinidog, croesawn strategaeth wyddoniaeth Llywodraeth Cymru. Wrth edrych drwy'r polisi, un o'r agweddau craidd arno yw denu gwyddonwyr o'r radd flaenaf i Gymru. Gwelsom un yn cael ei gyhoeddi fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, ar ffurf niwrofiologydd—a maddeuwch imi am fy ynganiad—Yves Barde; credaf imi ynganu'r enw yn iawn. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthyf pa gynnydd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i ddenu rhagor o wyddonwyr o'r radd flaenaf i Gymru, er mwyn helpu i godi proffil meysydd eraill o wyddoniaeth yng Nghymru, oherwydd, fel y dywedodd David Rees, gall y personoliaethau hyn yn aml wneud llawer i godi proffil gwahanol agweddau ar wyddoniaeth?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:32

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

In addition, of course, we have had a project under development in terms of Swansea University, where we have jointly made arrangements for another star in their team. These discussions take an incredibly long time to come to fruition. You might identify the individual whom you require, but you have to know whether they want to move or whether they fancy a new challenge. However, it is not just about them and their family, but also all their research people around them, and about what you can give them in terms of buildings and a way of life. Therefore, we are very hopeful that we are identifying other people. However, if it would be helpful, Presiding Officer, I will schedule an update on the science strategy in these particular areas, before the Easter recess, and we will hopefully have some more positive announcements.

Yn ogystal, wrth gwrs, mae prosiect wedi bod yn mynd rhagddo o ran Prifysgol Abertawe, lle rydym wedi gwneud trefniadau ar y cyd i wyddonydd rhagorol arall ymuno â'r tîm. Cymer amser hir iawn i'r trafodaethau hyn ddwyn ffrwyth. Efallai eich bod yn gwybod pa unigolyn sydd ei angen arnoch, ond rhaid ichi wybod a yw'n dymuno symud neu a yw'n awyddus i gael her newydd. Fodd bynnag, nid oes a wnelo hyn â'r unigolyn a'i deulu yn unig, ond hefyd â'i ymchwilwyr sy'n gweithio gydag ef, ac am yr hyn y gallwch ei roi iddo o ran adeiladau a ffordd o fyw. Felly, rydym yn obeithiol iawn ein bod yn nodi pobl eraill. Fodd bynnag, pe bai hynny o gymorth, Lywydd, trefnaf i ddiweddariad gael ei roi ar y strategaeth wyddoniaeth yn y meysydd penodol hyn, cyn toriad y Pasg, a gobeithio y cawn rai cyhoeddiadau mwy cadarnhaol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:32 **Alun Ffred Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cawsoch gyfle, Weinidog, i ymweld â ffatri Siemens yn Llanberis, sy'n arbenigo mewn gwyddoniaeth feddygol, ac sy'n allforio'r rhan fwyaf o'i chynnyrch. Gyda llaw, trist oedd deall y bore yma nad yw allforion yn cyfrannu dim at y twf honedig yn yr economi y dyddiau yma. Fodd bynnag, mae Siemens Llanberis yn cyflogi 450 o bobl. Rwy'n siŵr y byddech chi eisiau llonyfarch y penaethiaid, a'r gweithwyr, ar lwyddiant y gwaith. A fyddech yn cytuno y byddai pleidlais i adael yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn peryglu dyfodol cwmnïau fel Siemens yng Nghymru, ac felly'n peryglu'r cannoedd o swyddi sydd yn Arfon?

Last week, you had an opportunity, Minister, to visit the Siemens factory in Llanberis, which specialises in medical science and exports most of its produce. By the way, it was sad to hear this morning that exports contribute nothing to the alleged growth in the economy that is claimed today. However, Siemens in Llanberis does employ 450 people and I am sure that you would want to congratulate the managers and staff on the success of the plant. Do you agree that a vote to leave the European Union would put the future of companies such as Siemens at risk in Wales, and would therefore endanger hundreds of jobs in Arfon?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:33 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

May I say, Alun Ffred, that it was a wonderful opportunity to go with you to meet the company in Llanberis, and to see what a successful operation it is, as well as to see the level of exports, and to hear about the issues around transport, which were raised with me on that occasion? However, like you, I am concerned about large multinationals and what their attitude would be if there was a vote to leave the European Union. It is not just companies like Siemens. When I did my trade mission to Japan last year, there was a lot of interest from Japanese companies about what the position would be in the UK Government. I think that we have to recognise that the fact that we are in the European Union is actually very good for business.

A gaf fi ddweud, Alun Ffred, imi werthfawrogi'r cyfle gwych i fynd gyda chi i gwrdd â'r cwmni yn Llanberis a gweld pa mor llwyddiannus ydyw, yn ogystal â gweld lefel yr allforion, a chlywed am y materion a godwyd ynghylch trafnidiaeth, a godwyd gyda mi ar yr achlysur hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, fel chithau, pryderaf am gwmnïau rhyngwladol mawr a beth fyddai eu hagwedd pe bai pleidlais i adael yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Nid dim ond cwmnïau fel Siemens yw'r rhain. Pan euthum ar fy nhaith fasnach i Japan y llynedd, roedd llawer o gwmnïau Japaneaidd yn awyddus i wybod beth fyddai'r sefyllfa yn Llywodraeth y DU. Credaf fod yn rhaid inni gydnabod bod y ffaith ein bod yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn dda iawn i fusnes, mewn gwirionedd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

## Gwasanaethau Bws Sir Gaerfyrddin

## Carmarthenshire Bus Service

14:34 **Rhodri Glyn Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*4. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y broses ymgynghori i drigolion sir Gaerfyrddin ynglŷn â gwasanaethau bws yn dilyn canslo gwasanaeth Arriva? OAQ(4)0357(EST)*

*4. Will the Minister make a statement on the consultation process for Carmarthenshire residents concerning bus services following the cancellation of the Arriva service? OAQ(4)0357(EST)*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:34 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

As you are aware, my officials are working with local authorities on detailed long-term plans to improve bus services in south-west Wales. I have asked Bus Users UK in Wales to organise a number of local surgeries in early February, so that the views of passengers and other key stakeholders will inform my decisions. I know that you have particular concerns about the 701 bus service in Carmarthenshire, which you wrote to me about.

Fel y gwyrddoch, mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol ar gynlluniau hirdymor manwl i wella gwasanaethau bysiau yn y de-orllewin. Rwyf wedi gofyn i Bus Users UK yng Nghymru drefnu nifer o gymorthfeydd lleol yn gynnar ym mis Chwefror, fel y bydd barn teithwyr a rhanddeiliaid allweddol eraill yn llywio fy mhenderfyniadau. Gwn fod gennych bryderon penodol am y gwasanaeth bws 701 yn Sir Gaerfyrddin, y gwnaethoch ysgrifennu ataf yn ei gylch.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:34 **Rhodri Glyn Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Diolch yn fawr iawn, Weinidog. Rydym yn gwerthfawrogi'n fawr iawn eich ymyrraeth chi yn y mater hwn, sydd wedi sicrhau bod gwasanaeth yn bodoli. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n falch o glywed y bydd cyfle i'm hetholwyr i fynychu'r cyfarfodydd hyn, oherwydd mae ganddynt lawer iawn o syniadau creadigol ynglŷn â gwella'r gwasanaeth bws ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwrandao ar ddefnyddwyr y gwasanaeth presennol, a'r rhai hwyrach a fydd yn defnyddio'r gwasanaeth os caiff ei gryfhau. Rwyf wedi cael cyfarfodydd yn ddiweddar, ac rwy'n gwybod bod Elin Jones yng Ngheredigion wedi cael cyfarfodydd hefyd, gyda'r bobl yma a byddaf yn gwneud yn siŵr eu bod yn ymwybodol o'r cyfle sydd ganddyn nhw i fwydo i mewn i'r ymgynghoriad yma.

Thank you very much, Minister. We appreciate greatly your intervention in this matter, which has ensured that there is a service in existence. However, I am pleased to hear that there will be an opportunity for my constituents to attend these meetings, because they have many creative ideas about improving the bus service and it is important that we listen to the users of the current service, and perhaps those who will use the service if it is strengthened. I have had meetings recently, and I know that Elin Jones has had meetings as well, with these people and I will make sure that they are aware of the opportunity that they have to feed in to the consultation.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:35 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you for those comments. It is local communities that will have the ideas about how we can run services. They will know when the services are required and for what purpose et cetera, rather than there just being lines on a map and companies making decisions on possible routes. If Members wish to know about any of the consultation meetings and their dates, I would be more than happy to let them have the information.

Diolch ichi am y sylwadau hynny. Y cymunedau lleol a fydd yn cael y syniadau am sut y gallwn redeg gwasanaethau. Byddant yn gwybod pan fydd angen y gwasanaethau ac at ba ddiben ac ati, yn hytrach na bod dim ond llinellau ar fap a chwmnïau yn gwneud penderfyniadau ar lwybrau posibl. Os yw'r Aelodau yn dymuno gwybod am unrhyw un o'r cyfarfodydd ymgynghori a'u dyddiadau, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i adael iddynt gael y wybodaeth.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:35 **Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, my question is to ask about what you can do to ensure that the consultation is truly comprehensive, especially for a significant number of older people who might use these buses and who this would adversely affect. They do not always have access to the internet to be able to make their points of view heard and they find it very difficult to engage with bodies like local authorities. I would like to make sure that we make it as inclusive as possible.

Weinidog, mae fy nghwestiwn i yn ymwneud â holi beth y gallwch ei wneud i sicrhau bod yr ymgynghoriad yn wirioneddol gynhwysfawr, yn enwedig i nifer sylweddol o bobl hŷn a allai ddefnyddio'r bysiau hyn ac y byddai hyn yn effeithio'n andwyol arnynt. Nid oes ganddynt fynediad i'r rhyngwrwyd bob amser fel y gallant fynegi eu safbwyntiau ac maent yn ei chael hi'n anodd ymgysylltu â chyrff fel awdurdodau lleol. Hoffwn sicrhau ein bod yn ei wneud mor gynhwysol â phosibl.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:36 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I think that I could give some further consideration to this as the plans emerge. I know that a lot of older people go to luncheon clubs and organisations and like that. When I have my regular meetings with the voluntary sector, perhaps I could indicate that that should be an agenda item. We could perhaps look at having a separate discussion on how we can access these individuals—it could of course be in their churches and chapels and other places—when we have any other plans to which they might want to input. I shall certainly take that on board and report back to Assembly Members.

Credaf y gallwn roi rhagor o ystyriaeth i hyn wrth i'r cynlluniau ddatblygu. Gwn fod llawer o bobl hŷn yn mynd i glybiau cinio a sefydliadau a'u bod yn hoffi gwneud hynny. Pan gaf fy nghyfarfodydd rheolaidd â'r sector gwirfoddol, efallai y gallwn nodi y dylai hynny fod yn eitem ar yr agenda. Efallai y gallem ystyried cael trafodaeth ar wahân ynghylch sut y gallwn gael gafael ar yr unigolion hyn—gallem wrth gwrs wneud hyn drwy eu heglwysy a'u capeli a lleoedd eraill—pan fydd gennym gynlluniau eraill yr hoffent gyfrannu atynt o bosibl. Yn sicr byddaf yn ystyried hynny ac yn adrodd yn ôl i Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

## Rhagolygon Economaidd

## Economic Forecasts

14:36 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

5. *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y rhagolygon economaidd diweddaraf ar gyfer Cymru?*  
OAQ(4)0370(EST)

5. *Will the Minister make a statement on the latest economic forecasts for Wales?* OAQ(4)0370(EST)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

- 14:36 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- There has been some very good economic news lately, particularly on the labour markets. In assessing economic performance, it is important to look at a range of indicators and to consider longer term needs.
- Bu rhywfaint o newyddion economaidd da iawn yn ddiweddar, yn enwedig am y marchnadoedd llafur. Wrth asesu perfformiad economaidd, mae'n bwysig edrych ar ystod o ddangosyddion ac ystyried anghenion tymor hwy.
- 14:37 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thank you. I also welcome the suggestion that you will now take on board what we in Plaid Cymru have long been arguing regarding the need for, and the benefits of, a development bank for Wales. I stress that what we need now on this is real action and delivery. We welcome any signs of improvement in the economy, but note the fears that many people have that much of the growth is fuelled still by consumer debt and the fact also that we are seeing very inequitable growth within the UK, with the south-east of England still being the main beneficiary. Does the Minister agree that we need the right kind of data, and current data, on the state of the Welsh economy in order to be able to plan for the future?
- Diolch. Croesawaf hefyd yr awgrym y byddwch yn awr yn ystyried yr hyn yr ydym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru wedi bod yn dadlau yn ei gylch ers amser hir o ran yr angen i ddatblygu banc i Gymru, a manteision hynny. Pwysleisiaf mai'r hyn sydd ei angen arnom yn awr yw gweithredu a chyflawni gwirioneddol. Croesawn unrhyw arwyddion o welliant yn yr economi, ond nodwn y pryderon sydd gan lawer o bobl fod llawer o'r twf yn cael ei danio o hyd gan ddyled defnyddwyr a'r ffaith hefyd ein bod yn gweld twf anghyfartal o fewn y DU, a de-ddwyrain Lloegr yw'r prif fuddiolwr o hyd. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod angen y math cywir o ddata, a data cyfredol, ar gyflwr economi Cymru er mwyn gallu cynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol?
- 14:37 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- It is very important for us to recognise that, in some ways, the south-east of England is another country in terms of the development of its economy. When we look at ourselves, we perhaps have to look more at some of the English regions in terms of any progress that is being made. I concur with your comments about consumer debt and also your concern that there are more jobs in the economy, but that they are part-time and not full-time jobs, and there is still the impact on wages and the terms and conditions of the individual and the availability of cash to them. However, there are certainly improvements.
- Mae'n bwysig iawn inni gydnabod bod de-ddwyrain Lloegr mewn rhai ffyrdd, yn wlad arall o ran datblygiad ei heconomi. Pan edrychwn ar ein hunain, rhaid inni efallai edrych yn fwy ar rai o'r rhanbarthau yn Lloegr o ran unrhyw gynnydd a wneir. Cytunaf â'ch sylwadau am ddyled defnyddwyr a hefyd eich pryder fod llawer mwy o swyddi yn yr economi, ond eu bod yn swyddi rhan amser ac nid llawn amser, a bod effaith o hyd ar gyflogau a thelerau ac amodau'r unigolyn a'r arian parod sydd ar gael iddo. Fodd bynnag, mae gwelliannau yn bendant.
- In terms of economic data, we have the economic data that we currently hold and I discuss with officials on a regular basis if there is any further information that we can have access to.
- O ran data economaidd, mae gennym y data economaidd sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd ac rwy'n trafod yn rheolaidd â swyddogion i weld a oes unrhyw wybodaeth bellach y gallwn gael gafael arni.
- 14:38 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- There is of course data that it is possible to have access to. Will the Minister promise to invest in ensuring that we in Wales, and of course the Welsh Government, have the right data at our disposal—up-to-date data, such as up-to-date quarterly gross domestic product figures? How can we plan for the future of the Welsh economy if we cannot make an accurate assessment of where we are today?
- Mae data ar gael, wrth gwrs, y mae'n bosibl cael gafael arnynt. A wnaiff y Gweinidog addo buddsoddi er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym ni yng Nghymru, ac wrth gwrs yn Llywodraeth Cymru, y data cywir at ein defnydd—data cyfredol, megis y ffigurau cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth chwarterol diweddaraf? Sut y gallwn gynllunio ar gyfer dyfodol economi Cymru os na allwn wneud asesiad cywir o'n sefyllfa heddiw?
- 14:38 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I think that we can make a relatively accurate assessment of where we are today, but I will certainly consider with my officials what further data we might require. Jane, as the Minister for Finance, has responsibility in terms of statistical data and I will certainly discuss it with her and come back to you.
- Credaf y gallwn wneud asesiad cymharol gywir o'n sefyllfa heddiw, ond yn sicr gwnaf ystyried pa ddata pellach y gallai fod eu hangen arnom gyda'm swyddogion. Mae gan Jane, fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, gyfrifoldeb o ran data ystadegol a byddaf yn sicr yn ei drafod â hi ac yn adrodd yn ôl i chi.

14:39 **Mark Isherwood** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Given that the Welsh Government is responsible for economic development in Wales, I am sure that you agree with me that we should be ambitious in our economic forecasts for Wales. How do you think this will be affected therefore by the latest gross value added wealth creation statistics, out last month, that showed that Wales, yet again, is bottom among the 12 UK nations and regions in terms of the value of goods and services produced? The figures out last week show that, although the number of working-age people in Wales has fallen by 81,000 since the last UK general election, at 546,000 it is still double the UK average.

O gofio bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn gyfrifol am ddatblygu economaidd yng Nghymru, rwy'n siŵr eich bod yn cytuno â mi y dylem fod yn uchelgeisiol yn ein rhagolygon economaidd ar gyfer Cymru. Sut ydych yn credu y bydd yr ystadegau creu cyfoeth gwerth ychwanegol crynswth diweddaraf, a gyhoeddwyd fis diwethaf, a ddangosodd fod Cymru, unwaith eto, ar y gwaelod o blith y 12 o wledydd a rhanbarthau'r DU o ran gwerth y nwyddau a'r gwasanaethau a gynhyrchir yn effeithio ar hyn? Mae'r ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn dangos, er bod nifer y bobl o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru wedi gostwng 81,000 ers etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf y DU, ei bod ddwywaith cyfartaledd y DU o hyd, sef 546,000.

14:39 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)

For once in our lives, can we all agree that we will talk Wales up? The important thing for business and industry in Wales is that we talk up what we have got: the fact that we have good investment opportunities in Wales; that some Welsh businesses are doing very well and that we are trying to create employment. I can play with statistics and choose even better statistics than the ones that you have utilised, but I do not intend to do so. I know that there is the right direction of travel coming here. I think that we have made the right decisions in terms of how we invest in business, not only in terms of finance, but also training. Perhaps, if you went outside and talked to some companies, as I spend a lot of time doing, you would realise that sometimes they say to you, 'Thanks very much; we think that you're doing the right thing'.

Am unwaith yn ein bywydau, a allwn i gyd gytuno y byddwn yn brolio am Gymru? Y peth pwysig ar gyfer busnes a diwydiant yng Nghymru yw ein bod yn brolio am yr hyn sydd gennym: y gwir yw bod gennym gyfleoedd buddsoddi da yng Nghymru; bod rhai busnesau yng Nghymru yn gwneud yn dda iawn a'n bod yn ceisio creu cyflogaeth. Gallaf chwarae ag ystadegau a dewis ystadegau gwell hyd yn oed na'r rhai rydych chi wedi eu defnyddio, ond ni fwriadaf wneud hynny. Gwn fod y cyfeiriad teithio i Gymru yn gywir. Credaf inni wneud y penderfyniadau cywir o ran sut rydym yn buddsoddi mewn busnes, nid yn unig o ran cyllid, ond hefyd o ran hyfforddiant. Efallai, pe baech yn mynd allan ac yn siarad â rhai cwmnïau, fel yr wyf i'n treulio llawer o amser yn ei wneud, byddech yn sylweddoli eu bod weithiau yn dweud wrthy, 'Diolch yn fawr iawn; rydym yn credu eich bod yn gwneud y peth cywir'.

## Y Rhwydwaith Trafnidiaeth yn Nwyrain De Cymru

## The Transport Network in South Wales East

14:40 **William Graham** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)

6. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y rhwydwaith trafndiaeth yn Nwyrain De Cymru? OAQ(4)0363(EST)

6. Will the Minister make a statement on the transport network in South Wales East? OAQ(4)0363(EST)

14:40 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I am committed to improving transport in Wales and I am considering further options for investment in south-east Wales, particularly in relation to the metro.

Rwyf wedi ymrwymo i wella trafndiaeth yng Nghymru ac yn ystyried opsiynau pellach ar gyfer buddsoddi yn neddwyrain Cymru, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r metro.

14:40 **William Graham** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Thank you very much, Minister, for your answer. I think that we are all looking forward to your recommendations both in terms of the metro and improving the road system. May I ask when you hope to make that statement?

Diolch yn fawr iawn, Weinidog, am eich ateb. Credaf ein bod i gyd yn edrych ymlaen at eich argymhellion o ran y metro ac at wella'r system ffyrdd. A gaf fi ofyn pryd rydych yn gobeithio gwneud y datganiad hwnnw?

14:40 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I am hoping to make the statement on the general issues around how the network is currently working either next week or the following week. I know that there have been concerns about traffic congestion and how accidents are dealt with in the Brynglas tunnels and all around that area.

Rwy'n gobeithio gwneud y datganiad am y materion cyffredinol sy'n ymwneud â'r ffordd y mae'r rhwydwaith yn gweithio ar hyn o bryd naill ai'r wythnos nesaf neu'r wythnos ganlynol. Gwn fod pryderon wedi codi ynghylch tagfeydd traffig a sut yr ymdrinnir â damweiniau yn nhwnelau Brynglas a'r cyffiniau.

I will be making the statement on the M4 rather later, as we are currently considering the consultation options and there is a lot of work to do around that. Also, in terms of the metro, I indicated that I would do a briefing before the Easter recess for Members, so that they could ask questions of Mark Barry and the team, and there will be a full report in the summer, once we have his report.

Gwnaf ddatganiad ar yr M4 ychydig yn ddiweddarach, gan ein bod wrthi'n ystyried yr opsiynau ymgynghori ac mae llawer o waith i'w wneud mewn perthynas â hynny. Hefyd, o ran y metro, nodais y byddwn yn cynnal sesiwn frifio cyn toriad y Pasg ar gyfer Aelodau, fel y gallant ofyn cwestiynau i Mark Berry a'r tîm, a chyflwynir adroddiad llawn yn yr haf, pan fyddwn wedi cael ei adroddiad.

14:41 **Jocelyn Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

When you are considering the options around the M4 relief road, I hope that you will bear in mind the devastating effect on the environment that going across the Gwent levels would have. Obviously, there is a less costly alternative to which I hope that you will give equal weight of consideration—the blue route proposed by Professor Stuart Cole—that would improve existing roads to the east and south of Newport.

Pan fyddwch yn ystyried yr opsiynau ynghylch ffordd liniar yr M4, gobeithio y byddwch yn cofio'r effaith ddinistriol ar yr amgylchedd y byddai mynd ar draws gwastadeddau Gwent yn ei hachosi. Yn amlwg, mae dewis amgen llai costus yr wyf yn gobeithio y gwnewch chi ei ystyried yn yr un modd—y llwybr glas a gynigir gan yr Athro Stuart Cole—a fyddai'n gwella ffyrdd presennol i'r dwyrain a'r de o Gasnewydd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:41 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Obviously, it was a consultation and I have yet to receive the recommendations from officials, or any suggestions on the direction of travel, but I can assure you that my main consideration in this is to balance everything as well as I can. However, importantly, I want to support, very much, what business wants, which are improvements to the M4 and the extension of the M4. That will be of benefit to not just south-east Wales, but the whole of south Wales.

Yn amlwg, ymgynghoriad ydoedd ac nid wyf eto wedi cael yr argymhellion gan swyddogion, nac unrhyw awgrymiadau ar gyfeiriad y teithio, ond gallaf eich sicrhau mai fy mhrif ystyriaeth yw cydbwysu popeth cystal ag y gallaf. Fodd bynnag, yn hollbwysig, rwyf am gefnogi, yn fawr iawn, yr hyn y mae busnesau am ei gael, sef gwelliannau i'r M4 ac ymestyn yr M4. Bydd hynny nid yn unig o fudd i'r de-ddwyrain ond i dde Cymru i gyd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:42 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I call the Welsh Liberal Democrats' spokesperson, Eluned Parrott.

Galwaf ar lefarydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, Eluned Parrott.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:42 **Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Diolch, Lywydd. Minister, an issue that I have raised with you before is futureproofing our transport network, and I have mentioned to you the new station at Pye Corner that is being planned, just north of where the Ebbw Vale line splits from the Machen line. This would mean that, if the line to Machen were ever to reopen, the new platform at Pye Corner would be redundant for people living on that line. Are you going to reconsider that location, or can we assume that that line is not going to reopen in the near future?

Diolch, Lywydd. Weinidog, mater yr wyf wedi'i godi gyda chi o'r blaen yw diogelu ein rhwydwaith trafnidiaeth at y dyfodol, ac rwyf wedi sôn wrthyfch am yr orsaf newydd yn Pye Corner sy'n cael ei chynllunio, ychydig i'r gogledd o'r man lle mae llinell Glynebwy yn gwahanu oddi wrth linell Machen. Byddai hyn yn golygu, pe bai'r llinell i Fachen erioed yn ailagor, y byddai'r platfform newydd yn Pye Corner yn segur i bobl sy'n byw ar y llinell honno. A ydych yn mynd i ailystyried y lleoliad hwnnw, neu a allwn dybio nad yw'r llinell honno yn mynd i ailagor yn y dyfodol agos?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:42 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I have asked my officials to look at the issues around this. On the wider issues that you have raised with me about futureproofing, that is something that will have to be taken into account with large-scale projects, such as the metro. We would have to futureproof in terms of the LDPs that are emerging from local authorities, where they are planning to build in terms of industry and housing. That will also be a part of futureproofing.

Rwyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion edrych ar y materion sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn. O ran y materion ehangach yr ydych wedi'u codi gyda mi ynghylch diogelu at y dyfodol, mae hynny'n rhywbeth y bydd yn rhaid ei ystyried gyda phrosiectau ar raddfa fawr, megis y metro. Byddai'n rhaid inni ddiogelu at y dyfodol o ran y CDLlau sy'n deillio o awdurdodau lleol, lle maent yn bwriadu adeiladu o ran diwydiant a thai. Bydd hynny hefyd yn rhan o ddiogelu at y dyfodol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:43	<b>Eluned Parrott</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo Video</a>
	<p>Thank you, Minister. Another issue that I have pressed you on before is the lack of a direct rail service from Newport to Ebbw Vale. You have said that you will review the need for this service once you have reviewed passenger numbers on the bus from Newport to Rogerstone. I have asked your office and Newport City Council for these numbers and both have said to me that they do not hold that information. I wonder whether you have reviewed the demand for this service and, if so, on what basis, if no-one actually holds those data.</p>	<p>Diolch, Weinidog. Mater arall yr wyf wedi pwyso arnoch i'w ystyried yn y gorffennol yw diffyg gwasanaeth rheilffordd uniongyrchol o Gasnewydd i Lynebwy. Rydych wedi dweud y byddwch yn adolygu'r angen am y gwasanaeth hwn ar ôl ichi adolygu niferoedd y teithwyr ar y bus o Gasnewydd i Dŷ-du. Rwyf wedi gofyn i'ch swyddfa a Chyngor Dinas Casnewydd am y niferoedd hyn ac mae'r ddau wedi dweud wrthyf nad yw'r wybodaeth honno ganddynt. Tybed a ydych wedi adolygu'r galw am y gwasanaeth hwn ac, os felly, ar ba sail, os nad yw'r data gan unrhyw un mewn gwirionedd.</p>
14:43	<b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo Video</a>
	<p>I was very interested in this matter. Obviously, I see the correspondence and I am aware of what is going on. I have asked them to give me an explanation about this particular issue and I will write to the Member on this, because you cannot review without statistics.</p>	<p>Roedd gennyf ddi-ddordeb mawr yn y mater hwn. Yn amlwg, gwelaf yr ohebiaeth ac rwy'n ymwybodol o'r hyn sy'n digwydd. Rwyf wedi gofyn iddynt roi esboniad i mi o'r mater penodol hwn a byddaf yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod ynghylch hyn, oherwydd ni allwch adolygu heb ystadegau.</p>
	<b>Busnesau Bach</b>	<b>Small Businesses</b>
14:43	<b>Keith Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo Video</a>
	<p><i>7. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ei gwaith i gefnogi busnesau bach yng Nghymru?</i>  OAQ(4)0369(EST)</p>	<p><i>7. Will the Minister give an update on her work to support small businesses in Wales?</i> OAQ(4)0369(EST)</p>
14:44	<b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo Video</a>
	<p>As you know, we are very committed to supporting and working with Welsh businesses to help them to grow and create jobs. That is why we created Business Wales as a streamlined service to make it much easier for Welsh businesses to access the advice, support and funding that they need to thrive.</p>	<p>Fel y gwyddoch, rydym yn ymrwymedig iawn i gefnogi a gweithio gyda busnesau yng Nghymru er mwyn eu helpu i dyfu a chreu swyddi. Dyna pam y crëwyd Busnes Cymru fel gwasanaeth symlach, i'w gwneud yn llawer haws i fusnesau Cymru gael gafael ar y cyngor, y cymorth a'r cyllid sydd eu hangen arnynt i ffynnu.</p>
14:44	<b>Keith Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo Video</a>
	<p>Diolch, Weinidog. Mae busnesau Llanelli wedi manteisio ar gymorth busnes Llywodraeth Cymru—y gronfa twf economaidd a chymorth masnach tramor—ac rwy'n croesawu'r ffaith bod Llanelli newydd dderbyn arian i ddatblygu ardal gwella busnes. Mae'n fwyddyn ers lansio'r siopau un-stop. Mae'r un yn Nafen yn fy etholaeth i wedi bod yn adnodd cymunedol gwerthfawr. Blwyddyn ymlaen, pa asesiadau a ydych chi wedi eu gwneud o'u llwyddiant a'u cyswllt â busnesau lleol, y trydydd sector a'r sector preifat?</p>	<p>Thanks, Minister. Llanelli businesses have taken advantage of business support from the Welsh Government—the economic growth fund and international trade support—and I also welcome the fact that Llanelli has just received money to develop a business improvement district. It is now a year since the launch of the one-stop shops. The one in Dafen in my constituency has been a valuable community resource. A year on, what assessments have you made of their success and their links with local businesses, the third sector and the private sector?</p>
14:44	<b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo Video</a>
	<p>We do think that they have been a success and we have been looking at the work that they have been undertaking, but as you will be aware, I have a Business Wales strategic board and its members constantly monitor how they think that improvements can be made to help the services. They make recommendations to me if they think that I need to make any further improvements to the service. However, we are generally well pleased with the response we have had to the service.</p>	<p>Credwn eu bod wedi bod yn llwyddiant ac rydym wedi bod yn edrych ar y gwaith y maent wedi bod yn ei wneud, ond fel y gwyddoch, mae gan Busnes Cymru fwrdd strategol ac mae ei aelodau yn monitro'n gyson sut y gellir gwneud gwelliannau er mwyn helpu'r gwasanaethau, yn eu barn hwy. Gwnânt argymhellion imi os credant fod angen imi wneud unrhyw welliannau pellach i'r gwasanaeth. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn fodlon, ar y cyfan, ar yr ymateb a gawsom i'r gwasanaeth.</p>



- 14:45 **Russell George** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- One of the key Government initiatives to help small businesses in Newtown is the development of the Siroli business model to facilitate enterprise growth. I know that Doug Hughes has been appointed to take this model forward. At a recent meeting in Newtown, a view was expressed about a lack of progress, so I would be grateful for any update on how the work is progressing. If you are in Newtown tomorrow and can spare 10 minutes, Doug Hughes and I would welcome the opportunity to have a quick chat with you, perhaps.
- Un o fentrau allweddol y Llywodraeth i helpu busnesau bach yn y Drenewydd yw datblygu model busnes Siroli i hwyluso twf menter. Gwn fod Doug Hughes wedi ei benodi i ddatblygu'r model hwn. Mewn cyfarfod diweddar yn y Drenewydd, mynegwyd barn am ddiffyg cynnydd, felly byddwn yn ddiolchgar am unrhyw wybodaeth newydd am sut y mae'r gwaith yn mynd yn ei flaen. Os ydych yn y Drenewydd yfory ac yn gallu sbario 10 munud, byddai Doug Hughes a minnau yn croesawu'r cyfle i gael sgwrs fry â chi, efallai.
- 14:45 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I feel like my meeting has been hijacked now. [Laughter.] Perhaps I should not say where I am going so often, so that I can bump into other people. I am a bit concerned about what you said about the delay on the Siroli project. May I say that you can certainly leave that in my hands, because I am a great enthusiast for the type of work that has been done by Siroli? It has been particularly successful in the Blaenau Gwent area, and we would like it to be very successful in your region as well.
- Teimlaf fod fy nghyfarfod wedi cael ei herwgipio yn awr fel petai. [Chwerthin.] Efallai na ddylwn i ddweud ble rwy'n mynd mor aml, fel y gallaf i daro i mewn i bobl eraill. Pryderaf ychydig am yr hyn a ddywedasoch am brosiect Siroli. A gaf i ddweud y gallwch yn sicr adael hynny yn fy nwylo i, oherwydd rwy'n frwd iawn dros y math o waith a wnaed gan Siroli? Bu'n arbennig o lwyddiannus yn ardal Blaenau Gwent, a hoffwn iddo fod yn llwyddiannus iawn yn eich rhanbarth chi hefyd.
- 14:46 **Peter Black** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, I have been approached by a number of small businesses in the Skewen, Birchgrove and Jersey Marine area concerning the level of broadband available to them, which is very poor indeed. BT tells me that it is not proposing to update the Skewen exchange until 2015, which seems to be a long time for these businesses to have to struggle with this particular liability. Is there any way that you can arrange to have that brought forward, or any work that you could do with BT on this particular issue?
- Weinidog, mae nifer o fusnesau bach yn ardal Sgiwen, Birchgrove a Jersey Marine wedi cysylltu â mi ynghylch lefel y band eang sydd ar gael iddynt, sy'n wael iawn a dweud y gwir. Dywed BT wrthyf nad yw'n bwriadu diweddarau cyfnewidfa Sgiwen tan 2015, sy'n ymddangos yn amser hir iawn i'r busnesau hyn orfod ymdopi â'r anghyfleustra hwn. A oes unrhyw ffordd y gallwch drefnu i hynny gael ei gyflwyno yn gynt, neu unrhyw waith y gallech ei wneud gyda BT ar y mater penodol hwn?
- 14:46 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Well, I will certainly raise this matter with my Deputy Minister, who deals with the day-to-day tasks around broadband. Obviously, there are always people who are first, people who are in the middle, and people who are last. You are talking about Skewen, but, of course, I also have similar issues, particularly around rural and other communities. We will endeavour to see whether there is anything that can be done to help to speed up any process for you, but I make no promises.
- Wel, byddaf yn sicr yn codi'r mater hwn gyda'm Dirprwy Weinidog, sy'n delio â thasgau band eang o ddydd i ddydd. Yn amlwg, mae yna bobl sy'n gyntaf, pobl sydd yn y canol, a phobl sy'n olaf bob amser. Rydych yn sôn am Sgiwen, ond, wrth gwrs, mae gennyf i broblemau tebyg, yn enwedig o ran cymunedau gwledig a chymunedau eraill. Byddwn yn ymdrechu i weld a oes unrhyw beth y gellir ei wneud er mwyn helpu i gyflymu unrhyw broses i chi, ond nid wyf yn addo dim.
- 14:46 **Christine Chapman** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- We know that, very often, the first port of call for many small businesses for business advice is their own accountants. Can you tell me, Minister, in what ways is the Welsh Government making use of the accountancy profession and helping it to know about the support and advice that the Welsh Government can provide, so that accountants can, in turn, make sure that their clients know what is available?
- Gwyddom, yn aml iawn, mai'r lle cyntaf y bydd llawer o fusnesau bach yn mynd iddo i gael cyngor busnes yw at eu cyfrifwyr eu hunain. A allwch ddweud wrthyf, Weinidog, ym mha ffyrdd y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn defnyddio'r proffesiwn cyfrifyddiaeth ac yn ei helpu i ddysgu am y cymorth a'r cyngor y gall Llywodraeth Cymru eu darparu, fel y gall cyfrifwyr, yn eu tro, sicrhau bod eu cleientiaid yn gwybod beth sydd ar gael?
- 14:47 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I have to say that accountants have been pretty positive about the work that we have undertaken here, and Ben Cottam, who is the head of the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants in Wales, is part of the management board of Business Wales, so I think that we have the appropriate links.
- Rhaid imi ddweud bod cyfrifwyr wedi bod yn eithaf cadarnhaol am y gwaith yr ydym wedi'i wneud yma, ac mae Ben Cottam, sef pennaeth Cymdeithas y Cyfrifwyr Ardystiedig Siartredig yng Nghymru, yn rhan o fwrdd rheoli Busnes Cymru, felly credaf fod y cysylltiadau priodol gennym.

## Gweithgarwch Economaidd yn Abertawe

## Economic Activity in Swansea

- 14:47 **Julie James** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
*8. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i hybu gweithgarwch economaidd yn Abertawe yn 2014? OAQ(4)0356(EST)*
- 14:47 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
Thank you very much for that question. It is very important to recognise that we continue to work with our partners to progress the Swansea bay city region and we hope that that will boost economic activity in the Swansea region.
- 14:47 **Julie James** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
Thank you for that, Minister. Last week, I was delighted to host the launch of Swansea University's school of management graduate work placement scheme here at the Senedd. This is a scheme that places very highly qualified management graduates, and also science graduates and other qualified graduates, both into SMEs and into our strategic anchor companies, assisting them to continue to inwardly invest here in Wales and also to export Swansea University's excellent science graduates to the world. Minister, what plans does the Government have to continue to effectively support schemes such as this as part of our inward investment and export strategy?
- 14:48 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
I very much welcome schemes such as this, because I think that they are very important, and we do, of course, have tailored start-up support, including financial bursaries, available to graduates who want to set up businesses in Wales, which, I think, is important. We are also focused on delivering the key actions within the youth entrepreneurship strategy about building opportunities. I am aware that six regional higher education and further education hubs have been established by Welsh colleges and universities to do that. We have also tried to realign all our services, and Welsh Government business start-up services, according to the one-stop principle. So, I think that we are doing a lot in terms of our commitment to this group.
- 14:49 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
Minister, Swansea bay city region is expected, I think, rather than hoped, to improve the future economic prospects of Swansea and other communities in the region. Are you happy with the level of consideration that the Williams commission gave to the city regions model?
- 14:49 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
The First Minister made a statement yesterday on the Williams commission, and I leave those matters with him. The Minister for local government is now actively engaged in discussions.
8. What plans does the Minister have to boost economic activity in Swansea in 2014? OAQ(4)0356(EST)
- Diolch yn fawr iawn am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'n bwysig iawn cydnabod ein bod yn parhau i weithio gyda'nartneriaid i ddatblygu dinas-ranbarth Bae Abertawe, ac rydym yn gobeithio y bydd hynny'n rhoi hwb i weithgarwch economaidd yn rhanbarth Abertawe.
- Diolch ichi am hynny, Weinidog. Yr wythnos diwethaf, roeddwn yn falch o gynnal lansiad cynllun lleoliadau gwaith i raddedigion ysgol reoli Prifysgol Abertawe yma yn y Senedd. Mae hwn yn gynllun sy'n lleoli graddedigion rheoli tra chymwysedig, a hefyd raddedigion gwyddoniaeth a graddedigion cymwysedig eraill, mewn BBaChau ac yn ein cwmnïau angori strategol, gan eu cynorthwyo i barhau i fewnffuddsoddi yma yng Nghymru a hefyd i allforio graddedigion gwyddoniaeth rhagorol Prifysgol Abertawe i'r byd. Weinidog, pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Llywodraeth i barhau i gefnogi cynlluniau fel hyn yn effeithiol fel rhan o'n strategaeth fewnffuddsoddi ac allforio?
- Croesawaf gynlluniau tebyg i hyn yn fawr iawn, oherwydd credaf eu bod yn bwysig iawn ac mae gennym, wrth gwrs, gymorth cychwyn busnes wedi'i deilwra, gan gynnwys bwrsariaethau ariannol, sydd ar gael i raddedigion sydd am sefydlu busnesau yng Nghymru, sydd, yn fy marn i, yn bwysig. Rydym hefyd yn canolbwyntio ar gyflawni'r camau gweithredu allweddol o fewn y strategaeth entrepreneuriaeth ieuencid am gyfleoedd adeiladu. Rwy'n ymwybodol bod chwe chanolfan ranbarthol addysg uwch ac addysg bellach wedi cael eu sefydlu gan golegau a phrifysgolion Cymru i wneud hynny. Rydym hefyd wedi ceisio ail-alinio ein holl wasanaethau, a gwasanaethau cychwyn busnes Llywodraeth Cymru, yn ôl yr egwyddor un stop. Felly, credaf ein bod yn gwneud llawer o ran ein hymrwymiad i'r grŵp hwn.
- Weinidog, yn fy marn i, disgwylir i ddinas-ranbarth Bae Abertawe, yn hytrach na gobeithir iddo wella rhagolygon economaidd Abertawe a chymunedau eraill yn y rhanbarth yn y dyfodol. A ydych yn fodlon ar lefel y sylw a roddodd comisiwn Williams i'r model dinas-ranbarthau?
- Gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ddoe ar gomisiwn Williams, a gadawaf y materion hynny gydag ef. Mae'r Gweinidog dros lywodraeth leol bellach yn rhan weithredol o'r trafodaethau.

14:49	<p><b>Bethan Jenkins</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Weinidog, wythnos diwethaf gwnes i a Leanne Wood fynd i gwrdd â pherchnogion busnesau bach gyda'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yng nghanol Abertawe. Un o'r materion mwyaf pwysig a wnaethon nhw ddod ger ein bron oedd y ffaith bod lot o siopau gwag yng nghanol dinas Abertawe oherwydd y diffyg gallu i ailgofrestru neu newid cofrestru'r siopau hynny sydd yn wag. Maent yn poeni'n arw, felly, bod llai a llai o bobl yn mynd i ganol dinas Abertawe o ganlyniad i'r ffaith bod diffyg siopau o safon yno, er bod y FBB yn dweud bod galw am y siopau hynny. A fedrwnch edrych i mewn i'r mater hwn, gyda'r Gweinidog llywodraeth leol, er mwyn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa ddifrifol hon?</p>	<p>Minister, last week, Leanne Wood and I went to meet the owners of small businesses with the Federation of Small Businesses in central Swansea. One of the most important issues that they brought forward was the fact that there were many vacant shops in the middle of Swansea city centre, because of the inability to reregister or change the registration of those vacant stores. They are extremely concerned, therefore, that fewer people are going to Swansea city centre as a result of the fact that there is a shortage of quality shops there, although the Federation of Small Businesses does say that there is demand for those shops. Could you look into this issue, along with your Minister for local government, in order to try to tackle this serious situation?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:50	<p><b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>As a Government, across portfolios, we are very concerned about what is happening in town centres, and what is happening with vacant shops. We are always delighted to have any representation from anyone with any useful suggestions on this matter. Obviously, the City and County of Swansea council, as a local authority, will also need to deal with these matters in terms of its strategic approach to the development of the city centre. However, if you would like to send me more particular information about the matters that you have raised from the businesses that you met, I will be more than happy to take that forward across Government.</p>	<p>Fel Llywodraeth, ar draws portffolios, rydym yn bryderus iawn am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng nghanol trefi, a beth sy'n digwydd gyda siopau gwag. Rydym bob amser yn falch iawn o gael unrhyw sylwadau gan unrhyw un sydd ag unrhyw awgrymiadau defnyddiol ar y mater hwn. Yn amlwg, bydd angen i gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe, fel awdurdod lleol, ddelio hefyd â'r materion hyn o ran ei ddull strategol o ymdrin â datblygiad canol y ddinas. Fodd bynnag, os hoffech anfon rhagor o wybodaeth benodol ataf am y materion yr ydych wedi'u codi o'r busnesau y gwnaethoch gyfarfod â hwy, byddaf yn fwy na pharod i weithredu ar hynny ar draws y Llywodraeth.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
<p><b>Datblygiad SA1</b></p>		<p><b>The SA1 Development</b></p>	
14:51	<p><b>Bethan Jenkins</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>9. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi adroddiad cynnydd ar ddatblygiad SA1? OAQ(4)0358(EST)</p>	<p>9. Will the Minister provide a progress update on the SA1 development? OAQ(4)0358(EST)</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:51	<p><b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>It is important to note that the SA1 Swansea waterfront development has transformed what was a disused docklands area into a dynamic vibrant new quarter for Swansea.</p>	<p>Mae'n bwysig nodi bod datblygiad SA1 glannau Abertawe wedi trawsnewid yr hyn a oedd yn ardal segur y dociau yn ardal newydd fywiog a deinamig i Abertawe.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:51	<p><b>Bethan Jenkins</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi chwarae rhan allweddol yn y gwaith o helpu i ddarparu seilwaith o amgylch y campws arloesedd yn y ddinas, yn ogystal â darparu cyllid sylweddol ar gyfer y datblygiad hwnnw. Tybed a fedrwn ni yma heddiw gael rhyw fath o ddiweddariad ynghylch yr hyn sydd yn digwydd gyda'r prosiect penodol hwn gennych fel Gweinidog.</p>	<p>Thank you for that response. The Welsh Government has been a key player in the work of providing the infrastructure around the innovation campus in the city, as well as providing substantial revenue for that development. I wonder whether we can have an update here today into what is happening with the specific project from you as Minister.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:51	<p><b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>In terms of SA1, the total number of sites in SA1—this might be of interest to Members here—is 53. The total number of sites vacant currently is nine, and the total number of sites sold but not built is five. So, I think that we have done very well in terms of the development of that area.</p>	<p>O ran SA1, cyfanswm nifer y safleoedd yn SA1—gallai hyn fod o ddiddordeb i Aelodau yma—yw 53. Cyfanswm nifer y safleoedd gwag ar hyn o bryd yw naw, a chyfanswm nifer y safleoedd a werthwyd ond nas adeiladwyd yw pump. Felly, credaf inni wneud yn dda iawn o ran datblygu'r ardal honno.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>

14:51 **Mike Hedges** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

As the constituency Assembly Member representing the SA1 development, I welcomed the news last week that the University of Wales Trinity St David is set to invest millions of pounds in the area to build a new city campus, following an agreement with you to sell off parts of the land. With Fabian Way being one of the main roads in and out of Swansea, and with several key infrastructure investment projects taking place in the area, what plans does the Welsh Government have to improve this major transport link?

Fel yr Aelod Cynulliad etholaethol sy'n cynrychioli datblygiad SA1, croesewis y newyddion yr wythnos diwethaf fod disgwyl i Brifysgol Cymru y Drindod Dewi Sant fuddsoddi miliynau o bunnoedd yn yr ardal i adeiladu campws dinas newydd, yn dilyn cytundeb â chi i werthu rhannau o'r tir. Gan fod Ffordd Fabian yn un o'r prif ffyrdd i mewn ac allan o Abertawe, a chyda nifer o brosiectau buddsoddi mewn seilwaith allweddol yn mynd rhagddynt yn yr ardal, pa gynlluniau sydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i wella'r cyswllt trafnidiaeth pwysig hwn?

14:52 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Fabian Way is, of course, the responsibility of the local authorities of Neath Port Talbot and Swansea. Obviously, I have had some representations about Fabian Way, and I might look at it in terms of whether I should trunk it, in terms of where the responsibility might lie. However, there are also issues around planning et cetera that emerge for anything that might come off, so I think that this is open for further discussion.

Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol Castell-nedd Port Talbot ac Abertawe, wrth gwrs, yw Ffordd Fabian. Yn amlwg, rwy wedi cael rhai sylwadau am Ffordd Fabian, ac efallai y byddwn yn edrych arno i weld a ddylwn ei throï'n gefnffordd, o ran pwy sy'n gyfrifol amdani. Fodd bynnag, mae materion yn ymwneud hefyd â chynllunio ac ati sy'n dod i'r amlwg ar gyfer unrhyw beth a allai ddigwydd, felly credaf y gellir trafod hyn ymhellach.

14:52 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Thank you for that, Minister. We also welcome the University of Wales Trinity St David development at SA1. I am sure that it will work well with the private partners in SA1 and other companies in the wider region. Have you tasked anyone in your department with leading on ongoing aftercare for those private-sector businesses in SA1, the enterprise park and other locations in the city bay region?

Diolch ichi am hynny, Weinidog. Croesawn ninnau hefyd ddatblygiad Prifysgol Cymru y Drindod Dewi Sant yn SA1. Rwy'n siŵr y bydd yn gweithio'n dda gyda'r partneriaid preifat yn SA1 a chwmnïau eraill yn y rhanbarth ehangach. A ydych wedi rhoi'r cyfrifoldeb i unrhyw un yn eich adran i arwain gwasanaeth ôl-ofal parhaus ar gyfer y busnesau hynny yn y sector preifat yn SA1, y parc menter a lleoliadau eraill yn rhanbarth bae y ddinas?

14:53 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Yes. In terms of the companies that we introduced to SA1, and the nature of them, some of them will have links into the sectors et cetera and will have officials that they actually deal with. The point that you made is also important. I think that the university will work well with the private partners, because there are a lot of innovative companies down there, which I think will benefit from the links into the university. I think that that mixed approach is very good.

Ydw. O ran y cwmnïau a gyflwynwyd gennym i SA1, a'u natur, bydd gan rai ohonynt gysylltiadau â'r sectorau ac ati a bydd ganddynt swyddogion y maent yn ymwneud â hwy mewn gwirionedd. Mae'r pwynt a wnaethoch yn bwysig hefyd. Credaf y bydd y brifysgol yn gweithio'n dda gyda'r partneriaid preifat, oherwydd mae llawer o gwmnïau arloesol i lawr yno, a fydd yn elwa, fe gredaf, ar y cysylltiadau â'r brifysgol. Credaf fod y dull gweithredu cymysg hwnnw yn dda iawn.

## Seilwaith Trafnidiaeth

## Transport Infrastructure

14:53 **Gwyn R. Price** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*10. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am sut y gall gwell seilwaith trafnidiaeth annog datblygu economaidd? OAQ(4)0361(EST)*

*10. Will the Minister make a statement on how improved transport infrastructure can encourage economic development? OAQ(4)0361(EST)*

14:53 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Yes. I think that a high-quality, efficient and effective transport system is a key to attracting business investment, enabling businesses to grow, and, importantly, getting people back and forth to work.

Gwnaf. Credaf fod system drafnidiaeth effeithlon ac effeithiol o ansawdd uchel yn allweddol i ddenu buddsoddiad busnes, gan alluogi busnesau i dyfu, ac, yn hollbwysig, sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu teithio yn ôl ac ymlaen i'r gwaith.

- 14:53 **Gwyn R. Price** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thank you for that answer. Do you agree that, through supporting more rapid trains through communities such as my own, we can take a lead in helping residents across Wales to get back into jobs?
- Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw. A ydych yn cytuno y gallwn gymryd yr awenau a helpu trigolion ledled Cymru i aildechrau gweithio, drwy gefnogi trenau cyflymach drwy gymunedau tebyg i'm cymuned i?
- 14:54 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Yes. I think that it is very important, because I do see transport as one of the key enablers in that area. I very much hope that, when we look at the metro in south-east Wales, that will be a catalyst for more employment opportunities.
- Ydw. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn, oherwydd credaf fod trafndiaeth yn un o'r ffactorau galluogi allweddol yn yr ardal honno. Rwy'n mawr obeithio, pan edrychwn ar y metro yn y de-ddwyrain, y bydd hynny'n gatalydd ar gyfer rhagor o gyfleoedd cyflogaeth.
- 14:54 **Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, yesterday you provided an update to the Assembly on your transport strategy for Wales, and I was very pleased to note your reference in that to north Wales. One of the issues, in addition to the need for a direct rail link to Liverpool, is the need for a direct rail link to Manchester airport from north Wales. One does not exist at present, but that could present huge opportunities, particularly in terms of attracting inward investment into north Wales. Is that also something that you can ensure is added to the ministerial taskforce's agenda to ensure that these shorter term goals, which should be achievable at reasonable cost, can also be achieved in addition to electrification?
- Weinidog, rhoddwyd y diweddaraf i'r Cynulliad ddoe ar eich strategaeth drafnidiaeth i Gymru, ac roeddwn yn falch iawn o nodi eich cyfeiriad ynddi at y gogledd. Un o'r materion, yn ogystal â'r angen am gyswllt rheilffordd uniongyrchol i Lerpwl, yw'r angen am gyswllt rheilffordd uniongyrchol i faes awyr Manceinion o'r gogledd. Nid oes un yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd, ond gallai hynny greu cyfleoedd enfawr, yn enwedig o ran denu mewnfuddsoddiad i'r gogledd. A yw hynny'n rhywbeth y gallwch sicrhau a gaiff ei ychwanegu at agenda'r tasglu gweinidogol er mwyn sicrhau y gall y nodau tymor byrrach hyn, y dylid eu cyflawni am gost resymol, hefyd gael eu cyflawni ar ben trydaneiddio?
- 14:55 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- When you mention transport and reasonable costs in one breath, I do not necessarily agree. However, I know that Lesley Griffiths and I will be delighted for that to be taken up as an agenda item, as I am sure will the north Wales local authorities.
- Pan soniwyd am drafnidiaeth a chostau rhesymol mewn un anadl, nid wyf o reidrydd yn cytuno. Fodd bynnag, gwn y bydd Lesley Griffiths a minnau yn falch o dderbyn hynny fel eitem ar yr agenda, fel y bydd awdurdodau lleol y gogledd mae'n siŵr.
- 14:55 **Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- A all y Gweinidog gadarnhau y bydd ganddi gyllid yn ei chyllideb i fuddsoddi mewn pob math o seilwaith hanfodol, gan gynnwys seilwaith trafndiaeth, mewn cyswllt â datblygiadau'r canolfannau a pharthau menter? Yn arbennig lle mae yna ddiffyg cysylltiadau ffyrdd addas, a fyddai hi'n gweld buddsoddi yn y cysylltiadau hynny yn rhan o'i swyddogaeth hi o ran sicrhau bod y parthau menter hynny yn gystadleuol ac yn denu buddsoddiad?
- Can the Minister confirm that she will have funding within her budget to invest in all kinds of crucial infrastructure, including transport infrastructure, in relation to the enterprise zone developments? Particularly where there is a shortage of appropriate road links, would she see investment in those links as being part of her function in terms of ensuring that the enterprise zones are competitive and attract investment?
- 14:55 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Yes, I think that that is a point very well made. The chairs of the enterprise zones in particular make that point to me. It has been particularly difficult in Snowdonia, because of the infrastructure issues, to look at how we can attract further investment into that area. I am mindful that that needs to be a priority within my budget. My budget is constrained, but I am trying, within my budget, to prioritise the areas that do well in terms of economic development, and I will continue to strive to do so.
- Byddwn, credaf fod hynny'n bwynt da iawn. Mae cadeiryddion yr ardaloedd menter yn arbennig yn gwneud y pwynt hwnnw imi. Bu'n arbennig o anodd yn Eryri, oherwydd y materion yn ymwneud â seilwaith, i edrych i weld sut y gallwn ddenu rhagor o fuddsoddiad i'r ardal honno. Rwy'n ymwybodol iawn bod angen i hynny fod yn flaenoriaeth yn fy nghyllideb. Mae cyfyngiadau ar fy nghyllideb, ond rwy'n ceisio, o fewn fy nghyllideb, i flaenoriaethu'r ardaloedd sy'n gwneud yn dda o ran datblygu economaidd, a byddaf yn parhau i ymdrechu i wneud hynny.

CERN

CERN

- 14:56 **Antoinette Sandbach** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
*11. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hyrwyddo CERN, y Sefydliad Ewropeaidd ar gyfer Ymchwil Niwclear yng Nghymru? OAQ(4)0354(EST)* *11. Will the Minister make a statement on the promotion in Wales of CERN, the European Organisation for Nuclear Research? OAQ(4)0354(EST)*
- 14:56 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
I certainly think that this must have been an excellent trip, Presiding Officer, given the number of questions on it. [Laughter.] We are engaged with CERN on the supply chain opportunities available to businesses. The organisation has also presented in Wales on the benefits for the Welsh supply chain of being involved in this project, which I think is quite important. Rhaid bod y daith hon wedi bod yn un rhagorol, Lywydd, o gofio nifer y cwestiynau yn ei chylch. [Chwerthin.] Rydym yn gweithio gyda CERN ar y cyfleoedd cadwyn gyflenwi sydd ar gael i fusnesau. Mae'r sefydliad hefyd wedi rhoi cyflwyniad yng Nghymru ar y buddiannau i'r wlad pe bai cadwyn gyflenwi Cymru yn rhan o'r prosiect hwn, sy'n eithaf pwysig yn fy marn i.
- 14:56 **Antoinette Sandbach** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Minister, the ATLAS experiment is an ongoing project that started in 2009. It investigates the fundamental processes of nature. It involves 117 universities and laboratories, and Swansea University is the only higher education institution in Wales that is involved in this work. However, it is not the only higher education institution that could benefit from it. For example, the school of engineering and applied physics at Glyndŵr University could benefit from opportunities to work, analysing the data and constructing new parts of the detectors, which could, in turn, encourage students to take their subject further and use their skills in industry. Minister, I would ask that you look at meeting with other Welsh universities—other than Swansea, which already has a very impressive presence there—to see how they could make the most of the opportunities at CERN, which will, in turn, benefit our industry and business. Weinidog, mae arbrawf ATLAS yn brosiect parhaus a ddechreuodd yn 2009. Mae'n ymchwilio i brosesau sylfaenol natur. Mae'n cynnwys 117 o brifysgolion a labordai, a Phrifysgol Abertawe yw'r unig sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru sy'n cymryd rhan yn y gwaith hwn. Fodd bynnag, nid y sefydliad addysg uwch hwn yw'r unig un a allai elwa ar hyn. Er enghraifft, gallai'r ysgol beirianeg a ffiseg gymhwysol ym Mhrifysgol Glyndŵr elwa ar gyfleoedd i weithio, gan ddadansoddi'r data a llunio rhannau newydd o'r synwryddion, a allai, yn eu tro, annog myfyrwyr i fynd â'u pwnc ymhellach a defnyddio eu sgiliau mewn diwydiant. Weinidog, hoffwn ofyn ichi ystyried cyfarfod â phrifysgolion eraill Cymru—heblaw am Abertawe, sydd eisoes â phresenoldeb trawiadol iawn yno—i weld sut y gallent wneud y gorau o'r cyfleoedd yn CERN, a fydd, yn eu tro, o fudd i'n diwydiant a'n busnes.
- 14:57 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Yes, obviously this is a matter of great interest to us as a Government. On the CERN project, I confess that my knowledge and understanding of it is limited to what I have heard on science programmes on Radio 4. I think that the most useful thing to do would be to speak to the chief scientific adviser to the Government to ask her whether she would want to bring various parties together to look at the potential benefits. Mae hwn yn amlwg yn fater sydd o ddiddordeb mawr inni fel Llywodraeth. O ran prosiect CERN, cyfaddefaf fod fy ngwybodaeth a'm dealltwriaeth ohono wedi'i gyfyngu i'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i glywed ar raglenni gwyddoniaeth Radio 4. Credaf mai'r peth mwyaf defnyddiol i'w wneud fyddai siarad â phrif gynghorydd gwyddonol y Llywodraeth a gofyn iddi a fyddai'n awyddus i ddod ag amrywiol bartion ynghyd i edrych ar y manteision posibl.

14:58

**Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I declare an interest as another Member who visited CERN last week. I saw for myself the great work being undertaken by a number of institutions in Wales, but also—importantly—by a number of individual Welsh scientists there. Wales is well represented in CERN; in particular, I say to the Minister that Welsh-speaking scientists are represented in CERN. Scientists who know the difference between a neutron and a proton are represented in CERN, and scientists who have had their education through the medium of Welsh are responsible for some of the most highly technical engineering projects in the world. In that context, the comments of the vice chair of the Conservative party, that teaching science through the medium of Welsh is holding back Welsh education, are bad for Welsh science, bad for the image of Wales and bad for Wales in CERN. I hope that you would agree with me, Minister, that Michael Fabricant should go to CERN himself, see what Welsh scientists are doing there, and perhaps be bombarded with some particles to knock some sense into him. [Laughter.]

Datganaf fuddiant fel Aelod arall a ymwelodd â CERN yr wythnos diwethaf. Gwelais drosof fy hun y gwaith mawr sy'n cael ei wneud gan nifer o sefydliadau yng Nghymru, ond hefyd—yn bwysig ddiagon—gan nifer o wyddonwyr unigol o Gymru yno. Mae Cymru wedi ei chynrychioli'n dda yn CERN; yn enwedig, dywedaf wrth y Gweinidog y caiff gwyddonwyr sy'n siarad Cymraeg eu cynrychioli yn CERN. Caiff gwyddonwyr sy'n gwybod y gwahaniaeth rhwng niwtron a phroton eu cynrychioli yn CERN, ac mae gwyddonwyr sydd wedi cael eu haddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn gyfrifol am rai o'r prosiectau peirianeg mwyaf technegol yn y byd. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, mae sylwadau is-gadeirydd y blaid Geidwadol, sef bod addysgu gwyddoniaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn rhwystro addysg Gymraeg, yn beth drwg i wyddoniaeth yng Nghymru, yn beth drwg i ddelwedd Cymru ac yn beth drwg i Gymru yn CERN. Gobeithio y byddech yn cytuno â mi, Weiniidog, y dylai Michael Fabricant fynd i CERN ei hun, gweld beth mae gwyddonwyr Cymru yn ei wneud yno, a chael ei fombardio efallai gan rai gronynnau er mwyn dod ag ef at ei goed. [Chwerthin.]

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:59

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Well, may I say that, at the end of the day, we have extremely distinguished Welsh scientists, whether they speak through the medium of Welsh or English? I always remember a conversation with the late Professor Phil Williams about how science had contributed to the development of Wales, and about who Welsh scientists were. So, your points are made and understood.

Wel, a gaf ddweud, yn y pen draw, fod gennym wyddonwyr hynod nodedig o Gymru, pa un a ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg neu Saesneg. Rwyf bob amser yn cofio sgwrs gyda'r diweddar Athro Phil Williams ynglŷn â sut yr oedd gwyddoniaeth wedi cyfrannu at ddatblygiad Cymru, ac ynghylch pwy oedd y gwyddonwyr o Gymru. Felly, caiff eich pwyntiau eu gwneud a'u deall.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

## Gwasanaethau Rheilffyrdd yng Ngogledd Cymru

## Rail Services in North Wales

14:59

**Mark Isherwood** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*12. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yng Ngogledd Cymru? OAQ(4)0366(EST)*

*12. Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of rail services in North Wales? OAQ(4)0366(EST)*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:59

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I am committed to improving rail services in north Wales.

Rwyf wedi ymrwymo i wella gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yn y gogledd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:59

**Mark Isherwood** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

What consideration did you give to the number of rail travellers who will be visiting the new prison in Wrexham when you made the decision to reduce the redoubling of the line between Wrexham and Chester by two miles, halving future capacity on the line? If such consideration could not have been given at that time, will you review that now?

Pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd gennych i nifer y teithwyr rheilffordd a fydd yn ymweld â'r carchar newydd yn Wrecsam pan fyddwch yn gwneud y penderfyniad i dynnu dwy filltir oddi ar y gwaith o ailddyblu'r llinell rhwng Wrecsam a Chaer, gan haneru'r capasiti ar y llinell yn y dyfodol? Os na allai ystyriaeth o'r fath fod wedi cael ei rhoi ar y pryd, a wneuch chi adolygu hynny nawr?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

15:00

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I assume that you are talking about the Wrexham-Saltney rail project. I am content that the benefits of that project are on schedule and I am very happy with the decision that I have made.

Rwy'n cymryd eich bod yn siarad am brosiect rheilffordd Wrecsam-Saltney. Rwy'n fodlon bod manteision y prosiect hwnnw'n mynd rhagddynt yn ôl y disgwyl ac rwy'n hapus iawn gyda'r penderfyniad a wneuthum.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

- 15:00 **Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei pharodrwydd i gyflawni ei haddewid i gwrdd â chwmnïau rheilffyrdd stêm a threftadaeth yn y gogledd i drafod y posibilrwydd cynhyrfus o sicrhau cysylltiad rheilffordd cyfan gwbl mewn cylch o Borthmadog—sef prif orsaf reilffordd gogledd Cymru, wrth reswm—i Gaernarfon a Bangor, i'r brif reilffordd ac i lawr i Flaenau Ffestiniog ac yn ôl i Borthmadog.
- I thank the Minister for her willingness to deliver on her pledge to meet with the steam and heritage rail companies in north Wales to discuss the exciting possibility of ensuring a railway connection in an entire circle from Porthmadog—north Wales's main station, of course—to Caernarfon and Bangor and then to the main line and down to Blaenau Ffestiniog and back to Porthmadog.
- 15:00 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I am very much looking forward to the meeting because some of these lines could be quite important to us in terms of tourism activity and for the good of the region—and, eventually, in terms of employment opportunities and prospects. We have to utilise the excellent resources that we have and encourage organisations like those to carry on with their good work.
- Edrychaf ymlaen yn fawr iawn at y cyfarfod oherwydd gallai rhai o'r llinellau hyn fod yn eithaf pwysig inni o ran gweithgarwch twristiaeth ac er budd y rhanbarth—ac, yn y pen draw, o ran cyfleoedd cyflogaeth a rhagolygon am gyflogaeth. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r adnoddau rhagorol sydd gennym ac annog sefydliadau fel y rheini i barhau â'u gwaith da.
- 15:01 **Aled Roberts** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, I note your comments with regard to the amended plans for Wrexham to Saltney. Can I ask that you look at futureproofing as far as the amended details are concerned, which take out the possibility of park and travel at Wrexham north? Will you or the ministerial task group engage with Merseytravel? It announced last week that the Holton Curve will go to stage 4 in terms of the governance for railway investment projects, but has said that it is unlikely to proceed without support from outside its region because it is currently only 28 out of 35 on its priority list.
- Weinidog, nodaf eich sylwadau o ran y cynlluniau diwygiedig ar gyfer Wrecsam i Saltney. A gaf i ofyn ichi edrych ar ddiogelu at y dyfodol o ran y manylion diwygiedig, sy'n dileu'r posibilrwydd o wasanaeth parcio a theithio yng ngogledd Wrecsam? A wnewch chi neu'r grŵp gorchwyl gweinidogol gysylltu â Merseytravel? Cyhoeddodd yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd Tro Halton yn mynd ymlaen i gam 4 o ran llywodraethu prosiectau buddsoddi mewn rheilffyrdd, ond mae wedi dweud ei fod yn annhebygol o barhau heb gymorth o'r tu allan i'w ranbarth gan mai dim ond yn safle 28 allan o 35 y mae ar ei restr o flaenoriaethau.
- 15:01 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I assure you that the communication will happen with Merseyside. I also know that my colleague the Minister for Finance is meeting with the Mersey Dee Alliance tomorrow to talk about relevant cross-border issues, so you can be assured on those points. It is important that the north Wales taskforce on transport looks at the issues around HS2 and all sorts of issues relating to our links into England.
- Gallaf eich sicrhau y byddwn yn cysylltu â Glannau Mersi. Gwn fod fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Cyllid yn cyfarfod â Chynghrair Mersi a'r Ddyfrdwy yfory i drafod materion trawsffiniol perthnasol, fel y gellir rhoi sicrwydd ichi ar y pwyntiau hynny. Mae'n bwysig bod tasglu'r gogledd ar drafndiaeth yn edrych ar faterion HS2 a phob math o faterion sy'n ymwneud â'n cysylltiadau â Lloegr.
- Y Rhwydwaith Cefnffyrdd ym Mhowys** **The Trunk Road Network in Powys**
- 15:02 **Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- 13. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd ym Mhowys? OAQ(4)0368(EST)*
- 13. Will the Minister make a statement on the trunk road network in Powys? OAQ(4)0368(EST)*
- 15:02 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thank you for that question, because there are a lot of issues in terms of Powys roads. I hope that we can deliver our programme of improvements on those roads and the maintenance of the trunk road network in all parts of Wales, including Powys.
- Diolch ichi am y cwestiwn hwnnw, oherwydd mae llawer o broblemau ynghylch ffyrdd Powys. Gobeithio y gallwn gyflawni ein rhaglen o welliannau ar y ffyrdd hynny a chynnal a chadw'r rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd ym mhob rhan o Gymru, gan gynnwys Powys.



15:02	<b>Kirsty Williams</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Yes, indeed, Minister, there are a lot of issues with our roads. Despite the installation of a pedestrian crossing on the A470 at Newbridge-on-Wye, many children who have to cross that road to go to the primary school find that irresponsible drivers are failing to stop. Will you support the community council's calls for 20 mph zones on that road at the beginning and end of the school day and the installation of appropriate warning signs to alert drivers to the presence of young children on that trunk road?</p>	<p>le, yn wir, Weinidog, mae llawer o broblemau ynghylch ein ffyrdd. Er i groesfan i gerddwyr gael ei gosod ar yr A470 yn y Bontnewydd ar Wy, mae llawer o blant sy'n gorfod croesi'r ffordd honno i fynd i'r ysgol gynradd yn gorfod ymdopi â gyrwyr anghyfrifol sy'n methu â stopio. A wnewch chi gefnogi galwadau'r cyngor cymuned am barthau 20 milltir yr awr ar y ffordd honno ar ddechrau a diwedd y diwrnod ysgol a gosod arwyddion rhybudd priodol i rybuddio gyrwyr am bresenoldeb plant ifanc ar y gefnffordd honno?</p>
15:02	<b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>I think that it would be enormously helpful to visit with my officials when I am next in Powys to look at the issues when children are coming out of school et cetera, and to take the discussion from there.</p>	<p>Credaf y byddai'n helpu llawer pe bawn yn ymweld gyda'm swyddogion y tro nesaf y byddaf ym Mhowys er mwyn ystyried y problemau o ran plant yn dod allan o'r ysgol ac ati, a datblygu'r drafodaeth o'r fan honno.</p>
	<b>Ardal Fenter Glannau Dyfrdwy</b>	<b>Deeside Enterprise Zone</b>
15:03	<b>Llyr Gruffydd</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>14. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am berfformiad Ardal Fenter Glannau Dyfrdwy? OAQ(4)360(EST)</p>	<p>14. Will the Minister make a statement on the performance of the Deeside Enterprise Zone? OAQ(4)360(EST)</p>
15:03	<b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Yes, a progress update was published in the autumn term. I have also published performance indicators and targets against which we will report further progress in May of this year and on an annual basis thereafter.</p>	<p>Gwnaf. Cyhoeddwyd y newyddion diweddaraf am gynnydd yn ystod tymor yr hydref. Rwyf hefyd wedi cyhoeddi dangosyddion a thargedau perfformiad y byddwn yn nodi cynnydd pellach yn eu herbyn ym mis Mai eleni ac yn flynyddol wedi hynny.</p>
15:03	<b>Llyr Gruffydd</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Diolch am yr ateb. Rydym eisoes wedi clywed galwad i gryfhau'r isadeiledd trafniadaeth o gwmpas rhai o'r parthau menter sydd gennym. Byddwch yn ymwybodol, rwy'n siŵr, o un alwad benodol i ddatblygu gorsaf drenau ar y parc diwydiannol yng Nglannau Dyfrdwy. Pa ystyriaeth fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei rhoi i'r awgrym hwnnw?</p>	<p>Thank you for that response. We have already heard a call to strengthen the transport infrastructure around some of our enterprise zones. I am sure that you will be aware of one specific call to develop a train station on Deeside industrial estate. What consideration will the Welsh Government give to that suggestion?</p>
15:03	<b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>I have already visited the site of the proposed railway station to have a look at it. It is something that features in the discussions within the enterprise zone board, which is coming forward with suggestions regarding infrastructure like this. If we are able to do so, and think that it is value for money, it is certainly something that we will put in place.</p>	<p>Rwyf eisoes wedi ymweld â safle'r orsaf reilffordd arfaethedig i gael golwg arno. Mae'n rhywbeth sy'n cael ei gynnwys yn y trafodaethau o fewn y bwrdd ardal fenter, sy'n cyflwyno awgrymiadau ynghylch mathau fel hyn o seilwaith. Os gallwn wneud hynny, a chredaf ei fod yn werth am arian, mae'n sicr yn rhywbeth y byddwn yn ei roi ar waith.</p>
	<b>Y Seilwaith Trafniadaeth yng Nghanolbarth a Gorrlewin Cymru</b>	<b>The Transport Infrastructure in Mid and West Wales</b>
15:04	<b>Rebecca Evans</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>15. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y seilwaith trafniadaeth yng Nghanolbarth a Gorrlewin Cymru? OAQ(4)0364(EST)</p>	<p>15. Will the Minister make a statement on the transport infrastructure in Mid and West Wales? OAQ(4)0364(EST)</p>

15:04	<p><b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>My priorities are ensuring that we have transport infrastructure that improves economic competitiveness and provides enhanced access to jobs and services for communities across your region.</p>	<p>Fy mlaenoriaethau yw sicrhau bod gennym seilwaith trafnidiaeth sy'n gwella cystadleurwydd economaidd ac sy'n darparu mynediad gwell at swyddi a gwasanaethau ar gyfer cymunedau ar draws eich rhanbarth.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
15:04	<p><b>Rebecca Evans</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>I would like to take this opportunity to ask you to join me in calling on Network Rail to ensure that it uses as many local contractors and workers as possible when dealing with the recent storm damage. I know that when it dually the line at Loughor, for example, 80% of workers lived within just half an hour of the site. I would like to see something similar happening on the Cambrian coast line so that something positive can come out of the damage.</p>	<p>Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ofyn ichi ymuno â mi i alw ar Network Rail i sicrhau ei fod yn defnyddio cymaint o gontractwyr a gweithwyr lleol ag y bo modd wrth ymdrin â'r difrod storm diweddar. Gwn, pan oedd yn deulol'r llinell yng Nghasllwchr, er enghraifft, fod 80% o weithwyr yn byw o fewn hanner awr i'r safle. Hoffwn weld rhywbeth tebyg yn digwydd ar lein arfordir y Cambrian fel y gall rhywbeth cadarnhaol ddeillio o'r difrod.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
15:04	<p><b>Edwina Hart</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Unfortunately, I do not have the power to direct how Network Rail manages its activity, but I fully support the importance of using local skills where possible. I also understand and have spoken to Network Rail about the importance of committing to strengthen its links to local contractors, and the repair work on the Cambrian line is being undertaken by several contractors, including Welsh contractors. I think that it is a point that is very well made.</p>	<p>Yn anffodus, nid oes gennyf bwerau i gyfarwyddo sut y mae Network Rail yn rheoli ei weithgareddau, ond cefnogaf yn llwyr bwysigrwydd defnyddio sgiliau lleol lle y bo'n bosibl. Deallaf hefyd pa mor bwysig ydyw bod Network Rail yn ymrwymo i atgyfnerthu ei gysylltiadau â chontractwyr lleol, ac rwyf wedi siarad â swyddogion Network Rail ynghylch hyn, ac mae'r gwaith atgyweirio ar lein y Cambrian yn cael ei wneud gan sawl contractiwr, gan gynnwys contractwyr o Gymru. Credaf fod hwnnw'n bwyt da iawn.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
15:05	<p><b>Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd ar yr Ymchwiliad i Bolisi Ynni a Chynllunio yng Nghymru— Adroddiad Dilynol</b></p> <p><b>Llywydd / The Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>I call on the Chair of the Environment and Sustainability Committee, Dafydd Elis-Thomas, to move the motion.</p> <p>Cynnig NDM5415 Dafydd Elis-Thomas</p> <p>Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:</p> <p>Yn nodi adroddiad dilynol y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd ar ei ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni a chynllunio yng Nghymru a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2013.</p>	<p><b>The Environment and Sustainability Committee's Report on the Inquiry into Energy Policy and Planning in Wales—Follow-up Report</b></p> <p>Galwaf ar Gadeirydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd, Dafydd Elis-Thomas, i gynnig y cynnig.</p> <p>Motion NDM5415 Dafydd Elis-Thomas</p> <p>To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:</p> <p>Notes the follow-up report of the Environment and Sustainability Committee on its inquiry into energy policy and planning in Wales which was laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2013.</p>	<p><b>Y</b> Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
15:05	<p><b>Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Cynigiad y cynnig.</p> <p>Mae'n frain i mi fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor i agor y drafodaeth ar yr adroddiad diweddaraf, a thynnu sylw, nid yn unig at yr adroddiad, sydd ymhlith eich dogfennau, ond hefyd at ymateb y Llywodraeth. Diolch i'r Llywodraeth am dderbyn, mewn egwyddor neu yn rhannol, bron y cyfan o'r argymhellion. Arfer da iawn gan Lywodraeth Cymru yw derbyn, yn gyffredinol, argymhellion y pwyllgor hwn.</p>	<p>I move the motion.</p> <p>It is my privilege as the committee Chair to open this debate on the committee's latest report, and to draw attention, not only to the report, which is among your documents, but also to the Government's response. I thank the Government for accepting, in principle or partially, almost all the recommendations. It is very good practice, if I may say so, from the Welsh Government in accepting, generally speaking, the recommendations of this committee.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>

Ym mis Mehefin 2012, sy'n teimlo yn bell yn ôl erbyn hyn, cyhoeddodd y pwyllgor ein hadroddiad cyntaf ar bolisi ynni a chynllunio yng Nghymru. Fel y nodwyd yn yr adroddiad hwnnw, un o'r heriau amlycaf rydym yn ei wynebu yw pwysigrwydd ymateb yn briodol i'r newid yn yr hinsawdd yng Nghymru, ac yn wir yn fyd-eang. Fy mraint yw cynrychioli yn y Cynulliad hwn un o'r gwyddonwyr pwysicaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac o bosibl yn Ewrop, yn y maes hwn, sef Syr John Houghton, y meteorolegydd enwog o sir y Fflint.

Os yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn llwyddo i ymateb yn briodol i'r heriau o ran newid yn yr hinsawdd, mae Cymru yn debygol o elwa'n sylweddol o ran ei hamgylchedd a'i heconomi. Fodd bynnag, os ydym yn methu—os yw'r Llywodraeth yn methu—yna mae'r canlyniadau'n ddifrifol.

Prin un mis ar bymtheg yn ddiweddarach, rydym wedi gweld sut y gall tywydd annhymhorol eithafol, ond bellach amlach ei ergyd, greu difrod mawr, yn enwedig o ran y dinistr a grëwyd gan yr eira mawr ddiwedd y gwanwyn y llynedd, a'r difrod a wnaed i rannau helaeth o'r arfordir y gaeaf hwn. Cefais, fel llawer ohonoch, y cyfle i ymweld â lleoliadau'r difrod yn fy ardal fy hun ar lannau bae Ceredigion. Fel un a fu'n rhybuddio'n feirniadol am unrhyw oedi o ran delio â'r dinistr a grëwyd a'r bylchau sydd yn ein hamddiffynfeydd, a gaf i groesawu'r gweithredu buan bellach ar ran Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru ac Awdurdod Parc Cenedlaethol Eryri ynglŷn â'r bwch yn y clawdd llanw, yn enwedig yn ardal Pensarn a Llanbedr, a'r defnydd o gymorth hofrennydd, i sicrhau y bydd y bwch yn cael ei ddiogelu, o leiaf yn y tymor byr, gan weddio, yn llythrennol, gyd-Aelodau, na fydd gwyntoedd cryfion o'r cyfeiriad anghywir yn cydamseru â llanw uchel, fel y digwyddodd i achosi'r dinistr gwreiddiol?

Y cwestiwn i'w ofyn erbyn hyn i ni fel pwyllgor, neu'r cwestiwn i'w ofyn bob tro y bydd pwyllgor o'r Cynulliad yn cynhyrchu adroddiad—ac a gaf i ddweud, wrth sôn am hyn, fel y dywedais yn y pwyllgor y bore yma, fy mod i dipyn bach yn flinedig yn gwrando ar bobl yn y cyfryngau, arbenigwyr honedig mewn mudiadau gwirfoddol, yn dweud nad yw'r Cynulliad hwn yn gweithredu yn effeithiol? Rydym fel pwyllgor, fel y mae'r Siambr hon heddiw yn llawn, yn gweithredu'n gyson wrth graffu ar y Llywodraeth i sicrhau democratiaeth effeithiol yng Nghymru. Felly, dylai rai o'r bobl sy'n conan edrych gartref, ar eu heffeithlonrwydd eu hunain yn adrodd ac yn craffu ar yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud. Sylw wrth basio yw hwnnw.

In June 2012, which feels a long way away now, the Environment and Sustainability Committee published its first report on energy policy and planning in Wales. As was reported at the time, one of the main challenges that we face is the importance of getting the response to climate change right in Wales, and indeed on a global level. It is my privilege to represent in this Assembly one of the pre-eminent scientists in the UK, and possibly in Europe, working in this area, namely Sir John Houghton, the famous meteorologist from Flintshire.

If the Welsh Government does succeed in getting it right in terms of climate change, then Wales is likely to make substantial environmental and economic gains. However, if the Government gets it wrong, then the consequences could be severe.

Some sixteen months on, we have just seen how extreme unseasonable weather, which now occurs more often, can have a devastating impact, particularly in terms of the devastation wrought by the late spring snows last year and the destruction of and damage to large swathes of coastline this winter. I, like many of you, had an opportunity to visit some areas of damage in my own area on the coast of Cardigan bay. As one who has been critically warning about any delays in dealing with the devastation caused and the gaps left in our flood defences, may I welcome the early action on behalf of Natural Resources Wales and Snowdonia National Park Authority in terms of the gap in the flood defences in Pensarn and Llanbedr, and the use of helicopter support, in order to ensure that that damage is safeguarded, at least in the short term, while praying, quite literally, that there will be no further strong winds from the wrong direction coinciding with a very high tide, as was the case that caused the recent destruction that we suffered in that area?

The central question for us as a committee, which should be asked every time a committee of the Assembly produces a report—may I say, whilst I am discussing this, and I said this at committee this morning, that I am a little tired of listening to people in the media, who claim to be experts in voluntary organisations, saying that this Assembly is not working effectively? We as a committee, as this Chamber is doing today, which is full, work consistently in scrutinising the Government in order to ensure effective democracy in Wales. So, some of these people who are complaining should look closer to home at their own efficiency in reporting and scrutinising our activity. Those were just a few words in passing.

Yn ein hadroddiad, fe wnaethom ymrwymiad i ddwyn Llywodraeth Cymru i gyfrif am roi'n hargymhellion ar gyfer gwella ar waith. Rydym wedi cadw at yr ymrwymiad hwnnw ac wedi casglu tystiolaeth a chyhoeddi adroddiad yn crynhoi'n barn am yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud. Y cwestiwn canolog sy'n dal heb ei ateb yw hwnnw sy'n ymwneud â datganoli rhagor o bwerau i Gymru i ganiatáu i ni benderfynu ar brosiectau cynhyrchu ynni ar raddfa fwy a phennu cyfraddau cymhorthdal ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy. Wrth gyflwyno'n hadroddiad yn 2012, gwnaethom alw ar y Prif Weinidog i gyflwyno'i ddadl yn glir. Mae ef wedi gwneud hynny. Mae'r ddadl honno wedi'i chyflwyno, ac rydym yn pryderu, ond nid yn synnu, bod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, unwaith eto, wedi gwrthod cais Llywodraeth Cymru am y pwerau hyn. Mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig wedi awgrymu'n chwethig y gallai gymryd pwerau oddi ar awdurdodau lleol a'u trosglwyddo i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol y Deyrnas Unedig; nid oes gennym ryw olwg bositif iawn ar bethau felly. Fodd bynnag, os ydym am gael penderfyniadau sydd wedi'u seilio ar y ddealltwriaeth orau bosibl o'r ffactorau cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol perthnasol, mae'n rhaid iddynt gael eu gwneud mor lleol â phosibl.

Rydym wedi gweld yr anawsterau sy'n codi pan ddefnyddir system sydd wedi'i lleoli yn Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig—sydd, yn achos yr amgylchedd, yn bennaf yn llywodraeth dros Loegr—ar gyfer delio ag ardaloedd lleol yng Nghymru. Mae'r oedi ynglŷn ag ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus ynglŷn â datblygiadau ynni adnewyddadwy ym Mhowys yn ein pryderu. Mae hyn yn tanlinellu'r angen i benderfyniadau fel hyn gael eu gwneud yma yng Nghymru.

Pwerau sydd eisoes yng ngofal yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon yw'r pwerau hyn. Mae'r Alban yn arwain y ffordd ym maes cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy, meddai'r tystion wrthym. Fodd bynnag, yma yng Nghymru, mae gennym gyfle i arwain ym maes cynhyrchu ynni carbon isel o bob math, dim ond inni gael yr arfau i wneud hynny a chyflawni'n potensial. Rydym yn ddiolchgar i Lywodraeth Cymru am osod yr achos yn glir ac rydym yn cefnogi hynny.

Mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, sy'n gweithredu fel Llywodraeth dros Loegr, o blaid datblygu nwy anghonfensiynol. Nid ydym wedi'n hargyhoeddi gan y ddadl o blaid datblygu ffynhonnell ynni carbon dwys arall, ac mae hyn yn gyffredinol yn farn sy'n cael ei dal ar draws y pwyllgor. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn awr yn wynebu penderfynu ar achosion cynllunio anodd ac rydym yn galw eto ar Lywodraeth Cymru i'w cynorthwyo â'r dasg hon drwy gyhoeddi canllawiau ychwanegol. Yn Lloegr, mae canllawiau ar gael sy'n fwy manwl, ac sy'n cyfeirio'n fwy penodol at nwy siâl a methan gwely glo, na'r hen ganllawiau cynllunio ar fwynau sy'n parhau yn weithredol yng Nghymru. Mae yna gytundeb cyffredinol ymhlith ein rhanddeiliaid a'n tystion bod angen canllawiau ychwanegol yng Nghymru, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried gweithredu ymhellach ar y mater hwn.

In our report, we made a commitment to hold the Welsh Government to account on for delivering the improvements we recommended. We have stuck to that commitment and we have gathered evidence and published a report that summarises our opinions on the Government's progress. The central questions that remains to be answered is that of devolving further powers to Wales to allow us to decide on larger scale energy generation projects and the subsidy rates for renewables. In presenting our report in 2012, we called on the First Minister to make his case clearly. He has done so. That case has now been made, and we are concerned, but not surprised, that the UK Government has again rejected the Welsh Government's calls for these powers. The UK Government has suggested oddly that it may take powers away from local authorities and transfer them to the UK Secretary of State; we do not have a particularly positive view of such developments. However, if we are to have decisions that are based on the best possible understanding of the social, economic and environmental factors associated with them, then they must be taken as locally as possible.

We have seen the difficulties that are caused when a system that is based in the United Kingdom Government—which, in the case of the environment, is mostly a government for England—is used for dealing with local areas in Wales. The delays in public inquiries in terms of renewable energy generation in Powys are a cause for concern. This highlights the need for such decisions to be made in Wales.

These are powers already held by Scotland and Northern Ireland. According to witnesses, Scotland is seen as leader in renewable energy generation. However, we in Wales have an opportunity to lead in low-carbon energy production, but we will require the tools to deliver this if we are to fulfil our potential. We are grateful to the Welsh Government for clearly setting out the case, and we support that.

The exploitation of unconventional gas has received the support of the UK Government, which operates as the Government for England. We are not convinced that the case has been made for exploiting a further source of carbon rich energy generation—a view generally held across the committee. Local authorities now face difficult planning decisions and we renew our call for the Welsh Government to support them in this difficult task by issuing additional guidance. In England, there is now guidance available that is a lot more detailed and specific to shale gas and coal-bed methane than the old minerals planning guidance that prevails in Wales. There is a consensus among stakeholder and our witnesses that additional guidance is needed in Wales, and I ask that the Minister consider further action on this point.

Mae un neu ddau o feysydd eraill, tra fy mod wrthi, yr hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog eu hesbonio ymhellach. Rydym yn dal i aros i'r Llywodraeth gyhoeddi cynlluniau gweithredu ar gyfer pob math o ynni adnewyddadwy. Yn yr ymateb, dywedodd y Llywodraeth y gallem ddisgwyl cynllun cyflenwi yn y flwyddyn newydd. Mae hi bellach yn flwyddyn newydd, a charwn wybod pryd y bydd y cynlluniau hyn yn cael eu cyhoeddi.

Hefyd, rydym yn awchus iawn yn darllen cofnodion cyfarfodydd grŵp cyflenwi strategol ynni Cymru. Mae'r cofnodion ar y we wedi cyrraedd ym mis Mai 2013. Ble mae cofnodion 25 Tachwedd? A allwn gael gwybod pryd y byddant ar gael?

O ran yr oedi yn y broses o benderfynu ar rai o'r ceisiadau a gyflwynwyd ers cryn amser, rwy'n derbyn mai Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig sy'n penderfynu ar y rhan fwyaf o'r rhain, ond mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru ran hanfodol, yn enwedig o ran datrys problemau trafnidiaeth. Yn ôl yr ymatebion blaenorol i'n hargymhellion ar drafnidiaeth, nid yw'n ymddangos bod camau digon pendant wedi'u cymryd i ddatrys y problemau hyn.

Hefyd, ynglŷn ag adroddiad Hyder, mae rhesymau wedi bod dros yr oedi yn gweithredu ar hyn, ond carwn gael sicrwydd y bydd hyn, hefyd, yn cael ei weithredu yn fuan.

Rwy'n credu fy mod i wedi rhoi digon i'r Gweinidog ei ystyried ar ddechrau'r drafodaeth hon, felly rwy'n edrych ymlaen at weddill y ddadl.

There are one or two other areas, while I am at it, on which I would like further clarity from the Minister. We are still awaiting the publication of action plans for each form of renewable energy. The Government's response said that we could expect a delivery plan in the new year. It is now the new year, and I would like to know when these plans will be published.

Also, we are always eager to read the minutes of the energy Wales strategic delivery group. Minutes from the May 2013 meeting have been published on the internet. Where are the 25 November minutes? Can you confirm when these will be available?

On the delay in resolving some of the long-standing applications, I accept that it is the UK Government that decides on most of these, but the Welsh Government has a critical role to play, especially in resolving transport issues. Your previous responses to our transport recommendations do not seem to show a proactive approach to sorting these out.

Also, with regard to the Hyder report, there have been reasons for the delay in taking action, but I would like assurance that this, too, will be implemented soon.

I think that I have given the Minister enough to be getting on with in opening this debate, so I look forward to the remainder of the debate.

15:14

## Julie James [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I rise in this debate to add my voice to commending the Welsh Government for its stance on energy devolution and to encourage it to continue the fight to get energy devolved to Wales, as it certainly ought to be, in conjunction with the proposals in the planning Bill for sorting out the levels at which planning for energy are correctly situated.

On that theme, though, for small energy projects, particularly on-farm anaerobic digestion and small hydro projects, I would also urge the Government to look at providing right now some centralised support for planning authorities, which are dealing with schemes that are often the only scheme that they see, in order for them to pool expertise and so on. I think that this would speed up the process and, as we heard in committee only this morning, it would maximise the ability of Wales to benefit from the feed-in tariffs regime before the Government dismantles it completely. On that point, I note that the Government is also continuing to push for the devolution of the renewable energy certificates and for control over that sort of subsidy. Again, I commend the Government for its stance on that and would like to hear more about quite where we are in that conversation.

Codaf yn y ddadl hon i ychwanegu at y ganmoliaeth i Lywodraeth Cymru am ei safbwynt ar ddatganoli ynni ac i'w hannog i barhau â'r frwydr i ddatganoli ynni i Gymru, fel y dylid gwneud yn sicr, ar y cyd â'r cynigion yn y Bil cynllunio ar gyfer rhoi trefn ar y lefelau priodol ar gyfer cynllunio mewn perthynas ag ynni.

Fodd bynnag, ar y thema honno, ar gyfer prosiectau ynni bach, yn enwedig ar brosiectau treulio anaerobig a phrosiectau dŵr bach ar ffermydd, byddwn hefyd yn erfyn ar y Llywodraeth i ystyried darparu rhyw fath o gymorth canolog ar unwaith i awdurdodau cynllunio, sy'n ymdrin â chynlluniau lle mai dyna yn aml yw'r unig gynllun a welant, er mwyn iddynt gyfuno arbenigedd ac ati. Credaf y byddai hyn yn cyflymu'r broses ac, fel y clywsom yn y pwyllgor dim ond y bore yma, byddai'n cynyddu gallu Cymru i fanteisio ar y system tariffau cyflenwi trydan i'r eithaf cyn i'r Llywodraeth ei diddymu'n llwyr. Yn hynny o beth, nodaf fod y Llywodraeth hefyd yn parhau i bwysu am i'r tystysgrifau ynni adnewyddadwy gael eu datganoli ac am reolaeth dros y math hwnnw o gymhorthdal. Unwaith eto, canmolaf y Llywodraeth am ei safiad ar hynny a hoffwn glywed mwy am y cynnydd a wnaed gennym mewn perthynas â'r drafodaeth honno.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I have two other points that I really wanted to make. The first is the point that I made to the Minister when we were discussing building regulations in the Senedd—I think that it was last week—and the need to ensure that planning guidance combines properly with energy guidance in terms of the siting and advice that people have, just to make sure that those two regimes dovetail nicely together. He gave me that assurance and I would quite like this Minister to do the same thing. My other point is about unconventional gas. I share the Chair's concern about the development of another carbon energy source when we have not fully explored the possibilities for renewals. However, we clearly are going to have to look at what unconventional gas might mean for Wales. I would urge the Minister to look at education programmes for local planning authorities, and for local groups of concerned individuals. In my experience, my constituents confuse four or five different methods of extracting unconventional gas all together as one. There is not much educated consultation on the subject as a result. For example, the Minister will know that there is quite a difference between fracking and the extraction of gas via coal from underground. I would urge the Minister to look at an education programme for that as well as at support centrally for local planning authorities grappling with some of the exploratory bore hole applications that they are currently looking at.

Having said that that was my last point, I have just realised that I actually have one more. I would very much encourage the Minister to have another look at the local development orders and how they might combine with other proposals in the planning Bill proposals. I know that the Minister is not responsible for those proposals, but clearly there is an enormous overlap in these two areas. I would like his assurance that he is looking at those overlaps and making sure that they dovetail together around local development orders, and at the way in which they affect the rural development plan and the way that the planning Bill interacts with those two things for small-scale on-farm and, indeed, small industrial energy projects. Thank you.

15:17

## **Russell George** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I am pleased to make a contribution to this debate. I think that the Chair of the committee has set out our concerns regarding the Welsh Government's progress across areas that we focused on in our initial inquiry. The central plank of all our additional recommendations in this report, I believe, is centred on political will and leadership. I do not think that the Welsh Government's position has been strengthened in the past year, with the responsibility for energy and planning matters being split across a number of different departments. Julie James has just made a similar comment in her contribution. My preference for a strategic and co-ordinated approach to energy and planning policy would, I suggest, for one Minister to take the lead. At this stage, I think that that should be the First Minister, given that he is taking the lead on the bid to have further powers devolved.

Roedd gennyf ddau bwynt arall roeddwn yn awyddus iawn i'w gwneud. Y cyntaf yw'r pwynt a wneuthum i'r Gweinidog pan oeddwn yn trafod rheoliadau adeiladu yn y Senedd—credaf mai'r wythnos diwethaf ydoedd—a'r angen i sicrhau bod canllawiau cynllunio yn cael eu cyfuno'n briodol â chanllawiau ynni o ran y lleoliad a'r cyngor a gaiff bobl, er mwyn sicrhau bod y ddwy system hyn yn cydweddu'n briodol â'i gilydd. Rhoddodd y sicrwydd hwnnw imi a hoffwn i'r Gweinidog hwn wneud yr un peth. Mae a wnelo fy mhwynt arall â nwy anghonfensiynol. Rhannaf bryder y Cadeirydd ynghylch datblygu ffynhonnell ynni carbon arall pan nad ydym wedi ymchwilio'n llawn i'r posibiladau o ran ynni adnewyddadwy. Fodd bynnag, yn amlwg, bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried beth y gallai nwy anghonfensiynol ei olygu i Gymru. Byddwn yn annog y Gweinidog i edrych ar raglenni addysg i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol, ac i grwpiau lleol o unigolion â phryderon. Yn fy mhrofiad i, mae fy etholwyr yn cymysgu pedwar neu bum dull gwahanol o echdynnu nwy anghonfensiynol ac yn eu hystyried fel un. Nid oes llawer o ymgynghori hyddysg ar y pwnc o ganlyniad. Er enghraifft, bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod tipyn o wahaniaeth rhwng ffracio ac echdynnu nwy drwy lo o dan y ddaear. Byddwn yn annog y Gweinidog i edrych ar raglen addysg yn hynny o beth yn ogystal â chymorth canolog i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol sy'n ceisio mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r ceisiadau tyllau turio archwiliadol y maent yn eu hystyried ar hyn o bryd.

Ar ôl dweud mai dyna oedd fy mhwynt olaf, rwyf newydd sylweddoli mewn gwirionedd fod gennyf un arall. Byddwn yn annog y Gweinidog o ddifrif i edrych unwaith eto ar y gorchmynion datblygu lleol a sut y gallent gyfuno â chynigion eraill yng nghynigion y Bil cynllunio. Gwn nad yw'r Gweinidog yn gyfrifol am y cynigion hynny, ond yn amlwg mae goryffwrdd enfawr rhwng y ddau faes. Hoffwn iddo roi sicrwydd ei fod yn edrych ar y meysydd hynny o orgyffwrdd ac ar sicrhau eu bod yn gydnaws â'i gilydd o ran gorchmynion datblygu lleol, ac ar y ffordd y maent yn effeithio ar y cynllun datblygu gwledig a'r ffordd y mae'r Bil cynllunio yn rhyngweithio â'r ddau beth hwnnw ar gyfer prosiectau bach ar ffermydd ac, yn wir, brosiectau ynni diwydiannol bach. Diolch.

Mae'n bleser gennyf wneud cyfraniad at y ddadl hon. Credaf fod Cadeirydd y pwyllgor wedi nodi ein pryderon o ran cynnydd Llywodraeth Cymru ar draws meysydd y gwnaethom ganolbwyntio arnynt yn ein hymholiad cychwynnol. Mae elfen ganolog ein holl argymhellion ychwanegol yn yr adroddiad hwn, credaf, yn canolbwyntio ar ewyllys ac arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol. Nid wyf o'r farn bod safbwynt Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cael ei gryfhau yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, wrth i'r cyfrifoldeb am faterion yn ymwneud ag ynni a chynllunio gael eu rhannu ar draws nifer o wahanol adrannau. Mae Julie James newydd wneud sylw tebyg yn ei chyfraniad. Fy newis ar gyfer dull strategol a chydgyssylltiedig o ymdrin â pholisi ynni a chynllunio, awgrymaf, fyddai i un Gweinidog gymryd yr awenau. Ar hyn o bryd, credaf mai'r Prif Weinidog ddylai wneud hynny, o gofio mai ef sydd wrth y llyw mewn perthynas â'r cais i ddatganoli pwerau ychwanegol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I want to focus on a few recommendations that the committee has put forward. The first area is the devolution of further powers. While a proposition was made by Silk, I still do not believe that the strongest possible case has been made to the UK Government as to why the powers over planning consents, renewable obligation certificates and feed-in tariffs should be devolved. Politicians, local planning authorities and, most importantly, the Welsh public want to know exactly what the Welsh Government intends to do with these extra powers. My concern, which I have expressed on a number of occasions, is that there will be a centralisation of planning power and the removal of self-determination, local determination and democratic accountability. The reason why there has been so much protest in mid Wales—and the report is right, because the outcome of the conjoined inquiry will be a watershed for a number of reasons—is that local people want their views heard and they want the democratic system that is closest to them to determine what should be built in their area. The Leighton farm judicial review is a prime example of what happens when Welsh Ministers make a decision against the advice of the planning authority and the Planning Inspectorate.

Secondly, in terms of planning guidance, TANs are the most important aspect of the national planning policy presently, but many are in need of review. I believe that there was an expectation, certainly on my part in any case, that the planning Bill, as a centrepiece for the system's overhaul, would ensure that we move away from such guidance in the future. However, the White Paper that has been published does not seem to reflect that that expectation is realised. Therefore, when the Minister does comment, I would be grateful for more clarity on that point.

Thirdly, in terms of community benefit, the development of the debate around fracking in England has upped the ante somewhat in terms of what communities and local authorities are looking for in ways of tangible returns for hosting 'undesirable' energy technologies. I have asked Government Ministers in the past to allow communities and local authorities to keep the business rates that are generated by those energy developers in those areas, and I think that that needs to be taken forward as well.

Finally, and briefly, on hydro power, the Government has said that it wants to do everything it can through Natural Resources Wales to enable viable community schemes to go ahead and that streamlining and improving regulation on this was a priority. Leaving aside flow standards, I received a letter in the past couple of days from one developer that cites Natural Resources Wales as effectively putting up obstacles in its way over an abstraction licence, and, in our committee this morning, we had a great deal of evidence on that particular issue. I hope that other Members will have a chance to expand on that. However, the witnesses this morning were very pleased to agree to provide us with that evidence, and we will be able to pass that on to the Minister. I know that the Minister for natural resources wanted examples such as this. So, I am happy to pass on the examples that I have had, and we will pass on further committee examples, as we really need to improve this process.

Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar rai o'r argymhellion a gyflwynwyd gan y pwyllgor. Y maes cyntaf yw datganoli pwerau pellach. Er bod Silk wedi cyflwyno cynnig yn hyn o beth, ni chredaf o hyd bod yr achos cryfaf posibl wedi'i gyflwyno i Lywodraeth y DU o ran pam y dylid datganoli'r pwerau o ran caniatadau cynllunio, tystysgrifau ymrwymo i ynni adnewyddadwy a thariffau cyflenwi trydan. Mae gwleidyddion, awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ac, yn anad dim, y cyhoedd yng Nghymru am wybod yn union beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn bwriadu ei wneud gyda'r pwerau ychwanegol hyn. Fy mhryder, a fynegwyd gennyf sawl gwaith, yw y caiff pŵer cynllunio ei ganoli ac y ceir gwared ar benderfyniadau gan unigolion, ar benderfyniadau lleol ac ar atebolrwydd democrataidd. Y rheswm pam y bu cymaint o brotestio yng nghanolbarth Cymru—ac mae'r adroddiad yn llygad ei le, oherwydd bydd canlyniad yr ymchwiliad ar y cyd yn drobwynt am sawl rheswm—yw bod pobl leol am leisio eu barn a'u bod am i'r system ddemocrataidd sydd agosaf atynt benderfynu ar yr hyn y dylid ei adeiladu yn eu hardal. Mae adolygiad barnwrol fferm Leighton yn enghraifft wych o'r hyn sy'n digwydd pan fo Gweinidogion Cymru yn gwneud penderfyniad yn groes i gyngor yr awdurdod cynllunio a'r Arolygiaeth Gynllunio.

Yn ail, o ran canllawiau cynllunio, nodiadau cyngor technegol (TAN) yw'r agwedd bwysicaf ar y polisi cynllunio cenedlaethol ar hyn o bryd, ond mae angen adolygu llawer ohonynt. Credaf fod yna ddisgwyliad, yn sicr ar fy rhan i beth bynnag, y byddai'r Bil cynllunio, fel canolbwynt ar gyfer ailwampio'r system, yn sicrhau ein bod yn symud ymaith oddi wrth ganllawiau o'r fath yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, nid ymddengys fod y Papur Gwyn a gyhoeddwyd yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith bod y disgwyliad hwnnw wedi'i wireddu. Felly, pan wnaiff y Gweinidog ei sylwadau, byddwn yn ddiolchgar am fwy o eglurder yn hynny o beth.

Yn drydydd, o ran budd cymunedol, mae'r ddatl sydd wedi datblygu ynghylch ffracio yn Lloegr wedi cynyddu disgwyliadau'n sylweddol o ran yr hyn y mae cymunedau ac awdurdodau lleol am ei weld o ran adenillion pendant am fod yn gartref i dechnolegau ynni 'annymundol'. Rwyf wedi gofyn i Weinidogion y Llywodraeth yn y gorffennol ganiatáu i gymunedau ac awdurdodau lleol gadw'r ardrethi busnes a gaiff eu creu gan y datblygwyr ynni hynny yn yr ardaloedd hynny, a chredaf fod angen gweithredu ar hynny hefyd.

Yn olaf, ac yn gryno, o ran ynni dŵr, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dweud ei bod am wneud popeth y gall drwy Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru i alluogi i gynlluniau cymunedol hyfvy fynd rhagddynt a bod symleiddio a gwella arferion rheoleiddio yn hyn o beth yn flaenoriaeth. Gan roi safonau llif o'r neilltu, cefais lythyr yn ystod y diwrnodau diwethaf gan un datblygwr a ddatganodd fod Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru mewn gwirionedd yn codi rhwystrau er mwyn ei atal rhag cael trwydded echdynnu, ac, yn ystod ein pwyllgor y bore yma, cawsom gryn dipyn o dystiolaeth ar y mater penodol hwnnw. Gobeithio y caiff Aelodau eraill gyfle i ymhelaethu ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, roedd y tystion y bore yma yn fwy na pharod i gytuno i roi'r dystiolaeth honno inni, a byddwn yn gallu ei throsglwyddo i'r Gweinidog. Gwn fod y Gweinidog cyfoeth naturiol am gael enghreifftiau o'r fath. Felly, rwy'n fwy na pharod i drosglwyddo'r enghreifftiau a gefais, a byddwn yn trosglwyddo enghreifftiau pellach o'r pwyllgor, gan fod angen inni wella'r broses hon o ddirif.

Mae Plaid Cymru, ar sawl achlysur, wedi galw ar y Llywodraeth hon i ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu tymor hir ar gyfer datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy. Rwy'n croesawu'r ffaith, neu'r sicrwydd, fod cynllun cyflawni yn yr arfaeth, ond byddwn innau hefyd yn awyddus i ategu sylwadau'r Cadeirydd—rydym yn y flwyddyn newydd yn awr ac rydym yn teimlo bod y broses wedi cymryd yn rhy hir o lawer. Felly, edrychwn ymlaen at weld y cynllun hwnnw pan fydd yn barod.

Rhan bwysig o unrhyw gynllun o'r fath, yn fy marn i, fyddai gosod targedau. Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn tynnu sylw at botensial cynlluniau ynni cymunedol ac at arferion gorau mewn gwledydd eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig, yn benodol cynllun Community Energy Scotland. Mae Llywodraeth yr Alban wedi gosod targed uchelgeisiol o gynhyrchu 500 MW o ynni adnewyddadwy cymunedol erbyn 2020. Mae'n dweud wrthym ei bod ar y trywydd iawn i gyflawni'r targed hwnnw. Yn fy marn i, mae hynny'n gwrthgyferbynnu'n llwyr â Llywodraeth Cymru, sydd prin heb unrhyw dargedau ar hyn o bryd, ac mae'r rhai sydd ganddynt naill ai wedi eu methu neu yn rhai y mae'r Llywodraeth yn awyddus i'w hisraddio. Yn yr ymateb a gawn gan y Llywodraeth, er enghraifft, mae sôn am ystyried pa dargedau fyddai'n briodol, o bosibl, yn y dyfodol. Dyna'r math o ymagwedd rydym yn ei chael gan y Llywodraeth.

Mae Ynni'r Fro yn gynllun y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei ariannu ac yn gynllun sydd yn gwneud cyfraniad. Nid oes dim amheuaeth am hynny. Serch hynny, fe glywom yn y pwyllgor y bore yma, er enghraifft, fod Ynni'r Fro wedi cymryd tair blynedd i ddatblygu cynllun benthyciadau, sydd, eto, yn ymddangos yn 'typical' o'r modd y mae Cymru yn llusgo ei thraed, tra bo rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn achub y blaen. Mae'r pwyllgor wedi awgrymu bod angen edrych ar gefnogaeth ychwanegol y tu hwnt i Ynni'r Fro, ac, yn ei hymateb, mae'r Llywodraeth yn dweud ei bod wrthi yn gwneud cynlluniau. Mae'r amser i wneud cynlluniau wedi hen basio, ac mae'n amser yn awr inni weithredu, oherwydd mae natur y sector ynni yn golygu bod yn rhaid ichi fod mewn yn gynnar ar y cychwyn i fanteisio ac arloesi o ran y technegau y mae eu hangen arnom, neu byddwch yn cael eich gadael ar ôl. Fy ngofid i, a nifer o bobl eraill yr ydym wedi cael tystiolaeth ganddynt, yw bod Cymru yn cael ei gadael ar ôl.

Mae'r adroddiad yn datgan yn glir hefyd bod lleihau galw am ynni yr un mor bwysig â datblygu ffynonellau amgen o gynhyrchu ynni, yn enwedig yn lle tanwydd ffosil. Rwyf yn gyson wedi codi'r angen i wneud mwy am hyn, a, thra bod cynlluniau fel Arbed a Nyth yn rhai i'w croesawu a'u cefnogi, nid yw maint y rhaglenni hynny yn dod yn agos at yr hyn sydd ei angen mewn gwirionedd. Mae gwaith ymchwil wedi dangos bod angen i draean o stoc tai Cymru gael ei adnewyddu yn y 10 mlynedd nesaf er mwyn i ni fedru dod yn agos at gyrraedd y nod sydd gennym o safbwynt gostwng allyriadau yng Nghymru erbyn 2020. Drwy wneud hynny, byddem hefyd yn torri biliau ynni a thadlo tlodi tanwydd, yn ogystal â rhoi hwb economaidd drwy greu swyddi wrth gyflawni'r gwaith hwnnw.

Plaid Cymru, on many an occasion, has called on this Government to develop an implementation plan for the long-term development of renewable energy. I welcome the fact, or the assurance, that there is a delivery plan in progress, but I would be keen to support the remarks of our Chair—we are into the new year now and feel that the process has taken too long. We therefore look forward to seeing that plan, when it is ready.

An important part of any such plan, in my opinion, would be the setting of targets. The committee's report draws attention to the importance of community energy and best practice in other countries of the UK, specifically the Community Energy Scotland project. The Scottish Government has set an ambitious target of delivering 500 MW of renewable community energy by 2020. It tells us that it is on track to achieve that target. In my opinion, that contrasts with the Welsh Government, which, it would appear, has almost no targets at the moment, and those that it has have either failed or are ones that the Government is keen to downgrade. The Government's response talks about considering the targets that would be appropriate in the future. That is the attitude that we have seen from the Government.

Ynni'r Fro is a Government-funded plan and one that makes a contribution. There is no doubt about that. However, we heard in the committee this morning that Ynni'r Fro had taken three years to develop a borrowing plan, which is, again, typical of the way in which Wales is dragging its feet while other parts of the UK take a lead on this. The committee has suggested that there is a need to look at additional support, beyond Ynni'r Fro, and the Government states in its response that it is making plans. The time for making plans has passed and, in my opinion, it is time for us to act, because the nature of the energy sector means that you have to be in at the beginning in order to be innovative and to take advantage of the techniques needed, otherwise you will be left behind. My concern, and that of many other people who gave evidence, is that Wales is being left behind.

The report states clearly that reducing the demand for energy is just as important as developing alternative sources of producing energy, especially instead of fossil fuels. I have consistently raised the need to do more on this, and, while schemes such as Arbed and Nest are to be welcomed and supported, the size of those schemes does not come close to what is needed in reality. Research has shown that a third of the Welsh housing stock needs to be renewed in the next 10 years in order for us to come close to reaching our aim of reducing emissions in Wales by 2020. By doing so, we would also cut energy bills and tackle fuel poverty, as well as provide an economic boost through creating jobs in order to carry out that work.



Mae ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru yn sôn am gyhoeddiad y Llywodraeth yr wythnos diwethaf ar ddiwygio rhan L y rheoliadau adeiladu, sy'n edrych ar berfformiad ynni adeiladau yng Nghymru, ond roedd y cyhoeddiad hwnnw, ar y cyfan, yn siomedig, yn fy marn i. Er iddo ymgynghori ar y posibilrwydd o dorri allyriadau rhwng 25% a 40%, yr hyn a gawsom oedd penderfyniad i dorri allyriadau gan ddim ond 8%. Unwaith eto, yn fy marn i, mae hyn yn dangos diffyg uchelgais.

Mae'n rhaid cydnabod y bydd y Bil cynllunio arfaethedig yn gyfle i fynd i'r afael â rhai problemau sylfaenol yn y drefn gynllunio ac ynni yng Nghymru. Bydd ganddo oblygiadau eang, yn sicr, o safbwynt cryfhau'r broses cyn-ymgeisio; mae categori newydd o ddatblygiadau o arwyddocâd cenedlaethol yn cael ei argymhell; a bydd y fframwaith datblygu cenedlaethol yn arwyddocaol, oherwydd bydd yn caniatáu i'r nodiadau cyngor technegol, y TANs, gael eu hadolygu. Yng nghyd-destun y darn hwn o waith, mae TAN 8 wedi bod yn bwnc sydd wedi codi ei ben yn gyson iawn.

Rwyf am ategu sylwadau'r adroddiad ar nwy anghonfensiynol. Nid yw datblygu ffynhonnell newydd o ynni 'carbon intensive' yn addas ar hyn o bryd ac mae'n anghydnaws ag ymrwymadau Cymru ar lefel y Deyrnas Unedig a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd i leihau allyriadau. Fodd bynnag, gan fod trwyddedau archwilio yn bodoli yn rhannau o Gymru, mae angen i'r Llywodraeth roi gwell arweiniad ar faterion cynllunio yn y maes hwn.

The response of the Welsh Government talks about the announcement made by the Government last week regarding the revision of part L of the building regulations, which looks at the energy performance of buildings in Wales, but that announcement, on the whole, was disappointing, in my opinion. Even though it has consulted upon the possibility of cutting emissions by between 25% and 40%, what we had was a decision to cut emissions by only 8%. Once again, in my opinion, this shows a lack of ambition.

We have to recognise that the proposed planning Bill will be an opportunity to address some of the basic problems regarding the planning system and energy in Wales. It will certainly have broad implications with regard to strengthening the pre-application process; a new category of developments of national significance has been recommended; and also the national development framework will be significant, because it will allow the technical advice notes to be reviewed. In the context of this piece of work, TAN 8 has been a matter that has raised its head very often.

I would like to support the comments made in the report on unconventional gas. Developing a new source of carbon-intensive energy is not appropriate at present and is not consistent with Wales's commitments on a United Kingdom or a European Union level to lower emission levels. However, as exploratory licences exist in parts of Wales, the Government needs to provide greater leadership on planning matters in this field.

15:27

## **William Powell** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Like other Members, I would like to start by registering my thanks to all of the people who came forward with evidence for our sessions and particularly the committee and research staff, who always do so much to enrich the work that we do as Members on this committee.

The committee's energy policy and planning inquiry was indeed very ambitious, and such issues are never far from the news agenda. It should be clear to all of us that an effective and realistic energy policy must be the foundation of any long-term economic strategy that we have here in Wales. That is why the committee has taken the time to complete this follow-up report and continues to press the Government to establish a meaningful and realistic energy road map that responds to the threat of climate change but also makes the most of the numerous advantages that come with developing our green economy.

Fel Aelodau eraill, hoffwn ddechrau drwy gofrestru fy niolch i bob un o'r bobl a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth ar gyfer ein sesiynau ac yn enwedig y pwyllgor a'r staff ymchwil, sydd bob amser yn gwneud cymaint i gyfoethogi'r gwaith a wnawn fel Aelodau ar y pwyllgor hwn.

Roedd ymchwiliad y pwyllgor i bolisi ynni a chynllunio yn wir yn uchelgeisiol iawn, ac mae gan faterion o'r fath le cyson ac amlwg ar yr agenda newyddion. Dylai fod yn glir i bob un ohonom fod yn rhaid i bolisi ynni effeithiol a realistig fod yn sail i unrhyw strategaeth economaidd hirdymor sydd gennym yma yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y mae'r pwyllgor wedi cymryd yr amser i gwblhau'r adroddiad dilynol hwn a pham ei fod yn parhau i bwysu ar y Llywodraeth i sefydlu map ffordd ynni ystyrllon a realistig sy'n ymateb i fygythiad newid yn yr hinsawdd, ond sydd hefyd yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y buddiannau niferus sy'n gysylltiedig â'r broses o ddatblygu ein heconomi werdd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Such a road map is far from easy to achieve. For instance, we know that, beyond 2050, there is very little certainty on the grid, other than nuclear and hydro. Indeed, if everything that has currently been proposed or is in the middle of the planning system were to be built, we know that Welsh generation, by 2050, would still be less than half of what it is today. While this should give us all pause for thought, it should also tell us that we have a huge opportunity in Wales to take full advantage of our natural resources and to ensure that we take the lead in responding to climate change by establishing the jobs and inward investment that come from the low-carbon technologies. That is why I was pleased to see the Government accept the need for strong leadership, but at the same time I regret its refusal to update and refresh its own energy targets. With the UK Government seemingly refusing to move on energy devolution—a point on which there is a degree of unanimity in the Chamber, although I was concerned that Russell George resiled from that earlier—we need to ask ourselves some very serious questions about just how realistic these targets are and whether the Welsh Government is simply setting itself up to fail with the current targets.

Turning to planning, I note that the Welsh Government claims to undertake regular reviews of its technical advice notes. However, as other Members have already commented, many of these TANs have hardly been touched since they were first established, and, by the end of this Assembly, some will be approaching a decade old. That is surely not a sensible state of affairs.

Of course, within this context, arguments tend to revert to the ineffectiveness of TAN 8, and how it limits and concentrates development into relatively small areas, which then take a disproportionate part of the overall burden. Regardless of one's position on wind energy, it is clear that a review of TAN 8 is urgently required. We need to work to ensure that the burden is shared more effectively across Wales, and also that other areas have the opportunity to take advantage of the community benefits, and, indeed, the jobs and the economic development that come with such proposals.

Nid yw map ffordd o'r fath yn hawdd i'w gyflawni o bell ffordd. Er enghraifft, gwyddom, y tu hwnt i 2050, nad oes llawer o sicrwydd ar y grid, ar wahân i bŵer niwclear a dŵr. Yn wir, pe adeiladwyd popeth sydd yn yr arfaeth neu sydd ar ei hynt drwy'r system gynllunio ar hyn o bryd, gwyddom y byddai lefelau cynhyrchu yng Nghymru, erbyn 2050, yn llai na hanner y lefel heddiw o hyd. Er y dylai hynny fod yn destun pryder i bob un ohonom, dylai hefyd ddweud wrthym fod gennym gyfle eithriadol yng Nghymru i fanteisio'n llawn ar ein hadnoddau naturiol ac i sicrhau ein bod ar flaen y gad wrth ymateb i newid yn yr hinsawdd drwy greu'r swyddi a'r cyfleoedd mewnfuddsoddi sy'n gysylltiedig â thechnolegau carbon isel. Dyna pam roedd yn bleser gennyf weld y Llywodraeth yn derbyn bod angen arweinyddiaeth gadarn, ond ar yr un pryd, gresynaf wrth ei phenderfyniad i wrthod diweddarau ac adnewyddu ei thargedau ynni ei hun. Gan fod Llywodraeth y DU, yn ôl pob tebyg, yn gwrthod newid ei safbwynt ar ddatganoli ynni—pwynt lle ceir rhywfaint o unfrydedd yn y Siambwr, er fy mod yn pryderu bod Russell George wedi cefnu ar hynny yn gynharach—mae angen inni ofyn rhai cwestiynau difrifol iawn o ran pa mor realistig yw'r targedau hyn mewn gwirionedd a pha un a yw Llywodraeth Cymru mewn gwirionedd yn paratoi ei hun i fethu o ran y targedau presennol.

Gan droi at gynllunio, sylwaf fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn honni ei bod yn cynnal adolygiadau rheolaidd o'i nodiadau cyngor technegol. Fodd bynnag, fel y soniodd Aelodau eraill eisoes, prin y cyffyrddwyd â llawer o'r dogfennau hyn ers iddynt gael eu llunio gyntaf, ac, erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn, bydd rhaid ohonynt wedi'u cyflwyno ers bron i ddegawd. Does bosibl nad yw hynny'n sefyllfa synhwyrol.

Wrth gwrs, o fewn cyd-destun hwn, mae'r dadleuon yn dueddol o ddychwelyd at aneffeithiolrwydd TAN 8, a sut mae'n cyfyngu ac yn crynhoi datblygiadau i ardaloedd cymharol fach, sydd wedyn yn ysgwyddo rhan anghymesur o'r baich cyffredinol. Ni waeth beth fo'ch safbwynt ar ynni gwynt, mae'n amlwg bod angen adolygu TAN 8 ar frys. Mae angen inni weithio i sicrhau y caiff y baich ei rannu'n fwy effeithiol ledled Cymru, ac hefyd bod ardaloedd eraill yn cael y cyfle i fanteisio ar y buddiannau cymunedol, ac, yn wir, y swyddi a'r cyfleoedd ar gyfer datblygiad economaidd sy'n gysylltiedig â chynigion o'r fath.

Finally, given its prominence, I would like—as Llyr Gruffydd did in his contribution—to focus on unconventional gas. The Welsh Liberal Democrats' position continues to be in favour of a moratorium here in Wales, until such point as it can be demonstrated to be environmentally safe. As such, I am pleased to see that the Government makes reference to the precautionary principle in its response. However, we know that applications continue to be received, in north and south Wales, and we also know that local authorities are currently operating without sufficient specific planning guidance—a point that is not lost on the Welsh Local Government Association. In my view, this has to change. The Welsh Government must continue to press NRW into providing such advice as to ensure that our local authorities across Wales are equipped to deal with shale gas. Finally, this guidance must also be more than simply dealing with the act of drilling—it must also, crucially, address the key issue of water disposal, after a site has been subject to fracking. What happens with this contaminated water is often ignored in such debates, and I hope that this does not continue to be the case here in Wales.

Yn olaf, o ystyried ei amlygrwydd, hoffwn—fel y gwnaeth Llyr Gruffydd yn ei gyfraniad—ganolbwyntio ar nwy anghonfensiynol. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn parhau i fod o blaid moratoriwm yma yng Nghymru, hyd nes y gellir dangos ei fod yn amgylcheddol ddiogel. Fel y cyfryw, rwy'n falch o weld bod y Llywodraeth yn cyfeirio at yr egwyddor ragofalus yn ei hymateb. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom fod ceisiadau yn parhau i gael eu derbyn, yng ngogledd a de Cymru, a gwyddom hefyd fod awdurdodau lleol yn gweithredu ar hyn o bryd heb ddigon o ganllawiau cynllunio penodol—pwynt y mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn ymwybodol iawn ohono. Yn fy marn i, rhaid i hyn newid. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru barhau i bwysio ar Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru i ddarparu cyngor a fydd yn sicrhau bod ein hawdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru mewn sefyllfa i ymdrin â nwy siâl. Yn olaf, rhaid i'r canllawiau hyn hefyd wneud mwy nag ymdrin â'r gwaith o ddrilio—rhaid iddynt hefyd, yn allweddol, ymdrin â'r mater allweddol o waredu dŵr, ar ôl i safle fod yn destun ffracio. Yn aml, ni thrafodir yr hyn sy'n digwydd i'r dŵr halogedig hwn mewn trafodaethau o'r fath, a gobeithio na fydd hynny'n parhau'n wir yma yng Nghymru.

15:32

### Joyce Watson [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

The first thing that I want to do is to pay tribute to the leadership of the committee by our Chair, and to his absolute commitment to all things covered by the Environment and Sustainability Committee.

To that end, this inquiry has thrown up many things. The report states them, and they have been stated across the Chamber this afternoon. I do not want to repeat all of those, except for one. The one statement that I am sure the Government—and everyone in this room—would like to see come to an end is the full devolution of the decision-making powers to this place when it comes to energy provision, whatever that provision is, in Wales. We all know only too well what that has done to communities across mid Wales, particularly when we are talking about large-scale proposals for windfarms, and the total indecision that has come out of that, and the delays that have been caused as a consequence, and the stress that has been imposed on people there, and the frustrations that have been felt here. Therefore, that is the one thing that I feel that I really have to repeat.

Moving on, quickly—because I do not want to delay things—I want to particularly look at fracking. What we know full well is not only that our committee is looking back, but that we have to look forward. The one thing that moves forward somewhat quickly is the issue of the different types of energy that are now available, and are being talked about, that were not available or being talked about very much just a couple of years ago. Like Bill Powell, I would like to see some real examples of all those parameters being put in place to really be sure that what we are doing today will not have a negative impact on people tomorrow. I would like, Minister, if you can—and when that is a possibility—for you to make a statement on this Government's position with regard to fracking.

Yn gyntaf, hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'r ffordd y cafodd y pwyllgor ei arwain gan ein Cadeirydd, ac i'w ymrwymiad llwyr i bopeth a drafodir gan Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd.

I'r perwyl hwnnw, mae'r ymchwiliad hwn wedi tynnu sylw at sawl peth. Fe'u nodir yn yr adroddiad, ac fe'u datganwyd ar draws y Siambr y prynhawn yma. Nid wyf am ailadrodd pob un ohonynt, dim ond un. Yr un datganiad yr hoffai'r Llywodraeth—a phawb yn yr ystafell hon—ei weld yn dod i ben, sef datganoli'r pwerau llawn i wneud penderfyniadau i'r lle hwn yn achos darpariaeth ynni, ni waeth beth fo'r ddarpariaeth honno, yng Nghymru. Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol iawn o'r hyn y mae hynny wedi'i wneud i gymunedau ledled canolbarth Cymru, yn enwedig wrth sôn am gynnigion mawr ar gyfer ffermydd gwynt, a'r diffyg penderfyniad llwyr yn deillio o hynny, a'r oedi a achoswyd o ganlyniad, a'r pwysau a orfodwyd ar bobl yno, a'r rhwystredigaethau a deimlwyd yn yr ardal. Felly, dyna'r un peth y teimlaf fod gwir angen imi ei ailadrodd.

Gan symud ymlaen, yn gyflym—oherwydd nid wyf am achosi oedi—hoffwn edrych yn benodol ar ffracio. Gwyddom yn iawn yn ogystal ag edrych yn ôl, fod yn rhaid i'n pwyllgor edrych ymlaen. Yr un peth sy'n symud braidd yn gyflym yw'r gwahanol fathau o ynni sydd bellach ar gael, ac sy'n cael eu trafod, nad oeddent ar gael neu nad oedd llawer o sôn amdanynt ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl. Fel Bill Powell, hoffwn weld enghreifftiau gwirioneddol o'r holl bamedrau hynny yn cael eu rhoi ar waith er mwyn bod yn wirioneddol siŵr na chaiff yr hyn a wnawn heddiw effaith andwyl ar bobl yn y dyfodol. Hoffwn, Weinidog, os gallwch—a phan fo hynny'n bosibl—rwydd—ichi wneud datganiad ar safbwynt y Llywodraeth hon mewn perthynas â ffracio.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:35	<b>Antoinette Sandbach</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate. As Joyce Watson well knows, the reason for the concentration of windfarms in mid-Wales is the Welsh Government's TAN 8 criteria, which led to those areas being identified. In fact, much of the evidence before the committee—I do not believe that you were on the committee at that stage, Joyce—was about the fact the TAN 8 areas restricted development of renewable energy in Wales, and that that had perhaps led to the different delivery approach in Wales as opposed to in Scotland. The reality is that the committee's report highlighted, across the energy sector, the incredibly poor delivery by Welsh Government and the lack of leadership—</p>	<p>Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddatl hon. Fel y gwyr Joyce Watson yn iawn, y rheswm pam bod ffermydd gwynt wedi'u crynhoi yng nghanolbarth Cymru yw meini prawf TAN 8, a arweiniodd at nodi'r ardaloedd hynny. Mewn gwirionedd, roedd a wnelo'r rhan fwyaf o'r dystiolaeth ger bron y pwyllgor—ni chredaf eich bod yn aelod o'r pwyllgor bryd hynny, Joyce—â'r ffaith bod ardaloedd TAN 8 yn cyfyngu datblygiad ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru, a bod hynny o bosibl wedi arwain at y dull gweithredu gwahanol yng Nghymru o gymharu â'r Alban. Y gwir amdani yw bod adroddiad y pwyllgor wedi tynnu sylw, ar draws y sector ynni, at ddarpariaeth eithriadol o wael gan Lywodraeth Cymru a'r diffyg arweinyddiaeth—</p>
15:36	<b>Julie James</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Frankly, I do not think that that was the universal view of the committee. I do not think that the committee universally agreed what you just said at all.</p>	<p>A dweud y gwir, ni chredaf mai dyna oedd barn gyffredinol y pwyllgor. Ni chredaf fod y pwyllgor yn gyffredinol yn cytuno â'r hyn rydych newydd ei ddweud o gwbl.</p>
15:36	<b>Antoinette Sandbach</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>The evidence before the committee showed that—</p>	<p>Dangosodd y dystiolaeth ger bron y pwyllgor—</p>
15:36	<b>Alun Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>You got that wrong.</p>	<p>Mae hynny'n anghywir gennyh.</p>
15:36	<b>Antoinette Sandbach</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>I did not get that wrong, Minister, and I am very happy to show you the passages in the evidence before the committee. Certainly, it was not universally agreed by the committee that there should be devolution of energy; that is quite clear in the report. It was argued that the case should be made, but what Russell George has said today has highlighted that there are real concerns. There are concerns because of the failure of Welsh Government to deliver in the under-50 MW category, and precisely because of the problems that Julie James highlighted in relation to the lack of capability in Welsh Government and, indeed, in Welsh local government to deal with these kind of energy issues.</p>	<p>Nid yw hynny'n anghywir, Weinidog, ac rwy'n fwy na pharod i ddangos y rhannau o'r dystiolaeth ger bron y pwyllgor. Yn sicr, ni chytunodd y pwyllgor yn gyffredinol y dylid datganoli ynni; mae hynny'n gwbl glir yn yr adroddiad. Dadleuwyd y dylid cyflwyno'r achos dros hynny, ond mae'r hyn a ddywedodd Russell George heddiw wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod pryderon gwirioneddol. Mae pryderon oherwydd methiant Llywodraeth Cymru i gyflawni yn y categori o dan-50 MW, ac yn union oherwydd y problemau y cyfeiriodd Julie James atynt o ran y diffyg gallu o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru ac, yn wir, o fewn llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru i ymdrin â'r mathau hyn o faterion ynni.</p>
	<p>We know that there has been some progress. The energy Wales programme and the energy strategic delivery group have been set up, but we do not know how they are working, what they have done and how they are driving energy policy development. Maybe you could help us with that, Minister. We called for the production of action plans; I realise that the Chair, Lord Elis-Thomas, has already said that we have not seen them, but we would like to see them. The same is true of the public register of community benefits, which again, Minister, was supposed to be established by the end of 2013—or that at least was our recommendation.</p>	<p>Rydym yn cydnabod y bu rhywfaint o gynnydd. Sefydlwyd rhaglen ynni Cymru a'r grŵp cyflawni strategol ar ynni, ond ni wyddom sut maent yn gweithio, beth maent wedi'i wneud a sut maent yn llywio'r broses o ddatblygu polisi ynni. Efallai y gallech ein helpu yn hynny o beth, Weinidog. Gwnaethom alw am gynlluniau gweithredu; sylweddolaf fod y Cadeirydd, yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas, eisoes wedi dweud nad ydym wedi'u gweld, ond byddem yn hoffi eu gweld. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y gofrestr gyhoeddus o fuddiannau cymunedol, y disgylywyd, unwaith eto, Weinidog, iddi gael ei sefydlu erbyn diwedd 2013—neu o leiaf dyna oedd ein hargymhelliad.</p>
	<p>Local communities throughout north Wales and mid Wales are suffering the consequences of large windfarm applications and associated infrastructure developments and the impacts of associated material movements and construction on the surrounding area and transport networks. There is still no progress on clearing the backlog of onshore wind applications.</p>	<p>Mae cymunedau lleol ledled gogledd Cymru a chanolbarth Cymru yn dioddef o ganlyniad i geisiadau am ffermydd gwynt mawr a'r datblygiadau seilwaith cysylltiedig ac effeithiau cysylltiedig symud deunydd ac adeiladu ar yr ardal gyfagos a rhwydweithiau trafniadaeth. Ni wnaed unrhyw gynnydd o hyd o ran clirio'r ôl-groniad o geisiadau ar gyfer ffermydd gwynt ar y tir.</p>

I move at this point to Ynni'r Fro, Minister. I think that you will find it very interesting to read the evidence that was received by the committee this morning, which highlighted that, after three years, the loans that were supposed to be available for Ynni'r Fro still had not come through, and that the very first applicant, who was an expert in community energy, had not received a single loan. Nothing had come forward in three years. His evidence to us was that it was undermining the credibility of Welsh Government in terms of delivery and in whether the scheme could actually deliver. Given the amount of European funding that that programme has had, it looks, once again, as if the only thing that has been achieved is a layer of costs and administration. In terms of delivering community energy, the evidence to our committee was that communities have set up their own schemes, supported by lottery funding, because of the blocks that they perceive from Welsh Government. I think, Minister, that you will find it useful to read that evidence.

As Julie James and others on the committee will know, I have a particular passion for anaerobic digestion and for promoting it in Wales, particularly on farm. [Laughter.] It is an extremely useful technology, which offers a win-win situation for the environment and for farming communities in Wales. I know that you have said that you will look at large-scale support for anaerobic digestion, Minister, but will you also look at on-farm support, so that we can encourage more smaller-scale developments?

Symudaf yn awr at Ynni'r Fro, Weinidog. Credaf y bydd o ddiddordeb mawr ichi ddarllen y dystiolaeth a gafodd y pwyllgor y bore yma, a dynnodd sylw at y ffaith nad oedd Ynni'r Fro o hyd wedi cael y benthyciadau y disgwyliwyd y byddent ar gael iddo dair blynedd yn ôl, ac nad oedd yr ymgeisydd cyntaf un, a oedd yn arbenigwr ym maes ynni cymunedol, wedi cael unrhyw fenthyciad. Ni welwyd unrhyw gynnydd yn hynny o beth mewn cyfnod o dair blynedd. Nododd ei dystiolaeth inni fod hynny'n tansellio hygredd Llywodraeth Cymru o ran darparu ac o ran pa un a allai'r cynllun lwyddo mewn gwirionedd. O ystyried y swm o arian Ewropeaidd a gafodd y rhaglen honno, ymddengys, unwaith eto, mai'r unig beth y llwyddwyd i'w gyflawni yw haen o gostau a thaliadau gweinyddol. O ran darparu ynni cymunedol, nododd y dystiolaeth i'n pwyllgor fod cymunedau wedi rhoi eu cynlluniau eu hunain ar waith, gyda chymorth arian y loteri, gan eu bod o'r farn bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn creu rhwystrau. Credaf, Weinidog, y byddai'n ddefnyddiol ichi ddarllen y dystiolaeth honno.

Fel y bydd Julie James ac eraill ar y pwyllgor yn gwybod, mae gennyf ddiddordeb brwd mewn treulio anaerobig a'i hyrwyddo yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ar ffermydd. [Chwerthin.] Mae'n dechnoleg hynod ddefnyddiol, sydd o fudd i'r amgylchedd ac i gymunedau ffermio, fel ei gilydd, yng Nghymru. Gwn eich bod wedi datgan y byddwch yn awyddus i roi cymorth sylweddol i gynigion ar gyfer treulio anaerobig, Weinidog, ond a fyddwch hefyd yn ystyried cymorth ar ffermydd, fel y gallwn annog mwy o ddatblygiadau llai o faint?

15:40

## **Alun Davies** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

*Y Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol a Bwyd / The Minister for Natural Resources and Food*

Like other speakers, I will begin by thanking the committee Chair for the leadership of this inquiry, and for the points that he made in introducing the debate this afternoon. The Government appreciates and values the work of the committee, and appreciates and values the reports that the committee has made on these subjects.

I hope that the Government's response has been generous in approach and in substance. There has been a clear consensus—until Russell George took to his feet earlier this afternoon—on many aspects of energy and planning issues in Wales, and it is perhaps a reflection of that consensus that the Government was able to accept 23 of the report's additional 24 recommendations. A final amendment that was not accepted was not accepted because of a difference of principle, but based on the belief of what can be properly delivered.

Fel siaradwyr eraill, dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor am arwain yr ymchwiliad hwn, ac am y pwyntiau a wnaeth wrth gyflwyno'r ddaol y prynhawn yma. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwerthfawrogi gwaith y pwyllgor, ac yn gwerthfawrogi'r adroddiadau a gyflwynwyd gan y pwyllgor ar y pynciau hyn.

Gobeithio y bu ymateb y Llywodraeth yn hael o ran ymagwedd ac o ran sylwedd. Cafwyd consensws amlwg—tan i Russell George godi yn gynharach y prynhawn yma—ar lawer o agweddau ar faterion ynni a chynllunio yng Nghymru, ac efallai mai adlewyrchiad o'r consensws hwnnw yw'r ffaith bod y Llywodraeth wedi gallu derbyn 23 o'r 24 o argymhellion ychwanegol yr adroddiad. Nid oherwydd gwahaniaeth egwyddor na dderbyniwyd y gwelliant olaf nas derbyniwyd, ond ar sail yr hyn y credwn y gellir ei gyflawni mewn gwirionedd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

In terms of energy policy, planning is clearly critical to the success of the economy, in creating a future for all of our communities and for the promotion of sustainable economic growth. I was taken by the points that Julie James made. This is an area where Ministers work together, and where there needs to be a very clear joined-up approach from different Ministers and departments. What was most disappointing from Russell George's contribution earlier was that he attempted to make the rather peculiar argument that Government in Cardiff needs to be more joined-up with a single point of reference and a single layer of responsibility for energy policy but he seemed unable to accept exactly the same point about the UK Government. When we call for the devolution of these responsibilities, we do not do it for any reason except to create exactly the joined-up approach that Russell George was calling for in the earlier part of his speech. He might reflect on those words and on the position that he took earlier.

Members on all sides of the Chamber will be aware that the Welsh Government continues to be denied the levers that we require to incentivise renewable technologies and the executive functions regarding the consenting of large-scale energy generation and related energy infrastructure. Without these levers, it is difficult for us to set the sorts of aspirational targets for renewable technologies that Llyr Huws Gruffydd and others wish to see. We have no disagreement about the principle, but you and I know that a speech about those aspirations is entirely impotent if we do not have the levers to deliver them. It is the acquisition of those powers that is critical to the delivery of the aspirations that I am sure we share across the Chamber and that the Government shares with the committee.

The Government believes that Wales should have control over its resources and that the Welsh Government is best placed to align Wales's energy aspirations with the needs of our communities and our natural environment. We were disappointed by the UK Government's rejection in its response to part 2 of the commission on devolution. The Welsh Government will continue to press the case for the devolution of these functions to Wales, and we welcome the support of the committee in doing so.

Notwithstanding those remarks, it is our ambition to build a low-carbon economy in Wales. The UK faces a complete shift towards a new UK energy market reform. We know that climate change will also create an entirely new context for this policy area, and we know that investor confidence in a new regime in a new energy market is absolutely vital to the wider agenda. That is why we want to see a mixed energy economy where we can put the focus on investment in renewables—renewables on a larger scale but also on the smaller scale that Antoinette Sandbach described in her contribution. I will say that the points made by Antoinette will be reflected in the consultation document for the next rural development plan, which will be published in the middle of next month.

O ran polisi ynni, mae cynllunio yn amlwg yn hanfodol i lwyddiant yr economi, o ran creu dyfodol i bob un o'n cymunedau ac er mwyn hyrwyddo twf economaidd cynaliadwy. Gwnaeth pwyntiau Julie James gryn argraff arnaf. Mae'r maes hwn yn faes lle mae Gweinidogion yn cydweithio, a lle mae angen dull gweithredu cydgyssylltiedig clir iawn gan wahanol Weinidogion ac adrannau. Yr hyn a oedd fwyaf siomedig yng nghyfraniad Russell George yn gynharach oedd ei fod yn ceisio cyflwyno'r ddatllyfodd braidd bod angen i'r Llywodraeth yng Nghaerdydd fod yn fwy cydgyssylltiedig gan gynnig un pwynt cyfeirio ac un haen cyfrifoldeb mewn perthynas gydag un pwynt cyfeirio ac un haen o gyfrifoldeb mewn perthynas â pholisi ynni, ond roedd fel petai'n amharod i dderbyn yn union yr un pwynt am Lywodraeth y DU. Pan fyddwn yn galw am i'r cyfrifoldebau hyn gael eu datganoli, ni allwn wneud hynny am unrhyw reswm ac eithrio'r nod o greu'r union ddull gweithredu cydgyssylltiedig roedd Russell George yn galw amdano yn rhan gynharaf ei araith. Efallai y dylai fyfyrion ar y geiriau hynny ac ar ei safbwynt yn gynharach.

Bydd Aelodau ar bob ochr o'r Siambr yn ymwybodol bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn parhau i fethu â chael y pwerau sydd eu hangen arnom i gymell technolegau adnewyddadwy na'r swyddogaethau gweithredol sy'n gysylltiedig â chaniatáu prosiectau cynhyrchu ynni ar raddfa fawr a'r seilwaith ynni cysylltiedig. Heb y pwerau hyn, mae'n anodd inni bennu'r mathau o dargedau uchelgeisiol ar gyfer technolegau adnewyddadwy y mae Llyr Huws Gruffydd ac eraill yn awyddus i'w gweld. Nid ydym yn anghytuno â'r egwyddor, ond rydych chi a minnau yn gwybod mai siarad gwag yw unrhyw araith am y dyheadau hynny onid oes gennym y pwerau i'w cyflawni. Mae caffael y pwerau hynny yn hanfodol er mwyn cyflawni'r dyheadau a rennir, rwy'n siŵr, ar draws y Siambr ac y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu rhannu gyda'r pwyllgor.

Cred y Llywodraeth y dylai fod gan Gymru reolaeth dros ei hadnoddau ac mai Llywodraeth Cymru sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i gysoni dyheadau ynni Cymru ag anghenion ein cymunedau a'n hamgylchedd naturiol. Cawsom ein siomi gan benderfyniad Llywodraeth y DU i wrthod yn ei hymateb i ran 2 o'r comisiwn ar ddatganoli. Bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn parhau i bwysleisio'r achos dros ddatganoli'r swyddogaethau hyn i Gymru, a chroesawn gefnogaeth y pwyllgor wrth wneud hynny.

Er gwaethaf y sylwadau hynny, ein huchelgais yw creu economi carbon-isel yng Nghymru. Mae'r DU yn wynebu newid sylweddol tuag at gynigion newydd i ddiwygio'r farchnad ynni yn y DU. Gwyddom y bydd newid yn yr hinsawdd hefyd yn creu cyd-destun hollol newydd ar gyfer y maes polisi hwn, a gwyddom fod hyder buddsoddwyr mewn cyfundrefn newydd o fewn marchnad ynni newydd yn gwbl hanfodol i'r agenda ehangach. Dyna pam rydym am weld economi ynni gymysg lle y gallwn roi'r ffocws ar fuddsoddi mewn ynni adnewyddadwy—ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fwy, ond hefyd ar y raddfa lai a ddisgrifiwyd gan Antoinette Sandbach yn ei chyfraniad. Caiff y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Antoinette eu hadlewyrchu yn y ddogfen ymgynghori ar gyfer y cynllun datblygu gwledig nesaf, a gaiff ei gyhoeddi ganol mis nesaf.

The vision of 'Energy Wales', published by the First Minister in March 2012, is, I believe, a document that sets out clearly the ambitions of the Government to bring about joined-up policy development and delivery and to guide the low-carbon agenda into an area where these benefits can be realised. I committed to publishing an energy programmes delivery plan in the new year, and I would ask Members to be patient possibly for another few weeks. I can see that time is marching on, but we are still in January—just about—and, certainly, this delivery plan will be published before the conclusion of the RBS 6 Nations championship. I can certainly give you that assurance this afternoon.

May I say that the transition towards a low-carbon economy will take time and persistence? We need the support of industry, regulators and stakeholders. To inform policy development and the delivery of 'Energy Wales', the Welsh Government has brought together senior leaders from the energy sector and public bodies to provide a forum and create partnership and common purpose in the delivery of our ambitions. The work of the 'Energy Wales' strategic delivery group, chaired by the First Minister, is available publicly on the Welsh Government website, and I would invite Members to ensure that they understand what we are doing there.

May I say, before time beats me, that it is important not to underestimate the progress that we have made? I understand that Members will, at different times, compare differently the progress being made in Wales with that being made by other administrations in the UK and elsewhere. However, we have seen substantial increases in the amount of energy generated from renewable sources over the past decade. Between 2010 and 2011, there was the largest increase, by 33%; between 2011 and 2012, we saw an increase of 11%. So, we are seeing year-on-year increases in the amount of energy generated from renewable sources.

The draft planning Bill will seek to ensure that we are showing leadership within the planning system, and I hope that the consultation document, 'Positive Planning', demonstrates that in real terms. In particular, the Bill will create a new category of development—developments of national significance—which is proposed to include strategic-scale energy projects that are devolved. Welsh Ministers will be responsible for processing and deciding on planning applications for this category of development. Members have referred to different areas of planning, and I will say that we believe that our national planning policy and TAN 8 remain fit for purpose, and we have no intention at the present time to undertake a review of our renewable or low-carbon energy policies or guidance.

Gwledigaeth 'Ynni Cymru', a gyhoeddwyd gan y Prif Weinidog ym mis Mawrth 2012, yn fy marn i, yw dogfen sy'n nodi'n glir ddyheadau'r Llywodraeth i sicrhau proses gydgysylltiedig ar gyfer datblygu polisi a'i roi ar waith ac ar gyfer llywio'r agenda carbon-isel i faes lle y gellir gwireddu'r buddiannau hyn. Rwy'n ymrwymedig i gyhoeddi cynllun cyflenwi ar gyfer rhaglenni ynni yn y flwyddyn newydd, a hoffwn ofyn i Aelodau fod yn amyneddgar am ychydig wythnosau eto o bosibl. Gallaf weld bod amser yn prysur fynd heibio, ond mae'n fis Ionawr o hyd—fwy neu lai—ac, yn sicr, caiff y cynllun cyflenwi hwn ei gyhoeddi cyn diwedd pencampwriaeth Chwe Gwlad yr RBS. Gallaf yn bendant eich sicrhau o hynny y prynhawn yma.

A gaf ddweud y bydd y newid tuag at economi carbon-isel yn gofyn am amser a dyfalbarhad? Mae angen cefnogaeth y diwydiant, rheoleiddwyr a rhanddeiliaid arnom. Er mwyn llywio'r broses o ddatblygu polisi a rhoi 'Ynni Cymru' ar waith, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dod ag uwch arweinwyr o'r sector ynni a chyrrff cyhoeddus ynghyd i ddarparu fforwm a chreu partneriaeth a diben cyffredin wrth gyflawni ein dyheadau. Mae gwaith grŵp cyflawni strategol 'Ynni Cymru', o dan gadeiryddiaeth y Prif Weinidog, ar gael yn gyhoeddus ar wefan Llywodraeth Cymru, a byddwn yn gwahodd yr Aelodau i sicrhau eu bod yn deall yr hyn a wneir gennym yn y grŵp hwnnw.

A gaf ddweud, cyn bod fy amser ar ben, ei bod yn bwysig peidio â diystyru'r cynnydd a wnaed gennym? Deallaf y bydd Aelodau, ar wahanol adegau, yn cymharu'r cynnydd a wneir yng Nghymru â chynnydd gweinyddiaethau eraill yn y DU ac mewn mannau eraill yn wahanol. Fodd bynnag, rydym wedi gweld cynnydd sylweddol yn swm yr ynni a gynhyrchir o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy yn ystod y degawd diwethaf. Cafwyd y cynnydd mwyaf rhwng 2010 a 2011, sef cynnydd o 33%; rhwng 2011 a 2012, bu cynnydd o 11%. Felly, rydym yn gweld cynnydd o flwyddyn i flwyddyn o ran swm yr ynni a gynhyrchir o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy.

Bydd y Bil cynllunio drafft yn ceisio sicrhau ein bod yn dangos arweinyddiaeth o fewn y system gynllunio, a gobeithio bod y ddogfen ymgynghori, 'Cynllunio Cadarnhaol', yn dangos hynny mewn termau real. Yn arbennig, bydd y Bil yn creu categori newydd o ddatblygiad—datblygiadau o bwys cenedlaethol—y bwriedir iddo gynnwys prosiectau ynni datganoledig ar raddfa strategol. Bydd Gweinidogion Cymru yn gyfrifol am brosesu a phenderfynu ar geisiadau cynllunio ar gyfer y categori hwn o ddatblygiad. Mae Aelodau wedi cyfeirio at wahanol feysydd cynllunio, a hoffwn ddweud ein bod yn credu bod ein polisi cynllunio cenedlaethol a TAN 8 yn parhau'n addas at y diben, ac nad oes gennym unrhyw fwriad ar hyn o bryd i gynnal adolygiad o'n polisiau na'n canllawiau ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy nac ynni carbon-isel.

I can see that my time is moving along quickly. I agree with the points that Julie James made about Ynni'r Fro. I will continue to ensure that this forms an important part of our policy process as we take it forward. If Members have comments to make, as Russell George did, about NRW and hydro schemes, I would be happy to take those matters up with NRW. They are matters on which I believe NRW has made a significant difference in the last year, but I recognise that we need to move on there. I will say, in conclusion, and with your extreme patience, Presiding Officer, that a number of Members raised issues around unconventional gas as an energy source. These are complex matters in terms of the current devolution settlement. With Russell George's support, we will be able to clarify those matters and provide more clarity for Members here and for others. However, we do not believe that it is a choice between renewables and gas. We believe that we need a mixed energy economy. We want to see renewables taking a lead and what we want to see is a successful energy policy for Wales that has climate change at its heart, but which also delivers effective energy for industrial and domestic use across the country. Thank you very much.

Gwelaf fod fy amser yn mynd rhagddo'n gyflym. Cytunaf â phwyntiau Julie James am Ynni'r Fro. Byddaf yn parhau i sicrhau bod hyn yn rhan bwysig o'n proses polisi wrth inni symud ymlaen. Os oes gan Aelodau sylwadau i'w gwneud, fel y gwnaeth Russell George, am gynlluniau Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru a chynlluniau dŵr, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i drafod y materion hynny gyda CNC. Credaf fod CNC wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol mewn perthynas â'r materion hynny yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, ond rwy'n cydnabod bod angen inni symud ymlaen. Hoffwn ddweud, i gloi, a chyda'ch amynedd eithriadol, Lywydd, fod nifer o Aelodau wedi codi materion ynghylch nwy anghonfensiynol fel ffynhonnell ynni. Mae'r rhain yn faterion cymhleth o ran y setliad datganoli presennol. Gyda chymorth Russell George, byddwn yn gallu cael eglurhad ar y materion hynny a rhoi mwy o eglurder i'r Aelodau yma ac i eraill. Fodd bynnag, ni chredwn mai dewis rhwng ynni adnewyddadwy a nwy mohono. Credwn fod angen economi ynni gymysg arnom. Rydym am weld ynni adnewyddadwy yn chwarae rhan flaenllaw ac rydym am weld polisi ynni llwyddiannus i Gymru sy'n seiliedig ar newid yn yr hinsawdd, ond sydd hefyd yn darparu ynni effeithiol at ddefnydd diwydiannol a domestig ledled y wlad. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

15:50 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I call on the obviously much-loved Chair of the Environment and Sustainability Committee, Dafydd Elis-Thomas.

Galwaf ar Gadeirydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd, Dafydd Elis-Thomas, y mae gan bobl yn amlwg gariad mawr tuag ato.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:50 **Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

As much loved as you are, Dame Presiding Officer. [Laughter.] Well, I had to say it, did I not?

Fel ag y mae ganddynt tuag atoch chi, Fonesig Lywydd. [Chwerthin.] Wel, roedd yn rhaid imi ddweud hynny, onid oedd?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:50 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

No, you did not have to, but I am glad that you did. Thank you.

Nac oedd, nid oedd yn rhaid ichi, ond rwy'n falch ichi wneud. Diolch.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:50 **Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Rwy'n ddiolchgar am yr hyder sydd wedi ei fynegi gan Aelodau yng ngwaith y pwyllgor. Mae wedi bod yn bleser pur, fel bydd Beti George yn ei ddweud bob tro ar fore Sul, i wneud y gwaith hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddadl hon y prynhawn yma wedi dangos bod gwahaniaeth barn a bod parodrwydd i fynegi barn yn glir ymhlith aelodau'r pwyllgor, ac rwy'n gwerthfawrogi hynny.

I am grateful for the confidence expressed by Members in the work of the committee. It has been an absolute pleasure, as Beti George always says on Radio Cymru on a Sunday, to do this work. However, this debate this afternoon has shown that there is a difference of opinion and a willingness to express views among committee members, and I do appreciate that.

Diolch i Julie James, yn enwedig am ei phwyslais ar yr angen am ganllawiau cynllunio clir, a gwneud y cysylltiad rhwng gorchmynion datblygu lleol a'r Bil cynllunio. Mae cyfle mawr i ni, pan fyddwn ni fel pwyllgor yn craffu ar y Bil cynllunio, i wneud gwahaniaeth ac i greu deddfwriaeth newydd effeithiol yng Nghymru.

I would like to thank Julie James, particularly for her emphasis on the need for clear planning guidance, and making that connection between local development orders and the planning Bill. There is a major opportunity for us as a committee, in scrutinising the planning Bill, to make a difference and to create effective new legislation in Wales.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)



Fe wnes i fwynhau cyfraniad Russell George, fel y byddaf bob amser yn y pwyllgor, yn enwedig ei ddadl dros un Gweinidog arweiniol. O'm safbwynt i fel Cadeirydd, y mwyaf o Weinidogion sy'n atebol i'n pwyllgor ni, gorau oll, oherwydd bydd cyfle diderfyn wedyn i chwarae un yn erbyn y llall. Rwy'n hapus iawn i gael ein prif Weinidog ni—hynny yw, y prif Weinidog sy'n atebol i ni—sef Alun, sydd yma heddiw, a'r Prif Weinidog arall—Prif Weinidog y Llywodraeth—hefyd yn atebol i'n pwyllgor ni.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (David Melding) i'r Gadair am 15:51.*

I enjoyed Russell George's contribution, as I always do in committee, particularly his argument for having one lead Minister. From my point of view as Chair, the more Ministers that are accountable to our committee then all the better, because you then have an endless opportunity to plan one against the other. I am very pleased to have our lead Minister—that is, the Minister who is most accountable to us—namely Alun, who is here today, and the First Minister also being accountable to our committee.

*The Deputy Presiding Officer (David Melding) took the Chair at 15:51.*

15:51

## **Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Ynglŷn â'r ddadl am yr angen i'r cyhoedd weld y bwriad hwn sydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i ddefnyddio'r grymoedd, mae hwnnw'n bwynt digon teg, ac mae'n un y dylem ei ddilyn ymhellach.

Fe wnaeth Llyr Gruffydd bwysleisio'r angen i osod targedau uchelgeisiol fel sydd yn yr Alban. Mae'n ffasiwn, wrth gwrs, yn fy mhlaidd i edrych tua'r Alban, ac mae'r arolygon barn yn dangos efallai y bydd yn werth i barhau i edrych tua'r Alban. Ond, yn sicr, ym maes targedau ynni adnewyddadwy, rydym yn eiddigeddus o'r rhai sydd wedi eu cyrraedd yn yr Alban. Mae hynny'n dilyn oherwydd y pwerau sydd ganddynt.

William Powell, diolch am edrych i'r tymor canol—i'r flwyddyn 2050—a gweld yn glir iawn y bydd capasiti cynhyrchu Cymru, oherwydd y cynhyrchu sy'n dod i ben a diffyg datblygiad newydd yn ei le, yn sylweddol llai na'r hyn sydd gennym heddiw. Mae hynny'n pwysleisio'r angen eto i gynyddu'r buddsoddiad adnewyddadwy er mwyn gwneud yn iawn am hynny. Mae'r cwestiwn o ledu'r budd cymunedol ar draws Cymru yn dibynnu ar ble mae'r caniatadau cynllunio yn cael eu rhoi.

Fe gawsom dystiolaeth yn ein hadroddiad cyntaf ynglŷn â'r angen i ailedrych ar TAN 8. Roedd hynny'n cael ei ddadlau gan rai pobl, ond roedd yn glir iawn, o ran y datblygyr, nad oeddent eisiau hynny. Yn amlwg, yng nghyd-destun y Bil cynllunio newydd, byddwn mewn cyfundrefn gynllunio gwbl wahanol ac fe fydd cyfle i ni edrych ar y polisi, buaswn yn tybio, yn llawnach.

Diolch i Joyce Watson hefyd am ddiolch imi. Rwy'n hapus iawn i fod yn un o etholwyr Joyce Watson yn rhanbarth y gorllewin. Rwy'n siŵr y byddaf yn ffeindio lle i'r dyfyniad hwnnw yn fy anerchiad etholiad, gan fy mod i, er gwaethaf pawb a phopeth, fel y dywedodd un o'm cyfeillion unwaith, yn parhau i geisio sefyll i fod yn Aelod Cynulliad ar gyfer y lle hwn—nid fy mod yn bwriadu bod yn Gadeirydd pwyllgor, o angenrheidrwydd, y tro nesaf. Rwy'n meddwl bod y ddadl a gyflwynwyd ganddi hi yn glir iawn ynglŷn â'r angen i ddatganoli ynni yng Nghymru i fod yn gyflawnach, a bod y drefn sy'n cynnwys y Deyrnas Unedig yn achosi gohirio penderfyniadau. Roeddwn yn falch, hefyd, am yr hyn y dywedodd hi ynglŷn â ffracio.

In terms of the argument on the need for the public to see the Welsh Government's intention to use its powers, I do think that that is a fair point, and one that we should follow up.

Llyr Gruffydd emphasised the need to set ambitious targets as they have done in Scotland. It is a fashion in my own party to look towards Scotland and the opinion polls show that it may be worth while to continue looking towards Scotland. But, certainly, in terms of renewable energy targets, we look jealously at what has been achieved in Scotland, but that is as a result of the powers that they have.

William Powell, thank you for looking to the medium term—to the year 2050—and seeing very clearly that the Welsh generation capacity, because of the generation that is ending and the lack of new development in its place, will be significantly reduced compared to what we have today. That emphasises the need to increase the investment in renewables in order to put right that deficit. The question of spreading community benefit across Wales depends on where planning consents are granted.

We did take evidence for our first report on the need to look anew at TAN 8. That was argued by some people, but it became very clear, from the developers' point of view, that they did not want that. Clearly, in the context of the new planning Bill, we will be within an entirely different planning regime and there will be an opportunity for us to look at that policy, I assume, in greater detail.

I would like to thank Joyce Watson for thanking me. I am always happy to be a constituent of Joyce Watson in the Mid and West Wales region. I am sure that I will find a place for that quote in my election address, because despite everything and everyone, as a colleague of mine once said, I will be continuing to stand as an Assembly Member in future—not that I intend to be a committee Chair necessarily next time. I think that the case put forward by Joyce Watson was very clear on the need to devolve responsibility for energy in Wales, and for that to be more comprehensive, and that the current regime, which includes the UK, does cause delays in decision making. I was also grateful for what she had to say on fracking.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Mae Antoinette Sandbach wastad yn rhoi boddhad di-bendraw imi yn yr hyn y mae'n ei ddweud. Bu iddi gyflwyno ei hun fel un a oedd yn llawn angerdd dros 'anaerobic digestion'; roedd hwnnw'n osodiad plerus iawn y byddaf yn ei gadw gyda fi am flynyddoedd. [Chwerthin.] Mae'r pwyslais a roddodd hi ar y ffaith bod delifro ynni cymunedol yn anodd oherwydd diffyg cefnogaeth y Llywodraeth yn rhywbeth y mae'n bwysig i ni fynd yn ôl ato unwaith eto.

Dyma fy nghyfle arferol i ddiolch i'r Gweinidog. Rwyf yn ystyried fy hun yn rhyw fath o fentor gwleidyddol i'r Gweinidog, gan ein bod yn mynd yn ôl yn bell iawn, ond awn ni ddim ar ôl hynny heddiw. Bydd digon o gyfle eto i sôn am bethau fel yna.

Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig, rwy'n meddwl, yw bod gennym arweiniad sydd yn cryfhau gan Lywodraeth Cymru, yn enwedig tuag at greu economi carbon isel. Rwy'n falch o ddeall ein bod wedi cael diffiniad newydd o'r diwedd o beth yw 'blwyddyn newydd'. Mae'r flwyddyn newydd yng Nghymru—

I am sorry; I will give way.

Antoinette Sandbach always gives me endless pleasure in her contributions. For her to present herself as one who had a passion for anaerobic digestion; that was quite a statement, which I will treasure for years to come. [Laughter.] Her emphasis on the fact that the delivery of community energy is difficult because of a lack of support from Government is something that we should return to.

This is my usual opportunity to thank the Minister. I consider myself to be some sort of political mentor of the Minister, as we do go back a very long way, but we will not go after that particular issue today. There will be plenty of opportunity in the future to discuss such issues.

What is important, I believe, is that we have a strengthening lead role from the Welsh Government, particularly in creating a low-carbon economy. I am pleased to understand that we finally have a new definition of 'new year'. The new year in Wales—

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf; ildiaf.

15:55 **Antoinette Sandbach** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Chair, before we conclude the debate, one thing that has not been mentioned, which is a huge block to developing that low-carbon economy and the small-scale renewables sector, is the charges for network connections and the district network operators. While I appreciate that that is not a devolved area, it is something that I think we need to work with the Minister on to put pressure on the other end of the M4.

Gadeirydd, cyn inni derfynu'r ddadl, un peth nas crybwyllwyd, sy'n rhwystr enfawr i ddatblygu'r economi carbon-isel honno a'r sector ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fach, yw'r taliadau am gysylltiadau rhwydwaith a'r gweithredwyr rhwydwaith ardal. Er fy mod yn sylweddoli nad yw hynny'n faes datganoledig, mae'n faes lle mae angen inni gydweithio gyda'r Gweinidog er mwyn rhoi pwysau ar ben arall yr M4.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:55 **Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Yes, we had evidence on that this morning, and thank you for bringing that on board.

Do, cawsom dystiolaeth ar hynny y bore yma, a diolch ichi am gyfeirio at hynny.

Felly, i grynhoi, fel yr oeddwn yn dweud, y diffiniad bellach o 'blwyddyn newydd' yw diwedd pencampwriaeth y chwe gwlad. Rwy'n edrych ymlaen at lwyddiant hynny. Dyna ddiwedd y ddadl hon, ac mor braf yw cael dadl pwyllgor ar brynhawn dydd Mercher yn hytrach na dadleuon pleidiol. Gwell i ni gael mwy ohonynt.

Therefore, to conclude, as I was saying, the definition now of 'new year' is the end of the six nations championship. I look forward to seeing success in that area. That concludes this debate, and it is wonderful to have a committee debate on a Wednesday afternoon rather than party debates. We should have more of them.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:56 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The proposal is to agree the motion, to note the Environment and Sustainability Committee's report. Does any Member object? There are no objections and the motion is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

Y cynnig yw derbyn y cynnig, i nodi adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Nid oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad, ac felly derbynnir y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.*

*Motion agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.*

## Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Mewnfuddsoddi

Detolwyd y gwelliannau canlynol: gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Elin Jones, a gwelliannau 4 a 5 yn enw Aled Roberts.

## Welsh Conservatives Debate: Inward Investment

The following amendments have been selected: amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Elin Jones, and amendments 4 and 5 in the name of Aled Roberts.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:56

## **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Galwaf ar Nick Ramsay i wneud y cynnig.

I call on Nick Ramsay to move the motion.

Cynnig NDM5416 William Graham

Motion NDM5416 William Graham

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Yn nodi'r cynigion ar gyfer mewnfuddsoddi a amlinellwyd yn nogfen Ceidwadwyr Cymru 'Destination Cymru'.

Notes the proposals for inward investment outlined in the Welsh Conservative document 'Destination Cymru'.

15:56

## **Nick Ramsay** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I move the motion.

Cynigiau y cynnig.

I am pleased to open this opposition Welsh Conservative party debate today on inward investment. Last Thursday, at the port of Cardiff, the Welsh Conservatives launched 'Destination Cymru', a fresh approach to attracting companies to Wales. By launching at this venue, we were reminded of a time when Cardiff was home to one of the largest ports in the world, with a quayside that measured over 6.5 miles. In the early years of the twentieth century, it exported over 10 million tonnes of coal and was home to 122 shipping companies. As we know, in twenty-first century Britain and twenty-first century Wales, times have changed. Cardiff port now employs only between 100 and 200 people on site, and only Roath and Queen Alexandra docks remain operational. This can be put down to a number of factors, including the decline of heavy industry, increased competition and, of course, the move to a less labour-intensive operation. However, facilities such as Cardiff port remain at the heart of the Welsh and UK maritime economy, handling 2.1 million tonnes of goods annually. The five ports in south Wales collectively handle 12 million tonnes and provide excellent entry and exit points for goods and materials to enter and leave Wales.

Rwy'n falch o agor dadl yr wrthblaid gan Blaid Geidwadol Cymru heddiw ar fewnfuddsoddi. Ddydd Iau diwethaf, ym mhorthladd Caerdydd, lansiodd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig 'Destination Cymru', sef ffordd newydd o ddenu cwmnïau i Gymru. Drwy ei lansio yn y lleoliad hwn, cawsom ein hatgoffa o'r adeg pan oedd Caerdydd yn gartref i un o'r porthladdoedd mwyaf yn y byd, gyda glannau ceiau a oedd yn mesur dros 6.5 milltir. Yn ystod blynyddoedd cynnar yr ugeinfed ganrif, roedd yn allforio dros 10 miliwn o dunelli o lo ac yn gartref i 122 o gwmnïau llongau. Fel y gwyddom, ym Mhrydain yr unfed ganrif ar hugain ac yng Nghymru yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, mae amseroedd wedi newid. Mae porthladd Caerdydd bellach yn cyflogi rhwng 100 a 200 o bobl ar y safle, a dim ond doc y Rhath a doc y Frenhines Alexandra sy'n dal i fod yn weithredol. Gellir priodoli hyn i nifer o ffactorau, gan gynnwys dirywiad diwydiant trwm, mwy o gystadleuaeth ac, wrth gwrs, symud tuag at ddulliau gweithredu sy'n gofyn am lai o lafur. Fodd bynnag, mae cyfleusterau megis porthladd Caerdydd yn parhau i fod yn rhan ganolog o economi forwrol Cymru a'r DU, gan drafod 2.1 miliwn o dunelli o nwyddau bob blwyddyn. Mae'r pum porthladd yn ne Cymru gyda'i gilydd yn trafod 12 miliwn tunnell ac yn lleoliadau mewnfurio ac allforio rhagorol ar gyfer nwyddau a deunyddiau sy'n dod i mewn i Gymru ac yn ei gadael.

'Destination Cymru' is about maximising the economic opportunities of inward investment, not only by bringing businesses to Wales, but by keeping them here and embedding them into our domestic economy to ensure long-term success. It is one of the roles that the Welsh Development Agency fulfilled well, resulting in a boom of inward investment during the 1980s when Wales's share of the UK average was around 15%, compared with today's share, which is around 4%. While in recent months we have seen a welcome increase in inward investment into Wales, this is from, admittedly, a low base and it has a long way to go to reach those heights of 30 years ago, which must be our end goal.

Nod 'Destination Cymru' yw ceisio manteisio i'r eithaf ar gyfleoedd economaidd mewnfuddsoddi, nid yn unig drwy ddod â busnesau i Gymru, ond drwy eu cadw yma a'u gwneud yn rhan annatod o economi ein gwlad er mwyn sicrhau llwyddiant yn yr hirdymor. Mae'n un o'r rolau a gyflawnwyd yn dda gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, gan arwain at ymchwydd mewn mewnfuddsoddi yn ystod y 1980au pan oedd cyfran Cymru o fewnfuddsoddi cyfartalog y DU tua 15%, o gymharu â'r gyfran heddiw, sef tua 4%. Er inni weld cynnydd calonogol mewn mewnfuddsoddi yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, sydd i'w groesawu, daw, rhaid cyfaddef, o sylfaen isel ac mae tipyn o ffordd i fynd nes ei fod yn cyrraedd yr uchelfannau hynny a welwyd 30 mlynedd yn ôl, sef yr hyn y mae'n rhaid inni anelu ato yn y pen draw.

Few people doubt that inward investment is crucial to the long-term success of the Welsh economy. The Welsh Conservatives believe that inward investment is in need of reorganisation and regeneration and we have focused on the three areas of investor aftercare, private sector involvement and clear targets as being central to achieving this change. The overarching aim of our policy is to ensure that when investors come to Wales, they stay in Wales. Now, we realise that we cannot go on as we are, bringing businesses into Wales, but not laying the foundations and support that they need to thrive and grow here. Our policy is about being clever with inward investment and learning from some of the best practice that other parts of the United Kingdom have adopted.

From the inception of 'Destination Cymru,' we worked closely with Adam Breeze, an inward investment specialist who has advised a number of Governments around the world and has been involved in more than 100 inward investment projects. With his curriculum vitae also including time as national head of inward investment at English Partnerships, as well as working with UK Trade and Industry, we feel that we have a well-respected specialist who truly knows what support businesses need from Government. May I take this opportunity to thank Adam for his sage advice and for the time that he spent in helping the Welsh Conservatives to come up with 'Destination Cymru'. I hope that the Welsh Government will recognise the expert advice that we have received when considering our policy report.

We are all pleased when foreign investment is brought into Wales. I know that we sometimes talk about talking Wales down; well, we want to talk Wales up. All of us are pleased when any foreign investment is brought here; it shows that we are an attractive proposition as somewhere for a company to locate. However, we must also look after companies when they arrive. There are a number of historic examples of companies locating here on the back of attractive grants and tax breaks. The Welsh Government itself has cited these examples in the past. However, once these incentives have dried up, too many businesses relocate elsewhere—and have done so over a long period of time—resulting in the usual spiral of decline of job losses and a serious impact on local communities, many of which were in the more deprived areas of Wales. We all need to redouble our efforts to better sell Wales as an attractive area in which to locate for the longer term. Figures published in 2008 show that 171 foreign companies left Wales between 1998 and 2008. Could more have been done to retain them in Wales, and were questions asked about where they moved their businesses to? These questions need to be asked, and we think that the answers will be very telling.

Ychydig iawn o bobl sy'n amau bod mewnfuddsoddi yn hanfodol i lwyddiant hirdymor economi Cymru. Cred y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig fod angen ad-drefnu ac adfywio mewnfuddsoddi, ac rydym wedi canolbwyntio ar dri maes, sef ôl-ofal i fuddsoddwyr, ymwneud y sector preifat a thargedau clir fel meysydd sy'n ganolog i gyflawni'r newid hwn. Nod cyffredinol ein polisi yw sicrhau, pan fydd buddsoddwyr yn dod i Gymru, eu bod yn aros yng Nghymru. Nawr, sylweddolwn na allwn barhau fel yr ydym, gan ddod â busnesau i Gymru, ond heb osod y sylfeini a'r cymorth sydd eu hangen arnynt i ffynnu a thyfu yma. Mae ein polisi yn gofyn am drin mewnfuddsoddi yn ddeallus a dysgu gan rai o'r arferion gorau y mae rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig wedi'u mabwysiadu.

Ers sefydlu 'Destination Cymru,' rydym wedi gweithio'n agos gydag Adam Breeze, sef arbenigwr ar fewnfuddsoddi sydd wedi cynghori nifer o Lywodraethau ledled y byd ac sydd wedi ymwneud â mwy na 100 o brosiectau mewnfuddsoddi. Ac yntau hefyd wedi bod yn bennaeth cenedlaethol mewnfuddsoddi yn English Partnerships, yn ogystal â gweithio gyda Masnach a Diwydiant y DU, teimlwn fod gennym arbenigwr uchel ei barch sydd wir yn gwybod pa gymorth sydd ei angen ar fusnesau gan y Llywodraeth. Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i Adam am ei gyngor doeth ac am roi o'i amser i helpu'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig i lunio 'Destination Cymru'. Gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn cydnabod y cyngor arbenigol a gawsom wrth ystyried ein hadroddiad polisi.

Rydym i gyd yn falch pan fydd buddsoddiad tramor yn dod i Gymru. Gwn ein bod weithiau yn sôn am siarad yn ddilornus am Gymru; wel, rydym am siarad yn ganmoliaethus am Gymru. Mae pob un ohonom yn falch pan fydd unrhyw fuddsoddiad tramor yn dod yma; dengys ein bod yn lleoliad atyniadol fel rhywle i gwmni symud iddo. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd ofalu am gwmnïau pan fyddant yn cyrraedd. Mae nifer o enghreifftiau hanesyddol o gwmnïau yn dod yma ar sail grantiau atyniadol a gostyngiadau treth. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru ei hun wedi nodi'r enghreifftiau hyn yn y gorffennol. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd y cymhellion hyn wedi dod i ben, mae gormod o fusnesau yn symud i rywle arall—ac wedi gwneud hynny dros gyfnod hir o amser—gan arwain at y cylch arferol o ddirywiad o ran colli swyddi ac effaith ddifrifol ar gymunedau lleol, yr oedd llawer ohonynt yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru. Mae angen i bob un ohonom ymdrechu o'r newydd i hyrwyddo Cymru fel ardal atyniadol i symud iddi yn y tymor hwy. Dengys ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd yn 2008 fod 171 o gwmnïau tramor wedi gadael Cymru rhwng 1998 a 2008. A ellid bod wedi gwneud rhagor i'w cadw yng Nghymru, ac a ofynnwyd cwestiynau ynghylch i ble roeddent yn symud eu busnesau? Mae angen gofyn y cwestiynau hyn, a chredwn y bydd yr atebion yn dweud llawer.

Before the usual objections are made about funding being tight, this is not all about money. Of course, funding is limited at the moment, but investor aftercare is all about building relationships and making the most of the contacts and networks that are available through the private sector. If we can do our best to encourage businesses to rely on personal and business relationships, rather than on grants and funding, and if the Welsh Government can give guidance as to how more novice companies can build up these business relationships and networks, we think that this will ensure that aftercare is both sustainable and cost-effective in the longer term, looking forward, as Dafydd Elis-Thomas did, to 2050. The Government's lack of a dedicated investor aftercare programme of this type—I am not saying that there are not some aspects of aftercare, because there are, but I am talking about a coherent programme of dedicated investor aftercare—speaks volumes about why we have some of the problems that we have today in Wales.

Aftercare activities include assistance with import and export permits, advice on expansion projects and recruitment, and collaboration with Government and other agencies. This would encourage reinvestment, the strengthening of Wales's reputation, and the growth of local supply chains to support these new businesses. The body that can look after this is already there in the guise of the Welsh Government's trade and inward investment team. We would just need to reorganise aspects of it to ensure that aftercare was part of the department's remit, and that there is a coherent strategy that makes aftercare central to the attraction of business to Wales.

Of course, Government cannot do this alone. My party believes that probably more than any other. This aftercare must be delivered in partnership with the private sector. There are too many Government-led bodies that may not always have the most up-to-date experience of the marketplace. That is understandable; that is part of the way that it has worked in the past. Private sector involvement can really help to add value to networking, which is so valuable in attracting and retaining inward investment. If we look at Scottish Development International, the body responsible for attracting inward investment in Scotland, over 75% of its staff have relevant direct private sector experience. That is something that we need to aspire to in Wales, and I would be interested to know what the Minister is doing to encourage greater private sector involvement. Our policy of 'Destination Cymru' recommends that a private sector investment council be set up to support the aftercare programme.

The benefits of a foreign investment can have a far-reaching knock-on effect on local companies. Supply chains and contacts not only boost the local economy, but help to make foreign investors feel that they are a key part of the local community, and thus, hopefully, increase their chances of deciding to reinvest.

Cyn i'r gwrthwynebiadau arferol gael eu gwneud ynghylch cyfyngiadau ar gyllid, nid yw hyn yn ymwneud â chyllid yn unig. Wrth gwrs, mae cyllid yn gyfyngedig ar hyn o bryd, ond mae ôl-ofal i fuddsoddwyr yn ymwneud â meithrin cydberthnasau a manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cysylltiadau a'r rhwydweithiau sydd ar gael drwy'r sector preifat. Os gallwn wneud ein gorau i annog busnesau i ddibynnu ar gydberthnasau personol a busnes, yn hytrach nag ar grantiau a chyllid, ac os gall Llywodraeth Cymru roi canllawiau ynghylch sut y gall cwmnïau mwy newydd greu'r cysylltiadau a'r rhwydweithiau busnes hyn, credwn y bydd hyn yn sicrhau bod ôl-ofal yn gynaliadwy ac yn gost-effeithiol yn y tymor hwy, gan edrych ymlaen, fel y gwnaeth Dafydd Elis-Thomas, at 2050. Mae diffyg rhaglen benodol o ôl-ofal i fuddsoddwyr o'r fath—nid wyf yn dweud nad oes dim ôl-ofal, oherwydd ni fyddai hynny'n wir, ond sôn yr wyf am raglen gydlynol o ôl-ofal penodol i fuddsoddwyr—yn siarad cyfrolau ynghylch pam rydym yn cael rhai o'r problemau sydd gennym heddiw yng Nghymru.

Mae gweithgareddau ôl-ofal yn cynnwys cymorth gyda thrwyddedau mewnfario ac allforio, cyngor ar brosiectau ehangu a recriwtio, a chydweithio â'r Llywodraeth ac asiantaethau eraill. Byddai hyn yn annog ailfuddsoddi, atgyfnerthu enw da Cymru, a hyrwyddo twf cadwyni cyflenwi lleol i gefnogi'r busnesau newydd hyn. Mae'r corff sy'n gallu ymgymryd â hyn eisoes ar gael o dan gochl tîm masnach a mewnfuddsoddi Llywodraeth Cymru. Y cyfan y byddai angen inni ei wneud yw ad-drefnu agweddau arno er mwyn sicrhau bod ôl-ofal yn rhan o gylch gwaith yr adran, a bod strategaeth gydlynol sy'n rhoi lle canolog i ôl-ofal er mwyn denu busnesau i Gymru.

Wrth gwrs, ni all y Llywodraeth wneud hyn ar ei phen ei hun. Mae'n siŵr bod fy mhlaid innau yn credu hynny yn anad neb arall. Rhaid i'r ôl-ofal hwn gael ei roi mewn partneriaeth â'r sector preifat. Mae gormod o gyrff o dan arweiniad y Llywodraeth nad oes ganddynt bob amser y profiad mwyaf cyfredol o'r farchnad. Mae hynny'n ddealladwy; dyna ran o'r ffordd y mae wedi gweithio yn y gorffennol. Gall cynnwys y sector preifat wir helpu i ychwanegu gwerth at rwydweithio, sydd mor werthfawr o ran denu a chadw mewnfuddsoddiad. Os edrychwn ar Scottish Development International, sef y corff sy'n gyfrifol am ddenu mewnfuddsoddi yn yr Alban, mae dros 75% o'i staff wedi cael profiad perthnasol uniongyrchol yn y sector preifat. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae angen inni anelu ato yng Nghymru, a hoffwn wybod beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i annog mwy o ymwneud gan y sector preifat. Mae ein polisi o 'Destination Cymru' yn argymhell y dylid sefydlu cyngor buddsoddi o dan arweiniad y sector preifat i gefnogi'r rhaglen ôl-ofal.

Gall manteision buddsoddi tramor gael effaith ganlyniadol bellgyrhaeddol ar gwmnïau lleol. Mae cadwyni cyflenwi a chysylltiadau nid yn unig yn rhoi hwb i'r economi lleol, ond maent yn helpu i sicrhau bod buddsoddwyr tramor yn teimlo eu bod yn rhan allweddol o'r gymuned lleol, ac felly, gobeithio, yn ei gwneud yn fwy tebygol y byddant yn penderfynu ailfuddsoddi.

There needs to be, at the end of this process, a comprehensive understanding of the local market structure. Many companies looking to invest in Wales will want the infrastructure to be there ready for them, and, if it is not, they will want to know whether it is possible to create it. That has to happen quickly. It is therefore vital that those advising on inward investment for the Welsh Government have detailed knowledge of the geographical and economic areas in which they are operating.

Finally, we recommend in 'Destination Cymru' that the Welsh Government establish a clear set of ambitious targets for its inward investment operations. This is the only way that success or failure can be monitored and addressed. You would think that this would be a given in any Government policy, as it helps to ensure transparency and the all-important accountability. However, sadly, too often we have seen Government schemes where targets covering all aspects of the schemes are notoriously hard to identify. We are still awaiting information as to how successful the seven enterprise zones in Wales have been at attracting inward investment. The problem of targets is not an easy one to address, I know, but that has to be dealt with in the medium term. If we do not have the information, how can we provide the solutions?

The much-maligned Welsh Development Agency published yearly and six-monthly reports—something that its successor organisation under the Welsh Government umbrella has not done. We can also look at neighbouring parts of the UK to see how their inward investment arms publish measurable targets and priorities. 'Destination Cymru' would encourage targets and structures to be established alongside the programme for Government.

I will turn briefly to the other parties' amendments. We support all of them but one. We support amendment 1. We are pleased to see that Plaid Cymru seemingly supports our recommendation in 'Destination Cymru' for clear targets to provide transparency and accountability. We are also pleased to support amendment 2. It is clear that Plaid supports the premise, at least, of 'Destination Cymru' and that action needs to be taken. Regarding amendment 4, and the current inquiry that the Enterprise and Business Committee is conducting into the Welsh Government's approach, that is something that I know all parties are committed to following through with. We also share the concerns of the Lib Dems regarding the fact that two years have passed since the Minister—honestly, actually—admitted that the Government in the past had not got the brand of Wales right. That is something that definitely needs to be addressed, and all parties agree with that. In terms of amendment 3, while I understand the principle behind it, and it is a nice try, we cannot support it, as we do not believe that it is an accurate reflection of UK Trade & Investment's current activities.

Finally, Deputy Presiding Officer, we cannot go on as we are. I am proud to be associated with the 'Destination Cymru' approach, and I urge the Minister to give our recommendations serious consideration in order to give the Welsh economy the much-needed boost that it deserves. I look forward to hearing the other contributions to this debate.

Mae angen, ar ddiwedd y broses hon, gael dealltwriaeth gynhwysfawr o strwythur y farchnad leol. Bydd llawer o gwmnïau sy'n ystyried buddsoddi yng Nghymru am weld bod y seilwaith yn barod ar eu cyfer, ac, os nad yw'n barod, byddant am wybod a oes modd ei greu. Rhaid i hynny ddigwydd yn gyflym. Felly, mae'n hanfodol bod y rhai sy'n rhoi cyngor ar fewnfuddsoddi i Lywodraeth Cymru yn meddu ar wybodaeth fanwl o'r ardaloedd daearyddol ac economaidd y maent yn gweithredu ynddynt.

Yn olaf, rydym yn argymhell yn 'Destination Cymru' bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn sefydlu cyfres glir o dargedau uchelgeisiol ar gyfer ei gweithrediadau mewnfuddsoddi. Dyma'r unig ffordd y gall llwyddiant neu fethiant gael ei fonitro a chael sylw. Byddech yn meddwl y byddai hyn yn rhan annatod o unrhyw bolisi gan y Llywodraeth, gan ei fod yn helpu i sicrhau tryloywder a'r atebolrwydd hollbwysig. Fodd bynnag, yn affodus, yn rhy aml rydym wedi gweld cynlluniau gan y Llywodraeth lle mae targedau sy'n cwmpasu pob agwedd ar y cynlluniau yn hynod anodd eu nodi. Rydym yn dal i aros am wybodaeth ynglŷn â pha mor llwyddiannus fu'r saith ardal fenter yng Nghymru o ran denu mewnfuddsoddiad. Nid yw problem targedau yn un hawdd i fynd i'r afael â hi, fe wn, ond rhaid ymdrin â hynny yn y tymor canolig. Os nad oes gennym y wybodaeth, sut y gallwn gynnig yr atebion?

Cyhoeddodd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, a gafodd ei ddfrio'n fawr adroddiadau blynyddol a chwe-miso—rhywbeth nad yw ei sefydliad olynol o dan fantell Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ei wneud. Gallwn hefyd edrych ar rannau cyfagos o'r DU i weld sut mae eu canghennau mewnfuddsoddi yn cyhoeddi targedau a blaenoriaethau mesuradwy. Byddai 'Destination Cymru' yn annog sefydlu targedau a strwythurau ochr yn ochr â'r rhaglen lywodraethu.

Soniaf yn fyr am welliannau'r pleidiau eraill. Rydym yn cefnogi pob un ohonynt ond un. Rydym yn cefnogi gwelliant 1. Rydym yn falch o weld bod Plaid Cymru, yn ôl pob golwg, yn cefnogi ein hargymhelliad yn 'Destination Cymru' ar gyfer targedau clir er mwyn rhoi tryloywder ac atebolrwydd. Rydym hefyd yn falch o gefnogi gwelliant 2. Mae'n amlwg bod Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi egwyddor 'Destination Cymru', o leiaf, a'r ffaith bod angen gweithredu. O ran gwelliant 4, a'r ymchwiliad presennol y mae'r Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes yn ei gynnal i'r ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gweithredu, mae hynny'n rhywbeth y gwn fod pob plaid wedi ymrwymo i roi sylw iddo. Rydym hefyd yn rhannu pryderon y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ynglŷn â'r ffaith bod dwy flynedd wedi mynd heibio ers i'r Gweinidog dderbyn—yn onest, a dweud y gwir—nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn y gorffennol wedi llwyddo i gael brand Cymru yn iawn. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae angen mynd i'r afael ag ef yn bendant, ac mae pob plaid yn cytuno â hynny. O ran gwelliant 3, er fy mod yn deall yr egwyddor sy'n sail iddo, ac mae'n ymgais bach dylfar, ni allwn ei gefnogi, gan na chredwn ei fod yn adlewyrchu'n gywir weithgareddau cyfredol Masnach a Buddsoddi y DU.

Yn olaf, Ddirprwy Lywydd, ni allwn barhau fel yr ydym. Rwy'n falch o fod yn gysylltiedig ag ymagwedd 'Destination Cymru', a hoffwn annog y Gweinidog i roi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i'n hargymhellion er mwyn rhoi'r hwb mawr ei angen i economi Cymru y mae'n ei haeddu. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed y cyfraniadau eraill i'r ddatl hon.

16:07

## Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Rwyf wedi dethol y pump gwelliant i'r cynnig, a galwaf ar Rhun ap Iorwerth i gynnig gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3, a gyflwynwyd yn enw Elin Jones.

I have selected the five amendments to the motion, and I call on Rhun ap Iorwerth to move amendments 1, 2 and 3, tabled in the name of Elin Jones.

*Gwelliant 1—Elin Jones*

*Amendment 1—Elin Jones*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Add as new point at end of motion:*

*Yn nodi ansawdd gwael y data a gasglwyd ar lefel genedlaethol (Cymru) ar gyfer Buddsoddi Uniongyrchol Tramor ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithio gyda'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol i ddarparu data cynhwysfawr ar Fuddsoddi Uniongyrchol Tramor gan gynnwys sectorau, tarddiad a gwerth.*

*Notes the poor quality of data collected at national (Wales) level for Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) and calls on the Welsh Government to work with the Office of National Statistics to provide comprehensive data on FDI including sectors, origin and value.*

*Gwelliant 2—Elin Jones*

*Amendment 2—Elin Jones*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Add as new point at end of motion:*

*Yn cydnabod bod amgylchiadau economaidd wedi newid yn sylweddol dros y ddau ddegawd diwethaf a bod yn rhaid i strategaeth Llywodraeth Cymru newid hefyd yn unol â hynny.*

*Recognises that economic conditions have shifted significantly over the past two decades and that the Welsh Government's strategy must also shift accordingly.*

*Gwelliant 3—Elin Jones*

*Amendment 3—Elin Jones*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Add as new point at end of motion:*

*Yn gresynu nad oes gan UK Trade & Investment ganolfan yng Nghymru na strategaeth ar gyfer Cymru er bod ganddynt un ar gyfer Lloegr a'r Alban.*

*Regrets that UK Trade & Investment does not have a centre in Wales nor a Welsh strategy but does have one for Scotland and England.*

16:07

## Rhun ap Iorwerth [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Cynigiaf welliannau 1, 2 a 3.

I move amendments 1, 2 and 3.

First, may I welcome the 'Destination Cymru' document as a useful contribution to the debate on inward investment? In the past, of course, Wales has been regarded as a leader when it comes to investment, punching way above our weight. However, things are very different now. No longer are we in a position to offer ourselves as the European destination of choice for cheap labour costs. We face tougher competition now, and, for nearly a decade, we have no longer had the WDA. For all of its strengths and weaknesses, it was a brand recognised throughout the world, and now, I think, is the time to look at rejuvenating the Welsh brand and putting new focus on the Welsh product.

Yn gyntaf, a gaf groesawu'r ddogfen 'Destination Cymru' fel cyfraniad defnyddiol i'r ddadl ar fewnfuddsoddi? Yn y gorffennol, wrth gwrs, mae Cymru wedi cael ei hystyried yn arweinydd o ran buddsoddi, gan wneud yn llawer gwell na'r disgwyl. Fodd bynnag, mae pethau yn wahanol iawn erbyn hyn. Nid ydym bellach mewn sefyllfa i gynnig ein hunain fel y dewis leoliad Ewropeaidd o ran costau llafur rhad. Rydym yn wynebu cystadleuaeth lymach bellach, ac, ers bron ddegawd, nid yw'r WDA wedi bodoli. Er gwaethaf ei holl gryfderau a gwendidau, roedd yn frand cydnabyddedig ledled y byd, ac erbyn hyn, fe gredaf, mae'n bryd edrych ar adfywio brand Cymru a rhoi ffocws newydd ar y cynnyrch Cymreig.

For all of the benefits brought about through major inward investment projects in the past, we had our fingers burned too, with job losses as projects were deemed by investors to have run their course or to no longer be profitable, reminding us of the dangers of putting all of our nation's economic eggs in one basket. The economic renewal programme that was developed by Plaid Cymru as part of the One Wales Government quite rightly sought to lower dependency on inward investment. I still say that we cannot go back to those days of over-dependency. However, I do think that this Government has taken its eye off the ball in terms of the continued role that inward investment can and should play in our economy, and we need to redress the balance now.

The Minister will, I am sure, rightly point to the number of foreign direct investment projects in Wales in 2012-13, and point to the growth of 191% on the previous year. However, while we clearly welcome good news, we have to be very careful about what we are talking about with these statistics. There were 67 projects in 2012-13. That was an improvement, yes, but from a worryingly low base of just 23 projects the previous year. We cannot point to global factors alone, because England seemingly did not suffer the same fate. We also have to continue to consider the shallowness of the data. What is a project? Some of these projects could be large, and some could be very modest; the UKTI figures for Wales do not give a breakdown of the figures for analysis beyond the number of projects.

We have no data for jobs created versus jobs secured, for example. While securing and safeguarding jobs is hugely important, we cannot just stick a finger in the air and try to guess what is happening with our economy. We need real and detailed data, which means investing in working closely with the Office for National Statistics. If we cannot deal with the present, as I said earlier this afternoon, we certainly cannot deal with the future.

We need real targets—that is something that we support in the 'Destination Cymru' document. Also, the quality of jobs is important. Plaid Cymru's economic commission has also shown that, in job creation in Wales, we are still failing to bring in the real jobs that can lead to a growth in GVA. We know that we can get it right. The news that the former Plaid Cymru Member of Parliament, and now a Plaid Cymru candidate for the Assembly, Adam Price, has co-founded a new, global high-skill research and development company—Ideoba research and development centre in Pencoed—with backing from the Harvard professor who taught Mark Zuckerberg and Bill Gates, bringing in high-value jobs to that area, is testament to the fact that we can still do it.

Er gwaethaf yr holl fanteision a ddaeth yn sgil prosiectau mewnfuddsoddi mawr yn y gorffennol, llosgwyd ein bysedd hefyd, gan golli swyddi wrth i fuddsoddwyr dybio bod prosiectau wedi rhedeg eu cwrs, neu nad oeddent yn broffidiol mwyach, gan ein hatgoffa o beryglon rhoi holl wyau economaidd ein gwlad mewn un fasedd. Ceisiodd rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi a ddatblygwyd gan Blaid Cymru fel rhan o Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un leihau'r ddibyniaeth ar fewnfuddsoddi a hynny'n ddigon cywir. Rwy'n dal i ddweud na allwn ddychwelyd i'r cyfnod hwnnw o orddibyniaeth. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y Llywodraeth hon wedi colli ffocws o ran y rôl barhaus y gall mewnfuddsoddi ei chwarae ac y dylai ei chwarae yn ein heconomi, ac mae angen bellach inni adfer y cydbwysedd.

Bydd y Gweinidog, mae'n siŵr gennyf, yn cyfeirio at nifer y prosiectau buddsoddi uniongyrchol tramor yng Nghymru yn 2012-13, a hynny'n ddigon teg ac yn sôn am dwf o 191% ers y flwyddyn flaenorol. Fodd bynnag, er ein bod yn amlwg yn croesawu newyddion da, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus iawn ynghylch yr hyn yr ydym yn sôn amdano o ran yr ystadegau hyn. Cafwyd 67 o brosiectau yn 2012-13. Roedd hwnnw'n welliant, yn sicr, ond o sylfaen bryderus o isel o 23 o brosiectau yn unig yn y flwyddyn flaenorol. Ni allwn gyfeirio at ffactorau byd-eang yn unig, oherwydd ymddengys nad yw Lloegr wedi wynebu'r un dynged. Rhaid inni hefyd barhau i ystyried natur arwynebol y data. Beth yw prosiect? Gallai rhai o'r prosiectau hyn fod yn fawr, a gallai rhai fod yn fach iawn; nid yw ffigurau Masnach a Buddsoddi y DU ar gyfer Cymru yn rhoi manylion am y ffigurau i'w dadansoddi ar wahân i nifer y prosiectau.

Nid oes gennym ddata ar gyfer swyddi a grëwyd yn erbyn swyddi a sicrhawyd, er enghraifft. Er bod sicrhau a diogelu swyddi yn bwysig iawn, ni allwn roi bys yn yr awyr a cheisio dyfalu beth sy'n digwydd gyda'n heconomi. Mae angen data go iawn a manwl, sy'n golygu buddsoddi mewn gweithio'n agos gyda'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol. Os na allwn ddygydd â'r presennol, fel y dywedais yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, yn sicr ni allwn ddygydd â'r dyfodol.

Mae angen inni gael targedau gwirioneddol—rhywbeth a gefnogwn yn y ddogfen 'Destination Cymru'. Hefyd, mae ansawdd y swyddi yn bwysig. Mae comisiwn economaidd Plaid Cymru hefyd wedi dangos, o ran creu swyddi yng Nghymru, ein bod yn methu o hyd â denu swyddi go iawn a all arwain at dwf yn y GYC. Gwyddom y gallwn ei chael yn iawn. Mae'r newyddion bod y cyn-Aelod Seneddol dros Blaid Cymru, ac ymgeisydd Plaid Cymru i'r Cynulliad bellach, Adam Price, wedi cydsefydlu cwmni ymchwil a datblygu, sgiliau uchel byd-eang newydd—canolfan ymchwil a datblygu Ideoba ym Mhencoed—gyda chefnogaeth yr athro o Harvard a ddysgodd Mark Zuckerberg a Bill Gates, gan ddod â swyddi gwerth uchel i'r ardal honno, yn dyst i'r ffaith y gallwn wneud hynny o hyd.



We also note the proposal to bring in the private sector more through a private sector investment council. It is a principle that I certainly support, but I think that we need more detail than we have in the document. However, after those generally positive points about the document, and before turning to the amendments, I will just point out the glaringly obvious to the Conservatives. This document is a useful contribution to the debate, but may I just remind you of the immeasurable harm that would be done to the Welsh economy if the Conservatives continue to push for a vote on withdrawal from the European Union? To pull out of that market would be absolute madness.

Nodwn hefyd y cynnig am fwy o ymwneud gan y sector preifat drwy gyngor buddsoddi o dan arweiniad y sector preifat. Mae'n egwyddor yr wyf yn sicr yn ei chefnogi, ond credaf fod angen inni gael mwy o fanylion nag sydd yn y ddogfen. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl y pwyntiau cadarnhaol hynny yn gyffredinol ynglŷn â'r ddogfen, a chyn troi at y gwelliannau, hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Ceidwadwyr at rywbeth amlwg iawn. Mae'r ddogfen hon yn gyfraniad defnyddiol i'r ddadl, ond a gaf eich atgoffa o'r niwed afesuradwy a fyddai'n cael ei wneud i economi Cymru pe bai'r Ceidwadwyr yn parhau i alw am bleidlais ar dynnu'n ôl o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd? Byddai gadael y farchnad honno yn hollol hurt.

16:11 **Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Do you accept that there would be immeasurable harm done to the Welsh economy if Wales were to pull out of the UK?

A ydych yn derbyn y byddai niwed afesuradwy yn cael ei wneud i economi Cymru pe bai Cymru yn gadael y DU?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:12 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

We are talking about the European markets; we are talking about dealing with the UK market and the European markets, both of which we need.

Rydym yn sôn am y marchnadoedd Ewropeaidd; rydym yn sôn am ddelio â'r farchnad yn y DU a'r marchnadoedd Ewropeaidd, y mae angen y naill a'r llall arnom.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Trof at y gwelliannau yn enw Elin Jones. Mae'r tri ohonynt yn eithaf hunan-esboniadol. Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 4 gan Aled Roberts yn nodi'r ymchwiliad gan y pwyllgor. Rydym hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant 5, oherwydd ei bod yn amlwg inni, er gwaethaf lansio ymgyrch 'Just Ask Wales', nid oes strategaeth go iawn yn ei lle. I grynhoi, mae angen diwygio, mae angen newid, a mae angen bod yn arloesol yng Nghymru a gwneud popeth y gallwn ei wneud i sicrhau bod Cymru yn gallu cystadlu.

I turn to the amendments in the name of Elin Jones. All three of them are self-explanatory. We will support amendment 4 from Aled Roberts noting the committee's inquiry. We also support amendment 5, because it is clear to us, despite the launch of the 'Just Ask Wales' campaign, that there is no real strategy in place. To summarise, we need reform, we need change, and we need to be innovative in Wales and to do everything that we can to ensure that Wales can compete.

16:13 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Galwaf ar Eluned Parrott i gynnis gwelliannau 4 a 5, a gyflwynwyd yn enw Aled Roberts.

I call Eluned Parrott to move amendments 4 and 5, tabled in the name of Aled Roberts.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

*Gwelliant 4—Aled Roberts*

*Amendment 4—Aled Roberts*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Add as new point at end of motion:*

*Yn nodi ymchwiliad presennol y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes i ymagwedd Llywodraeth Cymru tuag at hybu masnach a mewnfuddsoddi.*

*Notes the Enterprise and Business Committee's current inquiry into the Welsh Government's approach to the promotion of trade and inward investment.*

*Gwelliant 5—Aled Roberts*

*Amendment 5—Aled Roberts*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Add as new point at end of motion:*

*Yn nodi sylwadau Gweinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth i'r Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar 14 Mawrth 2012 nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi llwyddo i gael y brand yn gywir ar gyfer Cymru, ac yn gresynu nad oes dim strategaeth brandio wedi'i chyflwyno ers hynny.*

*Notes the comments of the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport to the Enterprise and Business Committee on 14 March 2012 that the Welsh Government has not got the brand of Wales right, and regrets that no brand strategy has since been presented.*

16:13 **Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I move amendments 4 and 5 in the name of Aled Roberts.

Cynigiau welliannau 4 a 5 yn enw Aled Roberts.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I am glad to welcome new policy ideas into what is a very important area of debate for the Welsh economy. I think that, over the years, there has been much discussion about what the balance between inward investment and the growth of indigenous business here in Wales ought to be. I do not think that we have always got that balance right. Yes, there are dangers in an over-reliance on inward investment, but there are also dangers in an over-reliance on home-grown economic growth as well. The biggest danger there, of course, is that, with an economy that is built around small businesses, and with a very high proportion of people employed in microbusinesses, in particular, growth in those businesses is always going to be a lot slower, and we need jobs now. We need jobs for our young people to be able to do. Of course, it is a question of tapering that support between the two approaches over time so that, as the Welsh economy develops and as more indigenous companies grow, there is less reliance on inward investment. However, while there is a need for young people to have jobs today, inward investment will always be a factor.

I was surprised that this paper was launched on the day that the Enterprise and Business Committee began hearing evidence on this subject. The committee is, of course, chaired by the person who introduced this debate today and who introduced the document too. It is not so much a case of the jury being out: the jury has not retired yet and is still hearing the evidence at the moment. I think that it is difficult for members of the committee to be able to come to judgments when we believe that there is much more information that we could draw on in order to take the debate further forward. In that committee, we have already heard a lot of interesting evidence as to the nature of the issues that we face, and I think that there will be a lot of interesting suggestions as to a way forward.

I have a couple of points on the specifics in the report: the assessment of foreign direct investment is based solely on the number of projects, and while we are tied to UKTI figures in terms of comparable statistics, we need to ask the Welsh Government what assessment it can make of the value in terms of cost and jobs of the inward investments that it is supporting. Obviously, if it has an involvement, it surely has some kind of input into that.

We also have to think about the value to those projects in terms of the supply and demand chains in the local economies. The point on aftercare is a very important one to raise. It is about embedding those jobs and investments in the Welsh economy and making sure that they do stay here in the long term, but I am not really convinced that we need to create a new silo. I am not convinced that that is how a business would operate in an approach to managing relationships with companies. In fact, the marketing jargon for this is 'customer relationship management'. It is about a cradle-to-grave approach—the same person who looks after the individual when they first make the contact takes them through the process. They develop a knowledge of the customer. The customer develops a trust for the person who is managing that relationship, and it is perhaps a more effective way of developing those relationships and those contacts.

Rwy'n falch o groesawu syniadau polisi newydd yn yr hyn sy'n faes pwysig iawn i'w drafod o ran economi Cymru. Credaf, dros y blynyddoedd, inni weld llawer o drafodaeth ynghylch y cydbwysedd cywir rhwng mewnfuddsoddi a thwf busnesau cynhenid yma yng Nghymru. Ni chredaf ein bod bob amser wedi llwyddo i gael y cydbwysedd hwnnw'n iawn. Oes, mae peryglon mewn gorddibyniaeth ar fewnfuddsoddi, ond ceir peryglon hefyd mewn gorddibyniaeth ar dwf economaidd a dyfir yn fewnwladol. Y perygl mwyaf yn hynny o beth, wrth gwrs, os bydd economi yn cael ei hadeiladu ar sail busnesau bach, a chyfran uchel iawn o bobl a gyflogir mewn microfusnesau, yn arbennig, y bydd twf yn y busnesau hynny bob amser yn llawer arafach, ac mae arnom angen swyddi yn awr. Mae arnom angen swyddi y gall ein pobl ifanc eu gwneud. Wrth gwrs, mae'n fater o dapro'r cymorth rhwng y ddau ddull gweithredu dros amser, er mwyn sicrhau, wrth i economi Cymru ddatblygu ac wrth i fwy o gwmnïau cynhenid dyfu, fod llai o ddibyniaeth ar fewnfuddsoddi. Fodd bynnag, tra bydd angen swyddi ar bobl ifanc heddiw, bydd mewnfuddsoddi bob amser yn bwysig.

Fe'm synnwyd i'r papur hwn gael ei lansio ar y diwrnod y dechreuodd y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes wrando ar dystiolaeth ar y pwnc hwn. Mae'r pwyllgor, wrth gwrs, yn cael ei gadeirio gan y sawl a gyflwynodd y ddatl hon heddiw ac a gyflwynodd y ddogfen hefyd. Nid mater o reithgor sydd eto i benderfynu ydyw: nid yw'r rheithgor wedi ymneilltuo eto ac mae'n dal i wrando ar y dystiolaeth ar hyn o bryd. Credaf ei bod yn anodd i aelodau o'r pwyllgor allu llunio barn a ninnau'n credu bod llawer mwy o wybodaeth y gallem ei defnyddio er mwyn symud y ddatl ymlaen ymhellach. Yn y pwyllgor hwnnw, rydym eisoes wedi clywed llawer o dystiolaeth ddiddorol o ran natur y problemau a wynebwn, a chredaf y bydd llawer o awgrymiadau diddorol ynglŷn â'r ffordd ymlaen.

Hoffwn wneud un neu ddau o bwyntiau am y manylion yn yr adroddiad: mae'r asesiad o fuddsoddi tramor uniongyrchol yn seiliedig ar nifer y prosiectau yn unig, ac er ein bod yn gorfod dibynnu ar ffigurau Masnach a Buddsoddi y DU o ran ystadegau cymharol, mae angen inni ofyn i Lywodraeth Cymru pa asesiad y gall ei wneud o werth y mewnfuddsoddiadau y mae'n eu cefnogi o ran costau a swyddi. Yn amlwg, os yw'n rhoi cefnogaeth, rhaid iddi gyfrannu mewn rhyw ffordd neu'i gilydd.

Rhaid inni hefyd feddwl am werth y cynlluniau hynny o ran y cadwyni cyflenwi a galw yn yr economïau lleol. Mae'r pwynt ynglŷn ag ôl-ofal yn un pwysig iawn i'w godi. Mae'n ymwneud â sicrhau bod y swyddi a'r buddsoddiadau hynny yn rhan annatod o economi Cymru a'u bod yn aros yma yn yr hirdymor, ond nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig bod angen inni greu seilo newydd. Nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig mai dyna sut y byddai busnes yn mynd ati i reoli cydberthnasau â chwmnïau. Yn wir, y term marchnata am hyn yw 'rheoli cydberthnasau â chwsmeriaid'. Mae'n ymwneud â dull gweithredu o'r crud i'r bedd—yr un person sy'n gofalu am yr unigolyn pan fydd yn cysylltu gyntaf a fydd yn ei dywys drwy'r broses. Mae'n dod i adnabod y cwsmer. Mae'r cwsmer yn dechrau ymddiried yn y person sy'n rheoli'r berthynas honno, ac efallai ei bod yn ffordd fwy effeithiol o ddatblygu'r cydberthnasau hynny a'r cysylltiadau hynny.

Of course, the WDA did bring jobs, but some of those jobs left, and the reasons why are a little more complex than we give them credit for. Yes, partly, I think, it is to do with the fact that the environment has changed, but partly it is to do with the fact that that pitch was wrong in the first place. We said that we were a cheap location to enter the European market, but that pitch was fatally undermined by two different things: first, that the Welsh economy itself was developing, and therefore we were developing higher skills and higher costs, and, secondly, because of the new entrants to the European market offering even lower costs to potential investors. That is why the brand proposition for Wales is so important, and a brand is not just about a logo—it is a range of attributes that make up how we are perceived and how we present and sell ourselves abroad. So, it is not just about ditching pictures of miners and daffodils and giving ourselves a logo and a marketing campaign; it is about developing a credible market positioning for Wales. How do we compete on cost, skills, infrastructure and on access to markets with all of the potential competitors that we face? What is our position in that marketplace when we are going to talk to people? The brand is wrong because we still, too often, use the WDA's old pitch. Modern Wales needs a pitch that is going to fit us.

In terms of the involvement of the private sector, there is potential to look at this. I am not entirely sure that I understand what the investment council would do, or would actually be. Finally, on targets, that is something I actually agree with you on.

16:18

## Suzy Davies [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

I also thank those contributing today. The general welcome for new ideas being introduced into the arena is something that we welcome, and I can see that the other opposition spokespeople all seem to agree that while inward investment is something our economy needs, it is also something that Wales needs to be doing significantly better.

Could I also begin by acknowledging the arrival in Wales of 67 businesses this year, nine of which are new companies, of which only five acknowledge Welsh Government involvement? We seriously hope that those green shoots develop into permanent roots here, and we are pleased to welcome every single one of those businesses to Wales. However, like Rhun ap Iorwerth, I think we need to get some perspective on the Welsh Government's rejoicing in how inward investment has shot up by 191% this year. It is a great statistic, but it is not clear how much of that is due to Welsh Government activity, and three times of hardly anything is still hardly anything. I would like a firm commitment by the Minister today that this is not the limit of her ambitions for Wales.

Wrth gwrs, llwyddodd y WDA i ddenu swyddi, ond gadawodd rhai o'r swyddi hynny, ac mae'r rhesymau dros hynny ychydig yn fwy cymhleth nag a dybiwn. Ydy, mae'n ymwneud yn rhannol â'r ffaith, fe gredaf, fod yr amgylchedd wedi newid, ond mae'n ymwneud yn rhannol â'r ffaith bod yr hyn a gynigiwyd yn anghywir yn y lle cyntaf. Dywedwyd ein bod yn lleoliad rhad er mwyn mynd i mewn i'r farchnad Ewropeaidd, ond cafodd hynny ei danseilio'n llwyr gan ddau beth gwahanol: yn gyntaf, roedd economi Cymru ei hun yn datblygu, ac felly roeddem yn datblygu sgiliau uwch a chostau uwch, ac, yn ail, am fod newydd-ddyfodiaid i'r farchnad Ewropeaidd yn cynnig costau hyd yn oed yn is i ddarpar fuddsoddwyr. Dyna pam mae'r brand a gynigir i Gymru mor bwysig, a brand nad yw'n ymwneud â logo yn unig—mae'n ymwneud ag amrywiaeth o nodweddion sy'n cyfrannu at sut rydym yn cael ein hystyried a sut rydym yn cyflwyno ein hunain ac yn hyrwyddo ein hunain dramor. Felly, mae'n golygu mwy na chael gwared ar luniau o lowyr a chennin Pedr a llunio logo ac ymgyrch farchnata ar ein cyfer; mae'n ymwneud â datblygu safle credadwy i Gymru yn y farchnad. Sut rydym yn cystadlu o ran cost, sgiliau, seilwaith a mynediad i farchnadoedd pan fo'r holl ddarpar gystadleuwyr yn ein hwynebu? Beth yw ein safle yn y farchnad honno pan fyddwn yn siarad â phobl? Mae'r brand yn anghywir oherwydd ein bod yn parhau, yn rhy aml, i ddefnyddio'r hyn a gynigiwyd gynt gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Mae angen i Gymru gyfoes gael rhywbeth sy'n addas inni.

O ran ymwneud y sector preifat, mae lle i edrych ar hyn. Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr fy mod yn deall yr hyn y byddai'r cyngor buddsoddi yn ei wneud, neu beth fyddai mewn gwirionedd. Yn olaf, o ran targedau, mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr wyf yn cytuno â chi arno mewn gwirionedd.

Hoffwn innau hefyd ddiolch i'r rhai sy'n cyfrannu heddiw. Mae'r croeso cyffredinol i syniadau newydd yn cael eu cyflwyno yn y maes hwn yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei groesawu, a gallaf weld bod llefarwyr y gwrthbleidiau eraill i gyd yn cytuno yn ôl pob golwg, er bod mewnfuddsoddi yn rhywbeth sydd ei angen ar ein heconomi, mae hefyd yn rhywbeth y mae angen i Gymru fod yn ei wneud gryn dipyn yn well.

A gaf hefyd ddechrau drwy gydnabod dyfodiad 67 o fusnesau i Gymru eleni, y mae naw ohonynt yn gwmnïau newydd, nad oes ond pump ohonynt yn cydnabod cyfranogiad gan Lywodraeth Cymru? Mawr obeithiwn y bydd yr egin hynny yn magu gwreiddiau parhaol yma, ac mae'n bleser gennym groesawu pob un o'r busnesau hynny i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, fel Rhun ap Iorwerth, credaf fod angen inni roi gorfoledd Llywodraeth Cymru yn y modd y mae mewnfuddsoddi wedi cynyddu'n sydyn 191% eleni yn ei gyd-destun. Mae'n ystadegyn gwych, ond nid yw'n glir faint o hynny sy'n deillio o weithgarwch Llywodraeth Cymru, ac mae tair gwaith fawr ddim yn dal i fod yn bitw. Hoffwn gael ymrwymiad cadarn gan y Gweinidog heddiw bod ganddi fwy o uchelgais dros Gymru na hynny.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

As with the First Minister's jubilation about growth higher than the UK average in youth employment and construction yesterday, it serves us well to remember that, in Wales, by every significant measure of whether a Government has succeeded or failed, we start at the very bottom: gross domestic product, health targets, educational attainment, worklessness, long-term poverty. I am not talking Wales down here, Minister; I am just recognising that this is Labour's legacy in a devolved Wales. While I will congratulate you for any successes you may have contributed to in recent improvement in inward investment, your explanation about why it went so wrong over the last decade is still waiting to be heard.

What we can all see is that in the 70s, 80s and 90s, under Governments of both colours at Westminster, there was a steady stream of inward investment. Even in the more febrile days of industrial unrest and, ultimately, the miners' strike, the Conservative Government was able to attract Japanese manufacturing to Bridgend and the Cynon valley, for example. By 2004, however, Wales was facing stiff competition on price, as Eluned Parrott said, from accession countries to the EU.

Yesterday, the First Minister treated us to some full-throttle rhetoric about the Welsh Development Agency's response being to sell Wales cheap in its final days. However, when Dr John Ball gave evidence to the Welsh Affairs Select Committee about the WDA attracting employment at any price, he was also very clear that, by then, the WDA was not at arm's length from Government. Lack of clear policy and leadership was, therefore, not just a symptom of the WDA losing its way; it continued when Labour took direct control. From 2006, when we were in the middle of Gordon Brown's boom, inward investment fell from the heights of 15% to an all-time low of 3.6% of the UK total. That is just under 0.5% lower than the 4% for which we are invited to express so much joy this year.

It was a bit silly, in his questions yesterday, for the First Minister to suggest that I have not heard of anchor companies. I look out of my bedroom window every morning and see one of the most important ones in Wales: Tata steelworks. It has invested in infrastructure, it remains a major employer in my region, it is working directly with Swansea University on its expansion and it supports a supply chain of small and medium-sized enterprises in the locality and beyond. Nevertheless, it has had problems with profitability, has shed hundreds of jobs and may be facing court action, and it is one of only a handful of anchor companies. Wales should have learnt from its days of heavy industry that you do not put all of your eggs in one basket, to quote Rhun ap Iorwerth.

Fel yn achos gorfoledd y Prif Weinidog am dwf sy'n uwch na chyfartaledd y DU o ran cyflogaeth ieuencid a'r diwydiant adeiladu ddoe, rhaid inni gofio, yng Nghymru, yn ôl pob mesur pwysig sy'n mesur a yw Llywodraeth wedi llwyddo neu wedi methu, ein bod yn dechrau ar y gwaelod: cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, targedau iechyd, cyrhaeddiad addysgol, bod heb waith, tloedi hirdymor. Nid wyf yn siarad yn ddilornus am Gymru o ran hyn, Weinidog; cydnabod yr wyf mai dyna etifeddiaeth Llafur yng Nghymru wedi datganoli. Er y byddaf yn eich llongyfarch am unrhyw lwyddiannau yr ydych wedi cyfrannu atynt o bosibl o ran y gwelliant diweddar mewn mewnfuddsoddi, rydym yn dal i aros i'ch esbonio pam yr aeth pethau gymaint o chwith dros y degawd diwethaf.

Yr hyn y gallwn i gyd ei weld, o dan Lywodraethau Llafur a Cheidwadol yn San Steffan, yw bod llif cyson o fewnfuddsoddi yn y 70au, yr 80au a'r 90au. Hyd yn oed yn y cyfnod mwy tanbaid o anghydfod diwydiannol ac, yn y pen draw, streic y glowyr, llwyddodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol i ddenu cwmnïau o Japan i Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr a Chwm Cynon, er enghraifft. Erbyn 2004, fodd bynnag, roedd Cymru yn wynebu cystadleuaeth gref ar sail pris, fel y dywedodd Eluned Parrott, gan wledydd newydd yr UE.

Ddoe, cawsom lond pen o rethreg gan y Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr oedd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi ymateb drwy werthu Cymru yn rhad yn ei ddyddiau olaf. Fodd bynnag, pan roddodd Dr John Ball dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig ynglŷn â'r WDA yn denu swyddi am unrhyw bris, roedd yn glir iawn nad oedd y WDA, erbyn hynny, yn awdurdod hyd braich oddi wrth y Llywodraeth. Roedd diffyg polisi ac arweiniad clir, felly, nid yn unig yn symptom bod yr WDA wedi colli ei ffordd, parhaodd hynny pan aeth o dan reolaeth uniongyrchol Llafur. O 2006, pan oeddem yng nghanol cyfnod ffyniannus Gordon Brown, gostyngodd mewnfuddsoddi o'i lefel uchaf o 15% i'r lefel isaf erioed, sef 3.6% o gyfanswm y DU. Mae hynny ychydig o dan 0.5% yn is na'r 4% y gofynnir inni ymlawenhau cymaint ynddo eleni.

Bu braidd yn wirion, yn ei gwestiynau ddoe, i'r Prif Weinidog awgrymu nad wyf wedi clywed am gwmnïau angori. Edrychaf o ffenestr fy ystafell wely bob bore a gweld un o'r rhai pwysig yng Nghymru: gwaith dur Tata. Mae wedi buddsoddi mewn seilwaith, mae'n parhau i fod yn gyflogwr pwysig yn fy rhanbarth, mae'n gweithio'n uniongyrchol gyda Phrifysgol Abertawe ar ehangu ei fusnes ac mae'n cefnogi cadwyn gyflenwi o fusnesau bach a chanolig yn yr ardal a thu hwnt. Serch hynny, mae wedi cael problemau gyda phroffidioldeb, wedi dileu cannoedd o swyddi ac efallai y bydd yn wynebu achos llys, ac mae'n un o lond dwrn yn unig o gwmnïau angori. Dylai Cymru fod wedi dysgu o oes y diwydiannau trymion nad ydych yn rhoi eich holl wyau mewn un fasged, os caf ddyfynnu Rhun ap Iorwerth.

'Destination Cymru' recognises that all kinds of inward investment need to be courted, wooed and embraced in a permanent marriage with indigenous business. The UK is the most-favoured location in Europe for inward investment, and the Welsh Government should absolutely be getting a bit of that action. We will hear a lot more about 'Destination Cymru' from colleagues shortly, but I just want to finish with this point, if I may, Dirprwy Lywydd: whether you prefer the Welsh Government's reactive piecemeal approach, or the proactive coherent client-care strategy of the Welsh Conservatives, both risk failure if the Welsh Government does not meet the central challenge encapsulated by Dr Ball in the select committee, when he commented strongly that,

'at the end of the day there is no question but that the skill levels in Wales are appalling, the education system leaves a great deal to be desired, and the skill is simply not there for inward investors ... "Ireland has a multi-skilled education system. They are sound in mathematics and in science, and they are capable of learning new skills and driving forward the business." We don't have that in Wales.'

Today's education creates tomorrow's economy, Minister, and I hope that we have moved on from the situation that Dr Ball described in 2012. However, the consequences of that Estyn report stretch far into the future.

16:23

## Mike Hedges [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Inward investment is one of the three key tools in growing the economy, along with developing small and medium-sized enterprises and generating start-up businesses. Given Wales's relative position regarding the most successful regions of Europe, it would be a huge mistake for any Government not to try to get the maximum economic benefit from all three. We want and need to gain inward investment.

Attracting inward investment to stimulate exports is central to the Welsh Labour strategy for growth and economic renewal. Only last week, the Welsh Government launched its new 'Just Ask Wales' campaign to attract inward investment into Wales to create jobs and economic growth. What we do not want are the screwdriver plants that come to Wales due to grants and relatively low labour costs and move when the combination of both becomes more attractive elsewhere. All they do is put things together to access the European Union—another LG, where huge expectations of employment are raised, huge investments in infrastructure and support are made and then very little occurs, and what does occur very quickly disappears. It destroyed the whole of the development in the rest of Wales; all of the WDA money was collected, and things that should have happened in the Swansea valley did not, in order that we could get LG. I am not sure whether that was of benefit to anybody.

Mae 'Destination Cymru' yn cydnabod bod angen canlyn a chofleidio pob math o fewnffuddsoddi mewn priodas barhaol â busnesau cynhenid. Y DU yw'r lleoliad a ffeirir fwyaf yn Ewrop ar gyfer mewnffuddsoddi, ac yn sicr dylai Llywodraeth Cymru fod yn cipio rhywfaint o hynny. Byddwn yn dlywed tipyn mwy am 'Destination Cymru' gan gyd-Aelodau yn y man, ond hoffwn offren gyda'r pwynt hwn, os caf, Ddirprwy Lywydd: pa un a ydych yn ffafrio dull tameidiog ac adweithiol Llywodraeth Cymru, neu strategaeth gofal cleientiaid gydlynol a rhagweithiol y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, mae perygl y bydd y naill a'r llall yn methu os na fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn ymateb i'r brif her a grisialwyd gan Dr Ball yn y pwyllgor dethol, pan wnaeth y sylwadau cryf hyn,

yn y pen draw, nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth bod lefelau sgiliau yng Nghymru yn warthus, bod y system addysg yn anfodddhaol iawn, ac nad yw'r sgiliau yn bodoli i fewnffuddsoddwyr ... mae gan Iwerddon system addysg aml-sgiliau. Mae'n gadarn o ran mathemateg a gwyddoniaeth, ac mae'n gallu dysgu sgiliau newydd a datblygu'r busnes. Nid oes gennym hynny yng Nghymru.

Mae addysg heddiw yn creu economi yfory, Weinidog, a gobeithio ein bod wedi symud ymlaen o'r sefyllfa a ddisgrifiodd Dr Ball yn 2012. Fodd bynnag, mae goblygiadau'r adroddiad hwnnw gan Estyn yn ymestyn ymhell i'r dyfodol.

Mae mewnffuddsoddi yn un o'r tri adnodd allweddol o ran tyfu'r economi, ynghyd â datblygu busnesau bach a chanolig a sefydlu busnesau newydd. O ystyried sefyllfa Cymru o'i chymharu â rhanbarthau mwyaf llwyddiannus Ewrop, byddai'n gamgymeriad mawr i unrhyw Lywodraeth Ewrop â cheisio cael y budd economaidd mwyaf posibl o bob un o'r tri. Rydym am gael mewnffuddsoddi ac mae ei eisiau arnom.

Mae denu mewnffuddsoddi er mwyn ysgogi allforion yn ganolog i strategaeth Llafur Cymru ar gyfer twf ac adnewyddu'r economi. Dim on yr wythnos diwethaf, lansiodd Llywodraeth Cymru ei hymgyrch newydd 'Just Ask Wales' i ddenu mewnffuddsoddi i Gymru er mwyn creu swyddi a thwf economaidd. Yr hyn nad ydym am ei weld yw'r gweithfeydd sgrïwdreifers sy'n dod i Gymru o ganlyniad i grantiau a chostau llafur cymharol isel ac sy'n gadael pan fydd y cyfuniad o'r ddau yn mynd yn fwy atyniadol yn rhywle arall. Y cyfan y maent yn ei wneud yw rhoi pethau at ei gilydd er mwyn cael mynediad i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd—LG arall, lle codir disgwyliadau mawr ynglŷn â chyfflogaeth, gwneir buddsoddiadau enfawr mewn seilwaith a chymorth, ac yna ychydig iawn sy'n digwydd, ac mae'r hyn a ddigwydd yn y diwedd yn prysur ddiiflannu. Mae'n dinistrio'r holl waith datblygu yng ngweddill Cymru; casglwyd holl arian y WDA, ac nid oedd pethau a ddylai fod wedi digwydd yng Nghwm Tawe wedi digwydd, er mwyn inni allu cael LG. Nid wyf yn siŵr a oedd hynny o fudd i unrhyw un.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

What we want are high-technology firms working with our universities and becoming part of our economy. I have previously, in questions to the First Minister, raised the relative underperformance of Wales against the rest of Britain in financial services, information and communications technology and life sciences—with life sciences at just under 4% being the nearest that we get to our expected level by population share.

The Welsh Government works closely with key inward investors, such as Tata, Airbus, Ford and Toyota, through the anchor company programme, which has seen considerable reinvestment by these companies in Wales. These large companies also generate opportunities, throughout their supply chain, to support the local economy. Again, it is not about having either inward investment or support for local companies; it is about working to ensure that the best of both occur and that we get the benefit to our economy of both.

Like many people in this room, I have heard on more than one occasion Vincent Kane spend over an hour listing the failed inward investments of the former WDA. These inward investments all started with huge promises and ended up, at best, as warehouses or, most of the time, as nothing at all. We do not have either the finance or the capacity to repeat these mistakes. It is not about promising numbers in the future, but about viability and commitment to the area.

I will turn to the European Union. Welsh Labour's commitment to attracting inward investment and stimulating the growth in our economy is also why it continues to support the development of a single market to show both a level playing field and a dynamic business environment across the European Union. I can think of no better way to deter possible inward investors, especially those from north America and Asia, looking to enter the European market than to leave the European Union. I say this as someone who voted 'no' to staying in the European Union in the mid-1970s. With the EFTA gone and unable to be resurrected and the development of the European Union both east into the former Warsaw pact countries and south to the Mediterranean, creating the world's biggest trading bulk, it would be a potential disaster for the Welsh economy to contemplate European withdrawal. We are in it—some people like it, some do not—and, according to those immortal words, if we come out it is going to hurt a lot.

Finally, it is not about incentivising inward investment—staying until someone else offers a better deal—but about ensuring that the infrastructure is available. It is about improving the infrastructure to meet the needs of modern business, for example by aligning the revised national transport plan with our economic development objectives, and delivering next generation broadband to all businesses and residents—Superfast Cymru will aim to give 96% of properties in Wales access to superfast broadband. In England the figure is 90%, in Scotland 85%, showing a Welsh Labour Government committed to the development of Wales.

Yr hyn yr ydym am ei weld yw cwmnïau uwch-dechnoleg yn gweithio gyda'n prifysgolion ac yn dod yn rhan o'n heconomi. Mewn cwestiynau blaenorol i'r Prif Weinidog rwyf wedi codi tanberfformiad cymharol Cymru o'i chymharu â gweddill Prydain o ran gwasanaethau ariannol, technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu a gwyddorau bywyd—a gwyddorau bywyd, sy'n cyfrif am ychydig o dan 4%, yw'r agosaf o ran cyrraedd y lefel a ddisgwylyr gennym yn ôl cyfran o'r boblogaeth.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cydweithio'n agos â mewnfuddsoddwyr allweddol, megis Tata, Airbus, Ford a Toyota, drwy'r rhaglen cwmnïau angori, sydd wedi gweld cryn ailfuddsoddi gan y cwmnïau hyn yng Nghymru. Mae'r cwmnïau mawr hyn hefyd yn creu cyfleoedd, drwy eu cadwyn gyflenwi, i gefnogi'r economi leol. Unwaith eto, nid yw'n ymwneud â dewis rhwng naill ai mewnfuddsoddi neu neymorth i gwmnïau lleol; mae'n ymwneud â gweithio i sicrhau y cawn y gorau o'r ddau a'n bod yn sicrhau'r budd i'n heconomi o'r ddau.

Fel llawer o bobl yn yr ystafell hon, rwyf wedi clywed ar fwy nag un achlysur Vincent Kane yn treulio dros awr yn rhestru mewnfuddsoddiadau yr hen WDA a fu'n fethiant. Ar ddechrau pob un o'r mewnfuddsoddiadau hyn cafwyd addewidion mawr ond yn y pen draw cafwyd, ar y gorau, warysau neu, y rhan fwyaf o'r amser, ni chafwyd dim byd o gwbl. Nid oes gennym y cyllid na'r adnoddau i wneud yr un camgymeriadau hyn eto. Nid yw'n ymwneud â ffigurau addawol yn y dyfodol, ond â hyfywedd ac ymrwymiad i'r ardal.

Trof at yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Ymrwymiad Llafur Cymru i ddenu mewnfuddsoddi ac ysgogi twf yn ein heconomi yw'r rheswm hefyd pam y mae'n parhau i gefnogi datblygiad un farchnad lle ceir yr un amodau i bawb ac amgylchedd busnes deinamig drwy'r Undeb Ewropeaidd cyfan. Ni allaf feddwl am ffordd well o atal darpar fewnfuddsoddwyr, yn enwedig y rhai o ogledd America ac Asia, sy'n ystyried dod yn rhan o'r farchnad Ewropeaidd na gadael yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Dywedaf hyn fel rhywun a bleidleisiodd 'na' i aros yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yng nghanol y 1970au. A'r EFTA wedi darfod a heb fodd i'w hatgyfodi ynghyd â datblygiad yr Undeb Ewropeaidd i'r dwyrain i hen wledydd cytundeb Warsaw ac i'r de i Fôr y Canoldir, gan greu marchnad fasnachu fwyaf y byd, byddai'n drychineb o bosibl i economi Cymru ystyried tynnu'n ôl o Ewrop. Rydym ynnddi—mae rhai pobl yn ei hoffi, mae rhai yn ei drwghoffi—ac, yn ôl y geiriau anfarwol hynny, os gadawn bydd yn boenus iawn.

Yn olaf, nid yw'n ymwneud â chynnig cymhellion i fewnfuddsoddi—aros nes bod rhywun arall yn cynnig gwel bargaen—ond â sicrhau bod y seilwaith ar gael. Mae'n ymwneud â gwella'r seilwaith er mwyn diwallu anghenion busnesau modern, er enghraifft, drwy gysoni'r cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol diwygiedig â'n hamcanion datblygu economaidd, a darparu band eang y genhedlaeth nesaf i bob busnes a thrigolyn—bydd Superfast Cymru yn anelu at ddarparu mynediad i fand eang cyflym iawn i 96% o Gymru. Yn Lloegr y ffigur yw 90%, yn yr Alban 85%, gan ddangos bod Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru yn ymrwymedig i ddatblygu Cymru.

- 16:27 **Antoinette Sandbach** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Do you accept that the UK Government gave the Welsh Government substantial funding in order to achieve those aims—£57 million, I believe it was?
- A ydych yn derbyn i Lywodraeth y DU roi cyllid sylweddol i Lywodraeth Cymru er mwyn cyflawni'r nodau hynny—£57 miliwn, fe gredaf?
- 16:27 **Mike Hedges** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Considering that the Government in Westminster gives virtually all of the money that Wales spends—except for a small amount of income that we gain—yes, I will accept that, but it is a bit like saying that the Welsh Government gives local authorities most of their money, given that it gives about 80% of it. It is the only place from where we get money. [Interruption.]
- O ystyried bod y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan yn rhoi bron y cyfan o'r arian y mae Cymru yn ei wario—heblaw am swm bach o incwm yr ydym yn ei ennill—derbyniad hynny, ond mae ychydig bach fel dweud bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn rhoi'r rhan fwyaf o'u harian i awdurdodau lleol, o ystyried ei bod yn rhoi tua 80% ohono. Dyma'r unig le o ble y cawn arian. [Torri ar draws.]
- 16:27 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Order. Mr Hedges is speaking and I have called no-one else. I might not if you do not behave better.
- Trefn. Mae Mr Hedges yn siarad ac nid wyf wedi galw ar neb arall. Efallai na wnaf os nad ydych yn ymddwyn yn well.
- 16:27 **Mike Hedges** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Wales will complete this process in 2016; the rest of the UK will not complete it until 2017. A scheme set at 30 Mbps is the definition of superfast broadband. England and Scotland are happy with 24 Mbps upon completion. Superfast Cymru should make Wales highly competitive, which is what we want.
- Bydd Cymru yn cwblhau'r broses hon yn 2016; ni fydd gweddill y DU yn ei chwblhau tan 2017. Cynllun ar 30 Mbps yw'r diffiniad o fand eang cyflym iawn. Mae Lloegr a'r Alban yn fodlon ar 24 Mbps ar ôl cwblhau'r broses. Dylai Superfast Cymru wneud Cymru yn hynod gystadleuol, sef yr hyn a ddymunwn.
- Achieving inward investment is about using our greatest asset—the skills and abilities of the people living in Wales.
- Mae sicrhau mewnfuddsoddi yn ymwneud â defnyddio ein hasedau mwyaf—sgiliau a galluoedd y bobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru.
- 16:28 **Paul Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I am pleased to take part in this afternoon's debate. I want to concentrate my remarks on the importance of our policy's investor aftercare service, or, as it is sometimes called, our investor development service. The purpose of introducing an aftercare service is to ensure that when foreign businesses invest in Wales, they stay in Wales. Investor aftercare means looking after an investor and embedding them in the domestic economy in order to ensure long-term success and sustainability. We need to reward businesses on their decision to invest here and establish them within our communities in the long term, both by encouraging expansion opportunities and extending local and national supply chains. Quite simply, we on this side of the Chamber believe that the importance of investor aftercare has been neglected too much in Wales.
- Rwy'n falch o gymryd rhan yn y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Ni fy sylwadau, hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar bwysigrwydd ein polisi i gynnig gwasanaeth ôl-ofal i fuddsoddwyr, neu, fel y'i gelwir weithiau, ein gwasanaeth datblygu buddsoddwyr. Diben cyflwyno gwasanaeth ôl-ofal yw sicrhau, pan fydd busnesau tramor yn buddsoddi yng Nghymru, eu bod yn aros yng Nghymru. Mae ôl-ofal i fuddsoddwyr yn golygu gofalu am fuddsoddwyr a'i wneud yn rhan annatod o economi'r wlad er mwyn sicrhau llwyddiant a chynaliadwyedd yn yr hirdymor. Mae angen inni wobrwyo busnesau am eu penderfyniad i fuddsoddi yma a'u sefydlu yn ein cymunedau yn yr hirdymor, drwy annog cyfleoedd i ehangu ac ymestyn cadwyni cyflenwi lleol a chenedlaethol. Yn syml iawn, rydym ni ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambwr yn credu bod pwysigrwydd ôl-ofal i fuddsoddwyr wedi cael ei esgeuluso gormod yng Nghymru.
- At the moment, of course, the Welsh Government's current trade and inward investment team does not have a specific and dedicated investor development programme. There is no single organisation directing this process, and consequently there is no clear point of contact for businesses. Ensuring that investment is long term will not only boost local supply chains, but will lead to the development of new businesses as well.
- Ar hyn o bryd, wrth gwrs, nid oes gan dîm masnach a mewnfuddsoddi presennol Llywodraeth Cymru raglen benodol wedi'i neilltuo o ddatblygu buddsoddwyr. Nid oes unrhyw sefydliad unigol yn cyfarwyddo'r broses hon, ac o ganlyniad nid oes unrhyw bwynt cyswllt amlwg i fusnesau. Bydd sicrhau bod buddsoddiad yn un hirdymor nid yn unig yn rhoi hwb i gadwyni cyflenwi lleol, ond bydd yn arwain at ddatblygu busnesau newydd hefyd.

Existing businesses that are happy are the best ambassadors in recruiting new firms to an area. That is why the Welsh Government should be focusing on aftercare. You only have to look to Scotland for an example of an effective aftercare service. Scottish Development International is a joint venture with partnerships that include the Scottish Government, Scottish Enterprise, Highlands and Islands Enterprise, Business Gateway Scotland and Talent Scotland. Their aim is to help foreign companies to invest and thrive in Scotland as well as helping local enterprises to make the most of international trade and global markets.

An independent evaluation of Scottish Development International showed that for every £1 it spends on inward investment, an additional £11 is generated for the Scottish economy, which is a substantial return. Year on year, Scottish Development International works alongside investors, not just to attract them to Scotland but to support them in the long term. Indeed, last summer, the chief executive of Scottish Development International Anne MacColl stated that almost half of the projects that Scottish Development International brought in last year came from existing investors in Scotland.

At the moment, the primary focus of the current Welsh Government trade and inward investment team is to develop new inward investment opportunities for Wales, rather than focusing on reinvestments and concentrating on an aftercare service. Therefore, there is no specific programme to support and nurture businesses once they have invested here in Wales.

While the Minister in her response will likely argue that the Welsh Government delivers aftercare through its sector panels and that it has a good relationship with existing anchor companies, it is a fact that the Welsh Government does not have a clear structure or a clear programme for investor aftercare. The ad-hoc nature of the current system, as stated by the South Wales Chamber of Commerce, is confusing. Our proposals and this policy, if introduced, would reorganise the trade and inward investment team within the Welsh Government so that investor aftercare was part of the department's remit. Under this reorganisation, the investor aftercare department would have dedicated client teams assigned to each foreign investor. Their role would be to monitor and support investors during and after the initial investment. These teams would act as co-ordinators, ensuring that they are the first port of call for all interested stakeholders.

Busnesau sy'n bodoli eisoes ac sy'n fodlon eu byd yw'r cenhadon gorau wrth recriwtio cwmnïau newydd i ardal. Dyna pam y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ganolbwyntio ar ôl-ofal. Dim ond edrych ar yr Alban y mae angen ichi ei wneud er mwyn gweld enghraifft o wasanaeth ôl-ofal effeithiol. Mae Scottish Development International yn fenter ar y cyd â phartneriaethau sy'n cynnwys Llywodraeth yr Alban, Scottish Enterprise, Highlands and Islands Enterprise, Business Gateway Scotland a Talent Scotland. Eu nod yw helpu cwmnïau tramor i fuddsoddi a ffynnu yn yr Alban yn ogystal â helpu busnesau lleol i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar fasnach ryngwladol a marchnadoedd byd-eang.

Dangosodd gwerthusiad annibynnol o Scottish Development International fod swm ychwanegol o £11 yn cael ei gynhyrchu i economi'r Alban am bob £1 y mae'n ei gwario ar fewnfuddsoddi, sef enillion sylweddol. Flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, mae Scottish Development International yn gweithio ochr yn ochr â buddsoddwyr, nid dim ond i'w denu i'r Alban, ond i'w cefnogi yn yr hirdymor. Yn wir, yr haf diwethaf, dywedodd prif weithredwr Scottish Development International Anne MacColl fod bron hanner y prosiectau a ddenodd Scottish Development International y llynedd wedi dod o'r rhai sydd eisoes yn buddsoddi yn yr Alban.

Ar hyn o bryd, prif ffocws tîm masnach a mewnfuddsoddi Llywodraeth Cymru yw datblygu cyfleoedd mewnfuddsoddi newydd i Gymru, yn hytrach na chanolbwyntio ar ailfuddsoddi a chanolbwyntio ar wasanaeth ôl-ofal. Felly, nid oes rhaglen benodol i gefnogi a meithrin busnesau ar ôl iddynt fuddsoddi yma yng Nghymru.

Er y bydd y Gweinidog yn ei hymateb yn debygol o ddadlau bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn rhoi ôl-ofal drwy ei phaneli sector a bod ganddi berthynas dda â'r cwmnïau angori presennol, mae'n ffaith nad oes gan Lywodraeth Cymru strwythur clir na rhaglen glir ar gyfer ôl-ofal i fuddsoddwyr. Mae natur ad hoc y system bresennol, fel y nododd Siambwr Fasnach De Cymru, yn ddrislyd. Byddai ein cynigion a'r polisi hwn, o gael eu cyflwyno, yn ad-drefnu'r tîm masnach a mewnfuddsoddi yn Llywodraeth Cymru er mwyn sicrhau bod ôl-ofal i fuddsoddwyr yn rhan o gylch gwaith yr adran. O dan yr ad-drefnu hwn, byddai gan yr adran ôl-ofal i fuddsoddwyr dimau cleientiaid pwrpasol wedi'u neilltuo i bob buddsoddwr tramor. Eu rôl fyddai monitro a chefnogi buddsoddwyr yn ystod ac ar ôl y buddsoddiad cychwynnol. Byddai'r timau hyn yn gweithredu fel cyd-gysylltwyr, gan sicrhau mai atynt hwy y bydd pob rhanddeiliad â diddordeb yn troi'n gyntaf.



We must ensure that we retain investment for the long-term success of the Welsh economy. I believe that Wales must have a comprehensive aftercare programme, delivered in partnership with the private sector. Aftercare services can be delivered in a cost-effective manner, as they rely on personnel and business relationships, rather than grants and funding. As Nick Ramsay said earlier, our policy is about strengthening relationships; it is about making the most of contacts and networks that are available to us through the private sector. Our proposals would also look to utilise existing funding more effectively, in order to deliver first-class aftercare services, which would include an annual conference bringing together key businesses and potential investors. Making sure that an effective aftercare service is in place would maximise the impact of investment, encourage local supply chains and build a strong reputation for Wales as an investment location. An effective aftercare service is crucial to securing and maintaining businesses here in Wales, and I hope very much that the Welsh Government seriously considers our proposals.

Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cadw buddsoddiad ar gyfer llywyddiant hirdymor economi Cymru. Credaf fod yn rhaid i Gymru roi rhaglen ôl-ofal gynhwysfawr ar waith, a ddarperir mewn partneriaeth â'r sector preifat. Gall gwasanaethau ôl-ofal gael eu darparu'n gost-effeithiol, gan eu bod yn dibynnu ar bersonél a chydberthnasau busnes, yn hytrach na grantiau a chyllid. Fel y dywedodd Nick Ramsay yn gynharach, mae ein polisi yn ymwneud â chryfhau cydberthnasau; mae'n ymwneud â manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cysylltiadau a'r rhwydweithiau sydd ar gael inni drwy'r sector preifat. Byddai ein cynigion hefyd yn ceisio defnyddio'r cyllid presennol yn fwy effeithiol, er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau ôl-ofal o'r radd flaenaf, a fyddai'n cynnwys cynhadledd flynyddol sy'n dod â busnesau allweddol a darpar fuddsoddwyr at ei gilydd. Drwy sicrhau bod gwasanaeth ôl-ofal effeithiol ar waith byddai modd manteisio i'r eithaf ar effaith buddsoddiad, annog cadwyni cyflenwi lleol a chreu enw da i Gymru fel lleoliad i fuddsoddi ynddo. Mae gwasanaeth ôl-ofal effeithiol yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau a chynnal busnesau yma yng Nghymru, a gobeithio'n fawr iawn bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystyried ein cynigion o ddirif.

16:33

### **Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I am pleased to participate in this debate on our ideas to attract foreign direct investment into Wales, and I think that it is worth building, for a few moments, on some of the points that were made by Suzy Davies when she was referring to the Welsh education system potentially being a barrier to attracting inward investment. I wholeheartedly agree with that, and I would say in addition that the quality of NHS services are incredibly important, particularly for company directors who might want to relocate along with their business in order to invest in our nation. I do not think that some parts and aspects of our NHS attract inward investment into Wales, and that is a matter of great regret.

It is also worth reflecting on the fact that while we have had some disappointing years in terms of inward investment into Wales, there was some improvement in the last 12 months, which is very welcome, but it is nowhere near the levels of improvement, even during those difficult years, that the north-west region or the west midlands managed to secure. These are areas that border Wales, and we ought to have much more collaboration between those regions that border Wales and which have managed to be successful at attracting inward investment, and the Welsh Government's efforts to attract inward investment, in terms of helping to promote an environment that encourages companies to invest.

Furthermore, one of the other damaging things for our country has been the reputation that has sometimes been difficult to overcome when there are references from the Minister that she regretted the capitalist system and has espoused the values of Karl Marx and Engels. I do not believe that that has been particularly useful in terms of the debate or in attracting people to invest in our nation. Nevertheless, I have a great deal of respect for the Minister and I know that she wants to do what she can to promote Welsh business interests and to promote investment in our nation. That is why I very much hope that she will listen to our calls in 'Destination Cymru' and, hopefully, apply them as far as Government policy is concerned.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gymryd rhan yn y ddatl hon ar ein syniadau i ddenu buddsoddiad tramor uniongyrchol i Gymru, a chredaf ei bod yn werth ymhelaethu, am rai eiliadau, ar rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Suzy Davies wrth gyfeirio at y ffaith y gallai system addysg Cymru fod yn rhwystr o bosibl i ddenu mewnfuddsoddi. Cytunaf yn llwyr â hynny, a hoffwn ddweud hefyd fod ansawdd gwasanaethau'r GIG yn anhygoel o bwysig, yn enwedig ar gyfer cyfarwyddwyr cwmnïau sy'n ystyried adleoli yma ynghyd â'u busnes er mwyn buddsoddi yn ein gwlad. Yn fy marn i, nid yw rhai rhannau ac agweddau ar ein GIG yn denu mewnfuddsoddi i Gymru, ac mae hynny'n drueni mawr.

Mae'n werth ystyried hefyd y ffaith, er inni gael rhai blynyddoedd siomedig o ran mewnfuddsoddi i Gymru, fod rhywfaint o welliant wedi bod yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf, sydd i'w groesawu'n fawr, ond nid yw'n dod yn agos at y gwelliant, hyd yn oed yn ystod y blynyddoedd anodd hynny, y mae gogledd-orllewin Lloegr neu orllewin canolbarth Lloegr wedi llwyddo i'w sicrhau. Mae'r ardaloedd hyn yn cyd-ffinio â Chymru, a dylai fod llawer mwy o gydweithio rhwng y rhanbarthau hynny sy'n cyd-ffinio a Chymru ac sydd wedi llwyddo i ddenu mewnfuddsoddi, ac ymdrechion Llywodraeth Cymru i ddenu mewnfuddsoddi, o ran helpu i hyrwyddo amgylchedd sy'n annog cwmnïau i fuddsoddi.

Ar ben hynny, un o'r pethau niweidiol eraill i'n gwlad fu'r enw drwg sydd wedi bod yn anodd weithiau i'w oresgyn pan fo cyfeiriadau gan y Gweinidog ei bod yn gresynu at y system gyfalafol a phan fo wedi arddel gwerthoedd Karl Marx ac Engels. Ni chredaf fod hynny wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol iawn o ran y ddatl nac i ddenu pobl i fuddsoddi yn ein gwlad. Er hynny, mae gennyf barch mawr tuag at y Gweinidog a gwn ei bod am wneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i hyrwyddo buddiannau busnesau Cymru ac i hyrwyddo buddsoddiad yn ein gwlad. Dyna pam rwy'n gobeithio'n fawr y bydd yn gwrandao ar ein galwadau yn 'Destination Cymru' ac yn eu cymhwyso, gobeithio, o ran polisi'r Llywodraeth.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

The important people who are not currently at the table in terms of being able to support the Welsh Government's action are those in the private sector. It is very important that we take advantage of the opportunities that the private sector's expertise can bring to the table, to allow the Government—and support it in doing so—to sell Wales in the most effective way possible to ensure the maximum benefit for our nation. We know, for example, that where this approach is employed—a partnership approach between the private sector and Government—in other parts of the world, it has been tremendously successful. We need not look too far away across the border into England. In the case of Invest in Nottingham, for example, we see how the local private sector in Nottingham, just that one city, has come together to help to promote Nottingham as a place to invest. As a result of that work, in conjunction with the local authority in that region, not the UK Government, they have managed to attract significant investment into Nottingham, which is punching above its weight, even in UK terms. There is something to learn there about the opportunities and support that the private sector can bring to our efforts.

Y bobl bwysig nad ydynt wrth y bwrdd ar hyn o bryd yn yr ystyr eu bod yn gallu cefnogi gweithredoedd Llywodraeth Cymru yw'r rhai yn y sector preifat. Mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn manteisio ar y cyfleoedd y gall arbenigedd y sector preifat ei gynnig, er mwyn galluogi'r Llywodraeth—a'i chefnogi wrth wneud hynny—i hyrwyddo Cymru yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol bosibl er mwyn sicrhau'r budd mwyaf posibl i'n gwlad. Gwyddom, er enghraifft, lle y gweithredir yn y modd hwn—gweithredu mewn partneriaeth rhwng y sector preifat a'r Llywodraeth—mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd, ei bod yn hynod lwyddiannus. Nid oes angen inni endrych yn rhy bell i ffordd ar draws y ffin i Loegr. Yn achos Invest in Nottingham, er enghraifft, rydym yn gweld y ffordd y mae'r sector preifat lleol yn Nottingham, a'r ddinas honno'n unig, wedi dod at ei gilydd i helpu i hyrwyddo Nottingham fel lle i fuddsoddi. O ganlyniad i'r gwaith hwnnw, ar y cyd â'r awdurdod lleol yn y rhanbarth hwnnw, nid Llywodraeth y DU, maent wedi llwyddo i ddenu buddsoddiad sylweddol i Nottingham, sy'n gwneud yn well na'r disgwyl, hyd yn oed o ran y DU. Mae rhywbeth i'w ddysgu yn hyn o beth am y cyfleoedd a'r cymorth y gall y sector preifat eu hychwanegu at ein hymdrechion.

16:37 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

With regard to those private investors that you talk about, will you now take this opportunity to recognise that those private investors would or could potentially be put off from investing by the threat of UK withdrawal from the European Union and that they could, in fact, be encouraged to invest in Wales, knowing that Wales would likely in future choose to stay an integral member state of the European Union?

O ran y buddsoddwyr preifat hynny y soniwyd amdanynt, a wnewch chi achub ar y cyfle hwn yn awr i gydnabod y byddai neu y gallai'r buddsoddwyr preifat hynny benderfynu peidio â buddsoddi o bosibl oherwydd y bygythiad y bydd y DU yn tynnu'n ôl o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ac y gallent, mewn gwirionedd, gael eu hannog i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru, gan wybod y byddai Cymru yn debygol o ddewis aros yn aelod-wladwriaeth annatod o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn y dyfodol?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:37 **Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

As I said to you earlier, the biggest thing that could damage overseas inward investment would be if we left the United Kingdom, which, of course, is the policy of your own party. There would certainly be a lot less cash available in terms of Government resources to attract overseas inward investment if we looked at the Wales-only tax base as well, as a result.

Fel y dywedais wrthyhych yn gynharach, y peth mwyaf a allai amharu ar fewnfuddsoddi o dramor fyddai pe baem yn gadael y Deyrnas Unedig, sef polisi eich plaid eich hun, wrth gwrs. Byddai llawer llai o arian ar gael yn sicr o ran adnoddau'r Llywodraeth i ddenu mewnfuddsoddi o dramor pe baem yn edrych ar sylfaen treth Cymru yn unig hefyd, o ganlyniad i hynny.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

The private sector could be a very important partner. That is why our call for an inward investment council that is not just an advisory body, but a body that helps to make decisions about the policy and the approach of the Welsh Government towards overseas investment, is incredibly important. I hope, Minister, that you will look at the private sector as a partner, not an enemy, in trying to attract investment into Wales and that you will look at our proposals with some favour.

Gallai'r sector preifat fod yn bartner pwysig iawn. Dyna pam mae ein galwad am gyngor mewnfuddsoddi sy'n fwy na chorff cyngori, ond sy'n gorff sy'n helpu i wneud penderfyniadau ynglŷn â pholisi Llywodraeth Cymru a'r ffordd y mae'n ymdrin â buddsoddi o dramor, yn hynod bwysig. Gobeithio, Weinidog, y byddwch yn ystyried y sector preifat yn bartner, nid gelyn, wrth geisio denu buddsoddiad i Gymru ac y byddwch yn edrych ar ein cynigion yn ffafriol.

16:38 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Galwaf ar Weinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth, Edwina Hart.

I call on the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport, Edwina Hart.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

*Gweinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth / The Minister for Economy, Science and Transport*

Thank you very much, Deputy Presiding Officer. I have no enemies in life, and I see the private sector and companies as being opportunities for investment in Wales. I have always had an excellent relationship with them and continue to do so. You might wish to make political points here, but I never discuss politics with inward investors; the only thing that they are interested in is what we can provide in terms of support, how we can provide aftercare, what type of skills we have and what our transport links are like. Therefore, can we have a grown-up discussion on some of these issues, which are very important to the future of Wales?

Talking about growing up, I will dispel some of the myths that have come from those on the other side of the Chamber, to my left, during this debate. I very warmly say to Nick Ramsay that I welcome the Enterprise and Business Committee's inquiry into trade and investment, as mentioned in amendment 4, which we will be supporting. I look forward to giving evidence to the committee, and I believe that there will be a helpful discussion. Eluned Parrott put it well when she said that it will be an opportunity to hear the ideas and views that come out of that so that we can move forward constructively in terms of the suggestions made by the committee for any improvement in Government services. However, I am concerned about some of the statements that have been made today and the document that we are debating. Much of what I have heard from some of you is more likely to hinder inward investment, not help. This report is based on the past and not the future. That was well illustrated, dare I say, by Suzy Davies's contribution. What happened in the 1970s, 1980s and 1990s is irrelevant to the market now. Business investment strategies are constantly changing, and the global economy has changed unrecognisably in the intervening years when you look at the way in which multinationals operate, and so on.

To say that we do not have the skills in Wales to win inward investment and provide aftercare for companies is simply wrong. I would be surprised if some of the significant investors that have come to Wales would have settled and prospered here if that were the case. This kind of negative and false picture does not help Welsh efforts. The document implies that we do not have a set of clear inward investment targets. We do have clear targets; my officials have clear targets.

We also have a close working relationship with UKTI, so close that I arranged for the chief executive of UKTI to brief Members on the services provided by UKTI's inward investment strategy and the placement of UKTI staff in the Welsh Government. It is a discussion that I am continuing with the Westminster Government about having that type of involvement—

*Darren Millar a gododd—*

Diolch yn fawr iawn, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw elynion mewn bywyd, ac ystyriaif fod y sector preifat a chwmmniau yn gyfleoedd i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru. Mae'r berthynas rhyngof i a hwy bob amser wedi bod yn ardderchog ac mae'n parhau i fod yn ardderchog. Efallai yr hoffech wneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol yma, ond nid wyf byth yn trafod gwleidyddiaeth gyda mewnfuddsoddwyr; yr unig beth y mae ganddynt ddiddordeb ynddo yw'r hyn y gallwn ei ddarparu o ran cymorth, sut y gallwn ddarparu ôl-ofal, pa fath o sgiliau sydd gennym a pha fath o gysylltiadau trafnidiaeth sydd gennym. Felly, a allwn gael trafodaeth aeddfed ar rai o'r materion hyn, sy'n bwysig iawn i ddyfodol Cymru?

Sôn am fod yn aeddfed, gwnaf chwalu rhai o'r mythau a gafwyd gan y rhai ar yr ochr arall i'r Siambr, ar fy ochr chwith, yn ystod y ddaid hon. Dywedaf yn wresog iawn wrth Nick Ramsay fy mod yn croesawu ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes i fasnach a buddsoddi, fel y'i crybwyllwyd yng ngwelliant 4, y byddwn yn ei gefnogi. Edrychaf ymlaen at roi tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, a chredaf y cawn drafodaeth ddefnyddiol. Mynegodd Eluned Parrott y peth yn dda pan ddywedodd y bydd yn gyfle i wrando ar syniadau a safbwyntiau sy'n deillio o hynny fel y gallwn symud ymlaen yn adeiladol o ran yr awgrymiadau a wneir gan y pwyllgor ynglŷn ag unrhyw welliant yng ngwasanaethau'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf am rai o'r datganiadau a wnaethpwyd heddiw a'r ddogfen yr ydym yn ei thrafod. Mae llawer o'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i glywed gan rai ohonoch yn fwy tebygol o atal mewnfuddsoddi na'i hyrwyddo. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn seiliedig ar y gorfennol yn hytrach na'r dyfodol. Cafwyd enghraifft dda o hynny, os caf ddweud, yng nghyfraniad Suzy Davies. Mae'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn y 1970au, 1980au a'r 1990au yn amherthnasol i'r farchnad fel y mae ar hyn o bryd. Mae strategaethau buddsoddi busnes yn newid o hyd, ac mae'r economi fyd-eang wedi gweddnewid yn y cyfamser os edrychwch ar y ffordd y mae cwmnïau rhyngwladol yn gweithredu, ac yn y blaen.

Mae'n hollol anghywir dweud nad oes gennym y sgiliau yng Nghymru i ddenu mewnfuddsoddi na rhoi ôl-ofal i gwmnïau. Byddwn yn synnu pe bai rhai o'r buddsoddwyr sylweddol sydd wedi dod i Gymru wedi ymgartrefu ac wedi ffynnu yma os nad oedd hynny'n wir. Nid yw darlun negyddol ac anghywir o'r fath yn helpu ymdrechion Cymru. Mae'r ddogfen yn awgrymu nad oes gennym set o dargedau mewnfuddsoddi clir. Mae gennym dargedau clir; mae gan fy swyddogion dargedau clir.

Mae gennym berthynas waith agos â Masnach a Buddsoddi y DU hefyd, mor agos nes imi drefnu i brif weithredwr Masnach a Buddsoddi y DU i friffio'r Aelodau ar y gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan strategaeth fewnfuddsoddi Masnach a Buddsoddi y DU a lleoli ei staff yn Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'n drafodaeth yr wyf yn parhau i'w chael gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan ynghylch y math o gyfranogiad—

*Darren Millar rose—*

Do you intend to give way, Minister?

A ydych yn bwriadu ildio, Weinidog?

16:41

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I do not intend at this stage to give way, Deputy Presiding Officer.

The report also comments that Wales continues to be behind Scotland and England in attracting foreign direct investment. While it is always good to come first, it is most unlikely that we will ever bring in more inward investment than England, which has a population of over 53 million. So, let us get real on this.

Perhaps most damaging, though, are the comments about aftercare. How does anyone think we won reinvestment from the likes of Ford, Toyota, Sony, General Dynamics, Admiral, Deloitte, Airbus UK and many others if we were not giving them the aftercare that they required? 'Aftercare' is a very old-fashioned term, but it is very important to recognise that we have an effective programme. Companies have a named account manager who is responsible for day-to-day operations. As account managers, we also broker a relationship with the foreign parent company. We have account managers that put other companies together to create business. We have 39 anchor companies and 79 companies with overseas investors. We have effective arrangements with all of these companies, and this is why we have had things in. You will always find somebody that says that they have not had the proper aftercare, but then you look at the people that tell you that they have had effective aftercare. There were just two strategic account directors in the Welsh Development Agency's international division.

*Nick Ramsay a gododd—*

16:42

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The Minister has said that she is not going to give way.

16:42

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

It was suggested that this arrangement with two people was highly beneficial. However, let us not forget the history of the WDA; it is very important for us to remember that and put it into perspective. When we looked at changes in policy, when we had the economic renewal programme during the last administration, this effectively started the real work forward in getting the balance within the economy between foreign direct investment, which can sometimes quickly bring jobs, and the need to grow indigenous Welsh businesses.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Nid wyf yn bwriadu ildio ar hyn o bryd, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn nodi bod Cymru yn parhau i fod ar ei hôl hi o'i chymharu â'r Alban a Lloegr o ran denu buddsoddiad uniongyrchol o dramor. Er ei bod yn dda dod yn gyntaf bob amser, mae'n annhebygol iawn y byddwn byth yn denu mwy o fewnfuddsoddi na Lloegr, sydd â phoblogaeth o dros 53 miliwn. Felly, gadewch inni wynebu'r gwirionedd o ran hynny.

Efallai mai'r peth mwyaf niweidiol, fodd bynnag, yw'r sylwadau am ôl-ofal. Sut yn y byd mae rhywun yn meddwl inni ennill ailfuddsoddi gan gwmnïau fel Ford, Toyota, Sony, General Dynamics, Admiral, Deloitte, Airbus UK a llawer eraill os nad oeddem yn rhoi'r ôl-ofal sydd ei angen arnynt? Mae 'ôl-ofal' yn derm hen ffasiwn iawn, ond mae'n bwysig iawn cydnabod bod gennym raglen effeithiol. Mae gan gwmnïau reolwr cyfrif a enwir sy'n gyfrifol am weithrediadau o ddydd i ddydd. Fel rheolwyr cyfrifon, rydym hefyd yn meithrin perthynas â'r rhiant gwmni tramor. Mae gennym reolwyr cyfrifon sy'n rhoi cwmnïau eraill at ei gilydd i greu busnes. Mae gennym 39 o gwmnïau angori a 79 o gwmnïau sydd â buddsoddwyr tramor. Mae gennym drefniadau effeithiol gyda phob un o'r cwmnïau hyn, a dyna pam rydym wedi cael pethau. Byddwch bob amser yn dod o hyd i rywun sy'n dweud nad yw wedi cael yr ôl-ofal priodol, ond wedyn rydych yn edrych ar y bobl sy'n dweud wrthyh eu bod wedi cael ôl-ofal effeithiol. Dim ond dau gyfarwyddwr cyfrif strategol oedd yn is-adran ryngwladol Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru.

*Nick Ramsay rose—*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud nad yw'n bwriadu ildio.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Awgrymwyd bod y trefniant hwn gyda dau o bobl yn fuddiol iawn. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni beidio ag anghofio hanes y WDA; mae'n bwysig iawn inni gofio hynny a'i roi yn ei gyd-destun. Pan edrychwn ar newidiadau mewn polisi, pan oedd rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi ar waith gennym yn ystod y weinyddiaeth ddiwethaf, dechreuodd hyn ar y gwaith gwirioneddol i bob diben o ran cael y cydbwysedd o fewn yr economi rhwng buddsoddi uniongyrchol tramor, a all weithiau greu swyddi'n gyflym, a'r angen i dyfu busnesau cynhenid Cymru.

In terms of visits by me and the First Minister, what do they think those are if they are not to try to get foreign direct investment or retain jobs, as happened when I went to Japan? It was about meeting Japanese companies and talking to their senior executives. I have seen some of them since coming back; I had a discussion with a Japanese company yesterday, where someone who was leaving to go back to Japan said how much they had enjoyed their time and relationship with us. Ford in Bridgend has been with us for 40 years. We have secured the production of the Ford Sigma 1.5 litre engine, which is really good. Each of my sector teams has a portfolio of 100 or more companies, and these companies benefit very much from the links that we have, because we look at supply chain opportunities for smaller companies. Our approach is fit for a forward-looking economy. We now need the higher quality jobs attracting good salaries alongside those skills requirements. That is why it is important that we are focusing particularly on the skills agenda.

People will talk about what we have not secured in terms of this report. It is not novel to say, 'We don't get things; England, Scotland and Northern Ireland have them'. In a competitive world, we cannot win every opportunity that comes our way, just like England, Scotland and Northern Ireland cannot win every opportunity. HBO's decision to locate in Northern Ireland for the filming of 'Game of Thrones' can be matched by the decision to film 'Da Vinci's Demons' in the old Ford plant in Swansea. So, there are winners and losers across the piece in this regard, and it is important to recognise this. So, when we have lost jobs, we have looked at everything and, all the time through, we check up. If we think that we do not have something, we go back and look why we have not had it.

Our new campaign, 'Just Ask Wales', is focused on London and the south-east of England, because it is from there that the money comes in. We need to recognise that, and that is very important. When businesses take their decisions to invest in the country, the last thing in the world they would want is an investment council. Sometimes, they want decisions within a couple of weeks, you know, on how they can come here and what we can do for them. I have private sector expertise all over the place. Who chairs my enterprise zones? Who chairs my sector panels? So, if I hear any criticism from the opposition party in future about my enterprise zone chairs, I will remind you that they come from the private sector and therefore I am taking good advice—because you think that I need even further advice on this.

We are continuing to build on the growth of inward investment, and in the last figures we have seen more people employed in that area.

O ran ymweliadau gennyf i a'r Prif Weinidog, beth ydynt yn eu tyb hwy os nad ceisio cael buddsoddiad uniongyrchol tramor neu gadw swyddi yw'r nod, fel y digwyddodd pan euthum i Japan? Roedd yn ymwneud â chyfarfod â chwmnïau o Japan a siarad â'u huwch swyddogion gweithredol. Rwyf wedi gweld rhai ohonynt ers dod yn ôl; cefais drafodaeth gyda chwmni o Japan ddoe, lle dywedodd rhywun a oedd yn gadael ac yn dychwelyd i Japan gymaint yr oedd wedi mwynhau ei gyfnod a'i berthynas â ni. Mae Ford wedi bod gyda ni ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr ers 40 mlynedd. Rydym wedi sicrhau gwaith cynhyrchu injan 1.5 litr Ford Sigma, sy'n beth da iawn. Mae gan bob un o'm timau sector bortffolio o 100 neu ragor o gwmnïau, ac mae'r cwmnïau hyn yn elwa'n fawr iawn ar y cysylltiadau sydd gennym, oherwydd ein bod yn edrych ar gyfleoedd cadwyn gyflenwi i gwmnïau llai. Mae ein dull gweithredu yn addas ar gyfer economi sy'n edrych i'r dyfodol. Mae angen bellach inni gael y swyddi o safon uwch sy'n talu cyflogau da ochr yn ochr â'r gofynion sgiliau hynny. Dyna pam ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn canolbwyntio'n arbennig ar yr agenda sgiliau.

Bydd pobl yn siarad am yr hyn nad ydym wedi'i sicrhau o ran yr adroddiad hwn. Nid yw'n beth newydd i ddweud, 'Nid ydym yn cael pethau; mae Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon wedi'u cael'. Mewn byd cystadleuol, ni allwn ennill pob cyfle sy'n ymddangos ar y gorwel, yn union fel na all Lloegr, yr Alban na Gogledd Iwerddon ennill pob cyfle. Gall penderfyniad HBO i fynd i Ogledd Iwerddon i filmio 'Game of Thrones' gael ei wrthgyferbynnu â'r penderfyniad i ffilmio 'Da Vinci's Demons' yn hen ffatri Ford yn Abertawe. Felly, mae bob amser enillwyr a cholllwyr yn hyn o beth, ac mae'n bwysig cydnabod hyn. Felly, pan fyddwn wedi colli swyddi, rydym wedi edrych ar bopeth a, bob amser, byddwn yn cadarnhau'r ffeithiau. Os credwn nad oes gennym rywbeth, rydym yn mynd yn ôl ac edrych i weld pam nad ydym wedi ei gael.

Mae ein hymgyrch newydd, 'Just Ask Wales', yn canolbwyntio ar Lundain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr, oherwydd oddi yno y daw'r arian i mewn. Mae angen inni gydnabod hynny, ac mae hynny'n bwysig iawn. Pan fydd busnesau yn gwneud eu penderfyniadau i fuddsoddi yn y wlad, y peth olaf yn y byd y byddent am ei weld yw cyngor buddsoddi. Weithiau, maent am gael penderfyniadau o fewn ychydig o wythnosau, wyddoch chi, ynghylch sut y gallant ddod yma a'r hyn y gallwn ei wneud ar eu cyfer. Mae gennyf arbenigedd gan y sector preifat ym mhob man. Pwy sy'n cadeirio fy ardaloedd menter? Pwy sy'n cadeirio fy mhaneli sector? Felly, os clywaf unrhyw feirniadaeth gan yr wrthblaid yn y dyfodol am gadeiryddion fy ardaloedd menter, byddaf yn eich atgoffa eu bod yn dod o'r sector preifat, ac felly fy mod yn cael cyngor da—gan eich bod yn meddwl bod angen imi gael hyd yn oed mwy o gyngor ar hyn.

Rydym yn parhau i adeiladu ar y twf mewn mewnfuddsoddi, ac yn y ffigurau diwethaf rydym wedi gweld mwy o bobl yn cael eu cyflogi yn y maes hwnnw.

Diolch ichi am dderbyn ymyriad. Nid ydym yn dweud ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr nad oes dim yn cael ei wneud, ond, Weinidog, onid oes angen i'r Llywodraeth hefyd ddweud, 'Gallwn wneud yn well' a gosod nodau uwch a bod yn fwy uchelgeisiol i Gymru yn y maes hwn?

16:45

## Rhun ap Iorwerth [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you for taking an intervention. We are not saying on this side of the Chamber that nothing is being done, but, Minister, is it not necessary for the Government also to say, 'We can do better' and to set higher goals and be more ambitious for Wales in this area?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

16:45

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Yes, I share your ambition, and this is something that we constantly look at. In terms of the criticism that I myself had of how we marketed Wales, we looked at how we marketed Wales and we have developed a much better marketing brand. We are satisfied with 'Just Ask Wales'. So, it is right always to challenge, but, at the same time, it is also right not to put extra layers of bureaucracy into any system. We have to be fleet of foot if we are to get things. The private sector definitely adds value and I get that value from my sector panels, from my enterprise zones and all the links they have into what we do, and from all the anchor companies that are prepared to support smaller companies on trade missions. All of them are prepared to support us and say, 'Wales is a good place to invest'. So, at the end of the day, we will be supporting the amendment that supports the committee's report and rejecting all the others. I thank Members for the opportunity to respond to this debate.

Rhannaf eich uchelgais, ac mae hyn yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn edrych arno'n gyson. O ran y feiriadaeth yr wyf fi fy hun wedi'i chael ynghylch sut rydym yn marchnata Cymru, edrychwyd ar y ffordd yr ydym yn marchnata Cymru ac rydym wedi datblygu brand marchnata llawer gwell. Rydym yn fodlon ar 'Just Ask Wales'. Felly, mae bob amser yn briodol herio, ond, ar yr un pryd, mae'n briodol hefyd beidio ag ychwanegu haenau ychwanegol o fiwrocratiaeth at unrhyw system. Rhaid inni fod yn chwim ein traed os ydym am sicrhau pethau. Mae'r sector preifat yn bendant yn ychwanegu gwerth ac rwy'n cael y gwerth hwnnw drwy fy mhaneli sector, fy ardaloedd menter a'r holl gysylltiadau sydd ganddynt hwy â'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud, a thrwy'r holl gwmnïau angori sy'n barod i gefnogi cwmnïau llai ar deithiau masnach. Mae pob un ohonynt yn barod i'n cefnogi a dweud, 'Mae Cymru yn lle da i fuddsoddi'. Felly, yn y pen draw, byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant sy'n cefnogi adroddiad y pwyllgor ac yn gwrthod y lleill i gyd. Diolch i'r Aelodau am y cyfle i ymateb i'r ddatl hon.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:46

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Galwaf ar Andrew R.T. Davies i ymateb i'r ddatl.

I call Andrew R.T. Davies to answer the debate.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:46

**Andrew R.T. Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

In the four and a half minutes that I have to sum up, I very much hope to cover as many points as possible, but I think that it is worth reflecting that this document is certainly not setting out to criticise the improved performance of the Welsh Government. However, that is nowhere near as good as the historical performance of a 15% capture of inward investment in the UK. Now, that might be an ambitious target but, at the moment—and this has come from all sections of this Chamber—we do not know what the ambition of the Welsh Government is. What percentage of UK inward investment does the Welsh Government gear its offer up to attract? Is it 6%? Is it 7%? Is it 8%? If I go to Northern Ireland, I can see it in the programme for government, which tells you how many jobs it wants to create and how much inward investment it wants to attract. It is a key target for the Government there. If I go to Scotland, I can find that out as well. If I go to England and look at the enterprise boards that have been set up there, they clearly have targets, as we identify in this document. In Nottingham, for example, more than 250 private sector companies—just in that one area, that one city—are working with local authorities and other public sector bodies to promote the offer that Nottingham has.

Yn y pedair munud a hanner sydd gennyf i grynhai, rwy'n gobeithio'n fawr y gallaf ymdrin â chymaint o bwyntiau ag y bo modd, ond credaf ei bod yn werth nodi nad nod y ddogfen hon yn sicrhau beirniadu perfformiad gwell Llywodraeth Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n dod yn agos i'r perfformiad hanesyddol o ennill 15% o fewnfuddsoddi yn y DU. Yn awr, efallai fod hwnnw'n darged uchelgeisiol ond, ar hyn o bryd—ac mae hyn wedi dod o bob rhan o'r Siambur hon—ni wyddom beth yw uchelgais Llywodraeth Cymru. Pa ganran o fewnfuddsoddi'r DU y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn paratoi'r hyn a gynigir ganddi i'w denu? Ai 6% ydyw? Ai 7% ydyw? Ai 8% ydyw? Os af i Ogledd Iwerddon, gallaf weld yn y rhaglen lywodraethu, sy'n dweud wrthyf faint o swyddi y mae am eu creu a faint o fewnfuddsoddi y mae am ei ddenu. Mae'n darged allweddol i'r Llywodraeth yno. Os af i'r Alban, gallaf ddod o hyd i hynny hefyd. Os af i Loegr ac edrych ar y byrddau menter a sefydlwyd yno, mae'n amlwg bod ganddynt dargedau, fel y'i nodwyd gennym yn y ddogfen hon. Yn Nottingham, er enghraifft, mae 250 o gwmnïau yn y sector preifat—mewn un ardal, un ddinas yn unig—yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol a chyrrff eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus i hyrwyddo'r hyn a gynigir gan Nottingham.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

It is worth reflecting that, over the last couple of years, Wales has lost 171 foreign-based companies. That equates to 31,000 jobs in total. That is a significant deterioration in where we have been historically. I accept the figures that have come forward. I welcome the improvement in the figures that we have. However, ultimately, where are we going on this journey? Is it a question of waiting for the annualisation of these figures to come out to see whether we have done better or worse and need to change our offering? No-one in this Chamber knows. I offer the Minister the opportunity to say what her aspiration is, what the Government's aspiration is, for a percentage capture of inward investment to the UK. I am offering you the opportunity to say that, Minister.

Other speakers today have talked about education being critical. Suzy Davies touched on that. It is a fact that, when inward investment companies are looking at Wales, they will be benchmarking us against international league tables. No-one can take satisfaction from the Programme for International Student Assessment results or the Estyn report we saw. Ultimately, it is a skills-based economy that will attract the offer into Wales for high-tech companies and high wages, which is the way we all aspire to develop the Welsh economy. Aftercare is a critical component to develop that offer. Many speakers around this Chamber, including Mike Hedges, touched on this issue and the WDA offering and low-value jobs. They might well have been low-value jobs to start with, but they needed to be developed into a high-value offering. Bosch is a good example of that. Sadly it moved away from us to take the jobs to Hungary, but it never really developed that offer. In Northern Ireland, for example, 75% of inward investment companies reinvest. That is a significant proportion of capturing secondary and third-sector spend coming into Northern Ireland, to the province.

I do not know what it is in Wales. I invite the Minister, again, to offer the figure for here in Wales; how much are we capturing of second and third generation investment from companies that have located from abroad? This document clearly sets out what we, as a political party, believe needs to be done after talking to the experts and looking at what is on offer around Europe and around the world. It is, as Adam Breeze points out, a very competitive market. We are not in the days of the WDA; we have moved on. Virtually every city, every council and every country has a form of development corporation, or development arm, seeking to attract that investment. We have to up our game; we accept that.

This document is a genuine attempt to encapsulate where we, as Welsh Conservatives, believe that the offer should be pitched. I think that it is a very sensible offer. Industry representatives and consultants to whom we have spoken have commended that offer. I regret the hostility that the Minister has shown here today to that document, but as I say, I have not heard any figures from the Welsh Government today about exactly where it wants Wales to be. I have not heard about this aftercare. I have to draw the Minister's attention to the research service briefing note that came to us. It contains a formal response from the Government, which says that its trade and inward investment team does not have a specific and dedicated investor development programme.

Mae'n werth ystyried bod Cymru, yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, wedi colli 171 o gwmnïau tramor. Mae hynny'n cyfateb i 31,000 o swyddi i gyd. Mae hynny'n ddirywiad sylweddol o gymharu â'r sefyllfa hanesyddol. Derbyniat y ffigurau a gyflwynwyd. Croesawaf y gwelliant yn y ffigurau sydd gennym. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, beth yw pen y daith? Ai mater o aros i'r ffigurau hyn gael eu cyhoeddi bob blwyddyn ydyw er mwyn gweld a ydym wedi gwneud yn well neu'n waeth ac i weld a oes angen inni newid yr hyn a gynigir gennym? Nid oes neb yn y Siambr hon yn gwybod. Cynigiau gyfle i'r Gweinidog ddweud beth yw ei uchelgais, beth yw uchelgais y Llywodraeth, o ran y ganran o fewnfuddsoddi i'r DU. Rwy'n cynnig y cyfle ichi ddweud hynny, Weiniog.

Nododd siaradwyr eraill heddiw fod addysg yn hollbwysig. Soniodd Suzy Davies am hynny. Mae'n ffaith, pan fydd cwmnïau mewnfuddsoddi yn edrych ar Gymru, y byddant yn ein meincodi yn erbyn tablau cynghrair rhyngwladol. Ni all neb ymfalchïo yng nghanlyniadau'r Rhaglen Ryngwladol Asesu Myfyrwyr na'r adroddiad gan Estyn a welsom. Yn y pen draw, economi sy'n seiliedig ar sgiliau a fydd yn denu'r cynnig o gwmnïau uwch-dechnoleg a chyflogau uchel i Gymru, sef y ffordd yr ydym i gyd am ddatblygu economi Cymru. Mae ôl-ofal yn elfen hanfodol er mwyn datblygu'r cynnig hwnnw. Cyfeiriodd llawer o siaradwyr yn y Siambr hon, gan gynnwys Mike Hedges, at y mater hwn a'r hyn a gynigwyd gan WDA a swyddi gwerth isel. Efallai mai swyddi gwerth isel oeddent i ddechrau, ond roedd angen eu datblygu'n rhai gwerth uchel. Mae Bosch yn enghraifft dda o hynny. Yn anffodus symudodd i ffwrdd oddi wrthym ni a mynd â'r swyddi i Hwngari, ond ni ddatblygodd y cynnig hwnnw erioed mewn gwirionedd. Yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, er enghraifft, mae 75% o gwmnïau mewnfuddsoddi yn ailfuddsoddi. Mae hynny'n gyfran sylweddol o ddal gwariant y sector eilaidd a'r trydydd sector sy'n dod i Ogledd Iwerddon, i'r dalaith.

Ni wn beth yw'r ganran yng Nghymru. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog, unwaith eto, gynnig y ffigur ar gyfer Cymru; faint o fuddsoddiadau ail a thrydedd genhedlaeth yr ydym yn eu denu gan gwmnïau sydd wedi lleoli o dramor? Mae'r ddogfen hon yn nodi'n glir yr hyn yr ydym ni, fel plaid wleidyddol, yn credu y mae angen ei wneud ar ôl siarad â'r arbenigwyr ac edrych ar yr hyn sydd ar gael leded Ewrop a'r byd. Fel y noda Adam Breeze, mae'n farchnad gystadleuol iawn. Mae oes y WDA ar ben; rydym wedi symud ymlaen. Mae gan bron pob dinas, pob cyngor a phob gwlad gorfforaeth ddatblygu o ryw fath, neu gangen ddatblygu, sy'n ceisio denu'r buddsoddiad hwnnw. Rhaid inni fod yn fwy effeithiol; rydym yn derbyn hynny.

Mae'r ddogfen hon yn ymgais wirioneddol i grynhoi sut, yn ein barn ni, fel y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, y dylid anelu'r hyn a gynigir. Credaf fod yr hyn a gynigir yn synhwyrol iawn. Mae cynrychiolwyr diwydiant ac ymgynghorwyr yr ydym wedi siarad â hwy wedi canmol yr hyn a gynigir. Gresynaf at yr elyniaeth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i dangos yma heddiw tuag at y ddogfen honno, ond fel y dywedais, nid wyf wedi clywed unrhyw ffigurau gan Lywodraeth Cymru heddiw ynghylch ble yn union mae am weld Cymru. Nid wyf wedi clywed am yr ôl-ofal hwn. Rhaid imi dynnu sylw'r Gweinidog at nodyn briffio'r gwasanaeth ymchwil a anfonwyd atom. Mae'n cynnwys ymateb ffurfiol gan y Llywodraeth, sy'n dweud nad oes gan ei thîm masnach a mewnfuddsoddi raglen benodol wedi'i neilltuo i ddatblygu buddsoddwyr.

That is the Government's response to the research service here. That was only given to us last autumn. If that has changed, please tell us that it has changed, because it will have met one of the key planks of this document. Above all, it is working with the private sector—

Dyna ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r gwasanaeth ymchwil yma. Dim ond yr hydref diwethaf y rhoddwyd hwnnw inni. Os yw hynny wedi newid, dywedwch wrthym ei fod wedi newid, gan y bydd wedi cyflawni un o brif elfennau allweddol y ddogfen hon. Yn anad dim, mae'n ymwneud â gweithio gyda'r sector preifat—

16:51 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Order. Conclude now, please.

Trefn. Goffennwch yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

16:51 **Andrew R.T. Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

It is working with the private sector such as in the example that we use in this document about Nottingham. I commend this document to the Assembly; I commend it as a significant piece of work that will encourage companies to locate in Wales and develop the economy that we need in the twenty-first century.

Mae'n ymwneud â gweithio gyda'r sector preifat fel yn yr enghraifft a ddefnyddiwn yn y ddogfen hon am Nottingham. Cymeradwyaf y ddogfen hon i'r Cynulliad; fe'i cymeradwyaf fel darn sylweddol o waith a fydd yn annog cwmnïau i leoli yng Nghymru, a datblygu'r economi y mae ei hangen arnom yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

16:51 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. Oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly, gohiriaf y bleidlais ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

The question is that the motion without amendment be agreed to. Is there any objection? There is, so I defer the voting on this item until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.*

*Voting deferred until voting time.*

## Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Y Cynllun Bwyd Ysgol

*Detholwyd y gwelliannau canlynol: gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Elin Jones.*

Cynnig NDM5417 Aled Roberts

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. Yn nodi canfyddiadau'r Cynllun Bwyd Ysgol y byddai prydau ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn mewn ysgolion cynradd yn arwain at welliannau cadarnhaol o ran iechyd, cyrhaeddiad addysgol a chydlyniant cymdeithasol ac yn helpu teuluoedd gyda chostau byw.

2. Yn nodi mai 21% yn unig o blant oed babanod yng Nghymru sydd ar hyn o bryd yn cael pryd bwyd ysgol am ddim a thua 24% yn unig o ddisgyblion oed cynradd yn 2012-13 a gymerodd frecwest ysgol am ddim.

3. Yn nodi y bydd Cymru yn cael dros £62 miliwn o gyllid referniw canlyniadol Barnett ar gyfer 2014-16 a thros £4 miliwn o gyllid cyfalaf yn 2014-15 yn dilyn y cyhoeddiad gan Lywodraeth y DU ar brydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl oed babanod yn Lloegr.

4. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ddefnyddio cyllid canlyniadol Barnett i gyflwyno prydau ysgol am ddim yn gyffredinol i blant oed babanod yng Nghymru, er mwyn i bob plentyn bach gael pryd bwyd ysgol poeth, iach i hybu iechyd, addysg a lles disgyblion.

## Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: The School Food Plan

*The following amendments have been selected: amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Elin Jones.*

Motion NDM5417 Aled Roberts

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Notes the findings of the School Food Plan that free school meals for all children in primary schools would lead to positive improvements in health, educational attainment and social cohesion and help families with the cost of living.

2. Notes that in Wales only 21% of infants currently receive a free school meal and only around 24% of primary age pupils in 2012-13 took a free school breakfast.

3. Notes that Wales will receive over £62m of Barnett consequential revenue funding for 2014-16 and over £4m of capital funding in 2014-15 following the announcement by the UK Government on free school meals for all infant age pupils in England.

4. Calls on the Welsh Government to use the Barnett consequential to introduce universal free school meals for infants in Wales, so that all infants can receive a hot, healthy school lunch to boost pupil health, education and well-being.



I move the motion.

I am pleased to bring forward this motion today on behalf of the Liberal Democrats, which will allow us an opportunity to discuss and debate the principle of universal free school meals and, possibly, to kick-start discussion on how we can ensure that more children in Wales can benefit from free school meal provision.

The concept is not new; it was first introduced by a Liberal Government in 1906, which gave local councils the power to give free school meals to children from poor families. By 1914, over 158,000 children were in receipt of a free meal once a day. Of course, the Education Act 1944 then introduced the concept of universal free school meals, which made it compulsory for local councils to provide a free meal for children who were eligible in all state schools.

Universal free school meals for primary pupils was a key recommendation in the recent independent review of school food, produced for the Department for Education. We have often discussed here why Finland provides us with a good example of where educational attainment has improved significantly in the last 20 years. That review gathered a great deal of evidence from Finland, where free school meals have been provided to all children since the second world war.

The review found that, in pilot areas where all children received a free school dinner, rather than those to whom it was extended, students were academically months ahead of their peers in areas where the review had not been undertaken. Also, their eating patterns at home changed significantly.

The school food plan recommended that the Government in Westminster embark on a phased roll-out of free school meals for all children in primary schools. It provided evidence that this would lead to positive improvements in health, attainment and social cohesion, and would help families with the cost of living.

We do not need to remind ourselves of where we are as far as educational attainment in Wales is concerned. The PISA results in December were another stark indication of Wales's education system lagging behind the rest of the UK, never mind the rest of Europe.

'State of the Nation 2013' highlighted that the attainment gap between children eligible for free school meals and other children rose from 29.7% in 2007 to over 33% in 2012. Our hope is, of course, that key programmes such as the pupil deprivation grant will play an important part in helping to reduce this inequality. However, more must still be done to break down early barriers to attainment.

Cynigiau y cynnig.

Rwy'n falch o gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn heddiw ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a fydd yn rhoi cyfle inni drafod egwyddor prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl ac, o bosibl, ddechrau trafodaeth ynglŷn â sut y gallwn sicrhau bod mwy o blant yng Nghymru yn gallu cael budd o ddarpariaeth prydau ysgol am ddim.

Nid yw'r cysyniad yn un newydd; cafodd ei gyflwyno'n gyntaf gan Lywodraeth Ryddfrydol yn 1906, a roddodd y pŵer i gynghorau lleol roi prydau bwyd ysgol am ddim i blant o deuluoedd tlawd. Erbyn 1914, roedd dros 158,000 o blant yn cael cinio am ddim unwaith y dydd. Wrth gwrs, yna cyflwynodd Deddf Addysg 1944 y cysyniad o brydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl, gan ei gwneud yn orfodol i gynghorau lleol ddarparu cinio am ddim i blant a oedd yn gymwys ym mhob un o ysgolion y wladwriaeth.

Roedd prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl cynradd yn un o argymhellion allweddol yn yr adolygiad annibynnol diweddar o fwyd ysgol, a baratowyd ar ran yr Adran Addysg. Rydym yn aml wedi trafod yma pam mae'r Ffindir yn enghraifft dda inni o wlad lle mae cyrhaeddiad addysgol wedi gwella'n sylweddol dros y 20 mlynedd diwethaf. Casglodd yr adolygiad hwnnw gryn dipyn o dystiolaeth o'r Ffindir, lle mae prydau ysgol am ddim wedi cael eu darparu i bob plentyn ers yr ail ryfel byd.

Canfu'r adolygiad hwn, mewn ardaloedd peilot lle roedd pob plentyn yn cael cinio ysgol am ddim, yn hytrach na'r rhai yr oedd yn cael ei gynnis iddynt, fod myfyrwyr yn fisoedd o flaen eu cyfoedion yn academaidd mewn ardaloedd lle nad oedd yr adolygiad wedi ei gynnal. Hefyd, newidiodd eu patrymau bwyta gartref yn sylweddol.

Mae'r cynllun bwyd ysgol yn argymhell bod y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan yn cychwyn ar broses raddol o gyflwyno prydau ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn mewn ysgolion cynradd. Roedd yn rhoi dystiolaeth y byddai hyn yn arwain at welliannau cadarnhaol mewn iechyd, cyrhaeddiad a chydlynid cymdeithasol, a byddai'n helpu teuluoedd gyda chostau byw.

Nid oes angen inni atgoffa ein hunain o'n sefyllfa o ran cyrhaeddiad addysgol yng Nghymru. Roedd canlyniadau PISA ym mis Rhagfyr yn arwydd amlwg arall bod system addysg Cymru ar ei hôl hi o'i chymharu â gweddiill y DU, heb sôn am weddiill Ewrop.

Amlygodd 'State of the Nation 2013' fod y bwch cyrhaeddiad rhwng plant sy'n gymwys i gael prydau ysgol am ddim a phlant eraill wedi cynyddu o 29.7% yn 2007 i fwy na 33% yn 2012. Ein gobaith yw, wrth gwrs, y bydd y rhaglenni allweddol megis y grant amddifadedd disgyblion yn chwarae rhan bwysig i helpu i leihau'r anghydraddoldeb hwn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid gwneud rhagor i chwalu'r rhwystrau cynnar i gyrhaeddiad.

In Wales, we already have the free school breakfast scheme, and the 2000 partnership agreement between Labour and us recognised the link between a balanced diet and the ability to learn, supporting an extension to the free breakfast scheme. Universal free school meals, we believe, build on this principle. The figures show that, despite much effort, only around 24% of primary age pupils in Wales took advantage of a free school breakfast. Not all schools participate, and the scheme is particularly challenging to deliver, it would appear from the figures, in rural areas where pupils may be less likely to get to school in sufficient time for the free breakfast.

Many families, we have to appreciate, do not apply for reasons such as stigma, while many families living below the breadline, who cannot afford a decent packed lunch or lunch money, fall just outside eligibility. Over 80,500 infants in total in Wales do not receive a free school meal, either because they are not eligible or, more worrying, because they have not taken up their eligibility. That is over 78% of primary age children who are not receiving a free school meal. Universal free school meals is a policy that focuses on the pupils; just as those from wealthier backgrounds are not charged for their books or education, this measure would apply to all pupils so that they could benefit from a measure proven to increase attainment.

The Welsh Government has received, we believe, over £62 million of Barnett consequential revenue funding for 2014-16 as a result of the announcement made in England. We received a written statement this week, indicating that the Minister for Finance had decided that £12 million of next year's funding will be allocated to the education and skills main expenditure group to drive up standards, but also indicating that the Minister for education would have to make a further announcement on how that money would be spent. There was, of course, no mention of how the £36 million of free school meal revenue funding for the following year will be spent.

The evidence is growing of the benefits that universal free school meals offer in driving up educational attainment and improving health and social cohesion. We urge the Minister to consider the principles raised in today's debate when considering how best to spend the £12 million next year and, more importantly, the £36 million for 2015-16.

Children in Wales has suggested a number of options for consideration: universal free school meals for all pupils aged five to seven, with consideration of extending this in future as part of a phased process; universal free school meals for all pupils aged five to seven in geographical areas of disadvantage, such as Flying Start areas, with consideration of extending it further; or universal free school meals for five to 11-year-olds in geographical areas of disadvantage, with consideration of extending it further if successful. In all models, Children in Wales, interestingly, states that the universal element is non-negotiable. It would eliminate the costly bureaucracy involved with means testing and help reduce stigma by ensuring parity of access.

Yng Nghymru, rydym eisoes wedi sefydlu'r cynllun brecwast ysgol am ddim, a chydabu cytundeb partneriaeth 2000 rhwng Llafur a ninnau y cysylltiad rhwng deiet cytbwys a'r gallu i ddysgu, gan gefnogi estyniad i'r cynllun brecwast am ddim. Mae prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl, yn ein barn ni, yn adeiladu ar yr egwyddor hon. Dengys y ffigurau, er gwaethaf cryn ymdrech, mai dim ond tua 24% o ddisgyblion oedran cynradd yng Nghymru a fanteisiodd ar frecwast ysgol am ddim. Nid yw pob ysgol yn cymryd rhan, ac mae'r cynllun yn arbennig o heriol i'w gyflawni, fe ymddengys o'r ffigurau, mewn ardaloedd gwledig lle gall disgyblion fod yn llai tebygol o gyrraedd yr ysgol mewn da bryd i gael brecwast am ddim.

Mae llawer o deuluoedd, rhaid inni sylweddoli, yn peidio â gwneud cais am resymau megis stigma, tra bod llawer o deuluoedd sy'n byw mewn tlodi, nad ydynt yn gallu ffordio pecyn bwyd da nac arian cinio, ychydig y tu allan i'r meini prawf cymhwysedd. Mae dros 80,500 o fabanod i gyd yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn cael prydau ysgol am ddim, naill ai am nad ydynt yn gymwys neu am nad ydynt wedi manteisio ar y ffaith eu bod yn gymwys i'w cael, sy'n achos mwy o bryder. Nid yw dros 78% o blant cynradd yn cael prydau ysgol am ddim. Mae prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl yn bolisi sy'n canolbwyntio ar y disgyblion, yn union fel na chodir tâl ar y rhai o gefndiroedd mwy cyfoethog am eu llyfrau neu eu haddysg, byddai'r mesur hwn yn gymwys i bob disgybl fel y gallant gael budd o fesur y profwyd ei fod yn gwella cyrhaeddiad.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cael, fe gredwn, dros £62 miliwn o arian refeniw canlyniadol Barnett ar gyfer 2014-16 o ganlyniad i'r cyhoeddiad a wnaed yn Lloegr. Cawsom ddatganiad ysgrifenedig yr wythnos hon, sy'n dangos bod y Gweinidog Cyllid wedi penderfynu y bydd £12 miliwn o gyllid y flwyddyn nesaf yn cael ei ddyrannu i brif grŵp gwariant addysg a sgiliau er mwyn gwella safonau, ond hefyd yn nodi y byddai'n rhaid i'r Gweinidog addysg wneud cyhoeddiad pellach ynglŷn â sut y câi'r arian ei wario. Wrth gwrs, nid oes unrhyw sôn am sut y caiff y swm o £36 miliwn o gyllid refeniw prydau ysgol am ddim ar gyfer y flwyddyn ganlynol ei wario.

Cawn fwy a mwy o dystiolaeth ynglŷn â'r manteision a gynigir gan brydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl o ran gwella cyrhaeddiad addysgol a gwella iechyd a chydlyniant cymdeithasol. Rydym yn annog y Gweinidog i ystyried yr egwyddorion a godir yn y ddadl heddiw wrth ystyried y ffordd orau o wario'r £12 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf ac, yn bwysicach na hynny, y £36 miliwn ar gyfer 2015-16.

Mae Plant yng Nghymru wedi awgrymu nifer o opsiynau i'w hystyried: prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl rhwng pump a saith oed, gan ystyried ei ymestyn yn y dyfodol fel rhan o broses fesul cam; prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl rhwng pump a saith oed mewn ardaloedd daearyddol o anfantais, megis ardaloedd Dechrau'n Deg, gan ystyried ei ymestyn ymhellach; neu brydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl rhwng pump ac 11 oed mewn ardaloedd daearyddol o dan anfantais, gan ystyried ei ymestyn ymhellach os bydd yn llwyddiannus. Ym mhob model, mae Plant yng Nghymru yn nodi, yn ddiddorol ddigon, fod yn rhaid wrth yr elfen o gynnwys pob disgybl. Byddai'n cael gwared ar y fwiocratiaeth gostus sy'n gysylltiedig â phroffion modd ac yn helpu i leihau stigma drwy sicrhau mynediad cyfartal.

As part of our campaign on free school meals, we contacted local authorities and third sector organisations to listen to their views. There were, understandably, concerns raised over cost, but there was still widespread support within the responses for the principle of free school meals for all infants. The Royal College of Paediatrics and Child Health stated that

'all children should be able to access a nutritious, balanced and healthy meal during the school day'

and that

'a free school meal for all children is certainly one of the ways we can help ensure they have access to an adequate diet.'

In my region, Denbighshire council considered

'the introduction of a free, healthy, good quality, school meal in the middle of the day for Foundation Phase pupils as a positive development'.

Conwy viewed universal free school meals as

'a positive policy provided it is backed up with resources and staff infrastructure to promote and encourage the children to accept and enjoy the food provided.'

Flintshire noted a caveat about funding and capacity concerns, but still felt that the proposal could encourage younger children to eat meals together in a social setting and to try different foods that they may not have experienced at home. Gwynedd Council said that its research clearly showed that the link between nutrition and strong academic performance was made out.

We hope that the Minister will consider the principles raised today, and the benefits that will be highlighted from universal school provision. We hope that he will listen to the evidence when considering how best to allocate the additional funding that Wales is receiving as a result of the free school meals announcement in England, and consider—more importantly—the suggestions put forward by children's organisations in Wales to ensure that as many pupils as possible can enjoy the benefits that free school meals bring. This should be the part of the programme with regard to improving educational attainment in Wales.

Fel rhan o'n hymgyrch ar brydau ysgol am ddim, cysylltwyd ag awdurdodau lleol a sefydliadau'r trydydd sector i wrando ar eu barn. Codwyd pryderon, a hynny'n ddealladwy, ynglŷn â chost, ond cafwyd cefnogaeth eang yn yr ymatebion i'r egwyddor o brydau ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn oedran babanod. Dywedodd y Coleg Brenhinol Pediatreg ac Iechyd Plant

y dylai pob plentyn fod yn gallu cael pryd o fwyd maethlon, cytbwys ac iach yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol

a

bod cinio ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn yn sicr yn un ffordd y gallwn helpu i sicrhau y cânt ddeiet digonol.

Yn fy rhanbarth i, roedd cyngor sir Ddinbych o'r farn

bod cyflwyno pryd ysgol iach am ddim yng nghanol y dydd i ddisgyblion y Cyfnod Sylfaen yn ddatblygiad cadarnhaol.

Roedd Conwy o'r farn bod prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl

yn bolisi cadarnhaol ar yr amod ei fod yn cael ei ategu gan adnoddau a seilwaith staff i hyrwyddo ac annog y plant i dderbyn a mwynhau'r bwyd a ddarperir.

Nododd Sir y Fflint bryderon ynglŷn â chyllid ac adnoddau, ond roedd yn dal i deimlo y gallai'r cynnig annog plant iau i fwyta prydau bwyd gyda'i gilydd mewn lleoliad cymdeithasol ac i roi cynnig ar fwydydd gwahanol nad ydynt wedi profi o bosibl yn y cartref. Dywedodd Cyngor Gwynedd fod ei ymchwil yn dangos yn glir bod y cyswllt rhwng maeth a pherfformiad academiaidd cryf wedi'i brofi.

Rydym yn gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried yr egwyddorion a godwyd heddiw, a'r manteision a ddaw yn sgil darpariaeth yn yr ysgol i bob disgybl. Rydym yn gobeithio y bydd yn gwrandao ar y dystiolaeth wrth ystyried y ffordd orau o ddyrannu'r cyllid ychwanegol y bydd Cymru yn ei gael o ganlyniad i'r cyhoeddiad ynglŷn â phrydau ysgol am ddim yn Lloegr, ac ystyried—yn bwysicach na hynny—yr awgrymiadau a gyflwynwyd gan sefydliadau plant yng Nghymru i sicrhau y gall cymaint o ddisgyblion â phosibl gael manteision a ddaw yn sgil prydau ysgol am ddim. Dylai hyn fod yn rhan o'r rhaglen o ran gwella cyrhaeddiad addysgol yng Nghymru.

17:00

## Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Rwyf wedi dethol y ddau welliant i'r cynnig. Galwaf ar Simon Thomas i gynnig gwelliannau 1 a 2 a gyflwynwyd yn enw Elin Jones.

*Gwelliant 1—Elin Jones*

*Ym mhwynt 1, dileu popeth ar ôl 'Cynllun Bwyd Ysgol' a rhoi yn ei le: 'bod plant sy'n bwyta bwyd maethlon yn dod ymlaen yn well yn yr ysgol'.*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I have selected the two amendments to the motion. I call on Simon Thomas to move amendments 1 and 2, tabled in the name of Elin Jones.

*Amendment 1—Elin Jones*

*In point 1, delete all after 'School Food Plan' and replace with 'that well-nourished children fare better at school'.*

*Ym mhwynt 4, dileu popeth ar ôl 'refeniw canlyniadol Barnett' a rhoi yn ei le: 'yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol a sicr o wella safonau a lles ac i gyhoeddi rhaglen o'i bwriadau yng nghyswllt pob darpariaeth ar gyfer bwyd ysgol'.*

*In point 4, delete all after 'Barnett consequential' and replace with 'in the most effective and proven way to improve standards and well-being and to publish a programme of its intentions for all school meals provision'.*

17:01

## Simon Thomas [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I move amendments 1 and 2.

Cynigiad welliannau 1 a 2.

I thank the Liberal Democrats for the opportunity to debate this today. I will say at the outset that I think that we can agree on one thing and that is that the concept of children sharing a meal at the middle of the day, together, and in school, would have beneficial effects for wellbeing, social cohesion and attainment. The question that we need to debate today is what priority we attach to this in a time of public funding cuts, and how we deal with a Barnett consequential or decisions being taken in a different context and in a different school meals context that is happening now in England.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am y cyfle i drafod hyn heddiw. Dywedaf ar y dechrau fy mod yn credu y gallwn gytuno ar un peth a hynny yw bod y cysyniad y byddai plant yn rhannu pryd o fwyd ganol dydd, gyda'i gilydd, ac yn yr ysgol, yn fuddiol o ran lles, cydlyniant cymdeithasol a chyrhaeddiad. Y cwestiwn y mae angen inni ei drafod heddiw yw pa flaenoriaeth a roddwn ar hyn mewn cyfnod o doriadau mewn cyllid cyhoeddus, a sut rydym yn ymdrin â symiau canlyniadol Barnett neu benderfyniadau sy'n cael eu gwneud mewn cyd-destun gwahanol ac mewn cyd-destun gwahanol o ran prydau bwyd ysgol sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd yn Lloegr.

The first of our amendments simply replaces the conclusions that the Liberal Democrats seek in their motion to support their policy. There is nothing wrong with that; that is politics for you. However, our amendment seeks to replace that with a specific quote from the school food plan, which is that,

Mae ein gwelliant cyntaf ond yn disodli'r casgliadau y mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn eu ceisio yn eu cynnig i gefnogi eu polisi. Nid oes dim o'i le ar hynny; fel yna mae gwleidyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae ein gwelliant yn gofyn am roi dyfyniad penodol gan y cynllun bwyd ysgol yn ei le, sef bod

'well-nourished children fare better at school'.

'plant sy'n bwyta bwyd maethlon yn dod ymlaen yn well yn yr ysgol'.

That is clearly the case. The debate that we need to have is where the nourishment comes from, whether it is at home, with parents, at school or a combination of how we work together.

Mae hynny'n amlwg yn wir. Y drafodaeth sydd angen inni ei chael yw o ble daw'r maeth, boed yn y cartref, gyda rhieni, yn yr ysgol neu gyfuniad o'r ffordd yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'n gilydd.

Our second amendment today seeks to ensure that the Barnett consequential that does come to the Government is used in the most effective and proven way. Another question that we need to ask today is whether the introduction of a free school meal at this stage the thing that is the most effective and proven way to address the problems in our school system—problems that were evidenced very strongly yesterday in Estyn's annual report.

Mae ein hail welliant heddiw yn ceisio sicrhau bod arian canlyniadol Barnett a ddaw i'r Llywodraeth yn cael ei ddefnyddio yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol a phroffedig. Cwestiwn arall y mae angen inni ei ofyn heddiw yw ai cyflwyno prydau ysgol am ddim ar hyn o bryd yw'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol a sicr o fynd i'r afael â'r problemau yn ein system—problemau y cafwyd tystiolaeth gref iawn yn eu cylch ddoe yn adroddiad blynyddol Estyn.

I also hope that this debate will throw some light on a couple of other things in the motion: first, the contention that there is £62 million of Barnett consequential. I am not sure whether that is the case because, from what I have seen in Westminster, a lot of this money is being brought out of cupboards within the department's own allocation; it is not necessarily new money and we will not therefore get a Barnett consequential on that. A second aspect of this that I hope that we will throw some light on is the statement today that this is for infants to receive a hot, healthy school lunch. It was only today that there was a declaration and an analysis in the 'The Independent' newspaper that, in fact, the Westminster Government has gone back on the promise of a hot lunch and is now stating that a packed lunch is a nutritious meal at lunch time and is sufficient. That is not the same as a hot lunch. If the money in England is only paying for a packed lunch, the consequential in Wales will not be enough for a hot lunch. That is for certain.

Let us have a look at some of the evidence here, which is not, I am afraid, evidenced in the school food plan. I think that the motion is a little misleading on that. The school food plan makes assertions, and if you look behind them you will see that there is evidence to support some of those assertions, but not in the plan itself.

I think that Aled Roberts referred to the particular pilots that were done in Durham and Newham in 2009. There was no doubt there that those pilots, where everyone participated, showed that pupils were, on average, two months ahead of their peers elsewhere. So, there was a link there. However, there are two caveats that we need to put on those pilots. First, they were done in an English context where there were no free school breakfasts; so, you are only talking about a free school lunch going into a situation where there is no school breakfast. That is different to Wales. The second caveat is the fact that the result showed that pupils were two months ahead of their peers elsewhere. If you look at other evidence, for example, that produced by the Education Endowment Foundation, you will see that the use of digital technology in school itself advances children four months. So, if you have a choice to invest in digital technology and bring your cohort four months ahead, or to invest in a hot school meal and bring them two months ahead, you have a choice of how you use your resources. That is really the choice that faces Government and opposition parties when we are dealing with this issue today.

Gobeithio hefyd y bydd y ddadl hon yn taflu rhywfaint o oleuni ar un neu ddau o bethau eraill yn y cynnig: yn gyntaf, yr honiad bod £62 miliwn o arian canlyniadol Barnett. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny'n wir oherwydd, o'r hyn yr wyf wedi ei weld yn San Steffan, mae llawer o'r arian hwn yn dod o ddyraniad yr adran ei hun; nid yw'n arian newydd o reidrwydd ac felly ni chawn swm canlyniadol o dan Barnett am hynny. Yr ail agwedd ar hyn yr wyf yn gobeithio y cawn rywfaint o oleuni yn ei gylch yw'r datganiad heddiw y rhoddir yr arian hwn er mwyn i fabanod gael pryd ysgol poeth iach. Dim ond heddiw y cafwyd datganiad a dadansoddiad ym mhapur newydd 'The Independent' bod y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan wedi cefnu ar yr addewid o bryd poeth mewn gwirionedd a'i bod bellach yn nodi bod pecyn bwyd yn bryd maethlon amser cinio ac yn ddigonol. Nid yw hynny yr un fath â phryd poeth. Os mai dim ond talu am becyn cinio a wna'r arian yn Lloegr, ni fydd y swm canlyniadol yng Nghymru yn ddigon ar gyfer pryd poeth. Mae hynny'n sicr.

Gadewch inni edrych ar ychydig o'r dystiolaeth yma, nad yw, mae arnaf ofn, wedi'i chynnwys yn y cynllun bwyd ysgol. Credaf fod y cynnig ychydig yn gamarweiniol o ran hynny. Mae'r cynllun bwyd ysgol yn gwneud haeriadau, ac os ymchwiliwch iddynt gwelwch fod tystiolaeth i gefnogi rhai o'r haeriadau hynny, ond nid yw wedi'i chynnwys yn y cynllun ei hun.

Credaf i Aled Roberts gyfeirio at y cynlluniau peilot penodol a gynhaliwyd yn Durham a Newham yn 2009. Nid oedd unrhyw amheuaeth yno i'r cynlluniau peilot hynny, lle roedd pawb yn cymryd rhan, ddangos bod y disgyblion, ar gyfartaledd, ddeufis o flaen eu cyfoedion mewn manau eraill. Felly, gwelwyd cyswllt yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, rhaid seinio dau rybudd wrth ystyried y cynlluniau peilot hynny. Yn gyntaf, cawsant eu cynnal yng nghyd-destun Lloegr lle nad oedd brecwast am ddim yn cael ei ddarparu mewn ysgolion; felly, rydych ond yn sôn am bryd ysgol am ddim mewn sefyllfa lle na ddarperir brecwast yn yr ysgol. Mae hynny'n wahanol i Gymru. Yr ail rybudd yw'r ffaith i'r canlyniad ddangos bod disgyblion ddeufis o flaen eu cyfoedion mewn manau eraill. Os edrychwch ar dystiolaeth arall, er enghraifft, tystiolaeth a gyhoeddwyd gan y Sefydliad Gwaddol Addysg, gwelwch fod y defnydd o dechnoleg ddigidol yn yr ysgol yn arwain at ddatblygiad o bedwar mis ymhlith plant. Felly, os bydd gennych ddewis i fuddsoddi mewn technoleg ddigidol a dod â'ch carfan bedwar mis ymlaen, neu i fuddsoddi mewn prydau ysgol poeth a dod â hwy ddeufis ymlaen, rhaid dewis sut y byddwch yn defnyddio'ch adnoddau. Dyna'n wir yw'r dewis sy'n wynebu'r Llywodraeth a'r gwrthbleidiau wrth ymdrin â'r mater hwn heddiw.

Plaid Cymru therefore thinks that it is important that we take an evidence-based approach to this, that we focus on raising standards, and that we focus on breaking the link between poverty and attainment. We see that well-nourished children fare better at school, and that having a proper diet—and an education around diet—has a real role to play in that. However, we ask whether prioritising the introduction of free school meals for all infants at this stage now is the best use of any money that may be coming forward. We have to ask ourselves: do we want a situation where, in effect, all children in Wales, certainly in infants' schools, are being provided with two free meals a day—breakfast and lunch? Where is the parental responsibility here? What is the best use of resources? Also, as our amendments refer to, what is the long-term plan from the Government? A very wise person once said,

'While of course I recognise the importance of a good breakfast to a child's wellbeing, resources are finite. When it comes to a choice between the two, I would rather see teachers in classrooms than breakfasts.'

I look forward to Kirsty's change of heart today.

Felly mae Plaid Cymru o'r farn ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn gweithredu ar sail tystiolaeth o ran hyn, ein bod yn canolbwyntio ar godi safonau, a'n bod yn canolbwyntio ar dorri'r cysylltiad rhwng tlodi a chyrhaeddiad. Gwelwn fod plant sy'n derbyn bwyd maethlon yn gwneud yn well yn yr ysgol, a bod deiet priodol—ac addysg am ddeiet—yn chwarae rhan wirioneddol yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn gofyn a yw rhoi blaenoriaeth i gyflwyno prydau ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn oedran babanod ar hyn o bryd yn cynnig y defnydd gorau o unrhyw arian sy'n dod i'n rhan. Rhaid inni ofyn i ni'n hunain: a ydym am weld sefyllfa lle mae pob plentyn yng Nghymru, yn sicr mewn ysgolion babanod yn cael dau bryd o fwyd y dydd am ddim—sef brecwast a chinio? Ble mae cyfrifoldeb y rhiant o ran hyn? Beth yw'r defnydd gorau o adnoddau? Hefyd, fel y nodâ ein gwelliannau, beth yw'r cynllun gan y Llywodraeth yn yr hirdymor? Dywedodd rhywun doeth iawn unwaith,

Er fy mod yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd brecwast da i les plentyn wrth gwrs, mae terfyn ar adnoddau. O ddewis rhwng y ddau, byddai'n well gennyf weld athrawon mewn ystafell ddosbarth nac mewn brecwast.

Edrychaf ymlaen at newid meddwl Kirsty heddiw.

17:06

## Eluned Parrott [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I want to give some context as to the reasons why we think that universality is important in this instance. One of the reasons is the issue of stigma. One of the key themes that arose out of our work on the pupil deprivation grant was that many families that are eligible for free school meals do not claim them due to that stigma. Children themselves feel embarrassed about claiming free school meals, and they may even be bullied because of it, and parents may feel anxious about revealing their financial situation or the fact that they may be claiming benefits.

Back in 2011, we heard a debate by Joyce Watson in the Chamber calling for a fingerprint ID system of cashless payment to help poorer children, because some children would rather go hungry than be seen to claim a free school meal. However, this problem still exists, as the latest school census data for 2012-13 show. Twenty-five per cent of eligible pupils in Wales still do not claim their free school meals, even though they are entitled to them. In 2012, a study by the Institute for Social and Economic Research showed that more than a quarter of pupils entitled to free school meals take a packed lunch instead, due to the fear of being stigmatised. Not only does this have an impact in terms of the pupil deprivation grant and its take-up, it also means that many pupils from deprived backgrounds may be missing out on the benefits of a healthy free school meal, simply because of the way that this particular policy is designed and delivered.

Rwyf am roi rhywfaint o gyd-destun o ran y rhesymau pam y credwn fod darpariaeth i bob disgybl yn bwysig yn yr achos hwn. Un o'r rhesymau yw stigma. Un o'r themâu allweddol a gododd o'n gwaith ar y grant amddifadedd disgyblion oedd nad oedd llawer o deuluoedd sy'n gymwys i gael prydau ysgol am ddim yn eu hawlio oherwydd y stigma hwnnw. Mae plant eu hunain yn teimlo embaras ynghylch hawlio prydau ysgol am ddim, ac efallai y cânt eu bwlio hyd yn oed oherwydd hynny, a gall rhieni deimlo'n ofidus am ddatgelu eu sefyllfa ariannol neu'r ffaith eu bod yn hawlio budd-daliadau o bosibl.

Yn ôl yn 2011, clywsom ddadl gan Joyce Watson yn y Siambr yn galw am system adnabod olion bysedd o dalu heb arian er mwyn helpu plant tlawd, oherwydd byddai'n well gan rai plant fynd heb fwyd na chael eu gweld yn hawlio prydau ysgol am ddim. Fodd bynnag, mae'r broblem hon yn dal i fodoli, fel y dengys data diweddaraf y cyfrifiad o ysgolion ar gyfer 2012-13. Mae 25 y cant o ddisgyblion cymwys o hyd yng Nghymru yn peidio â hawlio eu prydau ysgol am ddim, er bod ganddynt hawl iddynt. Yn 2012, dangosodd astudiaeth gan y Sefydliad Ymchwil Economaidd a Chymdeithasol fod mwy na chwarter y disgyblion sydd â hawl i brydau ysgol am ddim yn mynd â phegyn bwyd yn lle hynny, am eu bod yn ofni cael eu stigmateiddio. Mae hyn nid yn unig yn cael effaith o ran y grant amddifadedd disgyblion a sut y caiff ei hawlio, mae hefyd yn golygu y gall llawer o ddisgyblion o gefndiroedd difreintiedig golli manteision prydau ysgol iach am ddim, a hynny oherwydd y ffordd y mae'r polisi penodol hwn yn cael ei gynllunio a'i ddarparu.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

In addition to those pupils who are eligible but do not claim, there are many children who are living in poverty in Wales and who fall just below the threshold for eligibility. In evidence to the Children and Young People Committee in November last year, Dr Victoria Winckler of the Bevan Foundation highlighted that only around 17% of children receive a free school meal, whereas the child poverty rate in Wales is around 30%. This is because eligibility is based on out-of-work benefits, and so many families on very low incomes miss out. An analysis by the Children's Society shows that there are 700,000 children of school age across the UK who are not eligible for free school meals, but whose family income, after they have paid their rent, is less than £10 per person per day. Paying for a meal at school would take up a substantial proportion of this—an average of around £2 per person per day.

The survey revealed cases where pupils were spotted stealing toast because they were so hungry, or where two girls were sharing a packed lunch in the toilets because only one had had enough money to buy food. This raises questions over whether resources are being allocated in the right way, and whether those most in need of support are receiving it.

However, even for those children from less deprived backgrounds, there is no guarantee that these pupils are given a healthy and nutritious packed lunch by their parents. Yes, the question of parental responsibility comes into this. It links into the question of whether or not the provision of a free school breakfast is adequate in this instance. One of the problems with the free school breakfast is that it is delivered 45 minutes before the school day starts. In those very chaotic homes, where parents are not adequately feeding their children, we are making the assumption that they will somehow, by miracle, take their children to school 45 minutes early every day so that they can collect a free school meal. I have to tell you that that is not likely to be the experience. When I take my children to their breakfast club, it is the organised working parents, who may have been able to provide a breakfast, who are delivering their children to that club.

The school food plan highlights that, in a survey of more than 400 headteachers, 91% agree that eating healthy, nutritious food improves attainment, as has been said. A similar number also agreed that it improves behaviour. Universal free school meals would end the issue of stigma and the culture of division between those who eat a packed lunch and those eating a school meal. It would also ensure that many children living in poverty who fall outside of the eligibility for free school meals would no longer be left out and could also enjoy the educational and health benefits that free school meals would bring. It also offers the potential for canteens to become more than just a place to eat. Lunch time can become a part of the school day—an opportunity to teach children about nutrition and to help nurture their social skills.

Yn ychwanegol at y disgyblion hynny sy'n gymwys ond nad ydynt yn hawlio, mae llawer o blant sy'n byw mewn tlodi yng Nghymru ac sy'n disgyn ychydig o dan y trothwy i fod yn gymwys. Mewn tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ym mis Tachwedd y llynedd, tynnodd Dr Victoria Winckler o Sefydliad Bevan sylw at y ffaith mai dim ond tua 17% o blant sy'n cael prydau ysgol am ddim, er bod cyfradd tlodi ymhlith plant yng Nghymru tua 30%. Y rheswm dros hyn yw bod cymhwysedd yn seiliedig ar fudd-daliadau diweithdra, ac felly mae llawer o deuluoedd ar incwm isel iawn ar eu colled. Dengys dadansoddiad gan Gymdeithas y Plant fod 700,000 o blant o oedran ysgol ledled y DU nad ydynt yn gymwys i gael prydau ysgol am ddim, ond y mae incwm eu haelwyd, ar ôl iddynt dalu eu rhent, yn llai na £10 y person y dydd. Byddai talu am bryd o fwyd yn yr ysgol yn mynd â chyfran sylweddol o hyn—tua £2 y person y dydd ar gyfartaledd.

Datgelodd yr arolwg achosion lle gwelwyd disgyblion yn dwyn tost am eu bod yn llwgu, neu lle roedd dwy ferch yn rhannu pecyn cinio yn y toiledau am mai dim ond un oedd wedi cael digon o arian i brynu bwyd. Mae hyn yn codi cwestiynau ynghylch a yw adnoddau yn cael eu dyrannu yn y ffordd iawn, ac a yw'r rhai y mae angen cymorth arnynt fwyaf yn ei gael.

Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed i'r plant hynny o gefndiroedd llai diffeintiedig, nid oes unrhyw sicrwydd bod y disgyblion hyn yn cael pecyn cinio iach a maethlon gan eu rhieni. Ydy, mae cwestiwn cyfrifoldeb rhiant yn codi o ran hyn. Mae'n gysylltiedig â'r cwestiwn a yw darparu brecwast ysgol am ddim yn ddigonol yn yr achos hwn. Un o'r problemau gyda'r brecwast ysgol am ddim yw ei fod yn cael ei gyflwyno 45 munud cyn i'r diwrnod ysgol ddechrau. Yn y cartrefi hynod ddi-drefn hynny, lle nad yw rhieni yn bwydo eu plant yn ddigon da, rydym yn rhagdybio y byddant rywsut, drwy wyrth, yn mynd â'u plant i'r ysgol 45 munud yn gynnar bob dydd fel eu bod yn gallu casglu pryd ysgol am ddim. Rhaid imi ddweud wrthyhch nad yw hynny'n debygol o ddigwydd. Pan fyddaf yn mynd â'm plant i'w clwb brecwast, y rhieni trefnus sy'n gweithio, a allai fod wedi gallu darparu brecwast, sy'n mynd â'u plant i'r clwb hwnnw.

Mae'r cynllun bwyd ysgol yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith, mewn arolwg o fwy na 400 o benaethiaid, fod 91% yn cytuno bod bwyta bwyd iach, maethlon yn gwella cyrhaeddiad, fel y dywedwyd. Cytunodd nifer debyg hefyd ei fod yn gwella ymddygiad. Byddai prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl yn rhoi terfyn ar y stigma a'r diwylliant o raniadau rhwng y rhai sy'n bwyta pecyn cinio a rhai sy'n bwyta cinio ysgol. Byddai hefyd yn sicrhau y byddai llawer o blant sy'n byw mewn tlodi nad ydynt yn gymwys i gael prydau ysgol am ddim yn cael eu cynnwys bellach ac y gallent hwythau hefyd fwynhau'r manteision o ran addysg ac iechyd sy'n deillio o brydau ysgol am ddim. Mae hefyd yn cynnig y potensial i ffreuturau fod yn fwy na lle i fwyta yn unig. Gall amser cinio ddod yn rhan o'r diwrnod ysgol—cyfle i addysgu plant am faeth ac i helpu i feithrin eu sgiliau cymdeithasol.

This potential was highlighted in the school food plan through the example of Carshalton Boys Sports College, which is on one of the largest estates in Europe with 40% of children on free school meals already. Ten years ago, only 4% of children managed to meet the academic benchmark of five GCSEs at grades A\* to C. The headteacher focused on making the canteen the centre of school life with a mission to nurture the whole child. Last year, 100% of its children got five GCSEs at grades A\* to C. Therefore, there is a clear link between this policy and improving attainment. I think that we need to focus on creating a healthier food culture in our schools that develops the whole person and makes the most of the opportunity to remove that stigma and give children access to the food that they need.

Amlygwyd y potensial hwn yn y cynllun bwyd ysgol drwy enghraifft Coleg Chwaraeon Bechgyn Carshalton, sydd ar un o'r ystadau mwyaf yn Ewrop gyda 40% o'r plant eisoes yn cael prydau ysgol am ddim. Ddeng mlynedd yn ôl, dim ond 4% o blant a lwyddodd i gyrraedd y meincnod academaidd o ennill pum TGAU gradd A\* i C. Canolbwyntiodd y pennaeth ar roi'r ffreutur yng nghanol bywyd yr ysgol â chenhadaeth i feithrin y plentyn cyfan. Y llynedd, enillodd 100% o'r plant bum TGAU gradd A\* i C. Felly, mae cysylltiad clir rhwng y polisi hwn a gwella cyrhaeddiad. Credaf fod angen inni ganolbwyntio ar greu diwylliant bwyd iachach yn ein hysgolion sy'n datblygu'r person cyfan ac yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfle i gael gwared ar y stigma a rhoi cyfle i blant gael y bwyd sydd ei angen arnynt.

17:11

## Jenny Rathbone [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

It has been a very interesting debate so far about a very complicated subject. Anything to do with food is about choice because nobody is into force-feeding anybody. It is very much about what is the best way of addressing a subject: that is, that many of our children come to school improperly prepared to learn. Some of them are able to benefit from free school breakfasts. The school food plan is an important document because it sheds some more light on this complex subject. It is important to recognise that Michael Gove seems to have come around from his previous cavalier position that academies could serve whatever they liked at lunch time to realise that food is an essential part of how we improve the educational attainment of pupils across the UK.

Bu'n ddadl ddiddorol iawn hyd yn hyn am bwnc cymhleth iawn. Mae unrhyw beth sy'n ymwneud â bwyd yn ymwneud â dewis gan nad oes neb am weld bwyd dan orfod. Mae a wnelo i raddau helaeth â'r ffordd orau o fynd i'r afael â phwnc: hynny yw, bod llawer o'n plant yn dod i'r ysgol heb gael eu paratoi'n briodol i ddsygu. Mae rhai ohonynt yn gallu cael brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol. Mae'r cynllun bwyd ysgol yn ddogfen bwysig am ei bod yn taflu ychydig mwy o oleuni ar y pwnc cymhleth hwn. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod yr ymddengys fod Michael Gove wedi cefnu ar ei safiad di-hid blaenorol y gallai academaïau weini beth bynnag y mynnont amser cinio ac wedi sylweddoli bellach bod bwyd yn rhan hanfodol o'r ffordd yr ydym yn gwella cyrhaeddiad addysgol disgyblion ledled y DU.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

What is interesting about the school food plan is that it identifies recommendations that we in Wales have already implemented. For example, recommendation 1 is to make cooking and food a curriculum entitlement from key stage 1 to key stage 3. Last week, I attended a wonderful lesson at Ysgol Gynradd Gymraeg Pen-y-groes in Pentwyn, which was around the daily nursery ritual of snack time. Each child was called to the table to choose a piece of fruit or vegetable and asked to name it in Welsh before they ate it. It was food that had been prepared in advance by some of those pupils. That, in itself, was an important lesson in celebrating the importance of fruit and vegetables. Their older peers have the benefit of ESDGC—otherwise known as 'education for sustainable development and global citizenship'. I am seeing many good examples of schools using this as a really good opportunity to get pupils to grow their own food. There are also eco-committees that are wonderful champions of peer-to-peer support, promoting the five a day. Therefore, Welsh students already have cooking and food as a curriculum entitlement.

Yr hyn sy'n ddiddorol am y cynllun bwyd ysgol yw ei fod yn nodi argymhellion yr ydym ni yng Nghymru eisoes wedi eu rhoi ar waith. Er enghraifft, mae argymhelliad 1 yn ymwneud â chynnig coginio a bwyd fel rhan o'r cwricwlwm o gyfnod allweddol 1 i gyfnod allweddol 3. Yr wythnos diwethaf, bûm mewn gwrs wych yn Ysgol Gynradd Gymraeg Pen-y-groes ym Mhentwyn, tua adeg byrbrydau sef defod feunyddiol y babanod. Cafodd pob plentyn ei allw at y bwrdd i ddewis darn o ffrwyth neu lysieuyn a gofynnwyd iddynt ei enwi yn Gymraeg cyn iddynt ei fwyta. Roedd yn fwyd a oedd wedi cael ei baratoi ymlaen llaw gan rai o'r disgyblion hynny. Roedd hynny, ynddo'i hun, yn wers bwysig i ddathlu pwysigrwydd ffrwythau a llysiau. Mae eu cyfoedion h'n yn manteisio ar ADCDF—sef 'addysg ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy a dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang'. Rwy'n gweld llawer o enghreifftiau da o ysgolion sy'n defnyddio hyn fel cyfle gwych i gael y disgyblion i dyfu eu bwyd eu hunain. Ceir hefyd eco-bwyllgorau sy'n ffordd wych o hyrwyddo cymorth rhwng cyfoedion, a hyrwyddo pump y dydd. Felly, i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru mae coginio a bwyd eisoes ar y cwricwlwm.

Recommendation 2 is to introduce food-based standards for all schools. We already have that in the Healthy Eating in Schools (Wales) Measure 2009, which is now mandatory in all our schools—and not before time.

Argymhelliad 2 yw y dylid cyflwyno safonau wedi'u seilio ar fwyd i bob ysgol. Mae hynny gennym eisoes ym Mesur Bwyta'n Iach mewn Ysgolion (Cymru) 2009, sydd bellach yn orfodol ym mhob un o'n hysgolion—a hen bryd hefyd.



Recommendation 3 is to kick-start increased take-up of good school food. I strongly support that and, as Eluned Parrott said, there is an issue that I am sure concerns us all around the stigma attached to free school meals. Although the take-up among primary school children is very good, the figures that were given to the Children and Young People Committee a couple of years ago showed that nearly 98% of primary school pupils took up those free school meals. I am sure that that is to do with the fact that no money changes hands in the dining room in primary schools, so there is no opportunity to be able to pinpoint which child has free school meals and which does not. When you come to secondary school, only 68% of children take up the free school meal to which they are entitled. That is something that we should reflect on seriously. It argues strongly the case for cards in the dining room to ensure that those who have had money put on their card via their free school meals entitlement are not identified as separate from those who are paying for the meal themselves.

Recommendations 4 and 5 are about setting up financially self-sufficient breakfast clubs. We already have our free breakfast scheme, but we have to be clear that, although it is fantastically important for many children, and does enable headteachers to identify children who they know are not getting proper nutrition and ensure that they get that breakfast, nevertheless it is not a universal scheme, because it is limited by the numbers of pupils that that school is able to get. You only have to see the queues going around the corner on the day when registration is opened up for the next year to understand just how big and important an element that is for many parents, often because of their childcare needs.

I have to say that I feel very strongly that a free school meal entitlement for all primary school children is a policy whose day will come, simply because of the pioneering work that has been done by a few boroughs around the country, which has shown just what the link is between that free school meal and educational attainment.

Argymhellid 3 yw y dylid annog mwy o blant i gael bwyd ysgol da. Cefnogaf hynny'n gryf ac, fel y dywedodd Eluned Parrott, cyfyd mater sy'n achos pryder inni i gyd mae'n siŵr o ran y stigma sy'n gysylltiedig â phrydau ysgol am ddim. Er bod y niferoedd ymhlith plant ysgol gynradd yn dda iawn, mae'r ffigurau a roddwyd i'r Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ychydig o flynyddoedd yn ôl yn dangos bod bron 98% o ddisgyblion ysgol gynradd wedi hawlio'r prydau ysgol hynny am ddim. Rwy'n siŵr bod hynny'n ymwneud â'r ffaith nad oes unrhyw arian yn newid dwylo yn yr ystafell fwyta mewn ysgolion cynradd, felly nid oes cyfle i allu nodi pa blentyn sy'n cael prydau ysgol am ddim a pha rai nad ydynt yn cael prydau ysgol am ddim. O ran ysgolion uwchradd, dim ond 68% o blant sy'n manteisio ar y prydau ysgol am ddim y mae ganddynt hawl iddynt. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y dylem ei ystyried o ddifrif. Mae'n ddadl gref dros gyflwyno cardiau yn yr ystafell fwyta er mwyn sicrhau na fydd modd gwahaniaethu rhwng y rhai sydd wedi cael arian ar eu cerdyn drwy eu hawl i brydau ysgol am ddim a'r rhai sy'n talu am y pryd eu hunain.

Mae argymhellion 4 a 5 yn ymwneud â sefydlu clybiau brechwast hunangynhaliol yn ariannol. Rydym eisoes wedi sefydlu ein cynllun brechwast am ddim, ond rhaid inni fod yn glir, er ei bod yn anhygoel o bwysig i lawer o blant, ac yn galluogi penaethiaid i nodi plant y gwyddant nad ydynt yn cael maeth priodol a sicrhau eu bod yn cael y brechwast hwnnw, serch hynny nid cynllun cyffredinol ydyw, am ei fod wedi ei gyfyngu gan nifer y disgyblion y gall yr ysgol honno eu cael i fynychu. Dim ond edrych ar y ciwiau yn mynd oddi amgylch y gornel ar y diwrnod pan fydd cofrestru ar agor ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf y mae angen ichi ei wneud er mwyn deall yn union pa mor bwysig yw'r elfen honno i rieni, yn aml oherwydd eu hanghenion gofal plant.

Rhaid imi ddweud fy mod yn teimlo'n gryf iawn bod hawl i brydau ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd yn bolisi a fydd yn cael ei dderbyn yn y pen draw, yn syml oherwydd y gwaith arloesol sydd wedi cael ei wneud gan rai bwrdeistrefi ledled y wlad, sydd wedi dangos yn glir beth yw'r cysylltiad rhwng y prydau ysgol am ddim a chyrrhaeddiad addysgol.

There are many studies that have shown that hunger adversely affects concentration and that well-nourished children perform better at school, with, for example, higher test scores, improved attendance and punctuality, better muscle co-ordination, a better memory, and are more adept at problem-solving activities. The trials in England have found that students in pilot areas were, on average, two months ahead of their peers elsewhere. Between 3% and 5% more children reached target levels in maths and English at key stage 1, and, in some cases, there was a bigger improvement than that following the introduction of a compulsory literacy hour back in 1998. Academic improvements were most marked among children from less affluent families. There was a 23% increase in the number of children eating vegetables at lunch time, and, conversely, there was an 18% drop in those going for the option of crisps. There are also wider benefits, as children can concentrate better and are less likely to disrupt their peers, which is a crucial point in terms of developing the learning strategy. There are clear and proven benefits to free school meals, and we need to look at how we can ensure that more children have access to free school meals in Wales than is currently the case.

I will just briefly mention the aspiration that has been brought forward to the Petitions Committee recently in terms of the banning of hot food vans in the vicinity of schools. That is another point that would tie in with our policy.

There are also clear benefits in terms of health, as poor diet and nutrition can contribute to poor child development, poor eating habits, or issues such as heart disease, diabetes and strokes in later life. In Wales, obesity is estimated to cost the NHS around £86 million a year, and around 1.5% of total healthcare spend. Sadly, Wales has the highest childhood obesity rates in the UK, with nearly three out of 10 children classed as overweight or obese. This is clearly a problem that school meals could go some way to address.

Mae llawer o astudiaethau wedi dangos bod eisiau bwyd yn effeithio'n andwyol ar y gallu i ganolbwyntio a bod plant sy'n cael maeth da yn perfformio'n well yn yr ysgol, er enghraifft, drwy sgoriau uwch mewn profion, gwell presenoldeb a phrydlondeb, gwell cydsymud cyhyrau, gwell cof, a'u bod yn fwy medrus wrth ymgymryd â gweithgareddau datrys problemau. Mae'r treialon yn Lloegr wedi canfod bod myfyrwyr mewn ardaloedd peilot, ar gyfartaledd, ddeufis o flaen eu cyfoedion mewn manau eraill. Cyrhaeddodd rhwng 3% a 5% yn fwy o blant lefelau targed mewn mathemateg a Saesneg yng nghyfnod allweddol 1, ac, mewn rhai achosion, cafwyd mwy o welliant na'r hyn a welwyd ar ôl cyflwyno awr lythrennedd orfodol yn ôl yn 1998. Ymhlith plant o deuluoedd llai cefnog y gwelwyd y gwelliannau academaidd mwyaf. Cafwyd cynnydd o 23% yn nifer y plant a oedd yn bwyta llysiau yn ystod amser cinio, ac, i'r gwrthwyneb, gwelwyd gostyngiad o 18% yn y niferoedd a oedd yn dewis creision. Ceir manteision ehangach hefyd, gan y gall plant ganolbwyntio'n well, maent yn llai tebygol o darfu ar eu cyfoedion, sy'n bwynt hollbwysig o ran datblygu'r strategaeth ddysgu. Mae manteision amlwg a phroffedig yn gysylltiedig â phrydau ysgol am ddim, ac mae angen inni ystyried sut y gallwn sicrhau bod mwy o blant yn cael cyfle i gael prydau ysgol am ddim yng Nghymru nag sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

Soniaf ychydig am y cais a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor Deisebau yn ddiweddar i wahardd faniau bwyd poeth yng nghyffiniau ysgolion. Mae hynny'n bwynt arall a fyddai'n cyd-fynd â'n polisi.

Ceir hefyd fanteision amlwg o ran iechyd, gan y gall deiet a maeth gwael gyfrannu at ddatblygiad gwael plant, arferion bwyta gwael, neu broblemau megis defyd y galon, diabetes a strôc yn ddiweddarach mewn bywyd. Yng Nghymru, amcangyfrifir bod gordewdra yn costio tua £86 miliwn y flwyddyn i'r GIG, a thua 1.5% o gyfanswm y gwariant ar ofal iechyd. Yn anffodus, gan Gymru y mae'r cyfraddau gordewdra uchaf ymhlith plant yn y DU, gyda bron dri o bob 10 plentyn yn cael eu hystyried yn rhy drwm neu'n ordew. Mae hyn yn amlwg yn broblem lle y gallai prydau ysgol fynd dipyn o'r ffordd i'w datrys.

Correspondence that we have received from Public Health Wales states that, while it has no formal policy position on this matter, universal free school meals for primary pupils is a policy that 'would merit further exploration', with more thorough evaluation in a Welsh context. The health benefits of universal free school meals were also examined in the school food plan in relation to Finland, as has previously been referenced. Although 30 years ago Finland was one of the world's unhealthiest nations, this has changed dramatically through the use of measures that tackle ill health from its cultural roots. Alongside other initiatives, Finland provides free school meals to every pupil, and 8% of its total education budget is spent on high-quality food. There is a great deal of support for the principle of universal free school meals, and this warrants investigation as to how we can be more ambitious in Wales and widen the scope of children who benefit from a healthy meal at lunch time. Following the announcement in England, the chief executive of the Children's Society stated that:

'Today's announcement making free school meals available to 1.4 million more children marks an historic step forward in the fight against child poverty.'

Barnardo's called the move a progressive measure

'to ensure better access to healthy food, which is so vital to their ability to study effectively.'

and further said that:

'By making school meals free for all infant pupils, more children from...working families will be supported to learn and grow by accessing a healthy lunch.'

Children in Wales has long campaigned for universal free school meal provision for all children and young people, and, while it acknowledges the challenges in terms of budgets, it urges the Welsh Government to consider how we can ensure that more children in Wales have access to a free school meal than is presently the case. We hope that the Minister will consider some of the comments that have been made in the Chamber today, and consider what improvements can be made to the free school meal regime in Wales to ensure that as many pupils as possible can enjoy the proven health, education and social benefits that it would bring.

Mewn gohebiaeth a gawsom gan Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru, nododd, er nad oes ganddo safbwynt polisi ffurfiol ar y mater hwn, y byddai prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl cynradd yn bolisi a fyddai'n haeddu cael ei ystyried ymhellach, gyda gwerthusiad mwy trylwyr yng nghydestun Cymru. Ystyriwyd manteision prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl o ran iechyd hefyd yn y cynllun bwyd ysgol mewn perthynas â'r Ffindir, fel y cyfeiriwyd ato eisoes. Er bod y Ffindir yn un o'r gwledydd lleiaf iach yn y byd 30 mlynedd yn ôl, mae hyn wedi newid yn ddramatig drwy ddefnyddio mesurau sy'n mynd i'r afael ag afiechyd wrth ei wreiddiau diwylliannol. Ochr yn ochr â mentrau eraill, mae'r Ffindir yn darparu prydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl, ac mae 8% o'i chyllideb addysg yn cael ei wario ar fwyd o safon uchel. Mae cryn dipyn o gefnogaeth i'r egwyddor o brydau ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl, ac mae hyn yn haeddu cael ei ystyried ymhellach o ran sut y gallwn fod yn fwy uchelgeisiol yng Nghymru ac ehangu cwrpas y plant sy'n cael budd o bryd iach amser cinio. Yn dilyn y cyhoeddiad yn Lloegr, nododd prif weithredwr Cymdeithas y Plant fod:

y cyhoeddiad heddiw ynglŷn â darparu prydau bwyd ysgol am ddim i 1.4 miliwn yn fwy o blant yn gam hanesyddol ymlaen yn y frwydr yn erbyn tlodi plant.

Yn ôl Barnardo's, roedd yn fesur blaengar

er mwyn sicrhau gwell mynediad at fwyd iach, sydd mor hanfodol i'w gallu i astudio'n effeithiol.

a dywedodd hefyd:

Drwy ddarparu prydau bwyd ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl oed babanod, bydd mwy o blant o ... deuluoedd sy'n gweithio yn cael eu cefnogi i ddysgu a thyfu drwy fanteisio ar ginio iach.

Mae Plant yng Nghymru wedi ymgyrchu'n hir dros ddarparu prydau ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn a pherson ifanc, ac, er ei fod yn cydnabod yr heriau o ran cyllidebau, mae'n annog Llywodraeth Cymru i ystyried sut y gallwn sicrhau bod mwy o blant yng Nghymru yn cael cyfle i gael prydau ysgol am ddim nag sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried rhai o'r sylwadau a wnaed yn y Siambr heddiw, ac yn ystyried pa welliannau y gellir eu gwneud i'r drefn prydau ysgol am ddim yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau y gall cymaint o ddisgyblion â phosibl gael y manteision profedig o ran iechyd ac addysg a'r manteision cymdeithasol a fyddai'n deillio o hynny.

17:21

## Angela Burns [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Well, there are four areas that I would like to try to cover briefly in my five minutes. I would like to talk about the evidence, very briefly; free school meals, stigma and the results; infants versus parents; and more creative ways of spending the money. I will start off by saying that we will be abstaining on this entire motion and abstaining on all of the amendments, although, if I were going to support the motion, I would support your amendments, Simon Thomas, because they are absolutely spot on; I agree with almost everything that Simon Thomas said.

Wel, mae pedwar maes yr hoffwn geisio ymdrin â hwy yn gryno yn y pum munud sydd gennyf. Hoffwn sôn am y dystiolaeth, yn fyr iawn; prydau ysgol am ddim, stigma a'r canlyniadau; babanod yn erbyn rhieni; a ffyrdd mwy creadigol o wario'r arian. Dechreuaf drwy ddweud y byddwn yn ymatal ar y cynnig cyfan ac yn ymatal ar bob un o'r gwelliannau, er, pe bawn yn cefnogi'r cynnig, byddwn yn cefnogi eich gwelliannau chi, Simon Thomas, oherwydd eu bod yn hollol gywir; cytunaf â bron popeth a ddywedodd Simon Thomas.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

My researcher and I had the funnest of fun—we actually went and read all of the research behind the school food plan, and it is not conclusive; I could rip it apart, but, honestly, you would all die of boredom. However, let us be very truthful: there is an awful lot of evidence here that is very mixed. There are researchers and evidence bases that say that there is some benefit, and there are a lot of people who say that there is no benefit. There are people who say, as Simon, I think, identified, that ICT is one way of helping children to move forward, then there are those who would say, 'No, no, no; it's got to be all about the food'.

However, if we go through it, one of the more negative things that come out is that it can be very difficult to follow through consistent effects in well-nourished children. Let us be honest here: an awful lot of our children in our schools in Wales are well nourished. We are not wall-to-wall with badly nourished children. We have a number of children who need help, but a universal benefit that aims to give good food to children who already have a very adequate diet, and parents who are able to ensure that they have an adequate diet, is not backed up in the research that is so carefully edited into the school food plan produced by the UK Government.

It lacks scientific credibility, because the measurement tools were not very accurate. I just want to give you one example. One of the articles used was called 'Hunger in children in the United States: potential behavioural and emotional correlates'—from 1998, so it is really up to date. The report lacks scientific credibility, because the measurement tools were not very accurate or appropriate. For example, measures of hunger were based on parental opinion. Neither was the children's behaviour and academic performance directly observed by the researchers. Essentially, the experiment associates parental assumptions about the child's hunger with parental assumptions of the child's behaviour in class, which is not an ideal study, I am sure that you would agree, on which to base Government policy.

So, the reason why we are going to abstain is that there may well be legs in your general contention, but, because you are bringing it forward in this manner and asking us to support a motion that is based on scientific evidence that, to be truthful, you could drive a coach and horses through, it is not something that the Welsh Conservatives could support.

Cafodd fy ymchwilydd a minnau dipyn o hwyl a sbri— aethom ati i ddarllen yr holl ymchwil sy'n sail i'r cynllun bwyd ysgol, ac nid yw'n dystiolaeth bendant; gallwn ei chwalu'n ddigon hawdd, ond, a dweud y gwir, byddai pawb yn diflasu'n llwyr. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni fod yn onest iawn: mae llawer iawn o dystiolaeth yma sy'n gymysg iawn. Ceir ymchwilydd a sylfeini tystiolaeth sy'n dweud bod rhywfaint o fudd, a llawer o bobl sy'n dweud nad oes unrhyw fudd. Mae rhai pobl sy'n dweud, fel y nododd Simon, fe gredaf, fod TGCh yn un ffordd o helpu plant i symud ymlaen, yna mae pobl eraill yn dweud, 'Na, na, na, y bwyd sy'n hollbwysig'.

Fodd bynnag, os awn drwyddi, un o'r pethau mwyaf negyddol sy'n dod i'r amlwg yw y gall fod yn anodd iawn sicrhau effeithiau cyson mewn plant sy'n cael maeth da. Gadewch inni fod yn onest o ran hyn: mae llawer iawn o'n plant yn ein hysgolion yng Nghymru yn cael maeth da. Nid yw ein plant i gyd yn cael maeth gwael. Mae gennym nifer o blant y mae angen cymorth arnynt, ond nid yw darpariaeth gyffredinol sy'n anelu at roi bwyd da i blant sydd eisoes yn cael deiet digonol iawn, a rhieni sydd yn gallu sicrhau eu bod yn cael deiet digonol, yn cael ei hategu yn yr ymchwil sydd wedi cael ei golygu mor ofalus yn y cynllun bwyd ysgol a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU.

Nid oes ganddo hygredded gwyddonol, gan nad oedd yr offer mesur yn gywir iawn. Hoffwn roi un enghraifft ichi. Un o'r erthyglau a ddefnyddiwyd oedd 'Hunger in children in the United States: potential behavioural and emotional correlates'—o 1998, felly mae'n gyfoes iawn. Nid oes gan yr adroddiad hygredded gwyddonol, gan nad yw'r offer mesur yn gywir iawn nac yn briodol. Er enghraifft, roedd mesurau o eisiau bwyd yn seiliedig ar farn rhieni. Ac nid arsylwyd ar ymddygiad na pherfformiad academaidd y plant yn uniongyrchol gan yr ymchwilydd ychwaith. Yn y bôn, mae'r arbrawf yn cysylltu rhagdybiaethau rhieni ynglŷn ag eisiau bwyd mewn plentyn â rhagdybiaethau rhieni ynglŷn ag ymddygiad y plentyn yn y dosbarth, nad yw'n astudiaeth ddelfrydol, y byddech yn cytuno mae'n siŵr gennyf, i seilio polisi'r Llywodraeth arni.

Felly, y rheswm pam y byddwn yn ymatal yw, er bod peth gwirionedd yn eich haeriad cyffredinol o bosibl, ond, gan eich bod yn ei gyflwyno yn y modd hwn ac yn gofyn inni gefnogi cynnig sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth wyddonol, y gellir, a dweud y gwir, ei chwalu'n hawdd, nad yw'n rhywbeth y gallai'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ei gefnogi.

I would like to touch on a couple of other subjects very briefly. A number of people have stood up and talked about the stigma of free school meals, which absolutely exists. They have also talked about the impact of free school meals on results. However, the motion before us is not about providing free school meals for anybody other than infants, so we have wandered way off the subject in this debate. If we want to come back and talk about providing a free school meal to somebody sitting their GCSEs, then that might well be a completely different debate. That is an age when it would perhaps be very good to try to offer additional support. A lot of people have talked today about the results base, the evidence base, the free school meals base, and we are talking there about people who are not part of this debate. We are talking in this debate about some very young children being given a hot meal at school.

That brings me to my third issue, which is parental responsibility. I think that Simon touched on this in a bit of detail. We cannot take everything away from parents. We must remember that those children who require a free school meal are not 100% of our school population, they are not 100% of our infants, and those parents who can, should. Why? Because it frees up money, time and Government resources to help those parents who cannot.

I see that my time is drawing to a close, Deputy Presiding Officer, so I will just make this final point. Any moneys that might come from the plan in England should be spent on ensuring that all those children who should be getting free school meals today, because they need them, are reached in creative ways, rather than taking the easy option of an expensive universal benefit.

17:26

### **Julie Morgan** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

This debate does give us the opportunity to discuss the importance of good nutritious food for children in Wales and to evaluate what we have been able to do so far. The Liberal Democrat motion refers to the school food plan, and I have looked briefly at the school food plan, which is designed for England and is not based in the context of what has already been achieved and carried out here in Wales. Jenny Rathbone has already listed the recommendations, and showed that Wales has already put a lot of them into place.

Hoffwn sôn ychydig am un neu ddau beth arall. Mae nifer o bobl wedi sefyll ar eu traed ac wedi sôn am y stigma sy'n gysylltiedig â phrydau ysgol am ddim, sydd, yn wir, yn bodoli. Maent hefyd wedi sôn am effaith prydau ysgol am ddim ar ganlyniadau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r cynnig ger ein bron yn ymwneud â darparu prydau bwyd ysgol am ddim i unrhyw un heblaw am fabanod, felly rydym wedi crwydro eithaf tipyn oddi ar bwnc y ddadl hon. Os ydym am ddod yn ôl a thrafod darparu prydau ysgol am ddim i rywun sy'n sefyll ei arholiadau TGAU, yna mae'n ddigon posibl y byddai hynny'n ddadl hollol wahanol. Dyna'r oedran pan fyddai'n syniad da iawn ceisio cynnig cymorth ychwanegol. Mae llawer o bobl wedi sôn heddiw am y sylfaen ganlyniadau, y sylfaen dystiolaeth, y sylfaen prydau ysgol am ddim, ac rydym yn sôn yn hyn o beth am bobl nad ydynt yn rhan o'r ddadl hon. Rydym yn sôn yn y ddadl hon am rai plant bach iawn yn cael pryd poeth yn yr ysgol.

Daw hynny â mi at fy nhrydydd mater, sef cyfrifoldeb rhieni. Credaf i Simon fanylu ar hyn. Ni allwn fynd â phopeth i ffwrdd oddi wrth y rhieni. Rhaid inni gofio nad yw'r plant hynny sydd angen prydau ysgol am ddim yn cyfrif am 100% o'n poblogaeth ysgol, nid ydynt yn cyfrif am 100% o'n babanod, a dylai'r rhieni hynny sy'n gallu ei wneud, wneud hynny. Pam? Am ei fod yn rhyddhau arian, amser ac adnoddau'r Llywodraeth i helpu'r rhieni hynny na allant wneud hynny.

Gwela'f fod fy amser yn dod i ben, Ddirprwy Lywydd, felly rwyf am wneud y pwynt olaf hwn. Dylai unrhyw arian sy'n deillio o'r cynllun yn Lloegr gael ei wario i sicrhau ein bod yn cyrraedd yr holl blant hynny a ddylai fod yn cael prydau ysgol am ddim heddiw, oherwydd mae eu hangen arnynt, mewn ffyrdd creadigol, yn hytrach na dewis yr opsiwn hawdd o ddarpariaeth ddrud i bob plentyn.

Mae'r ddadl hon yn rhoi cyfle inni drafod pwysigrwydd bwyd maethlon a da i blant yng Nghymru ac i werthuso'r hyn yr ydym wedi gallu ei wneud hyd yn hyn. Mae cynnig y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cyfeirio at y cynllun bwyd ysgol, ac rwyf wedi edrych yn fras ar y cynllun bwyd ysgol, sydd wedi'i gynllunio ar gyfer Lloegr ac nid yw'n seiliedig ar gyd-destun yr hyn sydd eisoes wedi ei gyflawni ac wedi'i gynnal yma yng Nghymru. Mae Jenny Rathbone eisoes wedi rhestru'r argymhellion, ac wedi dangos bod llawer ohonynt eisoes wedi cael eu rhoi ar waith yng Nghymru.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I think that everybody could say that they would like all infant schoolchildren to receive a hot lunch, but I do think that this has to be considered in the context of the Welsh situation. It is very important to bear in mind that 46,262 children are already receiving a free meal in school; they are receiving a free breakfast. The free school breakfast initiative has been a very pioneering and imaginative policy brought in by the Welsh Labour Government, and 79% of maintained primary schools are providing free breakfasts. I think that it is a great shame that it is not 100%, because I am sure that, in the 21% of schools that do not provide free breakfasts, there would be bound to be children who would benefit from a free breakfast. It would be interesting to know why some schools have not taken advantage of being able to offer free breakfasts. I am very pleased that virtually all of the primary schools in my constituency of Cardiff North have taken up free breakfasts, but there are some issues there. There are not enough places, for example, at some breakfast clubs for all of the children. There have also been problems of a lack of accommodation; I know of one school in Cardiff North where there is not enough room to accommodate all of the schoolchildren who would like to have a free breakfast. So, there are some practical issues. I do not know whether it would be possible for the local authorities to make an effort to try to address them, as they now have the responsibility for continuing the free school breakfast provision. However, I think that it is a very important policy initiative from the Labour Government that has been very pioneering.

We have heard a lot today about how important it is to have a good breakfast for the child's ability to concentrate, about the known benefits—you need to eat before you study in order to help you study—and the negative outcomes of skipping breakfast. I can think of lots of children who do not have any breakfast at all; you cannot get them to take breakfast. I did have some problems with my own children, I have to say. They would not eat breakfast, and I wish that there had been a school breakfast available at that time, because I think that would have been a huge help. We know that not eating breakfast is significantly more common among children who are obese and that, if you do not eat breakfast, you are much more likely to become obese. I think that it is very important that these lessons should be learned.

The importance of having a good breakfast does not just hold good for the time that children are in school, but for the long term. It is important that eating food is not an activity that is cut off from everything else that you do in school and from all the ways that you learn in school. It is an opportunity to give children information about the context of where you get food and the importance of nutrition. It is important that the children can see where the food comes from and that they can link the food to where it is grown. I found it encouraging to go around the schools in my constituency to see how many of them are growing vegetables; a couple of schools are keeping chickens. A lot of this is done via the foundation phase, therefore it is done at a very early stage. It is a tremendous advantage that that is being done, and it will be a great help to those children for their future.

Credaf y gallai pawb ddweud y byddent am weld pob un o'r babanod mewn ysgol yn cael cinio poeth, ond credaf fod yn rhaid i hyn gael ei ystyried yng nghyd-destun sefyllfa Cymru. Mae'n bwysig iawn cofio bod 46,262 o blant eisoes yn cael pryd am ddim yn yr ysgol; maent yn cael brecwast am ddim. Mae'r fenter brecwast ysgol am ddim wedi bod yn bolisi arloesol a llawn dychymyg a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur Cymru, ac mae 79% o ysgolion cynradd a gynhelir yn darparu brecwast am ddim. Credaf ei bod yn drueni mawr nad yw wedi cyrraedd 100%, oherwydd rwy'n siŵr, yn yr 21% o ysgolion nad ydynt yn darparu brecwast am ddim, yn sicr, y byddai plant a fyddai'n cael budd o gael brecwast am ddim. Byddai'n ddiddorol gwybod pam nad yw rhai ysgolion wedi manteisio ar y cyfle i gynnig brecwast am ddim. Rwy'n falch iawn bod bron pob un o'r ysgolion cynradd yn fy etholaeth i, sef Gogledd Caerdydd, yn cynnig brecwast am ddim, ond cyfyd rhai problemau yn hynny o beth. Nid oes digon o leodd, er enghraifft, mewn rhai clybiau brecwast i bob plentyn. Mae problemau wedi codi hefyd o ran diffyg lle; gwn am un ysgol yng Ngogledd Caerdydd, lle nad oes digon o le i ddarparu ar gyfer pob plentyn ysgol a fyddai'n hoffi cael brecwast am ddim. Felly, cyfyd rhai problemau ymarferol. Ni wn a fyddai'n bosibl i'r awdurdodau lleol wneud ymdrech i geisio mynd i'r afael â hwy, gan mai hwy sy'n gyfrifol bellach am barhau i ddarparu brecwast ysgol am ddim. Fodd bynnag, credaf ei bod yn fenter polisi bwysig iawn gan y Llywodraeth Lafur sydd wedi bod yn arloesol iawn.

Rydym wedi clywed cryn dipyn heddiw am bwysigrwydd cael brecwast da o ran gallu'r plentyn i ganolbwyntio, am y manteision hysbys—mae angen ichi fwyta cyn ichi astudio er mwyn helpu i astudio—a chanlyniadau negyddol colli brecwast. Gallaf feddwl am lawer o blant nad ydynt yn cael brecwast o gwbl; ni allwch eu cael i fwyta brecwast. Cefais rai problemau gyda'm plant fy hun, rhaid imi ddweud. Ni fyddent yn bwyta brecwast, a byddai wedi bod yn braf pe bai brecwast ysgol ar gael ar y pryd, oherwydd credaf y byddai hynny wedi bod o gymorth mawr. Gwyddom fod peidio â bwyta brecwast yn llawer mwy cyffredin ymhlith plant sy'n ordew ac, os nad ydych yn bwyta brecwast, eich bod yn llawer mwy tebygol o fynd yn ordew. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn bod y gwersi hyn yn cael eu dysgu.

Mae pwysigrwydd cael brecwast da nid y unig yn wir am y cyfnod y mae plant yn yr ysgol, ond yn yr hirdymor. Mae'n bwysig nad yw cael bwyd yn weithgaredd sy'n cael ei wahanu oddi wrth bopeth arall yr ydych yn ei wneud yn yr ysgol ac oddi wrth yr holl ffyrdd yr ydych yn dysgu yn yr ysgol. Mae'n gyfle i roi gwybodaeth am gyd-destun lle rydych yn cael bwyd a phwysigrwydd maeth i blant. Mae'n bwysig bod y plant yn gallu gweld o ble y daw'r bwyd ac y gallant gysylltu'r bwyd â'r man lle y caiff ei dyfu. Roedd yn galonogol mynd o amgylch yr ysgolion yn fy etholaeth i weld faint ohonynt sy'n tyfu llysiau; mae ychydig o ysgolion yn cadw ieir. Mae llawer o hyn yn cael ei wneud drwy'r cyfnod sylfaen, felly mae'n cael ei wneud ar gam cynnar iawn. Mae'n fantais aruthrol bod hynny'n cael ei wneud, a bydd yn help mawr i'r plant hynny ar gyfer eu dyfodol.

A lot of people have mentioned the issue of free school dinners and how the take-up is low, but, actually, the take-up of school dinners as a whole is slow, and it is worrying that children and parents prefer a packed lunch when it is not an issue of affordability, and that children who are able to get free school dinners also often take a packed lunch to school. All the analysis of those packed lunches that are taken to school on the whole show that they do not have the needed nutrition in them and that it is often not advantageous at all for children to be eating them. That is another issue that needs to be tackled. So, I think that this is a very important issue.

Mae llawer o bobl wedi sôn am ginio ysgol am ddim a'r ffaith bod y niferoedd yn isel, ond, mewn gwirionedd, mae'r nifer sy'n cael cinio ysgol yn isel yn gyffredinol, ac mae'n achos pryder ei bod yn well gan blant a rhieni fynd â pheycyn cinio pan nad yw'n fater o fforddiadwyedd, a bod plant sy'n gallu cael cinio ysgol am ddim hefyd yn aml yn mynd â pheycyn bwyd i'r ysgol. Mae'r holl ddadansoddiadau o'r pecynnau cinio hynny y mae plant yn mynd â hwy i'r ysgol yn dangos nad ydynt yn cynnwys y maeth angenrheidiol ar y cyfan ac nad yw'n aml yn fanteisiol o gwbl bod plant yn eu bwyta. Mae hynny'n fater arall y mae angen mynd i'r afael ag ef. Felly, credaf fod hyn yn fater pwysig iawn.

17:31

## **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Galwaf ar y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau, Huw Lewis.

I call on the Minister for Education and Skills, Huw Lewis.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:31

## **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*Y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau / The Minister for Education and Skills*

I will begin my contribution here today by thanking the Liberal Democrats for bringing this debate to the Chamber and for the opportunity it affords us all to discuss the importance of high-quality and nutritious food in our schools. However, I am afraid that I cannot support their motion or the amendments put to it.

Dechreuaf fy nghyfraniad yma heddiw drwy ddiolch i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am gyflwyno'r ddaol hon i'r Siambr ac am y cyfle y mae'n ei roi inni i gyd i drafod pwysigrwydd bwyd maethlon o safon uchel yn ein hysgolion. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf gefnogi eu cynnig na'r gwelliannau iddo, mae arnaf ofn.

There is no argument that healthy eating has a positive impact on children's health and development; of course it does. It clearly contributes to educational attainment and helps in the battle against obesity, heart disease and diabetes. Lessons learned at a young age about healthy eating stay with a child as they grow from childhood into adulthood, and that is why we have developed innovative policies, such as the free breakfast initiative, why we took action through the Healthy Eating in Schools (Wales) Measure 2009 and why we introduced flexible charging for meals in our schools. These policies demonstrate clearly this Welsh Government's commitment to the promotion of healthy eating and its key relationship to driving up standards in the classroom.

Nid oes dadl bod bwyta'n iach yn cael effaith gadarnhaol ar iechyd a datblygiad plant; wrth gwrs bod hynny'n wir. Mae'n cyfrannu'n amlwg at gyrhaeddiad addysgol ac yn helpu yn y frwydr yn erbyn gordewdra, clefyd y galon a diabetes. Mae gwersi a ddysgwyd yn ifanc am fwyta'n iach yn aros gyda phlentyn wrth iddynt dyfu o blentynod i fod yn oedolion, a dyna pam ein bod wedi datblygu polisiau arloesol, megis y fenter brechwast am ddim, pam y cymerwyd camau drwy Fesur Bwyta'n Iach mewn Ysgolion (Cymru) 2009 a pham y cyflwynwyd taliadau hyblyg am brydau yn ein hysgolion. Mae'r polisiau hyn yn dangos yn glir ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru i hybu bwyta'n iach a'i cysylltiad allweddol â gwella safonau yn yr ystafell ddsbarth.

Allow me the opportunity to clarify the financial situation that has surrounded the build-up to this debate. Wales is not receiving £62 million of Barnett consequential funding for free school meals in 2014-15. It is simply not so. The money identified in England to fund free school meals in primary schools is made up, in part, of existing money that other Whitehall departments have given up to fund that initiative. The truth is that Wales only receives a Barnett consequential in relation to this in terms of new money identified, which is around £26 million, which is nowhere near the £62 million quoted in the motion. I am now working closely with officials—

Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle i egluro'r sefyllfa ariannol sydd wedi bod ynghlwm wrth y ddaol hon. Nid yw Cymru yn cael £62 miliwn o arian canlyniadol Barnett ar gyfer prydau ysgol am ddim yn 2014-15. Nid yw'n hynny'n wir. Mae'r arian a nodwyd yn Lloegr i ariannu prydau ysgol am ddim mewn ysgolion cynradd yn cynnwys, yn rhannol, arian y mae adrannau eraill yn Whitehall wedi ei ildio i ariannu'r fenter. Y gwir yw mai dim ond mewn perthynas ag arian newydd a nodwyd y bydd Cymru yn cael swm canlyniadol o dan Barnett, sef tua £26 miliwn, nad yw'n agos at y swm o £62 miliwn a nodwyd yn y cynnig. Rwyf wrthi'n gweithio'n agos gyda swyddogion—

17:33

## **Peter Black** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

If you look at the motion, you will see that it is actually for the two years of 2014-16, which would make £52 million.

Os edrychych ar y cynnig, gwelwch ei fod yn cynnwys y ddwy flwyddyn o 2014-16 mewn gwirionedd, a fyddai'n gwneud cyfanswm o £52 miliwn.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Okay. I will return to the figures in a moment, because there is more than a deal of sleight of hand in terms of the way that the Welsh Liberal Democrats have put this motion together this afternoon.

I am now working closely with officials to decide how funding can be utilised to greatest impact and I will make an announcement in due course. However, I will state here and now that I do not believe that universal provision of free lunches to infant-age children is the best use of this money. In part, this is the case because the landscape is different here in Wales. Again, I do not have to remind colleagues that Wales has led the way in the UK in terms of universal meal provision by offering free breakfast to all pupils in primary schools from 2004. The School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013 now places local authorities under a legal duty to ensure that a free school breakfast is provided in any primary school where there is demand. That translates in the last academic year into 79% of maintained primary schools in Wales offering a free breakfast, with over 46,000 children taking up the offer on census day 2012.

From April 2013, the investment through the revenue support grant for free school breakfasts was a not inconsiderable £14.7 million. This means that, unlike their peers in England, children in Wales already get the healthy, nutritious start they need for the school day. This investment is, of course, built on solid foundations. Estyn research has identified that having breakfast at school has a positive impact on pupils' health and wellbeing, behaviour, learning and social skills. We also know that a wholesome breakfast has been associated with improved nutritional status. According to the recent research by Cardiff University, this is particularly true for children from disadvantaged backgrounds.

This policy is not a superficial one implemented to win votes; it is a policy that is fundamentally based on what we consider is best, on the basis of evidence, for the children of Wales. This is where our priority lies. Of course, we believe in providing free school lunches to those who need them most and we encourage those eligible in Wales to take them up. Free school lunches are an important aspect of our anti-poverty agenda. On that census day in 2012, over 62,000 children took up the offer of a free school lunch. It plays an important part in helping families with the cost of living. However, it is my firm belief that, following yesterday's Estyn annual report, any additional funding that my department might now receive for 2014-15 could, and indeed should, be put to more effective use than that outlined by the Lib Dems in this debate.

O'r gorau. Dychwelaf at y ffigurau yn y man, oherwydd mae'r ffordd y mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi llunio'r cynnig hwn y prynhawn yma yn eithaf ystrywgar.

Rwyf wrthi'n gweithio'n agos gyda swyddogion i benderfynu sut y gellir defnyddio'r arian er mwyn sicrhau'r effaith fwyaf bosibl a gwnaf gyhoeddiad maes o law. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn datgan yma nad yw darparu cinio am ddim i bob plentyn oed babanod yn cynnig y defnydd gorau o'r arian hwn, yn fy marn i. Yn rhannol, mae hyn yn wir am fod amgylchiadau yn wahanol yma yng Nghymru. Unwaith eto, nid oes rhaid imi atgoffa cyd-Aelodau bod Cymru wedi arwain y ffordd yn y DU o ran darparu prydau i bob disgybl drwy gynnig brecwast am ddim i bob disgybl mewn ysgolion cynradd o 2004. Mae Deddf Safonau a Threfniadaeth Ysgolion (Cymru) 2013 bellach yn rhoi dyletswydd gyfreithiol ar awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod brecwast ysgol am ddim yn cael ei ddarparu mewn unrhyw ysgol gynradd lle bo galw. Yn ystod y flwyddyn academaidd ddiwethaf mae hynny'n cyfateb i 79% o ysgolion cynradd a gynhelir yng Nghymru sy'n cynnig brecwast am ddim, gyda thros 46,000 o blant yn derbyn y cynnig ar ddiwrnod cyfrifiad 2012.

O fis Ebrill 2013, roedd y buddsoddiad drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw ar gyfer brecwast ysgol am ddim yn swm eithaf sylweddol sef £14.7 miliwn. Mae hyn yn golygu, yn wahanol i'w cyfoedion yn Lloegr, fod plant yng Nghymru eisoes yn cael pryd iach a maethlon sydd ei angen arnynt ar gyfer y diwrnod ysgol. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwn, wrth gwrs, wedi'i adeiladu ar sylfeini cadarn. Mae ymchwil Estyn wedi nodi bod cael brecwast yn yr ysgol yn cael effaith gadarnhaol ar iechyd a lles, ymddygiad dysgu a sgiliau cymdeithasol disgyblion. Gwyddom hefyd fod brecwast iach wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â statws maeth gwell. Yn ôl yr ymchwil ddiweddar gan Brifysgol Caerdydd, mae hyn yn arbennig o wir am blant o gefndiroedd difreintiedig.

Nid yw'r polisi hwn yn un arwynebol a roddwyd ar waith i ennill pleidleisiau; mae'n bolisi sy'n gwbl seiliedig ar yr hyn sydd orau, yn ein barn ni, ar sail tystiolaeth, i blant Cymru. Dyma ein blaenoriaeth. Wrth gwrs, credwn mewn darparu cinio ysgol am ddim i'r rhai sydd ei angen fwyaf ac rydym yn annog y rhai sy'n gymwys yng Nghymru i'w hawlio. Mae cinio ysgol am ddim yn agwedd bwysig ar ein hagenda ar wrthdlodi. Ar ddiwrnod y cyfrifiad yn 2012, roedd dros 62,000 o blant wedi derbyn y cynnig o ginio ysgol am ddim. Mae'n chwarae rhan bwysig o ran helpu teuluoedd gyda chostau byw. Fodd bynnag, credaf yn gryf, ar ôl adroddiad blynyddol Estyn ddoe, y gallai ac, yn wir, y dylai unrhyw arian ychwanegol y bydd fy adran yn ei gael o bosibl ar gyfer 2014-15, gael ei roi at ddefnydd mwy effeithiol na'r hyn a amlinellwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y ddadl hon.



I believe that, given the suite of policies that we already have in place, we have the right balance of priorities to warrant voting against this motion today. The Welsh Lib Dems cannot have it both ways. They cannot support a coalition in Westminster that chokes off resource to the Welsh Government and then produce a motion in Cardiff containing figures that simply would not, under any interpretation—and here is my response to Peter Black—whether it is over one year or two years, represent any kind of real grasp of the amount of investment that would be required in order to meet the demands of the motion. They cannot produce a motion like that and then ask me to spend that fantasy figure, which I simply do not have. If they are sincere in laying this motion today, then they simply have no grasp of the financial situation and of what they are asking the Government to adopt in this motion. I intend to channel the precious additional funding that we do have through the autumn consequentials into other, more urgent and more pressing, priorities.

Credaf, o ystyried y gyfres o bolisiau sydd eisoes ar waith gennym, ein bod wedi taro'r cydbwysedd cywir o ran blaenoriaethau er mwyn cyfiawnhau pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig hwn heddiw. Ni all Democrataid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ei chael hi bob ffordd. Ni allant gefnogi clymblaid yn San Steffan sy'n amiddfadu Llywodraeth Cymru o adnoddau ac yna lunio cynnig yng Nghaerdydd sy'n cynnwys ffigurau na fyddent, yn syml, o dan unrhyw ddehongliad—a dyma fy ymateb i Peter Black—boed dros flwyddyn neu ddwy flynedd, yn dangos unrhyw ddealltwriaeth wirioneddol o faint o fuddsoddiad y byddai ei angen er mwyn bodloni gofynion y cynnig. Ni allant lunio cynnig o'r fath, ac yna gofyn imi wario'r ffigur ffantasi hwnnw, nad oes gennyf mewn gwirionedd. Os ydynt yn ddiffuant wrth osod y cynnig hwn heddiw, yna nid oes ganddynt unrhyw syniad o'r sefyllfa ariannol a'r hyn y maent yn gofyn i'r Llywodraeth ei fabwysiadu yn y cynnig hwn. Bwriadaf wario'r arian ychwanegol gwerthfawr sydd gennym drwy symiau canlyniadol yr hydref, ar flaenoriaethau pwysicach eraill.

17:38 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Galwaf ar Kirsty Williams i ymateb i'r ddadl.

I call on Kirsty Williams to respond to the debate.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:38 **Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank colleagues from across the Chamber for their contribution to the debate this afternoon on the benefits that universal free school meals can bring and for looking at ways in which the Welsh Government could provide more children with that opportunity in Wales.

Hoffwn ddiolch i gyd-Aelodau o bob rhan o'r Siambr am eu cyfraniad i'r ddadl y prynhawn yma ynglŷn â manteision prydaud bwyd ysgol am ddim i bob disgybl ac am edrych ar sut y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru roi'r cyfle hwnnw i fwy o blant yng Nghymru.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

First, I will address the points that speakers have made. Simon Thomas, speaking for Plaid Cymru, accepted the principle that there is a direct correlation between decent nutrition on children's wellbeing and their ability to learn, and that it has an impact on attainment. Not unreasonably, Simon thinks that this is being adequately addressed by the provision of school breakfasts. However, as we know, and as was acknowledged by Jenny Rathbone, that is not a universal provision and fewer than a quarter of Welsh primary school pupils take up a free school breakfast. Therefore, there are many more children who are not having that provision, or taking it up, than those who are.

Yn gyntaf, ymdriniaf â'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan y siaradwyr. Derbyniodd Simon Thomas, gan siarad dros Blaid Cymru, yr egwyddor bod cydberthynas uniongyrchol rhwng maeth da ar les plant a'u gallu i ddysgu, a'i fod yn cael effaith ar gyrhaeddiad. Mae Simon o'r farn, nid yn afresymol, yr ymdrinnir â hyn yn ddigonol drwy ddarparu brechwast mewn ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddom, ac fel y cydnabuwyd gan Jenny Rathbone, nid yw honno'n ddarpariaeth i bob disgybl ac mae llai na chwarter y disgyblion mewn ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru yn hawlio brechwast ysgol am ddim. Felly, mae llawer mwy o blant nad ydynt yn cael y ddarpariaeth honno, neu nad ydynt yn ei hawlio, na'r rhai sy'n ei chael.

Simon also talked about the issue of funding, as did the Minister for Education and Skills. He seemed to suggest that Plaid could not support the motion today because it was not clear that there were any Barnett consequentials at all. However, the Minister for Finance's statement makes it quite clear that there are. As we know from debates in the Chamber in the past, Plaid is very keen on all occasions to point to the actions of the SNP Government in Scotland. Well, the SNP Government in Scotland has acknowledged that there are Barnett consequentials for this policy, and it has taken the decision to use that money to increase provision within Scotland. That demonstrates that there is money available and that it is a question of choices. Simon is quite right—it is about priorities and what we should spend the money on. We know that this provision would help attainment, and we all know that we need to do that in Wales. More than that, investment in this particular area would also help the Welsh Government achieve some of its policy objectives for children in other areas. It would begin to address the issue that we have about childhood obesity levels, Huw. We know that the provision of access to free school meals and different food choices means that children have better nutrition. Not only do they eat more and better food in schools, but they also take those habits home and influence the choices that their families are making for them at home. There is a big increase in the eating of vegetables at home, for instance, because of the experience of enjoying and eating them in school. We also know that it helps to promote cohesion, and it is also hugely beneficial to families who are not entitled to free school meals.

In the case of the consultation that we carried out with councils, Caerphilly County Borough Council also talked about the fact that the opportunity of using these resources would help it to prop up its school meals service, which is often very difficult to do, because more people would use it. Caerphilly also pointed to the advantage of being able to employ more local people to deliver this service within its schools. So, the benefit of this investment is not only helpful in terms of education, but also in terms of health and the economy.

Simon accused me of changing my mind. Perhaps Simon would like to reread the Plaid Cymru general election manifesto of 2010, when the party pledged to look at the feasibility of ensuring that this policy was introduced in Wales.

Soniodd Simon hefyd am arian, fel y gwnaeth y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau. Ymddangosai ei fod yn awgrymu na allai Plaid Cymru gefnogi'r cynnig heddiw, am nad oedd yn glir bod unrhyw symiau canlyniadol o gwbl o dan Barnett. Fodd bynnag, mae datganiad y Gweinidog Cyllid yn ei gwneud yn gwbl glir y bydd symiau canlyniadol. Fel y gwyddom o ddadleuon yn y Siambr yn y gorffennol, mae Plaid yn awyddus iawn ar bob achlysur i dynnu sylw at gamau gweithredu Llywodraeth Plaid Genedlaethol yr Alban. Wel, mae Llywodraeth Plaid Genedlaethol yr Alban wedi cydnabod bod symiau canlyniadol Barnett ar gyfer y polisi hwn, ac mae wedi gwneud y penderfyniad i ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw i gynyddu'r ddarpariaeth yn yr Alban. Mae hynny'n dangos bod arian ar gael ac mai mater o ddewisiadau ydyw. Mae Simon yn llygad ei le—mae'n ymwneud â blaenoriaethau a'r hyn y dylem wario'r arian arno. Gwyddom y byddai'r ddarpariaeth hon yn helpu i wella cyrhaeddiad, a gwyddom oll fod angen inni wneud hynny yng Nghymru. Yn fwy na hynny, byddai buddsoddiad yn y maes penodol hwn hefyd yn helpu Llywodraeth Cymru i gyflawni rhai o'i hamcanion polisi ar gyfer plant mewn meysydd eraill. Byddai'n dechrau mynd i'r afael â'r broblem a wynebwn o ran gordewdra ymhlith plant, Huw. Gwyddom fod darparu prydau ysgol am ddim a dewisiadau bwyd gwahanol yn golygu bod plant yn cael gwell maeth. Nid yn unig y maent yn bwyta mwy o fwyd a gwell bwyd mewn ysgolion, ond maent hefyd yn mynd i'r arfer gartref ac yn dylanwadu ar y dewisiadau y mae eu teuluoedd yn eu gwneud ar eu cyfer yn y cartref. Gwelir cynnydd mawr o ran bwyta llysiau gartref, er enghraifft, oherwydd y profiad o'u mwynhau a'u bwyta yn yr ysgol. Gwyddom hefyd ei bod yn helpu i hyrwyddo cydlyniant, ac mae hefyd yn hynod fuddiol i deuluoedd nad oes ganddynt hawl i brydau ysgol am ddim.

Yn achos yr ymgynghoriad a gynhaliwyd gennym â'r cynghorau, soniodd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili hefyd am y ffaith y byddai'r cyfle i ddefnyddio'r adnoddau hyn yn helpu i gynnal ei wasanaeth prydau ysgol, sydd yn aml yn anodd iawn ei wneud, oherwydd byddai mwy o bobl yn ei ddefnyddio. Nododd Caerffili hefyd y fantais o allu cyflogi mwy o bobl leol i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth hwn yn ei ysgolion. Felly, mae'r buddsoddiad hwn, nid yn unig yn ddefnyddiol o ran addysg, mae hefyd yn ddefnyddiol o ran iechyd a'r economi.

Fe'm cyhuddwyd gan Simon o newid fy meddwl. Efallai yr hoffai Simon ailddarllen manifesto etholiad cyffredinol 2010 Plaid Cymru, pan addawodd y blaid y byddai'n edrych ar y posibilrwydd o sicrhau bod y polisi hwn yn cael ei gyflwyno yng Nghymru.

Jenny Rathbone made a very thoughtful contribution on an area that Jenny spends a lot of time championing in the Chamber, namely access to decent food for children. She described this as a policy whose time had come. There is increasing evidence, not just in this country but across the world, that this can make a valuable contribution to education as well as to wider healthcare issues. She spoke particularly movingly on the issue of stigma. I know from my own child's experience in secondary school, where there is no cardless system, that there is a strong distinction between those who hand over their ticket and those who do not. Children are very aware that that ticket means that you are poor and that your family cannot afford to feed you. That must be a horrible thing for a child to put up with on a daily basis, when other children are able to hand over cash for their meals.

Angela spent a lot of time trying to distance herself from the policy that her colleagues in London are happy to see implemented. What was interesting about Angela's contribution was the concept of, 'Those who can, should'. On that basis, perhaps the policy that we will see coming forward from the Conservatives will be, 'Those who can should start paying for their children's schoolbooks, or should perhaps contribute to the cost of their children's education in state schools.'

Gwnaeth Jenny Rathbone gyfraniad ystyriol iawn mewn maes y mae Jenny yn treulio llawer o amser yn ei hyrwyddo yn y Siambr, sef sicrhau bod plant yn cael bwyd da. Dywedodd fod hwn yn bolisi y mae'n bryd ei gyflwyno. Mae tystiolaeth gynyddol, nid yn unig yn y wlad hon, ond ar draws y byd, y gall hyn wneud cyfraniad gwerthfawr i addysg yn ogystal ag i faterion gofal iechyd ehangach. Soniodd yn deimladwy iawn am stigma. Gwn o brofiad fy mhentyn fy hun yn yr ysgol uwchradd, lle nad oes system gardiau, fod gwahaniaeth amlwg rhwng y rhai sy'n cyflwyno eu tocyn a'r rhai nad ydynt yn gwneud hynny. Mae plant yn ymwybodol iawn bod y tocyn yn golygu eich bod yn dlawd ac na all eich teulu fforddio eich bwydo. Rhaid bod hynny'n beth ofnadwy i blentyn ddygydd ag ef o ddydd i ddydd, pan fo plant eraill yn gallu rhoi arian am eu prydau.

Treuliodd Angela dipyn o amser yn ceisio ymbellhau oddi wrth y polisi y mae ei chyd-Aelodau yn Llundain yn barod i'w weld yn cael ei weithredu. Yr hyn a oedd yn ddiddorol ynglŷn â chyfraniad Angela oedd y cysyniad, 'Y sawl a allo, boed iddynt wneud hynny'. Ar y sail honno, efallai mai'r polisi y byddwn yn ei weld gan y Ceidwadwyr yw, 'Dylai'r sawl a allo ddechrau talu am lyfrau ysgol eu plant, neu gyfrannu at gost addysg eu plant yn ysgolion y wladwriaeth'.

17:44 **Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Sorry, Kirsty, you are not usually so utterly ridiculous over something. [Laughter.] First, I make absolutely no apology for saying that if I was a Westminster MP, which thankfully I am not—

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Kirsty, nid ydych fel arfer mor hollol chwerthinllyd ynglŷn â rhywbeth. [Chwerthin.] Yn gyntaf, nid wyf yn ymddiheuro o gwbl dros ddweud, pe bawn yn Aelod Seneddol yn San Steffan, nad ydyf diolch byth—

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:44 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Finish with this.

Gorffennwch gyda hyn.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:44 **Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

[Continues.]—I would be standing up and saying that this policy is very poor because it is not evidence based—

[Parhau.]—byddwn yn sefyll ar fy nhraed ac yn dweud bod y polisi hwn yn wael iawn am nad yw'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth—

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:44 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Kirsty Williams.

Kirsty Williams.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:44 **Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Secondly, we are very tight on money—

Yn ail, mae arian yn dynn iawn—

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:44 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Kirsty Williams. [Interruption.] Interventions have to be to the point; you cannot have 'firstlys' and 'secondlys' in interventions.

Kirsty Williams. [Torri ar draws.] Rhaid i ymyriadau godi pwynt uniongyrchol, ni allwch ddweud 'yn gyntaf' ac 'yn ail' mewn ymyriadau.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:44	<b>Kirsty Williams</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Thank you very much, Deputy Presiding Officer. The truth is that the Government in England sees the benefit of providing these opportunities for more children across England, and I am sorry that the Conservatives do not feel able to introduce them here. What was most worrying about Angela's contribution, as I said, is the concept that the Conservatives believe that those who can, should. Where does that end in the context of an education system? Will we start paying for their school books, as I said, or a contribution to education? Julie Morgan highlighted the role of the school breakfast policy, and I welcome that. Minister, the money is there. You have decided not to spend it in this particular area. That is a matter of regret to me. I think that investment could have assisted you in your goal of getting better attainment—</p>	<p>Diolch yn fawr iawn, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Y gwir yw bod y Llywodraeth yn Lloegr yn ei hystyried yn fantais i roi'r cyfleoedd hyn i fwy o blant ledled Lloegr, a gresynaf nad yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn teimlo y gallant eu cyflwyno yma. Yr hyn a achosodd y pryder mwyaf am gyfraniad Angela, fel y dywedais, yw'r cysyniad bod y Ceidwadwyr yn credu y dylai'r sawl a allo wneud hynny. Beth yw pen draw hynny yng nghyd-destun system addysg? A fyddwn yn dechrau talu am eu llyfrau ysgol, fel y dywedais, neu gyfraniad i addysg? Amlygodd Julie Morgan rôl polisi brecwast ysgol, a chrosawaf hynny. Weinidog, mae'r arian ar gael. Rydych wedi penderfynu peidio â'i wario yn y maes penodol hwn. Gresynaf at hynny. Credaf y gallai'r buddsoddiad hwnnw fod wedi eich hepu gyda'ch nod o sicrhau gwell cyrhaeddiad—</p>
17:45	<b>Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	Order. Finish very quickly now please.	Trefn. Gorffennwch yn gyflym iawn os gwelwch yn dda.
17:45	<b>Kirsty Williams</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>[Continues.]—as well as assisting your Minister for Health and Social Services with better quality food for children as well as other benefits that this would mean for your Government in terms of achieving your goals for social cohesion.</p>	<p>[Parhau.]—yn ogystal â helpu'ch Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gyda bywd o ansawdd gwell i blant yn ogystal â'r manteision eraill a olygai hyn i'ch Llywodraeth o ran cyflawni'ch nodau i greu cydlyniad cymdeithasol.</p>
17:45	<b>Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Mae gwrthwynebiad, felly gohirir y pleidleisio ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.</p> <p><i>Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.</i></p>	<p>The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? There is objection, so I will defer all voting on this item until voting time.</p> <p><i>Voting deferred until voting time.</i></p>
17:45	<b>Cyfnod Pleidleisio</b>	<b>Y</b> Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<b>Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<b>Voting Time</b>
	<p>Before I conduct the first vote, are there three Members who wish for the bell to be rung? There are not.</p>	<p>Cyn imi gynnal y bleidlais gyntaf, a oes tri Aelod sy'n dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Nac oes.</p>
	<a href="#">Canlyniad y bleidlais ar gynnis NDM5416</a>	<a href="#">Result of the vote on motion NDM5416</a>
	<p><i>Gwrthodwyd y cynnig: O blaid 12, Yn erbyn 41, Ymatal 0.</i></p>	<p><i>Motion not agreed: For 12, Against 41, Abstain 0.</i></p>
	<a href="#">Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 1 i gynnis NDM5416</a>	<a href="#">Result of the vote on amendment 1 to motion NDM5416</a>
	<p><i>Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 27, Yn erbyn 27, Ymatal 0.</i></p>	<p><i>Amendment not agreed: For 27, Against 27, Abstain 0.</i></p>
	<p><i>Fel sy'n ofynnol o dan Reol Sefydlog 6.20, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw drwy bleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant.</i></p>	<p><i>As required by Standing Order 6.20 the Deputy Presiding Officer exercised his casting vote by voting against the amendment.</i></p>
	<a href="#">Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 2 i gynnis NDM5416</a>	<a href="#">Result of the vote on amendment 2 to motion NDM5416</a>
	<p><i>Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 27, Yn erbyn 27, Ymatal 0.</i></p>	<p><i>Amendment not agreed: For 27, Against 27, Abstain 0.</i></p>

*Fel sy'n ofynnol o dan Reol Sefydlog 6.20, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw drwy bleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant.*

*As required by Standing Order 6.20 the Deputy Presiding Officer exercised his casting vote by voting against the amendment.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 3 i gynnis NDM5416](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 3 to motion NDM5416](#)

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 15, Yn erbyn 39, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment not agreed: For 15, Against 39, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 4 i gynnis NDM5416](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 4 to motion NDM5416](#)

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 54, Yn erbyn 0, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment agreed: For 54, Against 0, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 5 i gynnis NDM5416](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 5 to motion NDM5416](#)

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 27, Yn erbyn 27, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment not agreed: For 27, Against 27, Abstain 0.*

*Fel sy'n ofynnol o dan Reol Sefydlog 6.20, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw drwy bleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant.*

*As required by Standing Order 6.20 the Deputy Presiding Officer exercised his casting vote by voting against the amendment.*

Cynnig NDM5416 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Motion NDM5416 as amended:

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn nodi'r cynigion ar gyfer mewnfuddsoddi a amlinellwyd yn nogfen Ceidwadwyr Cymru 'Destination Cymru'.

1. Notes the proposals for inward investment outlined in the Welsh Conservative document 'Destination Cymru'.

2. Yn nodi ymchwiliad presennol y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes i ymagwedd Llywodraeth Cymru tuag at hybu masnach a mewnfuddsoddi.

2. Notes the Enterprise and Business Committee's current inquiry into the Welsh Government's approach to the promotion of trade and inward investment.

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar gynnis NDM5416 fel y'i diwygiwyd](#)

[Result of the vote on motion NDM5416 as amended](#)

*Gwrthodwyd cynnis NDM5416 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 22, Yn erbyn 27, Ymatal 5.*

*Motion NDM5416 as amended not agreed: For 22, Against 27, Abstain 5.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar gynnis NDM5417](#)

[Result of the vote on motion NDM5417](#)

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnis: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 49, Ymatal 0.*

*Motion not agreed: For 5, Against 49, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 1 i gynnis NDM5417](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 1 to motion NDM5417](#)

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 10, Yn erbyn 44, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment not agreed: For 10, Against 44, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 2 i gynnis NDM5417.](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 2 to motion NDM5417.](#)

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 10, Yn erbyn 44, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment not agreed: For 10, Against 44, Abstain 0.*

17:50

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I ask those Members who are leaving the Chamber to do so quickly and quietly.

Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau hynny sy'n gadael y Siambr wneud hynny'n gyflym ac yn dawel.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

## Dadl Fer: Cyflogaeth i Raddedigion —Atal y Draen Dawn i Loegr

**Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I have chosen the subject of graduate employment for this short debate, and I have agreed to offer Angela Burns a minute to speak in this debate.

A few months after I was born, my parents left their home in Wales for the last time. Like so many young people in the 1970s and 1980s, they believed that in order to build a better life for themselves and their family, they had to head for the border. The brain drain that Wales suffered in the 1970s and 1980s has left a mark, I think, on our national psyche, but perhaps a much more significant one on our long-term economic prospects.

University graduates have long been recognised as a key source of the higher level skills necessary to secure Wales's economic competitiveness relative to other regions in the UK and across Europe. A high-skill economy not only attracts a higher level of inward investment, but it is also more resilient to the threats of labour market variations elsewhere and economic challenges. A higher skill workforce is harder to replace in cheaper labour markets. In challenging economic times when big companies are retrenching, high-skill headquarter locations are much more secure, because those big organisations will, in effect, sacrifice a limb to save the body.

However, an analysis of the data produced by organisations such as the Higher Education Statistics Agency make it clear that Wales is not experiencing the benefits of higher level qualifications to the same extent as the rest of the UK. In fact, that brain drain that we recognise from the 1970s and 1980s continues today. Not only are graduates from Welsh universities less likely to find employment after graduation than their counterparts from other UK nations, but an alarming proportion of Welsh graduates—both Welsh-domiciled graduates and graduates from Welsh higher education institutions—are leaving Wales to find work. The statistics are very clear: only 60% of employed, full-time, first-degree graduates from Welsh HEIs remained in Wales for employment six months after graduation with a drain to England of 39%. By contrast, the equivalent retention statistic for England is 98%, for Scotland, it is 82%, and for Northern Ireland, it is 91%.

I have heard suggestions in this Chamber that there is value to Wales in the diaspora going out into the world to learn new skills and bringing them home to Wales. There is some truth in this, but only if those graduates who leave us, return. The sad truth is that they simply do not. It is a shocking fact that there are now more graduates from Welsh universities working in England than there are working in Wales.

## Short Debate: Graduate Employment—Stopping the Brain Drain to England

Rwyf wedi dewis cyflogaeth graddedigion fel pwnc y ddadl fer hon, ac rwyf wedi cytuno i gynnig munud i Angela Burns siarad yn y ddadl hon.

Ychydig fisoedd ar ôl imi gael fy ngeni, gadawodd fy rhieni eu cartref yng Nghymru am y tro olaf. Fel cynifer o bobl ifanc yn y 1970au a'r 1980au, roeddent yn credu bod yn rhaid croesi'r ffin er mwyn creu bywyd gwell iddynt hwy a'u teulu. Mae'r draen dawn a ddiodeffodd Cymru yn y 1970au a'r 1980au wedi gadael ei ôl, fe gredaf, ar ein seice cenedlaethol, ond un llawer mwy arwyddocaol efallai ar ein rhagolygon economaidd yn yr hirdymor.

Cydnabuwyd ers amser bod graddedigion prifysgol yn ffynhonnell allweddol o'r sgiliau lefel uwch sydd eu hangen i sicrhau cystadleurwydd economaidd Cymru o'i gymharu â rhanbarthau eraill yn y DU ac ar draws Ewrop. Mae economi fedrus iawn nid yn unig yn denu lefel uwch o fewnfuddsoddiad, ond mae hefyd yn fwy gwydn i wrthsefyll bygythiadau o ran amrywiadau'r farchnad lafur mewn mannau eraill a heriau economaidd. Mae'n anoddach dod o hyd i weithlu mwy medrus cyfatebol mewn marchnadoedd llafur rhatach. Mewn cyfnod economaidd heriol pan fo cwmnïau mawr yn torri nôl, mae lleoliadau pencadlys medrus iawn yn llawer mwy diogel, gan y bydd y sefydliadau mawr hynny, i bob pwrpas, yn aberthu coes i achub y corff.

Fodd bynnag, mae dadansoddiad o'r data a gynhyrchwyd gan sefydliadau fel yr Asiantaeth Ystadegau Addysg Uwch yn ei gwneud yn glir nad yw Cymru yn profi manteision cymwysterau lefel uwch i'r un graddau â gweddill y DU. Yn wir, mae'r draen dawn sy'n gyfarwydd inni o'r 1970au a'r 1980au yn parhau heddiw. Nid yn unig y mae graddedigion o brifysgolion Cymru yn llai tebygol o ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth ar ôl graddio na graddedigion cyfatebol o wledydd eraill y DU, ond mae cyfran syfrdanol o raddedigion Cymru—graddedigion sy'n huanu o Gymru a graddedigion o sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru—yn gadael Cymru i ddod o hyd i waith. Mae'r ystadegau'n glir iawn: dim ond 60% o raddedigion cyflogedig, llawn amser, gradd gyntaf o SAUau Cymru a arhosodd yng Nghymru ar gyfer cyflogaeth chwe mis ar ôl graddio ac aeth 39% ohonynt i Loegr. I'r gwrthwyneb, yr ystadegyn cadw cyfatebol ar gyfer Lloegr yw 98%, ar gyfer yr Alban, mae'n 82% a 91% yng Ngogledd Iwerddon.

Clywais awgrymiadau yn y Siambr hon fod gwerth i Gymru o ran y rhai sy'n mynd allan i'r byd i ddysgu sgiliau newydd a dod â hwy adref i Gymru. Mae rhywfaint o wirionedd yn hyn, ond dim ond os yw'r graddedigion hynny sy'n ein gadael, yn dychwelyd. Y gwir trist yw nad ydynt yn gwneud hynny. Mae'n ffaith syfrdanol bod mwy o raddedigion bellach o brifysgolion Cymru yn gweithio yn Lloegr nag sydd yn gweithio yng Nghymru.

According to the latest destinations of leavers from higher education longitudinal studies from HESA, 50% of graduates from Welsh universities work in England in the long term, with only 48% remaining in Wales. Not only do we lose young people when they first graduate, but the statistics clearly show that we continue to lose more of them than we gain as the years go by.

The implications of this for the Welsh economy are stark. First, despite being successful in encouraging young people to go to university and gain skills, we do not retain that highly skilled workforce, which is so important in developing our indigenous economy and bringing new investment to Wales. We are investing in developing skills and talents, but not reaping the return on that investment.

Secondly, it suggests that Wales is not able to offer graduates the kind of opportunities that other parts of the UK are offering. Therefore, even if a person liked living in Wales and had intended to stay, they find themselves forced to leave to build the careers that they wanted. We know that student life satisfaction ratings for Welsh HEIs are among the highest in the UK, with Welsh institutions coming top in a number of surveys over the past decade. Despite this high quality of life, people still leave after they graduate. We have to ask why that would be the case. Perhaps the answer lies partially in the destinations of those graduates who choose to stay.

Graduates from Welsh HEIs make up the majority of the graduate workforce living in Wales due to the high retention rates of other parts of the UK, yet they are less likely to find employment in high-level occupations and are more likely to be working below their skill level in lower paid jobs than those from institutions elsewhere. Again, according to HESA longitudinal studies, graduates from Welsh universities are less likely to enter professional occupations than those in the rest of the UK by a factor of 58% per for Welsh universities to 64% for the rest of the UK. It cannot just be because of remote geography as we sometimes suggest, because the figure for Scotland is an impressive 69%.

As graduates from Welsh universities have lower prospects of entering professional or graduate-level fields, it is unsurprising that they can also expect the lowest starting salary in the UK at only £19,500 per annum. This falls below the average for Scotland, which is £22,000, for England, which is £21,000, and for Northern Ireland, which is £20,000. Across the UK, that is an average of £21,000. Therefore, the challenge is twofold: to strengthen the Welsh economy so that it is able to support more of the kind of high-value jobs that our graduates deserve, but also to give those graduates the support and advice that they need to access those jobs and build their careers.

Yn ôl cyrchfannau diweddaraf ymadawyr o astudiaethau hydredol addysg uwch o HESA, mae 50% o raddedigion o brifysgolion Cymru yn gweithio yn Lloegr yn yr hirdymor, gyda dim ond 48% yn aros yng Nghymru. Nid yn unig y collwn bobl ifanc pan fyddant yn graddio gyntaf, ond dengys yr ystadegau'n glir ein bod yn parhau i golli mwy ohonynt nag yr ydym yn eu hennill wrth i'r blynyddoedd fynd heibio.

Mae goblygiadau hyn i economi Cymru yn llwm. Yn gyntaf, er ein bod yn llwyddo i annog pobl ifanc i fynd i brifysgol a meithrin sgiliau, nid ydym yn cadw'r gweithlu medrus iawn hwnnw, sydd mor bwysig wrth ddatblygu ein heconomi gynhenid a dod â buddsoddiad newydd i Gymru. Rydym yn buddsoddi mewn datblygu sgiliau a doniau, ond nid ydym yn elwa ar y buddsoddiad hwnnw.

Yn ail, mae'n awgrymu nad yw Cymru yn gallu cynnig y math o gyfleoedd y mae rhannau eraill o'r DU yn eu cynnig i raddedigion. Felly, hyd yn oed os oedd rhywun yn hoffi byw yng Nghymru ac wedi bwriadu aros yma, caiff ei orfodi i adael er mwyn datblygu'r yrfa y mae am ei chael. Gwyddom fod cyfraddau boddhad bywyd myfyrwyr ar gyfer SAUau Cymru ymhlith yr uchaf yn y DU, gyda sefydliadau Cymreig yn dod i'r brig mewn nifer o arolygon dros y degawd diwethaf. Er gwaethaf yr ansawdd bywyd uchel hwn, mae pobl yn dal i adael ar ôl iddynt raddio. Rhaid inni ofyn pam fod hynny'n digwydd. Efallai fod yr ateb yn rhannol yng nghyrcfannau'r graddedigion hynny sy'n dewis aros.

Graddedigion o SAUau Cymru yw'r mwyafrif o'r gweithlu graddedigion sy'n byw yng Nghymru oherwydd cyfraddau cadw uchel rhannau eraill o'r DU, ac eto maent yn llai tebygol o ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth mewn galwedigaethau lefel uwch ac yn fwy tebygol o fod yn gweithio islaw eu lefel sgiliau mewn swyddi â thâl is na'r rhai o sefydliadau eraill. Unwaith eto, yn ôl astudiaethau hydredol HESA, mae graddedigion o brifysgolion Cymru yn llai tebygol o ddilyn galwedigaethau proffesiynol na'r rhai yng ngweddill y DU gyda 58% yn dewis gwneud o brifysgolion Cymru o gymharu â 64% ar gyfer gweddill y DU. Ni all hyn fod oherwydd y ddaearyddiaeth anghysbell yn unig, fel yr awgrymir gennym weithiau, oherwydd mae'r ffigur ar gyfer yr Alban yn 69% ac mae hynny'n drawiadol.

Gan fod gan raddedigion o brifysgolion Cymru ragolygon is o ddilyn galwedigaethau proffesiynol neu ar lefel raddedig, nid yw'n syndod y gallant hefyd ddisgwyl cael y cyflog cychwynnol isaf yn y DU sef dim ond £19,500 y flwyddyn. Mae hyn islaw'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer yr Alban, sy'n £22,000, ar gyfer Lloegr, sy'n £21,000 ac ar gyfer Gogledd Iwerddon, sy'n £20,000. Ledled y DU, mae hynny'n gyfartaledd o £21,000. Felly, mae'r her yn un ddeublyg: cryfhau economi Cymru fel y gall gefnogi mwy o'r math o swyddi gwerth uchel y mae ein graddedigion yn eu haeddu, ond hefyd rhoi cefnogaeth a chynghor sydd eu hangen ar y graddedigion hynny i gael gafael ar y swyddi hynny a datblygu eu gyrfaedd.

Turning to the first challenge, what do we need to do to strengthen the Welsh economy and create more graduate-level, high-value jobs? If this was an easy thing to do, clearly, the Welsh Government would have done it already, and I am sure that the Deputy Minister is going to tell me that it is doing exactly that. The challenge here, though, is a structural one, not a question of tactical intervention such as job creation schemes or career support, which I want to talk about in a moment. We have to assess the level of development in our economy and decide how we strike the appropriate balance between attracting inward investment and encouraging indigenous businesses to grow through both home trade and export. I am extremely concerned that, in Wales, we have been traditionally far too preoccupied with that home trade issue, debating issues such as procurement far more often than issues involving international trade and export. We also do not think strategically enough about the basic business growth strategies of market development and product development. We simply encourage Welsh businesses to do more of what they are doing, to sell more to their existing markets, and we need to be much more outward looking and much less parochial in general terms.

We do, of course, have a sector-based economic strategy aimed at focusing on those areas where Wales has an existing or a potential source of competitive advantage and a potential for growth. In order to deliver it, an appropriately skilled workforce in Wales is, of course, critical. In terms of the subjects being studied at Welsh HEIs, there has been a really encouraging increase in the number of people studying science, technology, engineering and mathematics in recent years. Between 2007-08 and 2011-12, we see increases of 25% in the biological sciences, 24% in the physical sciences, 33% in engineering and a really impressive 45% in maths. Additionally, graduates from Welsh HEIs are more likely to undertake further study than those from other parts of the UK, and this is a real source of potential competitive advantage for Wales.

On the face of it, these figures are very encouraging, but there are a couple of red flags that I would like to point out. The first one is a complete collapse in the number of people studying modern foreign languages at Welsh universities, dropping by 38% over the same period, and, in terms of Welsh-domiciled students, dropping by a staggering 53%. If we hope to encourage Welsh businesses to export and engage with the world, we are going to need to deal with people who speak other languages. We are going to need people with those higher level language skills, and we simply do not have them. Sadly, the evidence suggests that these subjects are in a critical crisis at the moment not only at university, but at other levels, and we will need to deal with that if we want to see indigenous businesses thrive in international trade.

Gan droi at yr her gyntaf, beth sydd angen inni ei wneud i gryfhau economi Cymru a chreu mwy o swyddi lefel raddedig, gwerth uchel? Os oedd hyn yn beth hawdd i'w wneud, yn amlwg, byddai Llywodraeth Cymru eisoes wedi ei wneud, ac rwy'n siŵr bod y Dirprwy Weinidog yn mynd i ddweud wrthyf ei bod yn gwneud yn union hynny. Fodd bynnag, her strwythurol yw hon, ac nid mater o ymyrraeth dactegol fel cynlluniau creu swyddi neu gymorth gyrfaol, yr hoffwn sôn amdanynt mewn eiliad. Rhaid inni asesu lefel y datblygiad yn ein heconomi a phenderfynu sut i daro'r cydbwysedd priodol rhwng denu mewnfuddsoddiad ac annog busnesau cynhenid i dyfu drwy fasnach gartref ac allforio. Rwy'n bryderus iawn ein bod ni, yng Nghymru, wedi ymhél gormod yn draddodiadol â'r mater masnach gartref hwnnw, gan drafod materion fel caffael yn amlach o lawer na materion yn ymwneud â masnach ac allforion rhyngwladol. Nid ydym ychwaith yn meddwl yn ddigon strategol am strategaethau twf busnes sylfaenol datblygu'r farchnad a datblygu cynnyrch. Y cyfan a wnawn yw annog busnesau Cymreig i wneud mwy o'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud, i werthu mwy i'w marchnadoedd presennol, ac mae angen inni fod yn fwy blaengar o lawer ac yn llai plwyfol yn gyffredinol.

Wrth gwrs, mae gennym strategaeth economaidd ar sail sector sydd â'r nod o ganolbwyntio ar y meysydd hynny lle mae gan Gymru eisoes ffynhonnell neu ddarpar ffynhonnell o fantais gystadleuol a photensial ar gyfer twf. Er mwyn cyflawni hyn, mae gweithlu medrus priodol yng Nghymru, wrth gwrs, yn hollbwysig. O ran y pynciau sy'n cael eu hastudio yn SAUau Cymru, bu cynnydd calonogol go iawn yn nifer y bobl sy'n astudio gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianneg a mathemateg yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Rhwng 2007-08 a 2011-12, gwelsom gynnydd o 25% yn y gwyddorau biolegol, 24% yn y gwyddorau ffisegol, 33% mewn peirianneg a 45% mewn mathemateg, sy'n drawiadol iawn. Yn ogystal, mae gradddedigion o SAUau Cymru yn fwy tebygol o ymgymryd ag astudiaeth bellach na'r rhai o rannau eraill o'r DU, ac mae hyn yn ffynhonnell wirioneddol o fantais gystadleuol bosibl i Gymru.

Ar yr olwg gyntaf, mae'r ffigurau hyn yn galonogol iawn, ond mae ambell i broblem yr hoffwn dynnu sylw atynt. Mae'r un gyntaf yn ymwneud â methiant llwyr o ran nifer y bobl sy'n astudio ieithoedd tramor modern yn mhreifysgolion Cymru, sydd wedi gostwng 38% dros yr un cyfnod, ac, o ran o myfyrwyr sy'n huanu o Gymru, sydd wedi gostwng 53%, sy'n ostyngiad syfrdanol. Er mwyn inni obeithio annog busnesau Cymru i allforio ac ymgysylltu â'r byd, mae angen inni ddelio â phobl sy'n siarad ieithoedd eraill. Bydd angen pobl arnom sydd â'r sgiliau iaith lefel uwch hynny ond nid oes rhai gennym. Yn anffodus, awgryma'r dystiolaeth fod y pynciau hyn yn wynebu argyfwng mawr ar hyn o bryd, nid yn unig ar lefel prifysgol, ond ar lefelau eraill hefyd, a bydd angen inni ddelio â hynny os ydym am weld busnesau cynhenid yn ffynnu mewn masnach ryngwladol.



The second is that while a greater number of people are studying STEM subjects, those individuals are not necessarily successful in entering the workforce and bringing those skills into the economy. Fewer than half of all first-degree graduates in the physical, mathematical and biological sciences are in full-time employment six months after graduation, and I believe that we need to collect further information to help us to understand why that is the case.

Turning to that second challenge, what can we do to ensure that graduates at Welsh HEIs have the support and advice that they need to build a career here? Obviously, GO Wales is the Welsh Government's flagship graduate employability programme. Phase 5 of the programme, covering the period of January 2009 to December 2011, included five strands of activity: 10-week paid work placements, 10-day work tasters, graduate training and development—a programme that subsidises training courses in Welsh businesses—a graduate academy, which is a two-week management training programme, and a freelancer academy to explore freelancing, self-employment and entrepreneurship opportunities.

The phase 5 evaluation report states that the programme's broad objectives are either being achieved or have been achieved, yet I find that a little difficult to swallow when only one of those strands—the lowest involvement, 10-day work tasters programme—actually met its target participation rate. I would also note that there were huge variations between institutions in terms of how they performed, with only Cardiff and Swansea meeting their targets, and institutions such as Aberystwyth only reaching 69% of the projected uptake. Universities in rural Wales, which do not have immediate access to a large local economy, need to offer more of these kinds of opportunities to their graduates if they want them to stay in the local area; yet, the evidence suggests that they struggle to offer even the target amount, even though the targets were adjusted to take into account the size and location of the institutions.

I also find it difficult to accept the finding that participants in this 10-day work experience programme benefited from an average salary uplift of £2,630 per year. I wonder, Deputy Minister, how you came to the before and after figures for individuals who were students not in the workplace before they undertook the placement. How would you demonstrate that this estimated salary uplift was as a result of that placement directly and not due to other factors?

Yr ail her yw hyn. Er bod nifer fwy o bobl yn astudio pynciau STEM, nid yw'r unigolion hynny o reidrwydd yn llwyddo i ymuno â'r gweithlu a chyflwyno'r sgiliau hynny i'r economi. Mae llai na hanner yr holl raddedigion gradd gyntaf yn y gwyddorau ffisegol, mathemategol a biolegol mewn cyflogaeth llawn amser chwe mis ar ôl graddio, a chredaf fod angen inni gasglu rhagor o wybodaeth i'n helpu i ddeall pam fod hynny'n digwydd.

Gan droi at yr ail her honno, beth y gallwn ei wneud i sicrhau bod graddedigion yn SAUau Cymru yn cael y cymorth a'r cyngor sydd eu hangen arnynt i ddatblygu gyrfa yma? Yn amlwg, GO Wales yw rhaglen cyflogadwyedd graddedigion flaenllaw Llywodraeth Cymru. Roedd Cam 5 y rhaglen, ar gyfer y cyfnod rhwng Ionawr 2009 a Rhagfyr 2011, yn cynnwys pum maes gweithgaredd: lleoliadau gwaith â thâl 10 wythnos, rhagflas ar waith 10 diwrnod, hyfforddiant a datblygiad i raddedigion—rhaglen sy'n rhoi cymhorthdal i gyrsiau hyfforddiant ym musnesau Cymru—academi i raddedigion, sef rhaglen hyfforddi rheolwyr sy'n para pythefnos, ac academi i bobl lawrydd i ymchwilio i gyfleoedd llawrydd, hunangyflogaeth ac entrepreneuriaeth.

Dywed yr adroddiad gwerthuso cam 5 fod amcanion cyffredinol y rhaglen naill ai'n cael eu cyflawni neu wedi cael eu cyflawni, ac eto mae'n anodd imi dderbyn hynny o gofio mai dim ond un o'r meysydd hynny—yr un lle mae angen yr ymwneud lleiaf, y rhaglen ragflas ar waith 10 diwrnod—a gyrhaeddodd ei darged o ran cyfradd gyfranogi. Hoffwn nodi hefyd fod amrywiadau enfawr rhwng sefydliadau o ran perfformiad, a dim ond Caerdydd ac Abertawe a gyrhaeddodd eu targedau, ac ni chyrrhaeddodd sefydliadau fel Aberystwyth ond 69% o'r nifer ragamcanol o fyfyrwyr. Mae angen i brifysgolion yng Nghymru wledig, nad oes ganddynt fynediad uniongyrchol i economi leol fawr, gynnig mwy o'r mathau hyn o gyfleoedd i'w graddedigion os ydynt yn dymuno iddynt aros yn yr ardal leol; ac eto, mae'r dystiolaeth yn awgrymu eu bod yn cael anhawster i gynnig hyd yn oed y swm targed, er i'r targedau gael eu haddasu er mwyn ystyried maint a lleoliad y sefydliadau.

Rwyf hefyd yn ei chael hi'n anodd derbyn y canfyddiad bod y cyfranogwyr yn y rhaglen profiad gwaith 10 diwrnod hon wedi elwa ar godiad cyflog o £2,630 y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd. Tybed, Ddirprwy Weinidog, sut y pennwyd y ffigurau cyn ac ar ôl gennyh i fyfyrwyr nad oeddent yn y gweithle cyn iddynt dderbyn y lleoliad. Sut y byddech yn dangos bod y codiad amcangyfrifedig hwn mewn cyflog o ganlyniad i'r lleoliad hwnnw yn uniongyrchol ac nid oherwydd ffactorau eraill?

If we drill into some of the objectives, that glowing assessment simply does not stand up to scrutiny. Looking at specifics, one objective was to aid the retention of graduate-level skills in the Welsh economy; as we have already heard, that has patently not been the case. Graduate retention rates are still abject. On upskilling participants and easing access to employment in their chosen career path, it is doubtful that this objective was fully met, given that the training and development strand was the least successful in terms of participation rates, at only 60% of its target. On enabling businesses in Wales to access higher-level skills, knowledge and innovation potential, with the freelancer strand that aims to develop those kinds of innovative and entrepreneurial skills only hitting 70% of its target participation rate, and only 53% in convergence areas where we really need them to be hitting the target, it is hard to believe that that objective was fully met either. I would like the Welsh Government to conduct some longitudinal studies to track participants of these schemes and find out where they are and what they are doing in three or five years after completing that programme, so that we can start to fill in some more detail of what is happening there.

More recently, of course, the Jobs Growth Wales scheme has been introduced and a graduate strand developed. However, as of November, only 371 opportunities had been created in this strand. There are nearly 23,000 graduates from Welsh HEIs every year, so those are opportunities created for less than 2% of our graduates. While the percentage of employment rate from the strand is apparently good, let us be clear that only 69 have actually secured a job, having finished a placement in the graduate strand of Jobs Growth Wales. That is one job for every 360 graduates. To say that it is a drop in the ocean must be an understatement.

So, what is to be done? First, I think that we have to be honest and recognise that we do have a significant challenge to meet in terms of growing the graduate employment market as a whole in Wales, and we have to accept that this problem has afflicted our economy for several generations. I think that it will take this generation a period of time to effectively address it. The issue is not simply one of providing support or advice, or even job creation schemes. It runs far deeper in our economy than that. We already know that Wales hosts relatively few business headquarters and that a relatively high proportion of employment is in microbusinesses, some of which have growth potential, of course, but some of which are content to remain at that smaller size. So, if we want to develop a graduate job market, we have to address these kinds of issues. While the sector strategy is aimed at driving growth, a higher-level strategic question about the balance of attention that we pay to indigenous business as opposed to inward investment and international trade also needs to be addressed. With these activities located within the department for the economy and transport, there has been less visibility for the strategies that it is following, which is a cause of concern to me.

Os astudiwn rai o'r amcanion hyn yn fanylach, nid yw'r asesiad canmoliaethus hwnnw yn dal dŵr mewn gwaith craffu. O edrych ar y nodweddion penodol, un amcan oedd helpu i gadw sgiliau lefel raddedig yn economi Cymru; fel y clywsom eisoes, yn amlwg, nid felly y bu. Mae cyfraddau cadw graddedigion yn dal yn druenus o hyd. O ran gwella sgiliau cyfranogwyr a hwyluso mynediad i gyflogaeth yn eu llwybr gyrfa dewisol, mae'n amheus a gyflawnwyd yr amcan hwn yn llawn, o gofio mai'r maes hyfforddi a datblygu oedd yr un lleiaf llwyddiannus o ran cyfraddau cyfranogi, gan gyrraedd ond 60% o'i darged. O ran galluogi busnesau yng Nghymru i fanteisio ar sgiliau lefel uwch, gwybodaeth a photensial arloesi, gyda'r maes llawrydd sy'n anelu at ddatblygu'r mathau hynny o sgiliau arloesol ac entrepreneuriaidd ond yn cyrraedd 70% o'i gyfradd cyfranogiad darged, a dim ond 53% mewn ardaloedd cydgyfeirio lle mae gwir angen iddynt gyrraedd y targed, mae'n anodd credu i'r amcan hwnnw gael ei gyflawni'n llawn hefyd. Hoffwn i Lywodraeth Cymru gynnal rhai astudiaethau hydredol i olrhain cyfranogwyr y cynlluniau hyn a chanfod ble maent yn awr a beth maent yn ei wneud dair neu bum mlynedd ar ôl cwblhau'r rhaglen honno, fel y gallwn ddechrau cwblhau rhagor o'r manylion am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yno.

Yn fwy diweddar, wrth gwrs, cyflwynwyd cynllun Twf Swyddi Cymru a datblygwyd maes graddedigion. Fodd bynnag, o fis Tachwedd ymlaen, dim ond 371 o gyfleoedd a oedd wedi cael eu creu yn y maes hwn. Mae bron 23,000 o raddedigion o SAUau Cymru bob blwyddyn, felly cyfleoedd yw'r rheini a grëir ar gyfer llai na 2% o'n graddedigion. Er bod canran y gyfradd gyflogaeth o'r maes hwn yn dda yn ôl pob golwg, gadewch inni fod yn glir mai dim ond 69 sydd wedi cael swyddi mewn gwirionedd, ar ôl gorffen lleoliad ym maes graddedigion Twf Swyddi Cymru. Un swydd am bob 360 o raddedigion yw hynny. Hanner stori yw dweud mai piso dryw bach yn y môr yw hyn.

Felly, beth y gellir ei wneud? Yn gyntaf, credaf fod yn rhaid inni fod yn onest a chydabod bod gennym her fawr i'w hateb o ran cynyddu'r farchnad cyflogaeth i raddedigion yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru, a rhaid inni dderbyn bod y broblem hon wedi effeithio'n andwyol ar ein heconomi ers sawl cenhedlaeth. Credaf y bydd yn cymryd cyfnod o amser i'r genhedlaeth hon fynd i'r afael â hi yn effeithiol. Nid mater o ddarparu cymorth neu gyngor yn unig ydyw, na hyd yn oed gynlluniau creu swyddi. Mae'n mynd yn ddyfnach o lawer i'n heconomi na hynny. Gwyddom eisoes mai prin yw nifer y pencadlysoedd busnes yng Nghymru a bod cyfran gymharol uchel o swyddi ym maes microfusnesau, y mae gan rai ohonynt botensial ar gyfer twf, wrth gwrs, ond y mae rhai ohonynt yn fodlon aros ar y maint llai hwnnw. Felly, er mwyn datblygu marchnad swyddi i raddedigion, rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r mathau hyn o faterion. Er bod y strategaeth sector wedi ei hanelu at hybu twf, mae angen mynd i'r afael hefyd â mater strategol lefel uwch ynghylch faint o sylw a roddwn i fusnesau cynhenid yn hytrach na mewnfuddsoddiad a masnach ryngwladol. Gyda'r gweithgareddau hyn yn rhan o waith adran yr economi a thrafnidiaeth, mae llai o weledd wedi bod ar gyfer y strategaethau y mae'n eu dilyn, sy'n peri pryder i mi.

I welcome the signs from the Welsh Government that it recognises the importance of these issues, but I would also welcome the Government publishing more strategic information about the approach that it is taking in those strategic areas, and providing an annual report for the work of the teams delivering its strategies, in terms of inward investment and international trade, in particular. I also believe that, while the data that we have identify a problem, they do not tell us the reasons why we have a problem. The HESA data are robust and reliable, but they are not specifically tailored to our own needs here in Wales. Without more detailed information as to the reasons for the challenges that we face, any policy intervention that we plan will, at best, be based on anecdote and, at worst, be plain guesswork. So, I wonder if the Welsh Government would either consider commissioning its own more detailed research, or even work alongside HESA to add questions to the existing questionnaires, so that we can have a clearer picture of the situation that we face.

We have to have a better understanding of why our graduates are leaving Wales in such numbers. We have to find out why Welsh graduates are less likely to find professional-level work than those in other parts of the UK. We need this information so that we can devise effective strategies that are going to give Welsh graduates the opportunities that they need to keep our skilled workforce in Wales. We have to act now or we will see yet another generation of talented young people heading for the border. The brain drain is real. It is happening now. We must act to tackle it.

Croesawaf yr arwyddion gan Lywodraeth Cymru ei bod yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y materion hyn, ond byddwn hefyd yn falch o weld y Llywodraeth yn cyhoeddi gwybodaeth fwy strategol am y dull y mae'n ei fabwysiadu yn y meysydd strategol hynny, ac yn cyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol ar waith y timau sy'n cyflawni ei strategaethau, o ran mewnfuddsoddiad a masnach ryngwladol, yn benodol. Credaf hefyd, er bod y data sydd gennym yn nodi problem, nid ydynt yn dweud wrthym pam fod gennym broblem. Mae data HESA yn gadarn a dibynadwy, ond nid ydynt wedi'u teilwra'n benodol i'n hanghenion ni ein hunain yma yng Nghymru. Heb wybodaeth fanylach am y rhesymau dros yr heriau a wynebwn, bydd unrhyw ymyrraeth polisi a gynlluniwn, ar y gorau, yn seiliedig ar anecdote ac, ar y gwaethaf, yn ddyfalu llwyr. Felly, tybed a fyddai Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystyried comisiynu ei hymchwil fanylach ei hun, neu hyd yn oed weithio ochr yn ochr â HESA i ychwanegu cwestiynau at yr holiaduron presennol, fel y gallwn gael darlun cliriach o'r sefyllfa a wynebwn.

Rhaid inni ddeall yn well pam mae cymaint o'n graddedigion yn gadael Cymru. Rhaid inni ddarganfod pam mae graddedigion Cymru yn llai tebygol o ddod o hyd i waith ar lefel broffesiynol na'r rhai mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Mae angen y wybodaeth hon arnom fel y gallwn lunio strategaethau effeithiol a fydd yn rhoi'r cyfleoedd i raddedigion Cymru sydd eu hangen arnynt er mwyn cadw ein gweithlu medrus yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni weithredu yn awr neu fe welwn genhedlaeth arall o bobl ifanc dalentog yn croesi'r ffin. Mae dawn Cymru yn gadael. Mae'n digwydd yn awr. Rhaid inni weithredu i fynd i'r afael ag ef.

- 18:06 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I call on the Deputy Minister for Skills and Technology, Ken Skates, to reply to the debate. Galwaf ar y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau a Thechnoleg, Ken Skates, i ymateb i'r ddadl.
- 18:06 **Kenneth Skates** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- These short debates from Eluned Parrott are getting shorter by the month, I fear. There are no contributions today, so we will wrap up quickly. Thank you for raising this important issue. Mae'r dadleuon byr hyn gan Eluned Parrott yn mynd yn fyrrach bob mis, mae arnaf ofn. Nid oes unrhyw gyfraniadau heddiw, felly down i ben yn gyflym. Diolch ichi am godi'r mater pwysig hwn.
- 18:06 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Order. I was not able to call anyone because the Member took the full 15 minutes. It is no reflection on the other Member who wanted to speak. Trefn. Nid oeddwn yn gallu galw unrhyw un am fod yr Aelod wedi cymryd y 15 munud llawn. Nid yw'n adlewyrchiad ar yr Aelod arall a oedd am siarad.
- 18:06 **Kenneth Skates** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I apologise, Deputy Presiding Officer. Ymddiheuraf, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

Thank you for raising this issue, Eluned. It is something that has received some attention recently. It is certainly not unique to Wales. I wish to address the subtitle of your debate today, which I hope is a mistake, but I will come to that later. The 2011 report by the Wales Institute of Social and Economic Research, Data and Methods, 'Welsh Graduate Migration', indicates that the concept of a brain drain is highly complex. While it is true that Wales has the lowest graduate retention rate, compared to the other UK countries as a whole, when compared to English regions, it does better than all other regions except the north-west and London—two highly urbanised parts of Britain, where many young people seek experience of city life.

As Wales is a net importer of students, it is highly likely, therefore, to be a net exporter of graduates. In addition, the WISERD report points out that it is known that many Welsh graduates seek to return to Wales at a later stage of their life cycle or career, with some establishing their own businesses as a way of achieving this. Other research concluded that the phrase 'brain drain' is not particularly accurate when describing the flow of graduate labour shaping regional economic development. The term 'brain circulation' has been favoured, to better illustrate that this flow of graduates is not one way. Even with those graduates who may leave Wales, it is often the case that they return home at some point in their lives.

In this respect, the most recent labour market statistics illustrate that Wales is maintaining an employment rate well above its historical average, with a level at a record high—at 183,000 since the start of the Assembly. The employment rate gap between Wales and the UK, which was around five to six percentage points at devolution, has fallen to around two to three percentage points, and most recently appears to be getting even smaller. Unemployment rates within Wales have also reduced, with inactivity rates at a record low. This shows that Wales is not only bouncing back from the recession but is also making significant improvements by closing some of the historical gaps that have existed with the rest of the UK. For example, employment in Wales has increased by 15.1% since devolution, compared to 10.8% for the UK as a whole over the same period. The economic inactivity rate in Wales has fallen by 4.8%, compared to a fall of 1.3% for the UK as a whole, over that same period.

Since devolution, most job creation in Wales has been in the private sector and also in the top occupations, with many requiring degree-level qualifications. Research has shown that graduates are likely to have greater earnings during the course of their careers, with graduates also more likely to be in employment than those with lesser or no qualifications. For example, in Wales, graduates have an 80% employment rate, compared to 35% for those with no qualifications.

Diolch ichi am godi'r mater hwn, Eluned. Mae'n rhywbeth sydd wedi cael rhywfaint o sylw yn ddiweddar. Yn sicr, nid yw'n unigryw i Gymru. Hoffwn fynd i'r afael ag isdeitl eich dadl heddiw, sy'n gamgymeriad gobeithio, ond dof at hynny yn nes ymlaen. Dengys yr adroddiad yn 2011 gan Sefydliad Ymchwil, Data a Methodoleg Gymdeithasol ac Economaidd Cymru, fod y cysyniad o ddraen dawn yn un cymhleth iawn. Er ei bod yn wir bod gan Gymru y gyfradd cadw graddedigion isaf, o'i chymharu â gwledydd eraill y DU yn gyffredinol, o'i chymharu â rhanbarthau Lloegr, mae'n gwneud yn well na'r holl ranbarthau eraill ar wahân i ogledd-orllewin Lloegr a Llundain—dwy ran drefol iawn o Brydain, lle mae cymaint o bobl ifanc yn ceisio profi bywyd y ddinas.

Gan fod Cymru yn fewnforiwr net o fyfyrwyr, mae'n debygol iawn felly ei bod yn allforiwr net o raddedigion. Hefyd, mae adroddiad Sefydliad Ymchwil, Data a Methodoleg Gymdeithasol ac Economaidd Cymru yn nodi ei bod yn hysbys bod llawer o raddedigion Cymru yn ceisio dychwelyd i Gymru yn nes ymlaen yn eu cylch bywyd neu yrfa, gyda rhai yn sefydlu eu busnesau eu hunain fel ffordd o gyflawni hyn. Daeth ymchwil arall i'r casgliad nad yw'r ymadrodd 'draen dawn' yn arbennig o gywir wrth ddisgrifio'r llif o weithwyr graddedig sy'n creu datblygiad economaidd rhanbarthol. Mae'r term 'dosbarthu dawn' neu 'brain circulation' yn Saesneg wedi ei ffafrio, er mwyn cyfleu'n well nad yw'r llif hwn o raddedigion yn unffordd yn unig. Hyd yn oed gyda'r graddedigion hynny sy'n gadael Cymru efallai, maent yn aml yn rhyw dychwelyd adref ar ryw adeg yn eu bywydau.

Yn hyn o beth, mae ystadegau diweddaraf y farchnad lafur yn dangos bod Cymru yn cynnal cyfradd gyflogaeth lawer uwch na'r cyfartaledd hanesyddol, gyda'r lefel uchaf erioed—183,000 ers dechrau'r Cynulliad. Mae'r bwlch cyfradd gyflogaeth rhwng Cymru a'r DU, a oedd tua phump i chwe phwynt canran adeg datganoli, wedi gostwng i tua dau neu dri phwynt canran, ac yn fwy diweddar ymddengys ei fod yn gostwng hyd yn oed ymhellach. Mae cyfraddau diweithdra yng Nghymru hefyd wedi gostwng, gyda chyfraddau anweithgarwch ar eu hisaf erioed. Mae hyn yn dangos bod Cymru, nid yn unig yn gwella'n sylweddol ar ôl y dirwasgiad, ond ei bod hefyd yn gwneud gwelliannau sylweddol drwy gau rhai o'r bylchau hanesyddol sydd wedi bodoli rhyngddi hi â gweddill y DU. Er enghraifft, mae cyflogaeth yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu 15.1% ers datganoli, o'i chymharu â 10.8% ar gyfer y DU gyfan dros yr un cyfnod. Mae'r gyfradd anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru wedi gostwng 4.8%, o'i chymharu â gostyngiad o 1.3% ar gyfer y DU gyfan, dros yr un cyfnod.

Ers datganoli, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r swyddi a grëwyd yng Nghymru wedi bod yn y sector preifat a hefyd yn y galwedigaethau gorau, gyda llawer yn gofyn am gymwysterau lefel gradd. Mae ymchwil wedi dangos bod graddedigion yn debygol o ennill mwy yn ystod eu gyrfa, a bod graddedigion hefyd yn fwy tebygol o fod mewn cyflogaeth na'r rheini sydd â llai o gymwysterau neu ddim cymwysterau o gwbl. Er enghraifft, yng Nghymru, mae gan raddedigion gyfradd cyflogaeth o 80%, o'i chymharu â 35% ar gyfer y rhai sydd heb gymwysterau.

The Welsh Government is helping to enhance employability and retain graduates in large and small and medium-sized enterprise businesses through the pan-Wales GO Wales programme. Managed by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, GO Wales is helping graduates to develop careers in the Welsh economy, where they can use their higher-level skills, knowledge and unlimited potential, ultimately helping to retain graduate-level skills in the Welsh economy. The Member drew attention to the work-experience element offered but the fact is that, compared to the situation over the border, GO Wales is faring very well. Over the border in England, the careers service has virtually been demolished, so no work experience is offered there.

Jobs Growth Wales is another Welsh Government initiative that has proved successful in assisting Wales's young people into employment. Although the programme is helping both graduates and non-graduates, evidence suggests that those with degree-level qualifications are best placed to secure permanent employment using these schemes. Indeed, 92% of graduates taking a Jobs Growth Wales opportunity through the specialist graduate strand are gaining permanent employment with that employer at the end of the opportunity. It is true that some graduates are in jobs for which degrees are not required—we have seen this trend increasing during the recession. Although the Welsh Government promotes the upskilling and appropriate utilisation of skills within Wales's labour market, it must be recognised that some instances of skill mismatches are aligned to graduates' job requirements. For example, this may be to balance family commitments or to allow more fluid employment, either during or in between courses.

Wales has net outmigration in the 20-24 age range and many of these will be good graduates, but overall Wales has had more people of working age migrating in rather than out over recent years. In terms of graduate flows, Wales has an outflow of people who were resident in Wales prior to higher education, but the flow of recent graduates to the major metropolitan centre—which, of course, is London—is a common feature across many countries and the direction of flow is typically reversed later in life. While I agree that we want graduates to return, we should not be anything but supportive of those who seek to experience, often, city life. As you said, we need more graduates to be outward looking. What better way to be outward looking than to experience life—for a short period, at least—outside of Wales.

Finally, I will return to the subtitle of the debate. I hope that it was a mistake. It reads:

'the best and brightest graduates from Welsh Universities'.

I do not discriminate between graduates of Welsh universities and graduates who attended university outside of Wales but who were born and raised in Wales. I would like to see the best possible job opportunities offered to all graduates from Wales.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn helpu i wella cyflogadwyedd a chadw gradddedigion mewn busnesau mawr a bach a chanolig drwy rhaglen Go Wales ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Rheolir GO Wales gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ac mae'n helpu gradddedigion i ddatblygu gyrfaedd yn economi Cymru, lle y gallant ddefnyddio eu sgiliau lefel uwch, eu gwybodaeth a'u potensial diddiwedd, gan helpu yn y pen draw, i gadw sgiliau lefel raddedig yn economi Cymru. Tynnodd yr Aelod sylw at yr elfen profiad gwaith a gynigir, ond y gwir yw bod GO Wales, o'i chymharu â'r sefyllfa dros y ffin, yn ffynnu yn dda iawn. Dros y ffin yn Lloegr, mae'r gwasanaeth gyrfaedd bron wedi'i ddinistrio, felly ni chynigir unrhyw brofiad gwaith yno.

Mae Twf Swyddi Cymru yn fenter arall gan Lywodraeth Cymru sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus yn cynorthwyo pobl ifanc Cymru i gael cyflogaeth. Er bod y rhaglen yn helpu gradddedigion a rhai nad ydynt yn radddedigion, mae tystiolaeth yn awgrymu mai'r rhai sydd â chymwysterau lefel gradd sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i sicrhau cyflogaeth barhaol gan ddefnyddio'r cynlluniau hyn. Yn wir, mae 92% o radddedigion sy'n manteisio ar un o gyfleoedd Twf Swyddi Cymru drwy'r maes gradddedigion arbenigol yn cael cyflogaeth barhaol gyda'r cyflogwr hwnnw ar ddiwedd y cyfle. Mae'n wir bod rhai gradddedigion mewn swyddi lle nad oes angen graddau—gwelsom y duedd hon yn cynyddu yn ystod y dirwasgiad. Er bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn hyrwyddo'r gwaith o wella sgiliau a defnyddio sgiliau yn briodol o fewn marchnad lafur Cymru, rhaid cydnabod y ceir rhai enghreifftiau lle nad yw'r sgiliau'n gyson â gofynion swyddi gradddedigion. Er enghraifft, efallai y gwneir hyn er mwyn cydbwysu ymrwymadau teuluol neu er mwyn cael cyflogaeth fwy hyblyg, naill ai yn ystod cyrsiau neu rhyngddynt.

Mae gan Gymru allfudiad net yn yr ystod oedran 20-24 a bydd llawer o'r rhain yn radddedigion da, ond ar y cyfan mae Cymru wedi cael mwy o bobl o oedran gweithio yn mewnfudo yn hytrach nag allfudo dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. O ran llifau gradddedigion, mae gan Gymru all-lif o bobl a oedd yn preswyllo yng Nghymru cyn addysg uwch, ond mae'r llif diweddar o radddedigion i'r ganolfan fetropolitanaid fawr—sef Llundain, wrth gwrs—yn nodwedd gyffredin ar draws sawl gwlad a chaiff cyfeiriad y llif fel arfer ei wrthdroi yn ddiweddarach mewn bywyd. Er fy mod yn cytuno ein bod am i radddedigion ddychwelyd, ni ddylem ond cefnogi'r rheini sy'n ceisio profi, yn aml, fywyd y ddinas. Fel y dywedaso, mae angen i fwy o radddedigion fod yn allblyg. Pa ffordd well o fod yn allblyg na phrofi bywyd—am gyfnod byr, o leiaf—y tu allan i Gymru.

Yn olaf, dychwelaf at isdeitl y ddadl. Rwy'n gobeithio mai camgymeriad ydoedd. Mae'n darllen:

y gradddedigion gorau a mwyaf disglair o Brifysgolion Cymru.

Nid wyf yn gwahaniaethu rhwng gradddedigion o brifysgolion Cymru a gradddedigion a aeth i brifysgolion y tu allan i Gymru ond a gafodd eu geni a'u magu yng Nghymru. Hoffwn weld y cyfleoedd gorau posibl am swyddi yn cael eu cynnig i bob unigolyn graddedig o Gymru.

18:13

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Thank you, Deputy Minister. That concludes today's proceedings.

Diolch ichi, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion heddiw.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 18:13.*

*The meeting ended at 18:13.*